REPORT TO: CITY DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE - 8 JUNE 2009

REPORT ON: STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS REINSTATEMENT PERFORMANCE

**IN DUNDEE - 2008/2009** 

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION

**REPORT NO: 234-2009** 

#### 1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to:

- a provide a summary of the performance of Statutory Undertakers operating in Dundee during 2008/2009 based on inspections and coring of their reinstatements under the New Roads and Street Works Act 1991 (NRSWA); and
- b update the Committee on the status of the Transport (Scotland) Act 2005, Part 2 Road Works.

#### 2 RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee note the performance of Statutory Undertakers reinstatements in Dundee based on the visual sample inspection regime, the local and the national coring results for the last year.
- 2.2 It is recommended that the Committee approves the continuation of the local coring programme.
- 2.3 It is recommended that the Committee note the status of the Transport (Scotland) Act 2005, Part 2 Road Works, different parts of which came into force on 1 April 2008 and 1 October 2008.

#### 3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 Statutory Undertakers are responsible for carrying out their own reinstatements. They are charged the prescribed national fee of £30 for each visual sample inspection up to the prescribed chargeable level of 30% of an estimated annual workload. For coring purposes, Statutory Undertakers are charged for the actual cost of any failed cores plus a standard administration fee of £60. For failed reinstatements, discovered after sample or routine inspections or after coring, Statutory Undertakers are also charged for two further inspections of their remedial works at £60 each.
- 3.2 To implement the Transport (Scotland) Act Part 2 Road Works (in particular Fixed Penalty Notices) additional staff resources may be required. It is anticipated that the income from these notices will cover these staff costs. The Department will review the additional work, arising from the implementation of the new legislation and the forthcoming new Statutory Undertaker called H20 Fibrecity Dundee, and will report back to Committee with the implications.

#### 4 BACKGROUND

- 4.1 There are three types of inspections, carried out by the Roads Authority, that are randomly selected from a sample of Statutory Undertakers' road works by:
  - Visual Sample Inspections at three different stages ie during the works, after reinstatement and before the end of the two year guarantee period (or three years for trenches over 1.5 metres deep);
  - Local Coring Programme a physical core is taken through the bituminous layers (blacktop materials only) and the core can then be measured and assessed; and
  - National Coring Programme a biannual programme, by all Roads Authorities in Scotland, co-ordinated by the Roads Authorities and Utilities Committee (Scotland) - RAUC(S).

From the three separate methods, engineering staff identify problems and determine what they think is happening locally and compare it with previous results and national practices.

4.2 Full results are shown in Appendices 1 and 5, however, the findings are summarised in Sections 5 to 8 below.

# 5 STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS REINSTATEMENT PERFORMANCE - BASED ON VISUAL SAMPLE INSPECTION REGIME (SEE APPENDIX 1 FOR DETAILS)

- As in previous years, although the minimum required standard of performance of 90%, based on the random sample inspection regime, was achieved by all Statutory Undertakers (98% average achieved last year), it has been found that this regime alone does not accurately reflect the quality of reinstatements. Some of the reasons for this are that the sample inspections are visual, the majority of works are not witnessed by the Roads Authority due to the sample size being limited (30% of an estimated annual workload), Statutory Undertakers' contractors may only be on site for relatively short periods and sometimes work outwith normal office hours.
- 5.2 It is therefore only after coring the bituminous materials that the depth of layers, degree of compaction and type of materials used can be accurately assessed against the NRSWA Reinstatement Specification. Dundee City Council has therefore continued its own local coring programme and is also continuing to participate in the biannual National Coring Programme detailed below. However, it should be noted that, as coring does not reveal what is below the bituminous layers, any defects in sub-base materials or its compaction will be rectified by Statutory Undertakers if reported within the guarantee period.

# 6 STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS REINSTATEMENT PERFORMANCE - BASED ON LOCAL CORING PROGRAMME (SEE APPENDIX 2 FOR DETAILS)

6.1 All cores were selected randomly from permanent reinstatements, completed between April 2008 and January 2009, with the majority in carriageways as against footways. The sample size was approximately 5% of estimated annual workload of each utility.

