

REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE – 11 JUNE 2001

REPORT ON: TAYSIDE ACUTE SERVICES REVIEW

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF CORPORATE PLANNING

REPORT NO: 360-2001

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To advise Committee of the proposals contained in Tayside Health Board's consultation paper on the Tayside Acute Services Review and to approve the Council's response.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that:

- 2.1.1 Committee approves the contents of Section 7 of this report as the basis of the Council's response to the consultation paper on the Tayside Acute Services Review.

- 2.1.2 Committee instructs the Chief Executive to carefully monitor any proposal to transfer services from Ninewells to Perth Royal Infirmary.

- 2.1.3 Committee instructs the Chief Executive to write to Tayside Health Board expressing the Council's view that any proposal to transfer services from Ninewells Hospital to Perth Royal Infirmary be based on sound clinical need rather than financial expediency, or as a 'quid pro quo' arrangement for services transferred from Perth Royal Infirmary.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 This report has no direct financial implications for Dundee City Council.

4 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

- 4.1 The Tayside Acute Services Review addresses issues directly relevant to the Local Agenda 21 theme relating to the provision of health services which emphasise prevention of illness as well as care for the sick.

5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES

- 5.1 The Tayside Acute Services Review considers equality of access to health services.

6 BACKGROUND

- 6.1 In December 1999, Tayside Health Board published the findings of Phase 1 of the Acute Services Review which concluded that Tayside spends more on acute services than the national average for Scotland and commensurately less on primary and secondary care. It based its findings on the principles of ensuring services could be delivered safely and also considered the natural desire to maintain services locally where possible. This process developed a number of concepts for providing acute services in the future.

- 6.2 Following wide consultation, Phase Two of the Acute Services Review has developed these concepts further into a series of detailed costs options and makes recommendations on the delivery of Acute Care, Maternity Services and Paediatric Services. These are, in summary:

- Ninewells will remain a major teaching centre for Tayside and the East of Scotland, however, there is a need to modernise the way in which services are provided and redesign these to improve service delivery.
- Perth Royal Infirmary should continue to provide a wide range of acute services.
- A new local hospital for Angus supported by existing locality based services.
- In the interim period, prior to the development of a new facility, NHS Tayside is minded to recommend that the proposed range of services for Angus would be developed at Stracathro Hospital.

6.3 Formal consultation on the Report of the Tayside Acute Services Review is now being undertaken and will continue until the end of July. NHS Tayside will consider a report on all the views expressed during the consultation process at its meeting to be held on 29 August 2001. The following section draws together a corporate response to the Report which was produced following distribution to all departments.

7 DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL RESPONSE

7.1 Dundee City Council welcomes the aims set out in the Executive Summary and opening sections of the Tayside Acute Services Review – “To build an integrated health service where there is more public and patient involvement in the decisions affecting their care. This will include working together with our local authority partners to tackle inequalities in health with particular emphasis on social inclusion”.

7.2 General Comments

Dundee City Council recognises the challenging context within which this review is being taken forward, and supports Tayside Health Board’s stance in so far as the review acknowledges that there are “no right or single answers”. The review also provide a clear indication of the difficult choices and the rationale for making these choices.

An area of concern that the Council would wish noted is the inference in the report that healthcare expenditure in Tayside should be leveled down to the Scottish average on Page 3 *The Need for Change*.

There is a national policy governing needs which is not addressed in this review. It could be argued that, given the demographic and geographic profile of Tayside, the current higher levels of expenditure are entirely appropriate, i.e. Dundee has, second to Glasgow, the highest percentage of its population living within areas of deprivation, and Tayside, as a whole, has the additional costs of geographic dispersal combined with a population profile biased towards the elderly which will inevitably push-up health care costs.

7.3 Detailed Comments

7.3.1 Page 5 *Dundee*

This section of the report highlights the fact that patients do not perceive Ninewells as “patient friendly”. One reason for this is the car parking charges. This also creates a pressure on the neighbouring residential areas with staff and visitors going to extraordinary lengths to avoid paying for car parking at Ninewells.

7.3.2 Section 3 – *The Future of Maternity Services*

The debate, which will continue throughout the review period, is reflected in the section on maternity services. On the one hand, there is the understandable demand for localisation while, at the same time, there is recognition that, on grounds of efficiency and expertise, centralisation of paediatric and day case activity is the only model that makes sense.

From a patient perspective, Dundee is, therefore, less likely to be affected by the proposals set out in the review document. From an economic perspective, and from that of maximising the potential of Tayside as a focus for expertise and professional development, Dundee City Council welcomes the recognition of the role played by Ninewells Hospital and the Board's continuing commitment to Ninewells as the centre of neo-natal, paediatric and high-risk maternity services for the region it serves.

- 7.4 In considering the future provision of acute services in Tayside, there may be pressures on the NHS in Tayside to configure services based on financial expediency and in response to public demand. Any proposal to transfer services from Ninewells Hospital to Perth Royal Infirmary must be firmly based on sound clinical need rather than financial expediency or as a 'quid pro quo' arrangement for services transferred from Perth.

8 **CONSULTATION**

- 8.1 All Chief Officers were consulted in the preparation of this report.

9 **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

None.

Director of Corporate Planning

Date