REPORT TO: Council Improvement & Efficiency Sub Committee - 30 March 2010

REPORT ON: Best Value Working Group - Mobile/Flexible Working

REPORT BY: Head of Personnel

**REPORT NO: 201-2010** 

#### 1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 To outline the findings of the Best Value Group on Mobile/Flexible Working, and recommend work style change as an efficiency opportunity for the Council, with proposals on how it should be taken forward.

#### 2 **RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that:-

- 2.1 accommodation/relocation working groups for each of Dundee House and the former Grove Academy be set up immediately with representatives from all of the departments affected. Their remit would be to investigate all work style change and shared facilities efficiency opportunities in respect of the new/refurbished buildings and, building on the work style data gathered by the Best Value Group, produce Action Plans accordingly;
- 2.2 a longer term corporate project team for work style change, ideally with a full time project manager supported by process analysts, be established with a remit from the Council's Improvement and Efficiency Board to investigate, make recommendations and oversee the implementation of work style change efficiency opportunities across all services and premises of the Council;
- 2.3 the Council adopts, as a working model, a minimum average desk to staff ratio of 8:10 in Dundee House, the former Grove Academy and all new/refurbished buildings in future (subject to consultation with departments affected);
- 2.4 departments continue to review and amend their figures for the four work style types and current desk to staff ratios. Regular updates of these figures be reported to the Council's management team.
- 2.5 City Development and Architects Departments, in conjunction with the proposed project team, develop new models for work space operation for application in new/refurbished buildings;
- 2.6 City Development Department be remitted to oversee and co-ordinate rationalisation of freed up space in Council buildings, resulting from work style change projects;
- 2.7 seminars/workshops be run for appropriate managers to promote the potential benefits to the Council of all aspects of work style change.

#### 3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 Costs of establishing in-house work style change teams should be met from existing departmental budgets. If, in future, employment of external consultants is deemed beneficial to progress specific items then costs will be incurred.

#### 4 MAIN TEXT

#### 4.1 Background

During 2008 the Council undertook an Efficiency Diagnostic project. This was a Scottish Government sponsored initiative with the intention of identifying opportunities for possible efficiency improvements within Councils. Dundee City Council's final report identified work style change (see Appendix 1 which defines typical work styles) as one area of opportunity for potential efficiency improvement.

A number of other Councils who participated in the Efficiency Diagnostic also identified this topic as having efficiency opportunities for them (eg Aberdeen City, Aberdeenshire, Dumfries and Galloway, Fife, Highland, Moray, Perth and Kinross, South Lanarkshire, West Lothian). They are now actively pursuing it with a view to achieving long term efficiency savings in conjunction with amending the way services are delivered to better suit the customer.

The Improvement Service is interested in this subject and is keen to work with Councils on shared solutions.

NOMAD Scotland is a voluntary group of local authority representatives who have come together to assist each other and share information on mobile working solutions for Local Government. It ran mobile and flexible working events on 5 March and 1st October 2009, which Dundee City Council attended. The presentations were thought provoking and suggested various ways of achieving efficiencies and improving services to customers. NOMAD Scotland has now made work style change implementation its focus for the coming year including specific technology solutions and culture change issues.

The Government's position on work style change is to promote its adoption by public sector employers as indicated in the Office of Government Commerce publications 'Working without walls' and 'Working beyond walls'. These documents can be viewed at: <a href="http://www.ogc.gov.uk/documents/cp0039">http://www.ogc.gov.uk/documents/cp0039</a> working without walls.pdf
<a href="http://www.ogc.gov.uk/documents/workingbeyondwalls.pdf">http://www.ogc.gov.uk/documents/workingbeyondwalls.pdf</a>

The former document states, "demographic and social trends are creating a more diverse, agile and demanding workforce, where work-life balance concerns and career aspirations are light years away from those that existed when the civil service was founded. Developments in e-business and flexible working are creating new roles for, and a new emphasis on, the office workplace. The Lyons Review and Sir Peter Gershon's Efficiency Review of 2004, are challenging conventional notions about the location of government work and demanding radically more efficient ways to do government business. Together these reviews challenge the traditional approach and offer an opportunity for a fresh look at how and where government work is done. The flexibility and innovation being seen today and the experiences and lessons learnt, will be key to the successful evolution of the government workplace in responding to these challenges."

In the latter document, Sir Gus O' Donnell (Cabinet secretary and Head of the Home Civil Service) states, "Work is what you do, not a place you go. The next generation of workforce will know that and be ready and able to work anywhere. Work has migrated beyond the conventional boundaries of time and space into a wider environment and those who manage the government estate need to be prepared. The office is rapidly becoming just one of a network of workplace options, and for many people their work and personal lives are becoming more integrated. Technology now allows people to communicate virtually anywhere in many different ways, and members of the next generation are learning from birth to use this technology as second nature. They are already highly mobile, highly connected and comfortable mixing the real and virtual worlds.