- Out of 96 cores taken from Statutory Undertakers' reinstatements last year in Dundee, 14 cores failed to meet the Specification representing 85% average pass rate, compared to 84%, 92% and 68% in the previous three years respectively. However, only nine reinstatements (ie 9% of total) require replacement of the blacktop materials by the utility companies and five reinstatements have minor defects which do not require replacement and will be monitored for two years for their performance.
- 6.3 To continue to monitor the performance of Statutory Undertakers' reinstatements, and to impress on them the requirement to achieve the minimum target of 90% pass rate, it is intended to continue with local coring programmes during 2009/2010.

# 7 STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS REINSTATEMENT PERFORMANCE - BASED ON NATIONAL (SCOTTISH) CORING PROGRAMME (SEE APPENDICES 3, 4 AND 5 FOR DETAILS)

- 7.1 Following the last five biannual National Coring Programmes (reported previously to Committee), the RAUC(S) decided to repeat this programme during 2008/2009 until the level of performance is such that it provides the industry with confidence in the quality of reinstatements. Falkirk Council was the lead authority for TayForth Area RAUC on behalf of Dundee City, Angus, Clackmannanshire, Fife, Perth & Kinross and Stirling Councils.
- 7.2 All cores were selected randomly from works permanently reinstated between 1 July 2007 and 30 June 2008. The sample size was approximately 2% of estimated annual workload with minimum five cores per utility if available.
- 7.3 The overall average pass rate for Dundee was 91% which was well above the Scottish average of 64% and Dundee's previous national programme results of 56% in 2006 and 82% in 2004. Therefore, there appears to be an improvement in the quality of utility reinstatements with minor defects in 4 out of 44 cores taken which do not require replacement and will be monitored for the next two years for their performance.
- 7.4 To continue to monitor the performance of Statutory Undertakers' reinstatements on a national basis, it has been recommended to RAUC(S) by the National Coring Working Group (with a representative from Dundee City Council) to carry out another National Coring Programme starting April 2010, coring samples of reinstatements completed between 1 April 2009 and 31 March 2010.

# 8 PROGRESS OF STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS SINCE THE ISSUE OF IMPROVEMENT NOTICES

- 8.1 Since the issue of Improvement Notices by Dundee City Council on 25 June 2001, Statutory Undertakers have shown improvements in the quality of reinstatements in the city although there is still room for more improvement. The Planning and Transportation Department as the local Roads Authority will, however, continue to monitor them as vigorously as possible and meet them individually on specific issues as and when required.
- 8.2 Quarterly Co-ordination meetings ie Dundee RAUC, will continue to be held with all Statutory Undertakers (together with representatives from other sections of Planning and Transportation Department, BEAR (Scotland) and Tayside Police) to discuss

their planned major works, to co-ordinate these with the Council's own planned works and to monitor their performance.

8.3 Meetings and discussions are also ongoing with utility companies to ensure that lessons are continuing to be learned and improvement plans are monitored and implemented effectively.

#### 9 TRANSPORT (SCOTLAND) ACT 2005

9.1 The Transport (Scotland) Act 2005 received Royal Assent on 5 August 2005.

The Act has four parts:

- Part 1 Regional Transport (related to Regional Transport Partnerships);
- Part 2 Road Works (see below);
- Part 3 Miscellaneous (related to public transport); and
- Part 4 General (related to secondary legislation).

Part 2 of the Act "Road Works" amends some sections of the New Roads and Street Works Act 1991 and Roads (Scotland) Act 1984, aiming to improve the quality and co-ordination of road works across Scotland by:

