

City Chambers
DUNDEE
DD1 3BY

2nd September, 2016

Dear Sir or Madam

You are requested to attend a MEETING of the **POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE** to be held in the City Chambers, City Square, Dundee on Monday, 12th September, 2016 following the meetings of the City Council, City Council as Fleming Trustees, Community Safety and Public Protection and Neighbourhood Services Committees called for 6.00 pm.

Yours faithfully

DAVID R MARTIN

Chief Executive

AGENDA OF BUSINESS

1 DECLARATION OF INTEREST

Members are reminded that, in terms of The Councillors Code, it is their responsibility to make decisions about whether to declare an interest in any item on this agenda and whether to take part in any discussions or voting.

This will include all interests, whether or not entered on your Register of Interests, which would reasonably be regarded as so significant that they are likely to prejudice your discussion or decision-making.

2 REVENUE MONITORING - Page 1

(Report No 275-2016 enclosed).

3 INTRODUCTION OF A SALARY SACRIFICE CAR BENEFIT SCHEME - Page 9

(Report No 283-2016 enclosed).

4 SCOTTISH LIVING WAGE ACCREDITATION - Page 13

(Report No 279-2016 enclosed).

5 PROPOSED REORGANISATION OF DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL REGISTERED CHARITIES (AN72-2016)

Reference is made to Article XII of the minute of meeting of the Policy and Resources Committee on 9th March, 2015 wherein the Committee approved the proposals for the reorganisation of Dundee City Council registered charities and instructed the Director of Corporate Services to submit applications to the Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator (OSCR) for approval of the charity reorganisation schemes.

Approval has now been received from OSCR for the reorganisation of the following charities: - Charles Ower Bequest, Charles Ower Mafeking Gift, Public Libraries Art Fund, D W Crichton Trust and Alexander Wilson Bequest. Members are requested to formally approve the charity reorganisation schemes for these charities in order to complete the reorganisation process.

Members are also requested to formally approve the charity reorganisation schemes for the remaining Dundee Registered Charities as set out in paragraph 4.3 of Report 66-2015, in order to complete the reorganisation process for those charities, in the event of statutory approvals being issued by OSCR under section 39(1) of the Charities and Trustee Investment (Scotland) Act 2005 for the reorganisation schemes.

REPORT TO: POLICY & RESOURCES COMMITTEE – 12 SEPTEMBER 2016
REPORT ON: REVENUE MONITORING 2016/2017
REPORT BY: EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF CORPORATE SERVICES
REPORT NO: 275-2016

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 To provide Elected Members with an analysis of the 2016/2017 projected revenue outturn as at 31 July 2016 monitored against the adjusted 2016/2017 Revenue Budget.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 It is recommended that Elected Members:

- a note that the overall General Fund 2016/2017 projected revenue outturn as at 31 July 2016 is a breakeven position against the adjusted 2016/2017 Revenue Budget.
- b note that the Housing Revenue Account as at 31 July 2016 is projecting a breakeven position against the adjusted HRA 2016/2017 Revenue Budget.
- c agree that the Executive Director of Corporate Services will take every reasonable action to ensure that the 2016/2017 Revenue expenditure is below or in line with the adjusted Revenue Budget.
- d instruct the Executive Director of Corporate Services in conjunction with all Chief Officers to continue to monitor the Council's 2016/2017 projected revenue outturn.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS (see Appendix A)

3.1 The overall projected 2016/2017 General Fund Revenue outturn position for the City Council is currently projecting a breakeven position based on the financial information available at 31 July 2016. A system of perpetual detailed monitoring will continue to take place up to 31 March 2017 with the objective of the Council achieving a final outturn which is below or in line with the adjusted 2016/2017 Revenue Budget.

3.2 The Housing Revenue Account outturn position for 2016/2017 is currently projecting a breakeven position based on the financial information available for the period to 31 July 2016. A system of perpetual detailed monitoring will continue to take place up to 31 March 2017 with the objective of the HRA achieving a final outturn which is below or in line with the adjusted 2016/2017 HRA Revenue Budget.