This is a huge challenge but also an opportunity for rethinking the government estate as a strategic whole. By adopting distributed workplace networks, linked through technology, we can move the work closer to the citizens and deliver services more directly and immediately, we can allow people to work closer to where they live and to balance work, personal and community commitments more flexibly, we can enable people to work together without actually having to be together so reducing travel. By using workspace more intensively and wisely we can reduce our use of buildings and thus our impact on the environment."

Dundee City Council's Improvement and Efficiency Board agreed that work style change opportunities should be explored further via a best value review. A short life working group was established with a remit to further investigate where mobile and flexible solutions could be implemented throughout the Council (see Appendix 2), and had its first meeting on 13 January 2009.

#### 4.2 **Current Position**

The Council has established policies for flexible and home working, which benefit both worker and Council, recognising individuals' work/life commitments and helping with recruitment and retention.

More flexible staff working hours have been used by the Social Work Department in the recent past to attract and retain qualified staff in response to market scarcity.

More recently, a number of work style change pilots have been pursued by Dundee City Council departments, ie City Development, Dundee Contracts, Finance Revenues.

Current practice within Council buildings is that staff have recognised work stations/offices. Employees and supervisors are familiar and comfortable with this type of environment and any move away from it will require a significant culture change.

#### 4.3 IT Infrastructure

Effective IT platforms and systems are essential to support the day to day work of the Council and ensure the efficient transfer and recording of essential business information. In Dundee City Council, the Council-wide IT infrastructure has been developed to facilitate mobile, home and flexible working. Supporting the development of these work styles has been a fundamental design consideration. All systems and services are delivered in a standardised, centralised, secure manner. They can support mobile devices and devices located in the home, or at any location with access to internet services.

Dundee City Council's IT infrastructure is ideally placed to respond to business change in general and in particular at this time to facilitate work style change.

#### 4.4 Pilots Recently Undertaken Within the Council

Departments of the Council have undertaken, or are in the process of undertaking, experiments related to work style change. These have been largely successful and, along with information from external case studies, may be used to promote the topic further within the Council.

#### 4.4.1 Finance Revenues

Finance Revenues has been running a pilot of home working within its Accounts and Benefits team since July 2006. Approximately 25% of the team of 65 are now homeworking. The pilot was initiated by management using volunteers.

The main benefits gained have been:-

- Average increase in output 50%;
- Reduction in sickness levels, on average 60%;
- Better work life balance for participants;
- Much reduced travel requirements for participants (also reduces carbon footprint/ vehicle congestion);
- More relaxed working environment for participants;
- Financial savings for participants, eg bus/train fares, car costs;
- Reduced floor space requirement in office;
- Flexibility in working hours for homeworking staff compared to office based staff.

Although there is a reduction in floor space usage, there is not a saving if remaining staff still occupy the whole floor. However, Revenues took the opportunity to move its training suite from City House to the released space in Tayside House. This provided a saving of £15,000 in financial year 2008/2009. A further saving will come when moving to Dundee House in that there will be less staff requiring accommodation in the new building. There was some additional cost with the initial purchase of table type desks for the homeworking staff, but all other equipment was transferred from the existing office environment. The department supplied mobile phones (under the Council's contract) for staff business phone calls which has assisted in reducing costs.

Management is now developing plans to transfer Recovery Officers (6 staff) to homeworking. It also intends to transfer Visiting Officers (8 staff) to mobile working, starting/finishing from their homes.

#### 4.4.2 City Development

City Development has taken its scheduled move to Dundee House as an opportunity to change work styles. The target for staff numbers to be accommodated in the new building has been set at a minimum of 10% less than the current level of approximately 256 posts for the department, ie c. 230 workstations for 256 employees.

The department has completed a successful pilot of flexible working which has been running since 2007 with 12 staff participating. It is a variation of home working with staff alternating between full time home working and part time home working. There has been no formal measure of the effect on productivity, but Team Leaders have given positive feedback. The pilot was initiated by management using volunteers and will now be made permanent.

The department is now planning to extend the pilot further. Flexible/mobile working for Building Standards Officers and Roads Supervisors/ Inspectors (based at Clepington Road) is under consideration, as is the establishment of staff to desk ratios for day to day operational purposes and the introduction of 'hot desking'.

'Hot desks' are purpose built work stations which enable mobile/flexible staff to connect to the corporate systems, etc, to perform work related tasks. 'Hot desks' are not allocated to specific individuals and can be incorporated into 'touch down' areas located at sites around the Council's geographic area, to support mobile/flexible workers and reduce the need for return travel to main offices. Staff would use these mainly as occasional short stay work areas to allow the transfer of information, work schedules, etc.

#### 4.4.3 <u>Dundee Contract Services</u>

Dundee Contract Services is currently undertaking a pilot of cell phone technology to provide jobs information and instructions from HQ to trades staff throughout the day. This allows trades staff to start and finish from home, to update back office systems in real time and contact clients prior to visits. Also, to advise HQ of any issues arising on site and deal with emergency jobs quickly as sent to the closest vehicle to the customer.