- establishing a Scottish Road Works Commissioner to monitor the quality of road works carried out on all roads (including trunk roads) by Roads Authorities and Statutory Undertakers, driving and promoting improvements and imposing penalties for persistent poor performance of Statutory Undertakers as well as Roads Authorities. Mr John Gooday was appointed in May 2007 as the Scottish Road Works Commissioner and has now three staff and an office in Edinburgh;
- improving the co-ordination of road works by making the Scottish Road Works Register (SRWR) a Statutory requirement, placing more stringent duties on both Statutory Undertakers and Roads Authorities to co-operate, co-ordinate, plan their works and notify/register works information in the SRWR;
- introducing, during 2010/2011, new provisions on resurfacing parts of roads by Statutory Undertakers in special cases; and
- giving new powers to local Roads Authorities to issue fixed penalty notices for a limited number of notification offences (see Appendix 6 for details).
- 9.2 To implement the provisions of Part 2 of the Act, new Regulations and Codes of Practice such as "Co-ordination of Road Works and Works for Road Purposes" and the "Penalties Code of Practice" came into force on 1 April and 1 October 2008 respectively.
- 9.3 The fixed penalties regime has yet to be implemented in Dundee. This will be progressed during financial year 2009/2010.

#### 10 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

10.1 This Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. The major issues are set out below:

#### a Sustainability

The principle of first time, high quality reinstatement of road material by Statutory Undertakers accords with the Council's sustainability policy, in particular "Energy and Water", "Built Environment" and "Minimising and Remediating Pollution".

# b Strategic Environmental Assessment

There are no implications relating to this report.

# c Anti-Poverty

There are no implications relating to this report.

## d Equality Impact Assessment

There are no implications relating to this report.

## e Risk Management

The monitoring and maintenance of road reinstatement procedures by Statutory Undertakers ensures that the road network is protected and the need reduced for early maintenance by Dundee City Council after satisfactory completion of the guarantee period of reinstatements.

#### 11 CONSULTATIONS

11.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Depute Chief Executive (Finance), Head of Finance and Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

## 12 BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 12.1 Report No 301/2000 Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 1999/2000 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 22 May 2000.
- 12.2 Report No 338/2001 Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 2000/2001 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 25 June 2001.
- 12.3 Report No 319/2002 Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 2001/2002 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 27 May 2002.
- 12.4 Report No 509/2003 Statutory Undertakers Performance in Dundee 2002/2003 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 25 August 2003.

- 12.5 Report No 137/2004 The Regulation of Utility Companies Roadworks: A Consultation was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 23 February 2004.
- 12.6 Report No 279/2005 Statutory Undertakers Reinstatement Performance in Dundee 2003/2005 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 16 May 2005.
- 12.7 Report No 227/2006 Statutory Undertakers Reinstatement Performance in Dundee 2005/2006 was presented to Planning and Transportation Committee on 8 May 2006.
- 12.8 Report No 267/2007 Statutory Undertakers Reinstatement Performance in Dundee 2006/2007 was presented to Planning and Transport Committee on 11 June 2007.
- 12.9 Report No 247/2008 Statutory Undertakers Reinstatement Performance in Dundee 2007/2008 was presented to Planning and Transport Committee on 12 May 2008.

Mike Galloway
Director of Planning & Transportation

Neil Gellatly Head of Transportation

NHG/FV/MM 26 May 2009

Dundee City Council Tayside House Dundee

#### **APPENDIX 1**

# SAMPLE INSPECTION RESULTS (VISUAL) OF STATUTORY UNDERTAKERS REINSTATEMENTS IN DUNDEE

Appendix 1 shows the results of the visual random sample inspections of each Statutory Undertaker's works in Dundee, together with annual figures from previous years for comparison.

	Sample Inspe	ection 2008/2009	
Statutory Undertaker	Agreed Units of Inspections (estimated annual workload)	No of Passes/Total No of Inspections	Pass Rate
Openreach (BT)	182	55/55	100%
Cable & Wireless	No Works	-	-
Scottish Water	455	132/137	96%
Scottish & Southern Energy	308	89/92	97%
Virgin Media (ex Telewest)	156	46/47	98%
Thus	Minimal Works	-	-
Scotland Gas Networks	691	204/207	99%
Average Pass Rate			98%

# Note

The number of sample inspections carried out annually is 30%, ie 10% of the Agreed Units of Inspections (based on estimated annual workload) at each of three different stages, eg for BT,  $3 \times 10\% \times 182 = 55$ 