4 BACKGROUND

4.1 Following approval of the Council's 2016/2017 Revenue Budget by the Special Policy and Resources Committee on 25 February 2016 this report is now submitted in order to monitor the 2016/2017 projected revenue outturn position as at 31 July 2016, against the adjusted 2016/2017 Revenue Budget.

- 4.2 This report provides a detailed breakdown of service revenue monitoring information along with explanations of material variances against adjusted budgets. Where services are projecting a significant under or overspend against adjusted budget, additional details have been provided. Where service expenditure is on target and no material variances are anticipated, additional information has not been provided.

5 RISK ASSESSMENT

- 5.1 In preparing the Council's 2016/2017 Revenue Budget, the Executive Director of Corporate Services considered the key strategic, operational and financial risks faced by the Council over this period (Article II of the minute of the meeting of the Special Policy & Resources Committee on 25 February 2016, Report No: 72-2016 refers). In order to alleviate the impact these risks may have should they occur, a number of general risk mitigation factors are utilised by the Council. These include the:

- system of perpetual detailed monthly budget monitoring carried out by service
- general contingency provision set aside to meet any unforeseen expenditure
- level of general fund balances available to meet any unforeseen expenditure
- level of other cash backed reserves available to meet any unforeseen expenditure
- possibility of identifying further budget savings and efficiencies during the year, if required.

- 5.2 The key risks in 2016/2017 have now been assessed both in terms of the probability of whether they will occur and the severity of their impact on the Council should they indeed happen. These risks have been ranked as either zero, low, medium or high. Details of this risk assessment, together with other relevant information including any proposed actions taken by the Council to mitigate these risks, are included in Appendix D to this report.

6 GENERAL FUND SERVICES - MONITORING POSITION AS AT 31 JULY 2016

- 6.1 The forecast position as at 31 July 2016 for General Fund services is summarised below:

	<u>Adjusted Budget 2016/17 £000</u>	<u>Forecast 2016/17 £000</u>	<u>Variance £000</u>
Total Expenditure	332,379	332,379	-
Total Income	<u>(332,379)</u>	<u>(332,379)</u>	-
Forecast Position	_____ -	_____ -	_____ -

The forecast position as at 31 July 2016 is shown in more detail in the appendices to this report, as follows:

Appendix A shows the variances between budget and projected outturn for each service of the Council.

Appendix B provides detailed explanations for the variances against budget that are shown in Appendix A.

Appendix C lists the budget adjustments that have been undertaken to date.

Appendix D lists the key strategic, operational and financial risks being faced by the Council. These risks have been assessed and ranked accordingly both in terms of the probability of whether they will occur and the severity of their impact on the Council should they indeed happen. Any changes to the assessment from the previous reporting period, together with any additional comments included, are highlighted in bold type.

- 6.2 The following paragraphs summarise the main areas of variance by service along with appropriate explanations. It should be emphasised that this report identifies projections based on the first four months of the financial year to 31 July 2016. The figures are therefore indicative at this stage and are used by the Chief Executive, Executive Director of Corporate Services and all other Chief Officers to identify variances against budget and enable corrective action to be taken as appropriate.

Service Commentary

- 6.3 Education (£50,000 overspend)
The service is anticipating an overspend in relation to special transport provision.
- 6.4 Social Work (£300,000 overspend)
Within Children and Families, the service is projecting an overspend in relation to residential and secure care placements.
- 6.5 City Development (£50,000 overspend)
The service is projecting a shortfall in external rental income due to the number of commercial properties they anticipate will remain vacant during the year.
- 6.6 Chief Executive (breakeven)
An underspend in relation to the current level of staff vacancies within the service is offset by an anticipated under recovery of lets income along with reduced income relating to advertising on Council digital media.
- 6.7 Capital Financing Costs / IORB (£400,000 underspend)
The above underspend reflects a projected saving due to lower than anticipated interest rates.