The pilot involves some twenty operatives and is being run in conjunction with IT. The operatives receive the repairs details via the phone display screen, they are then able to update the in-house system with progress of the repair including completion details. Some of the operatives have adapted to the new technology better than others. In general, the move has been well received and there is now evidence of demand for the use of the technology by other trades staff.

There have been some problems with signal reception in the City and this situation is being monitored.

The main benefits for the department are:-

- The in-house system will be updated online improving information and giving increased process efficiency;
- The tradesperson does not have to travel back and forth to the depot to receive instruction; this allows them more time to spend on front line service delivery;
- A reduction in fuel costs:
- A reduction in paperwork electronic timesheets can be generated;
- Improved security for lone workers who now have phone contact at all times;
- The tradesperson is able to call ahead to the tenant if needed and alert them to their arrival. This may lead to a reduction in abortive calls.

Dundee Contract Services will consider extending the project after a period of monitoring and review. Financial and non financial savings are anticipated but have not been fully evaluated.

#### 4.4.4 Housing Department

The work of the Best Value (BV) Working group prompted the Housing Department to look again at the opportunities for work style change within the department and a possible reduction in the number of staff to be accommodated in Dundee House.

Housing has focused on the sections moving to the new building and is considering experiments in home, flexible and mobile working in the Housing Investment Unit (approximately 15 staff). It is intended that Project Officers/Assistants will use hand held devices to allow more mobile operations, potentially mixed with working from home for periods of the week. This would reduce the number of workstations required in offices. Monitoring and data preparation staff may be able to work from home for periods of the week and thus require fewer work stations within Dundee House.

Experiments are at an early stage, with staff showing enthusiasm for such changes. If successful, other sections such as Private Sector Services and Finance and Corporate Services could follow.

#### 4.5 Work Style Change in other Councils

Contact was made with a number of Councils who are pursuing flexible/mobile working, ie Aberdeenshire, Aberdeen City, Argyll and Bute, Fife, Moray, Perth and Kinross, South Lanarkshire, West Lothian. Aberdeenshire and Fife now have representatives from their change teams in key roles on NOMAD Scotland. These Councils have identified opportunities resulting from work style changes. The two main channels of efficiency gain are productivity improvement (including reduced absence rates) and asset savings (eg more efficient use of buildings, reduced office furniture/equipment costs, reduced maintenance costs, reduced energy consumption). From information gathered, average efficiency gain predictions are 12-14%. Mobile working coupled with whole business process redesign is seen as having great potential for efficiencies.

All councils contacted had identified that virtually every worker who works from an office has a desk, even where the worker is out of the office for most of the day. Indeed, some staff have desks or work areas at more than one location. Information gathered to date suggests that the position is similar in Dundee. Work done by other councils indicates an anticipated average desk to staff ratio target for a building being in the order of 8 desks to 10 staff.

In Moray Council, target desk to staff ratios currently being used are:-

Fixed - 1/1; Flexible - 8/10; Mobile - 5/10; Home - 2/10

Where external consultants are involved, they tend to regard such estimates as conservative.

Councils are investigating the introduction of 'hot desking' into Council premises as well as 'touch down' areas that would be located at specific sites around the Council's geographic area, to support mobile/flexible workers and reduce the need to return to main offices. A number of Councils (eg Aberdeenshire, Fife, Perth and Kinross, Moray) have undertaken buildings utilisation surveys. On average, office/room utilisation was approximately 50% which tends to support the suggestions that a ratio of 8 desks to 10 staff may well be conservative.

More effective work space utilisation is not only the rationalisation of work stations but also the optimal use of work areas such as meeting/training rooms. Currently, such resources tend to be departmental specific. In the future, all such areas could be bookable by any member or group of staff of the Council for any work related event.

Some Councils have undertaken 'day in the life' studies of staff groups. In some cases field operatives are only able to spend a total of approximately 90 minutes per day face to face with customers because of the existing systems/processes in operation. It is believed that client contacts could be improved by redesigning processes and focusing on mobile/flexible working opportunities.

Councils that cover a wider geographic area than Dundee (eg Aberdeenshire, Fife, Moray) have identified additional efficiency opportunities from rationalisation of existing Council buildings where services currently operate their own offices throughout a geographic area). This can be achieved from work style change coupled with process improvement. The result is an overall reduction in space requirements enabling a number of departments and partner agencies to share fewer buildings freeing others for alternative uses or sale. Even if a building can only be 'mothballed' there may be significant savings in running costs.

All Councils contacted had undertaken a categorisation exercise of Council posts (in most cases assisted by an outside consultant such as BT) focusing on their future work style potential. Commonly, four categories resulted, ie Fixed worker, Flexible worker, Mobile worker, Home worker (see Appendix 1). This information has been used as a basis for Councils to begin to identify and prioritise potential groups where cost/benefits estimates of work style change can be undertaken and change plans developed for approval.