		Annual Sample Inspection Pass Rate (%)											
Statutory Undertaker	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09						
Openreach (BT)	94	99	93	93	90	93	100						
Cable & Wireless (No Works)	-	-	-	-	-	-	1						
Scottish Water	94	96	98	93	97	98	96						
Scottish & Southern Energy	98	99	100	96	99	99	97						
Virgin Media (ex Telewest)	97	100	100	83	95	98	98						
Thus (Minimal Works)	91	100	-	100	-	-	-						
Scotland Gas Networks	99	99	100	96	99	99	99						
Average Pass Rate (%)	96	98	99	94	97	98	98						

#### **APPENDIX 2 - LOCAL DUNDEE CORING PROGRAMME 2008/2009**

Appendix 2 shows the results of the local Dundee Coring Programme during last year with figures from previous eight years for comparison. All cores were selected randomly (approximately 5% sample size) from permanent reinstatements in carriageways and footways completed between April 2008 and January 2009.

		Core	Pass		Fail-Monitor							Fail-Replace						
Statutory Undertaker	Core Description	No	No	%	Com-	Lavers	Material	Others	то	TAL	Com-	Layers	Material	Others	то	TAL		
				,,	paction	Layers	inatorial	Others	No	%	paction	Layers	Material	Others	No	%		
Openreach (BT)	Randomly Selected	10	9	90%					0	0%		1			1	10%		
Cable & Wireless	No Works																	
Scottish Water	Randomly Selected	23	18	78%					0	0%		5			5	22%		
Scottish & Southern Energy	Randomly Selected	17	14	82%	3				3	18%					0	0%		
Virgin Media (ex Telewest)	Randomly Selected	9	7	78%					0	0%		2			2	22%		
Thus	(Minimal Works)																	
Scotland Gas Networks	Randomly Selected	37	34	92%		2			2	5%		1			1	3%		
TOTAL 2008/2009	Randomly Selected	96	82	85%	3	2			5	6%		9			9	9%		
Totals 2007/2008	Randomly Selected	95	80	84%	8	2			10	11%		5			5	5%		
Totals 2006/2007	Randomly Selected	100	92	92%	3	2	1		8	3%	1	4			5	5%		
Totals 2005/2006	Randomly Selected	25	17	68%	3	2	1		8	32%					0	-		
Totals 2004/2005	Randomly Selected	29	24	83%	1		1		2	7%		3			3	10%		
Totals 2003/2004	Randomly Selected	54	27	50%					0	-	9	10	5	3	27	50%		
Totals 2002/2003	Randomly Selected	102	45	44%					0	-	6	13	37	1	57	56%		
Totals 2001/2002	Randomly Selected	56	26	46%	6	3			9	16%	9	11	1		21	38%		
Totals 2000/2001	Random & Targeted	97	24	25%	3	17			20	21%	8	45			53	54%		

#### **Notes**

Pass = Reinstatement in compliance with NRSWA Reinstatement Specification

Fail-Monitor = Defects of minor nature, requiring further two year monitoring

Fail-Replace = Outwith NRSWA Reinstatement Specification, requiring replacement of bituminous layers and a further two year guarantee period

Appendices 3, 4 and 5 show the results of the latest National Coring Programme with summary sheets for Dundee and for all local Roads Authorities and all Statutory Undertakers in mainland Scotland respectively, together with totals from the previous five National Programmes for comparison. These results are expected to be approved at the 3 June 2009 meeting of the Roads Authorities and Utilities Committee (Scotland) (RAUC(S)). All cores were selected randomly from works reinstated between 1 July 2007 and 30 June 2008, with the majority in carriageways as against footways. The sample size was approximately 2% of estimated annual workload of each utility company.