7 HOUSING REVENUE ACCOUNT - MONITORING POSITION AT 31 JULY 2016

- 7.1 The forecast position as at 31 July 2016 for the HRA is summarised below:

	<u>Adjusted Budget 2016/17 £000</u>	<u>Forecast 2016/17 £000</u>	<u>Variance £000</u>
Total Expenditure	54,054	54,054	-
Total Income	<u>(54,054)</u>	<u>(54,054)</u>	-
Forecast Position	-	-	-

- 7.2 The service is anticipating that expenditure on repairs and relets will exceed budget due to increased demand. This adverse variance is expected to be offset by savings elsewhere due to reduced loss of rental income due to quicker reletting of houses and projected savings on capital financing costs due to lower than anticipated interest rates (please refer to Appendix B for further details).
- 7.3 The overall impact is a breakeven position against the adjusted HRA 2016/2017 Revenue Budget. A system of perpetual detailed monitoring will continue to take place up to 31 March 2017 with the objective of the HRA achieving a final outturn which is below or in line with the adjusted 2016/2017 HRA Revenue Budget.

8 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of sustainability, strategic environmental assessment, anti-poverty, equality impact assessment and risk management. Details of the risk assessment are included in Appendix D to this report.

There are no major issues.

9 CONSULTATIONS

The Chief Executive, Head of Democratic and Legal Services and all other Chief Officers have been consulted in the calculation of projected outturns included in this report, insofar as they apply to their own individual service.

10 BACKGROUND PAPERS

None.

MARJORY M STEWART
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF CORPORATE SERVICES

01 SEPTEMBER 2016

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL											
2016/2017 REVENUE OUTFURN MONITORING											
PERIOD 1 APRIL 2016 - 31 JULY 2016											
Statement analysing 2016/2017 Projected Revenue Outturn to Budget (Capital Charges, Central Support, Corporate Business Support, Central Buildings & Corporate Property Recharges have been excluded from Departments as these costs are outwith their control).											
		Budget	Total			Worse	Better	Net		Previous	Movement
	Approved	Adjustments	Budget	Adjusted	Forecast	Than	Than	Variance	Notes	Months	since
	Budget	to 31 Jul	Adjustments	Budget	Budget	Budget	Budget	(see Appx B)		Projected	Previous
	£000	£000	£000	£000	£000	£000	£000	£000		£000	Month
General Fund Departments											
Education	121,608			121,608	121,658	50		50	1	0	50
Social Work	97,307			97,307	97,607	300		300	2	0	300
City Development	16,452			16,452	16,502	50		50	3	0	50
Environment	14,834			14,834	14,834					0	
Chief Executive	17,785			17,785	17,785				4	0	
Corporate Services	22,967			22,967	22,967					0	
Other Housing	1,853			1,853	1,853					0	
Supporting People	11,604			11,604	11,604					0	
Scottish Welfare Fund	1,586			1,586	1,586					0	
	305,996	0	0	305,996	306,396	400	0	400		0	400
Capital Financing Costs / Interest on Revenue Balances	25,682			25,682	25,282	(400)		(400)	5	0	(400)
Contingencies:					0						
- General	500			500	500					0	
- Other Cost Pressures	(736)			(736)	(736)					0	
- Unallocated Corporate Savings:					0						
CFTF - Admin / Clerical Review	(367)			(367)	(367)					0	
VER / VR Scheme (Corporate Services)	(117)			(117)	(117)						
Structure Review	(210)			(210)	(210)						
NS Unallocated	(516)			(516)	(516)						
Miscellaneous Income	(1,338)			(1,338)	(1,338)						
Discretionary NDR Relief	147			147	147						
Supplementary Superannuation Costs	2,389			2,389	2,389						
Voluntary Early Retirement / Redundancy (VER/VR) Schemes				0	0						
Tayside Valuation Joint Board	949			949	949						
Total Expenditure	332,379	0	0	332,379	332,379	0	0	0		0	0
Sources of Income											
General Revenue Funding	(214,620)			(214,620)	(214,620)						
Contribution from NNDR Pool	(71,011)			(71,011)	(71,011)						
Council Tax	(46,748)			(46,748)	(46,748)						
Use of Balances -											
Committed Balances c/f				0	0						
Renewal & Repair Fund				0	0						
VER/VR Scheme				0	0						
Equal Pay Costs				0	0						
Other Balances				0	0						
(Surplus)/Deficit for the year	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
Housing Revenue Account	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	