An example from other authorities was environmental health officers using hand held devices to capture data and compile reports while on-site with customers. The data could be transmitted direct to/from main office systems from the officer's mobile unit. Officers would not require to visit the office to prepare for the day's visits, nor return to office to update files, etc. They could start and finish at home and with a link to Council systems, they could undertake additional items from there, leave messages/pictures to update colleagues and agree any team meeting time/place with their supervisor.

Councils are investigating the cost of the typical office worker to allow comparisons with costs of other work styles (eg home working). In the 'Working Beyond Walls' publication, it states 'When the annual cost of providing an office workplace can exceed the purchase price of a small car, the issue of value for money and stakeholder choice jumps sharply into focus. As issues of economy and design as well as environmental sustainability loom larger, alternatives to the traditional office with a dedicated desk for everyone will look increasingly attractive'.

The Care Commission has introduced work style change and agreed to make a presentation to the BV Working Group. The Commission was set up in 2002 to regulate all adult, child and independent health care services in Scotland. It regulates 15,000 services and employs 582 staff. The Commission operates a policy of flexible/mobile working for inspectorate staff and flexible working for office staff. It developed flexible working practises early on in their new office building in Dundee. Its Human Resources Manager advised the BV Working Group that:-

- The cost of an office based worker to the business is £5,500 compared to £3,000 for home based workers (in discussions with councils, one had calculated that their cost per office based worker was £4,000; an accurate figure for Dundee is not currently available);
- In a recent survey, 97% of home workers were happy with the new style of employment and did not want to change;
- Reduced absence rates (reduced to 3.2% from 5.1%);
- Increased productivity;
- Reduced travel:
- Reduced staff turnover.

Aberdeenshire, Fife, Moray and South Lanarkshire have either set up dedicated change teams to take forward efficiency projects or are in the process of doing this. Other Councils have indicated that they may do the same to ensure that projects are structured and progressed to a project plan. Project managers and process analysts are key personnel being considered for teams.

#### 4.6 **Dundee City Council - Information Gathered**

With a view to establishing the opportunity potential for Dundee City Council, the BV Working Group asked departments to provide high level estimates of how posts could be allocated over the four work style types (Appendices 1 and 3). Information gathered gave a total staff number of 5,633 (teaching and schools support staff were excluded from the survey).

Initial projections are that:-

44% of staff could work Fixed; 29% of staff could work Mobile; 24% of staff could work Flexible; 2% of staff could work Home.

This represents significant opportunities for the Council in work style change and the related benefits that accrue. Moreover, it should be borne in mind that the information gained resulted from first estimates by departments and the projections may well be conservative. With ongoing developments in information technology, home working could increase and fixed working could decrease. Councils such as Aberdeenshire, Fife, Moray, South Lanarkshire have used similar information as a starting point to prioritise further investigations into the potential efficiency opportunities of specific groups and the costs involved to realise these savings.

#### 4.6.1 Larger Groups

In general, the larger the post group the greater the potential for economies of scale from efficiency savings in processes and office space. Such groups must be fully considered by departments as this will assist in identifying and prioritising further work to be done on realising the benefits available from work style change.

#### 4.7 New Council Buildings - Dundee House and Former Grove Academy

Work style change could play an important part in the moves to the new Council Headquarters building (Dundee House) and the refurbished Grove Academy building. Both these events are scheduled for 2011. Currently, discussions are ongoing into how to accommodate existing staff numbers into these buildings. Due to the tight timescales for Dundee House and Grove, potential gains must be determined swiftly and consideration given to all teams/work groups intended to be located there, whether large or small. This would also apply to departments that are not scheduled for the above buildings, though the timescales could be less urgent.

Consideration should be given to the effect of staff holidays and absence on work station utilisation. For example, 750 office based staff would have approximately 30,900 non working days per year from holidays and sickness. This would equate to approximately 119 full time staff not in the workplace over the year.

It is important that departments sharing floors of the same building liaise with each other on how they can share resources and eliminate duplication (eg two reception areas on same floor). It may also be desirable to have one site in each building for specific tasks (eg reception, mail). Meeting and training facilities should be for the use of all departments and managed via an electronic booking system. There is still time for departments to reconsider the way in which staff undertake their jobs (work styles) to bring reductions in the numbers of staff and related office furniture to be accommodated in new buildings. Mobile/flexible workers could work from remote locations rather than having dedicated work stations within an HQ building. Employees processing information all day in an office setting could do the same work on line from home. Further efficiencies should result from work styles being supported by streamlined processes and new technology systems (eg Corporate electronic Records and Document Management System).

#### 4.8 Options for taking work style change opportunities forward

There are three main options available to move work style change opportunities forward within the Council as a whole:-

## 4.8.1 <u>Allow departments to explore the matter relative to their operation and proceed at their own pace.</u>

In this option departments progress in line with their priorities. However, development would be piecemeal and would not facilitate corporate change. Departments might be too close to certain processes. Duplication of resource time from departments such as IT and Personnel could result. There would be minimal overall programme management.