APPENDIX 3 - DUNDEE RESULTS FROM NATIONAL CORING PROGRAMME 2008

		Pa	ISS			Fail-Mo	nitor		Fail-Replace						
Statutory Undertaker	Core No	No	%	Com-	Layers	Material	Others	TO	TAL	Com-	Layers	Material	Others	то	TAL
	1.0		/0	paction	Layers	iviatei iai	Others	No	%	paction	Layers	Material	Others	No	%
Openreach (BT)	5	5	100%												
Scottish & Southern Energy	6	6	100%												
Scottish Water	8	8	100%												
Virgin Media (ex Telewest)	5	5	100%												
Thus	5	3	60%		1	1		2	40%						
Scotland Gas Networks	15	13	87%	1	1			2	13%						
TOTALS 2008	44	40	91%	1	2	1		4	9%						
	_				_										
TOTALS 2006	43	24	56%	4	4	4		12	28%	1	6			7	16%
TOTALS 2004	44	36	82%		4		2	6	13.5%				2	2	4.5%
TOTALS 2002	60	19	32%							14	8	17	2	41	68%
TOTALS 2000	44	4	9%	1	11			12	27%	8	18	2		28	64%
TOTALS 1998	60	26	43%					18	30%					16	27%

APPENDIX 4 - NATIONAL CORING PROGRAMME 2008 - SCOTLAND SUMMARY BY COUNCIL

			Pa	ISS			Fail-Mor	nitor					Fail-Rep	lace		
Area	Council	Number of Cores	No	%	Com-	Lavers	Material	Others	TC	OTAL	Com-	Lavers	Material	Others	TC	OTAL
		01 00103		/6	paction	Layers	wateriai	Others	No	%	paction	Layers		Others	No	%
	Argyll & Bute	None														
	City of Glasgow	188	104	55%		18	2		20	11%	2	28	31	3	64	34%
	Dumfries & Galloway	78	41	53%	1	2	2		5	6%	2	14	15	1	32	41%
	East Ayrshire	36	26	72%			3		3	8%		7			7	19%
	East Dunbartonshire	None														
est	East Renfrewshire	None														
South West	Inverclyde	29	21	72%			2		2	7%		5	1		6	21%
듐	North Ayrshire	40	16	40%		5	3		8	20%	1	3	10	2	16	40%
So	North Lanarkshire	101	77	76%		2	2		4	4%	4	10	6		20	20%
	Renfrewshire	45	22	49%		7	3		10	22%	1	5	7		13	29%
	South Ayrshire	37	17	46%			2		2	5%	1	2	9	6	18	49%
	South Lanarkshire	166	97	58%		2	3		5	3%	1	36	15	12	64	39%
	West Dunbartonshire	34	16	47%		4			4	12%	1	12	1		14	41%
	Total	754	437	58%	1	40	22		63	8%	13	122	95	24	254	34%
	Aberdeenshire	54	32	59%	5		6		11	20%	2	5	4		11	20%
73	City of Aberdeen	58	31	53%	8		1		9	16%	3	7	8		18	31%
a of	Highland	47	23	49%	7	1	1		9	19%	6	4	5		15	32%
North of Scotland	Moray	41	29	71%	4				4	10%	8				8	20%
ŽŐ	Total	200	115	58%	24	1	8		33	17%	19	16	17		52	26%
	Angus	30	25	83%		1	4		5	17%						
	Clackmannanshire	22	17	77%		2			2	9%		3			3	14%
ج	Dundee City	44	40	91%	1	2	1		4	9%						
TayForth	Falkirk	61	41	67%			4		4	7%	2	8	4	2	16	26%
ayF	Fife	66	41	62%	2	1	5		8	12%	4	8	4	1	17	26%
-	Perth & Kinross	39	31	79%		4	2		6	15%	1			1	2	5%
	Stirling	44	28	64%	1				1	2%		10	5		15	34%
	Total	306	223	73%	4	10	16		30	10%	7	29	13	4	53	17%
	City of Edinburgh	159	129	81%	1	3	1	3	8	5%	2	17	3		22	14%
	East Lothian	25	17	68%		1		1	2	8%		4	2		6	24%
l ts	Midlothian	30	23	77%		1	3		4	13%		3			3	10%
Еä	Scottish Borders	36	20	56%		7		1	8	22%		7		1	8	22%
South East	West Lothian	56	43	77%							4	3	2	4	13	23%
Soı	Total	306	232	76%	1	12	4	5	22	7%	6	34	7	5	52	17%
	2008 Grand Total	1,566	1,007	64%	30	63	50	5	148	9%	45	201	132	33	411	26%