REASONS FOR 2016/2017 CONTROLLABLE PROJECTED REVENUE OUTTURN VARIANCES
(Excludes Capital Charges, Central Support Services & Office Recharges)
AT 31 JULY 2016

<u>Department</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>As at 31 Jul £000</u>	<u>As at 30 Jun £000</u>	<u>Cost Centre</u>	<u>Subjective Analysis</u>	<u>As at 31 Jul £000</u>	<u>As at 30 Jun £000</u>	<u>Reason / Basis of Over/(Under)spend</u>
<u>Education</u>	1	50	n/a	Departmental	Transport	50	n/a	Special Transport overspend in line with last year
<u>Social Work</u>	2	300	n/a	Children & Families	Third Party Payments	300	n/a	Reflects an increase in the number of residential and secure care placements currently being made.
<u>City Development</u>	3	50	n/a	Property	Income	50	n/a	Reflects projected shortfall in external rental income due to the number of properties that are currently vacant.
<u>Chief Executive</u>	4	0	n/a	Corporate Division	Staff	(29)	n/a	Mainly due to excess Budget allocation for staff costs as Improvement Service are now to fund those costs offset by shortfall in budget for Members Services Secretariat transferred back from CBSS along with various regradings and increments.
					Income	29	n/a	£30k budget for advertising on Council digital media - slow progress of the Council procurement process resulting in less councils participating in the scheme in 2015/16. The contract with CAN Digital Solutions has now been cancelled.
<u>Capital Financing Costs</u>	5	(400)	n/a	Corporate	Capital Financing Costs / IORB	(400)	n/a	Reflects projected saving on capital financing costs due to lower than anticipated interest rates.
<u>Housing Revenue Account</u>	6	0	n/a	Repairs & Relets		283	n/a	Reflects higher than anticipated costs for repairs and relet costs due to increased demand
				Rent of Houses		(127)	n/a	Reflects reduced loss of rental income compared to budget due to quicker reletting of houses
				Capital Financing Costs		(156)	n/a	Reflects projected saving on capital financing costs due to lower than anticipated interest rates
<u>Total Overspend</u>		<u>0</u>						

<u>General Fund Departments</u>	<u>Alloc From</u> <u>Contra</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>2015/16 Under</u> <u>spends</u> <u>b/fwd</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>Funding</u> <u>T/Fs</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>Alloc from</u> <u>R&R</u> <u>Fund</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>Alloc from</u> <u>Other</u> <u>Bals</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>T/Fs</u> <u>Between</u> <u>Depts /</u> <u>Contra</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>Council Tax</u> <u>Reduction</u> <u>Scheme</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>Vol Early</u> <u>Retiral/</u> <u>Redund</u> <u>Scheme</u> <u>£000</u>	<u>Dept</u> <u>Totals</u> <u>£000</u>
Education								0	
Social Work								0	
City Development								0	
Environment								0	
Chief Executive								0	
Corporate Services								0	
Other Housing								0	
Supporting People								0	
Scottish Welfare Fund								0	
General Contingency								0	
Unallocated Savings Contingency: CFTF - Admin / Clerical Review								0	
Capital Financing Costs / IORB								0	
Miscellaneous Income								0	
Unallocated Savings Contingency: VER/VR Scheme								0	
Capital Financing Costs / IORB								0	
Miscellaneous Income								0	
Council Tax Income								0	
Other General Fund Balances								0	