This option will not work for the Dundee House and Grove projects, where timescales are critical and co-ordination is essential.

4.8.2 <u>Establish a Corporate project team for work style change within the Council that would be given an overall remit from the Council's Improvement and Efficiency Board.</u>

The team would have a core membership from Personnel, IT, City Development and Finance departments and include representatives from other departments as appropriate for development of opportunity projects. The team would work with departments to identify and prioritise opportunities to be taken forward into an overall programme for the Council. It would also be involved in any corporate culture change initiatives related to work style change. Departments would be responsible for building business cases and project plans for opportunities to be taken forward, and the Work Style Change team would assist them in this. This would bring a common focus and methodology to projects and the development of an agreed corporate programme with a projected timescale with costs linked to a structured culture change programme.

As this would be a significant programme for the Council, similar to the current Corporate electronic Records and Document Management System (CeRDMS) project, a full time project manager would be appropriate. This is in line with other authorities' approaches and without this type of post it is likely that progress could be compromised. The use of outside consultants might be appropriate, subject to approval by the Council Improvement and Efficiency Board.

4.8.3 Appoint an outside consultancy company to undertake a work change project for the Council. The consultancy would report to the Council's Improvement and Efficiency Board and undertake the same function as 2 above. The consultancy would bring its expertise in the subject and knowledge of leading practises in other organisations. It is likely that radical and challenging options would be offered to the Council.

Other local authorities (eg Aberdeenshire, Fife, South Lanarkshire, West Lothian) have used consultants such as BT for the initial phases of their investigations but have not delegated whole projects to consultants. Cost constraints are part of these decisions.

Costs of option 3 have not been investigated but are likely to be significant. This option would still require significant staff time involvement as consultants need to work intensively with clients' staff to develop proposals and progress them to implementation. The Council would need to be fully committed to driving both culture change and work change programmes to an agreed timescale with an outside company to avoid further costs arising. However, it is likely that initial consultancy costs would rise as unforeseen elements/opportunities are discovered during the programme.

It is considered that option 4.8.2 is the most appropriate way for the Council to progress this topic in the future. It allows focus and cost control but with the ability to engage consultants for key items if required.

#### 4.9 **Culture Change**

In the current financial climate, and the resulting pressures being experienced by councils, every efficiency opportunity must be pursued. The transformation process of work style changes and how the Council utilises and operates its buildings in the future would require a change in culture. Some people are slower than others to embrace change. The Council would require to break down barriers and it is important that a well developed communications and education strategy be put in place to support the change programme.

Trade unions should be consulted at an early stage and kept informed of proposed developments and any effects on employees.

#### 4.10 Conclusions

The two main channels of efficiency gain from work style change are productivity improvement (including reduced absence rates) and asset savings (e.g. reduced office furniture/equipment, reduced office space/maintenance, reduced energy consumption). It is also likely that work style change and improved work/life balance would act as an incentive in recruitment and retention of staff.

Other benefits are to staff (work/life balance, motivation, reduced distractions) to customers (better service) and to citizens and the environment (reduced Council carbon footprint and traffic congestion).

The evidence available to date supports reduced absence rates and improved productivity for home workers in comparison to office workers. It is reasonable to expect that reduced absence rates would result from other types of work style change due to greater autonomy and control by individuals.

There are significant opportunities for the Council in work style change and in moving from 1:1 desk/staff ratios to a figure that is in line with how the Council will operate in the future. Potentially, 56% of staff (and this may be a conservative figure) do not require to be fixed workers.

The greatest potential is in efficiency gains from productivity improvements. If 13% (from efficiency diagnostic) of the Council's workforce (excluding teachers and support staff) could achieve a 12% increase in productivity from work style change, it would be the equivalent of 88 full time posts to the authority. At an average post cost of £25,324 (from efficiency diagnostic) this equates to £2.2M equivalent. (NB This is a high level estimate and efficiency savings will require initial investment to change processes. BT has indicated in surveys for other councils that this investment could be up to two thirds of the estimated savings.)

There is a requirement to finalise staff **numbers for Dundee House by November 2009** and departments should consider what possible savings in accommodation requirements could be achieved from work style change by them and plan how to implement such changes before moving to Dundee House.

Departments that have a number of offices within Dundee may be able to release work space from staff undergoing work style change and as a result of new electronic records management systems. It may then be possible to rationalise office accommodation across departments and/or incorporate 'drop in' sites throughout the City to support mobile and flexible working initiatives as they are introduced. Such sites would be corporate resources for use by any Council staff working mobile/flexible work styles and reduce the need for staff to return to specific main offices.

As work progresses on work style change projects and relocating to Dundee House, it should be possible to establish an accurate Dundee City Council cost for a typical office based worker and a home based worker for use by the Council in future work style decisions related to office developments. The integration of hot desking, touch down areas, fixed desking and bookable rooms/spaces can be developed into new working environment templates for the Council.