Pass rates for previous National Coring Programmes: 60% (2006), 59% (2004), 45% (2002), 38% (2000) and 43% (1998)

APPENDIX 5 - NATIONAL CORING PROGRAMME 2008 - SCOTLAND SUMMARY BY STATUTORY UNDERTAKER

		Pass				Fail-Mo	nitor		Fail-Replace							
All Undertakers	Core No	Core	No	%	Com-	Layers	Material	Others	ТО	TAL	Com-	Layers	Material	Others	TO	TAL
	NO	110	/0	paction	Layers	Material	Others	No	%	paction	Layers	waterial	Others	No	%	
British Telecom (Openreach)	217	127	59%	11	4	11		26	12%	3	33	15	13	64	29%	
E S Pipelines	5	2	40%	2	1			3	60%							
Energetics	6	4	67%								1	1		2	33%	
GTC Pipelines	3	0	0%								3			3	100%	
Independent Pipelines	7	4	57%		1			1	14%		2			2	29%	
Scotland Gas Networks	419	322	77%	7	28	13	1	49	12%	2	38	6	2	48	11%	
Scottish & Southern Energy	44	32	73%	5	1	1		7	16%	1	3	1		5	11%	
Scottish Power	190	148	78%	1	7	3	1	12	6%	7	16	2	5	30	16%	
Scottish Water	539	277	51%	1	13	17	2	33	6%	26	91	105	7	229	42%	
T Mobile	5	4	80%								1			1	20%	
Thus	64	41	64%	3	4	3	1	11	17%	5	7			12	19%	
Verizon	5	5	100%													
Virgin Media (NTL & Telewest)	54	36	67%		4	2		6	11	1	5	2	4	12	22%	
West Lothian Street Lighting	8	5	63%								1		2	3	38%	
TOTALS 2008	1,566	1,007	64%	30	63	50	5	148	9%	45	201	132	33	411	26%	

Pass rates for previous National Coring Programmes: 60% (2006), 59% (2004), 45% (2002), 38% (2000) and 43% (1998)

#### **APPENDIX 6**

Transport (Scotland) Act, amending the New Roads and Street Works Act 1981, introduced the following Fixed Penalties for certain offences applicable from 1 October 2008. The fixed penalties are £120 if paid within 36 calendar days but discounted at £80 if paid within 29 calendar days.

### Schedule 6A to the New Roads and Street Works Act 1991

Fixed Penalty Offences (applicable to Statutory Undertakers)

# Imposition by the Roads Authority

Offence	Brief Description
An offence under Section 113(5)	Failure to comply with duties under Section 113 (advance notice of certain works etc).
An offence under Section 114(5)	Beginning to execute works in contravention of Section 114 (notice of starting date).
An offence under Section 116(4)	Failure to give notice in accordance with Section 116 (notice of emergency works).
An offence under Section 129(6) consisting of a failure to comply with sub-section (3) or (4)	Failure to comply with requirements to give notice of completion of reinstatement.

# Schedule 8A to the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984

Fixed Penalty Offences (applicable to persons other than Statutory Undertakers)

## Imposition by the Roads Authority

Offence	Brief Description								
An offence under Section 58(1)	Deposit of building materials in or erection of scaffolding over road without or other than in accordance with permission.								
An offence under Section 85(3) as read with (4)	Deposit of builder's skip on road without permission of roads authority.								
	Failure of owner of skip or other person to ensure conditions of permission are complied with.								

# Section 119A of the New Roads and Street Works Act 1991

The imposition of penalties by the Scottish Road Works Commissioner is applicable to Roads Authorities as well as Statutory Undertakers who are regularly and continually failing in their respective duties to co-ordinate and co-operate. It is not intended that a one off failure in duty, would lead to the imposition of a penalty by the Commissioner. The level of this penalty is to be determined by the Commissioner but the Regulations have provided that this cannot exceed a maximum of £50,000.