Risks - Revenue	Assessment		Risk Management / Comment
	Original	Revised	
<u>General Inflation</u> General price inflation may be greater than anticipated.	Med	Med	Corporate Procurement strategy in place, including access to nationally tendered contracts for goods and services. In addition, fixed price contracts agreed for major commodities i.e. gas and electricity.
<u>Equal Pay Claims</u> A provision may be required for the cost of equal pay claims.	Low	Low	Relatively few cases being taken through the Employment Tribunal process.
<u>Capital Financing Costs</u> Level of interest rates paid will be greater than anticipated.	Low/ Med	Low/ Med	Treasury Mgmt Strategy. Limited exposure to variable rate funding.
<u>Savings</u> Failure to achieve agreed level of savings & efficiencies.	Low/ Med	Low/ Med	General risk mitigation factors (ref para 5.1), in particular, regular monitoring by departments to ensure savings targets are met.
<u>Emerging Cost Pressures</u> The possibility of new cost pressures or responsibilities emerging during the course of the financial year.	Low/ Med	Low/ Med	General risk mitigation factors (ref para 5.1), in particular, regular monitoring by departments to ensure cost pressures are identified early and corrective action can be taken as necessary.
<u>Chargeable income</u> The uncertainty that the level of chargeable income budgeted will be received.	Med/ High	Med/ High	General risk mitigation factors (ref para 5.1), in particular, regular monitoring by departments to ensure any shortfalls are identified as early as possible and corrective action can be taken as necessary.
<u>Council Tax Collection</u> Provision for non-collection of Council Tax (3.2%) may not be adequate.	Low	Low	Provision set takes cognisance of amounts collected for previous financial years. Non-payers subject to established income recovery procedures.
<u>Welfare Reform</u> The changes introduced as part of the welfare reform exercise may increase the risk that budgeted income collection levels are not achieved and that current non-collection provision levels are inadequate.	Low/ Med	Low/ Med	General risk mitigation factors (ref para 5.1), in particular, regular monitoring by departments to ensure any shortfalls are identified as early as possible and corrective action can be taken as necessary. Budget also introduced for discretionary housing payments to assist those affected by these changes.

ITEM No ...3.....

REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE 12 SEPTEMBER 2016

REPORT ON: Introduction of a Salary Sacrifice Car Benefit Scheme

REPORT BY: Executive Director of Corporate Services

REPORT NO: 283-2016

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To seek approval for the introduction of a salary sacrifice scheme for leasing company cars.

2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee approves the proposal to implement a new salary sacrifice scheme and agrees that full salary before sacrifice is still used in calculation of all other pay allowances, other than for pension purposes.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 Potential savings arise from a reduction in Employers National Insurance and Pension contributions and the movement of some casual mileage payments to business mileage. They will be dependent on uptake
- 3.2 Employees will also make savings in National Insurance and Pension contributions as well as tax. However there is a potential impact on their future pension plus they will be taxed on the benefit in kind they are receiving.

4 BACKGROUND

- 4.1 Following a Procurement review a direct award can be made to Tusker a company who will administer this through their hosted website and in line with a Crown Commercial Services framework. A special arrangement has been agreed where payments will be made through an embedded payment card which will generate further rebates to the Council.
- 4.2 The scheme will allow all employees, including teachers, to access a new car with a 3 year lease and full maintenance and insurance cover. Each employee may have an entitlement to a maximum of 2 agreements at any one time. All permanent employees will be eligible to the extent that any salary sacrifice does not take them below the National Living Wage.
- 4.3 Employees will be able to access the scheme through a specific website which Tusker will create for the City Council. This will assess affordability re National Living Wage. All quotes and orders will be generated through this. There will still be an opportunity for HR and the appropriate line manager to review before any order is placed.