A programme of work style change brings with it significant culture change issues for the Council and the Personnel Department will have an important role in developing and communicating any policy changes, including consultation with employees and trade unions, that will be required during the implementation of such a programme.

#### 4.11 **Proposals**

The Council should aim for an average desk to staff ratio of 8:10 in all new buildings as a minimum. This should be used for the Dundee House and Grove projects that are currently underway (subject to consultation and more detailed work with departments affected).

Some posts are already working flexible/mobile (eg clerk of works, car parking operatives). The Council should consider whether all such postholders need to have a work station within a building given the reduced time requirement for staff to be in offices. Furthermore, reviews of current operating processes and supporting technology should be undertaken to establish whether more efficient working practices are achievable. When considering work station requirements for any office, account must be taken of part time employees, job shares, shift workers, holiday and absence levels, etc.

The work style data gathered by the best value review team should be used as the basis for further focused investigations into potential efficiencies to the Council from work style changes. More detailed cost/benefit projections being developed to allow the Council's Improvement and Efficiency Board to determine a prioritised project list.

As changes to structures have occurred since the work style data was gathered, and will continue to happen, departments should review and update their figures on a regular basis for the four work style types and their desk to staff ratios.

Regular reporting of progress on work style change should be undertaken by all departments. This could be in the form of a quarterly report to the Council's Management Team. The report would show for current and previous periods;

- Department average desk to staff ratio
- Department desk to staff ratios by work style type (Fixed, Flexible, Mobile, Home)
- Department projected staff numbers per work style type (Fixed, Flexible, Mobile, Home)

To bring the benefits of work style change to the Dundee House and Grove projects the departments involved must use their work style data from the Best Value exercise to focus on post groups that can change their work styles. They should also revisit current flexible/mobile groups to identify opportunities to improve processes and minimise the need for returns to main offices (see Appendix 5).

Accommodation/relocation working groups for Dundee House and Grove should be set up immediately with representatives from each department moving into them. These teams should investigate all work style change and shared facilities efficiency opportunities that will impact on the new buildings. Each team should establish an action plan with measurable benefits and paths to delivery.

To ensure that opportunities beyond Dundee House and Grove are pursued a corporate project team for work style change should be established within the Council. It should be given an overall remit from the Council's Improvement and Efficiency Board. Part of this remit should be to revisit the work styles analysis done so far and develop this further, eg establish average staff to desk ratios for specific work style types (eg Mobile, Home, Flexible). The team would ideally have a full time project manager supported by process analysts and a core membership from Personnel, IT, City Development and Finance departments and include representatives from other departments as appropriate for development of opportunity projects.

City Development Department and Architects Department, with input from the proposed project team, should develop a new model for work space operation to be used for office developments in the future to inform decision makers within departments for any work place changes they may be considering. This model would incorporate hot desking, multifunction (bookable) rooms/spaces, touch down sites, etc.

The City Development Department should be tasked to oversee and co-ordinate rationalisation of all freed space in Council buildings or other leased/rented premises from work style change projects. This should be part of an ongoing programme.

A workshop event designed for managers to promote the potential benefits to the Council of all aspects of work style change should be arranged. (This could be run in conjunction with an outside consultancy if private sector experiences/solutions were deemed desirable.)

#### 5 **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

5.1 This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. There are no major issues.

#### 6 CONSULTATIONS

6.1 Members of the Best Value Review Group have been consulted on the contents of this report.

#### 7 BACKGROUND PAPERS

7.1 None.

I M M Martin Head of Personnel

30 March 2010

#### Fixed:

Due to work requirements (eg face to face interactions, interdependence of information used is too difficult to allow another work style) must be based in one physical work area within organisation

Works full time at single place of employment (ie spends more than 90% of time in the office or establishment)

Has a desk and/or PC workstation allocated specifically to them

Requires access to corporate systems to perform role

No mobile requirement (eg to work from home/out of office)

Fixed telephone extension, post point

Examples could be: Sheltered Housing Warden, Council Officers, Schools Tech. Support, Community Centre Worker, Workshop Staff, Garage Attendants, Nursery Nurse, Classroom Assistant, Counter staff (primarily payments receipt).

#### Flexible:

Requires access to corporate systems to perform role in the office

Requires limited access to corporate systems to perform role in the field (eg mail, calendar)

No requirement to have a fixed desk in a specific office

Assigned a building as their 'base location' - post point

Has to be office based for more than 50% of their time

Requirement to work in multiple council offices

Occasionally works at home or remotely (1 or 2 days a week)

Flexible working hours do not create issues with clients/workloads

Examples could be: Project Managers, Certain Internal Consultancy staff, IT staff, Housing Officers, HR staff, certain Social Work staff.

#### PTO

#### Mobile:

Requires access to corporate systems to perform role in the office

Requires full access to corporate systems and business applications to perform role in the field (eg mail, calendar, case work)

No requirement to have a fixed desk in a specific office

Assigned a building as their 'base location' - post point

Could be office based for less than 50% of their time

Requirement to work in multiple Council offices/sites

Predominately works away from the office (eg 3 days a week)

Examples could be: EHTS Officers, Social Care staff, Trading Standards Parking Attendants, District Housing Officers, certain IT staff (eg schools), Architectural staff, "trades" staff, certain Revenues staff, Community Care staff, Occupational Therapists

#### Home:

Could work full time at home (ie could spend more than 90% of time at home)

Has a Desk and PC workstation allocated specifically to them

Requires access to corporate systems to perform role

No mobile requirement - eg to work in the field

Fixed telephone extension, post point or could use mobile phone for business contacts

Examples could be: Policy Officers, Finance Revenues staff, WP staff, Housing Repairs staff.

#### **BEST VALUE REVIEW PROGRAMME**

Appendix 2

#### **TERMS OF REFERENCE PAPER**

REVIEW TOPIC	Mobile and Flexible Working opportunities within Dundee City Council
LEAD OFFICER	lain Martin

## 1. Scope of the Review

Through the Diagnostic Pathway project, it has been identified that the Council is keen to improve practices regarding flexible and mobile working. There is currently a home working initiative underway within Dundee City Council, on a small scale within a specific area. The current initiative has proved successful. Other pilots on mobile working have also proved successful and started the learning process within departments.

There are currently considerations being made around future office space and accommodation at alternative locations, as a result of the current Council premises having reached their maximum capacity/ usage and therefore considerations that are currently being made around a move to Dundee House.

This review will further investigate where mobile and flexible working solutions could be implemented throughout the Council. The potential benefits accruing to the Council, including reduction in office space requirements/redevelopment in the future. The review will make recommendations for future development of mobile and flexible working solutions within the Council incorporating timescales, cost implications and the necessary change management processes that will be required.

## 2. Objectives

This project will seek to identify the extent to which mobile and flexible working arrangements can be introduced within the Council with a view to increasing efficiency in the delivery of core council services and facilitating the rationalisation of Council office accommodation to deliver long term financial benefits.

The project will seek to define a future vision (Target Operating Model) for the Council. This vision is of a workforce which has the optimal mix of mobile, flexible and office working to maximise customer service and minimise property costs to the Council. It will focus on an overall approach, in terms of people, technology and the changing office environment.

It will make recommendations on how to create a flexible and supportive working environment for all employees, which optimises the use of Council operational assets, ensuring that technology supports service delivery in an efficient and secure manner and minimises work related travel, as appropriate. It will consider traditional staff/desk ratios within the Council and the opportunity for change.

Also how best to implement facilities such as "hot desking" and "touch-down" centres into working environments and into future accommodation strategies, calculations and developments.

It will undertake an analysis of the potential benefit streams within the Council and a cost/benefit analysis of these to determine the future strategy for the Council for introduction of a flexible and/or mobile working approach to daily working.

## Appendix 2

3.	Group Membership
	lain Martin - Chair
	Mike Keddie (Architects)
	Colin Craig (Econ. Development)
	Janet Robertson (Education)
	John Martin (Dundee Contracts)
	Ian Gillanders (Finance)
	Hazel Smith (Housing)
	Ged Bell (IT)
	Merrill Smith (Leisure and Recreation)
	Allison Adamson (Personnel)
	David Brown (Personnel) - Review Management
	Ron Tinley (Planning and Transport)
	Ray Wilson (Social Work)
	Frank Feechan (Support Services)
	First meeting will consider if further representatives should be on group

4	Consultation Process – Who to Consult and How

5	Schedule for Completing the Review					
	Pre planning	By 9 January 2009				
	Milestone Meeting 1 (Planning) Investigation Milestone Meeting 2 (Define Issue) Generate Options/Ideas Milestone Meeting 3 (Select Option) Implementation Milestone Meeting 4 (Report) Evaluation	13 January 2009				

Department: Section:

Appendix 3

Fixed Work Style		Flexible Work Style			Mobile Work Style					
Post Designation	No. Staff	Relocating to	No. staff relocating	Post Designation	No. Staff	Relocating to	No. staff relocating	Post Designation	No. Staff	Relocatin
			,							