- 4.4 A salary sacrifice scheme is a tax efficient vehicle that enables employees to purchase or lease assets through an agreement between HMRC, the employer and a third party provider. Employees can choose to “sacrifice” part of their annual pay in order to fund whatever benefit is included in the salary sacrifice scheme.
- 4.5 This sacrificed pay is deducted from the employee’s gross pay before the calculation of PAYE income tax and National Insurance Contributions (NIC), thereby generating savings for the employee. To comply with HMRC regulations, the employee’s contract of employment must be amended to reflect the new reduced rate of pay. The employee’s hourly rate of pay must not fall below the national minimum wage.
- 4.6 As well as savings for the employee, the employer also benefits through a reduction in employer’s NICs payable on the sacrificed part of pay. It should be noted that any Salary Sacrifice Scheme is subject to HMRC approval and also that any changes in regulations in the future may directly impact on the scheme
- 4.7 This scheme differs from other salary sacrifice schemes within the Council as it does impact on pensionable pay and employees will need to consider that when making any decisions. As the vehicles are classed as company cars any usage will be paid at the business rather than casual mileage rate.
- 4.8 Initially the administration work of notifying payroll of deductions and ensuring monies are reconciled will be shared between the existing Contract Car Hire team and the Procurement Section. This will be reviewed in light of impact on workload.
- 4.9 It is proposed that the existing Contract Car Hire scheme continues in its current format but there may be an opportunity to integrate the two schemes at a later date.
- 4.10 Tusker will produce publicity materials and will host a series of roadshows which will highlight the benefits. They will work in conjunction with Communications Division.
- 4.11 This scheme will also help the city’s carbon footprint as the initial CO2 emissions will be set at 120g/km moving gradually down to 110, which is lower than the current UK average for new cars.
- 4.12 Cars will be provided through local franchises where possible but there will also be the opportunity for all servicing to be delivered locally
- 4.13 Elected members would be eligible to participate in the scheme where they meet the minimum salary requirements and where they have at least 3 years left in office at time of application.

5 **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

- 5.1 This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Risk Management, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty and Equality Impact Assessment. There are no major issues although there are potential environmental improvements noted at 4.11.

6 **CONSULTATION**

- 6.1 The Chief Executive and Head of Democratic and Legal Services have been consulted in the preparation of this report

7 **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

7.1 None.

Marjory M Stewart
Executive Director of Corporate Services

22 August 2016

ITEM No ...4.....

REPORT TO: POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE – 12TH SEPTEMBER, 2016
REPORT ON: SCOTTISH LIVING WAGE ACCREDITATION
REPORT BY: CHIEF EXECUTIVE
REPORT NO: 279-2016

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 This Report confirms Dundee City Council's intention to apply for the Scottish Living Wage accreditation.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that Committee:-
- (a) notes that there are no practical obstacles to securing Scottish Living Wage accreditation for Dundee City Council.
 - (b) instructs Officers to submit an application to achieve accreditation prior to Living Wage Week in November 2016.

3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 Payment of Living Wage to all Council staff and to Tayside Contracts staff who are employed on Council premises is contained within existing revenue budgets. While some Contractors or Sub-Contractors may not currently pay the Living Wage, progress towards this will be set out in "milestones" which form part of the application for accreditation.

There is an overall accreditation fee of £400 which will be contained within existing revenue budgets.

4.0 BACKGROUND

- 4.1 On 9th November, 2015, Committee agreed that an Officers Working Group be created to review the practical steps required to achieve Scottish Living Wage Accreditation (Article IX of the Minute of Meeting and Report No 395-2016 refer). An update on the work of this Group was presented to Committee on 27th June, 2016 (Article V of the Minute of Meeting and Report No 235-2016 refer).
- 4.2 It has been ascertained that there are no practical obstacles to securing accreditation. Work is underway to establish the current position of all Contractors and Sub-Contractors and there is a requirement to work with them to promote and monitor progress towards the payment of a Scottish Living Wage to all employees. The action required to support them will therefore form a significant element of the Council's application for accreditation.
- 4.3 Further requirements around the Council's procurement and community benefit approaches (including the payment of the Scottish Living Wage to Health and Social Care Staff was addressed through the Scottish Government's finance settlement for 2016/17 and as a result, will receive the Living Wage from 1st October, 2016.

5.0 CONSULTATION

- 5.1 The Executive Director of Corporate Services and Head of Democratic and Legal Services have been consulted on, and are in agreement with, the terms of this Report.

6.0 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

- 6.1 This Report has been screened for any implications in respect of sustainability, strategic environmental assessment, anti-poverty, equality impact assessment and risk management. Progressing Living Wage accreditation will make a significant contribution to the anti-poverty objectives set out in the Council's Fairness Strategy.

7.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 7.1 None

DAVID R MARTIN, CHIEF EXECUTIVE

23rd August, 2016