# Summary of work style information Received to 22 June 2009 All Departments having submitted information

Department	Flexible	Mobile	Home	Fixed	Grand
	(Total)	(Total)	(Total)	(Total)	Total
Corporate Planning (Incl.C. E.)	4.0	8.0	2.0	23.0	37
Dundee Contract Services	43.0	437.0	5.0	53.0	538
Economic Development	12.0	6.0	1.0	75.0	94
Education	10.0	118.0	7.0	82.0	217
Finance ( General)	7.0	0.0	12.5	84.5	104
Finance (Revenues)	0.0	6.5	65.0	170.5	242
Housing	122.0	29.0	26.0	249.0	426
IT	10.5	7.0	5.0	66.5	89
Leisure & Communities	359.0	40.0	0.0	436.0	835
Personnel	34.7	3.0	0.0	10.7	48.4
Planning & Transportation	112.0	38.0	3.0	49.0	202
Social Work	569.0	596.0	1.0	911.0	2077
Support Services - Architects	0.0	28.0	0.0	80.0	108
Support Services - Committee Servs	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	7
Support Services - EHTS	26.0	44.0	0.0	8.0	78
Support Services - General Services	0.0	0.0	0.0	18.0	18
Support Services - Legal	33.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	33
Support Services - Office Services	15.0	0.0	0.0	66.0	81
Support Services - Scientific Services	3.0	0.0	0.0	18.7	21.7
Waste Management	5.0	270.0	12.0	90.0	377
Totals	1365.2	1630.5	139.5	2497.9	5633.1
As % of Grand Total	24%	29%	2%	44%	100%
Department	Flexible	Mobile	Home	Fixed	Total
	(%)	(%)	(%)	(%)	(%)
	_				
Corporate Planning (Incl.C. E.)	10.8	21.6	- A		
Dundee Contract Services		21.6	5.4	62.2	100
Economic Dovolonment	8.0	81.2	0.9	9.9	100 100
Economic Development	12.8		0.9 1.1	9.9 79.8	100 100
Education	12.8 4.6	81.2 6.4 54.4	0.9 1.1 3.2	9.9 79.8 37.8	100 100 100
Education Finance ( General)	12.8 4.6 6.7	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3	100 100 100 100
Education	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7	0.9 1.1 3.2	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5	100 100 100
Education Finance ( General)	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5	100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues)	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5	100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5	100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7	100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2	100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4 27.4	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8 28.7	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0 1.5	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3 43.9	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work Support Services - Architects	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4 27.4 0.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8 28.7 25.9	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0 1.5 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3 43.9 74.1	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work Support Services - Architects Support Services - Committee Servs	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4 27.4 0.0 0.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8 28.7 25.9	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0 1.5 0.0 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3 43.9 74.1 100.0	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work Support Services - Architects Support Services - Committee Servs Support Services - EHTS	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4 27.4 0.0 0.0 33.3	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8 28.7 25.9 0.0 56.4	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0 1.5 0.0 0.0 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3 43.9 74.1 100.0	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work Support Services - Architects Support Services - EHTS Support Services - General Services	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4 27.4 0.0 0.0 33.3 0.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8 28.7 25.9 0.0 56.4 0.0	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0 1.5 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3 43.9 74.1 100.0 10.3 100.0	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100
Education Finance ( General) Finance (Revenues) Housing IT Leisure & Communities Personnel Planning & Transportation Social Work Support Services - Architects Support Services - Committee Servs Support Services - EHTS Support Services - General Services Support Services - Legal	12.8 4.6 6.7 0.0 28.6 11.8 43.0 71.7 55.4 27.4 0.0 0.0 33.3 0.0 100.0	81.2 6.4 54.4 0.0 2.7 6.8 7.9 4.8 6.2 18.8 28.7 25.9 0.0 56.4 0.0	0.9 1.1 3.2 12.0 26.9 6.1 5.6 0.0 0.0 1.5 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0	9.9 79.8 37.8 81.3 70.5 58.5 74.7 52.2 22.1 24.3 43.9 74.1 100.0 10.3 100.0 0.0	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100

Departments moving to Dundee Hse - as at 220609

Appendix 5

Revenues may not achieve this total figure for the work style

	Fixed Work Style	Flexible Work Style	Mobile Work Style	Home Work Style
Department	No. Staff	No. Staff	No. Staff	No. Staff
CE (IT)	8	0	0	0
City Development (ED)	73	12	6	1
City Development (PT)	37	108	18	3
Education	54	0	18	3
Finance (General)	84.5	7	0	12.5
Finance (Revenues)	170.5	0	6.5	65
	_	_	_	_
Housing (HDMT)	3	0	0	0
Housing (FCSU)	15	2	0	6
Housing (HIU)	14	16	3	4
Housing (HSU)	1	0	0	2
Housing (PSSU)	12	10	0	2
0:-   10/  (0 0 D)		40		
Social Work (S&P)	2 2	12	0	0
Social Work (F&C)		8	0	0
Social Work (FS)	14	6	0	0
Social Work (S&HR) Social Work (OS)	7 7	0	0	0
Social Work (BB)	2	0	0	0 0
Social Work (D&S)	3	0	0	0
Social Work (1stCA)	7	18	0	0
Social Work (WR)	1	0	0	0
Social Work (WIX)	'	0	U	0
Support Servs. (MR)	2			
Support Servs. (OSS)	46			
Capport Co. (CCC)				
Styles total	565	200	51.5	98.5
2-3,100 10101			5110	33.0
Grand Total	915			