

REPORT TO: PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE - 14 AUGUST 2006

REPORT ON: TAY HOTEL – DRAFT SITE DEVELOPMENT BRIEF

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION

REPORT NO: 474-2006

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 The purpose of the report is to seek approval of a draft development brief as the basis of consultation with site owner and interested parties.

2 RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee:
- a approves the attached draft development brief for the purposes of consultation;
 - b remit the Director of Planning and Transportation to consult with the other owners and interested parties on the terms and content of the draft site planning;
 - c remit the Director of Planning and Transportation to report back on the results of the consultation exercise within a period of two months; and
 - d remit the Director of Planning and Transportation to put forward the final brief as a basis for assembly of the development site.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

- 3.1 There are no financial implications arising from the approval of this development brief.

4 LOCAL AGENDA 21 IMPLICATIONS

- 4.1 The development brief for this important site seeks to ensure the protection of the character of the Category 'B' listed building, and assist to secure a high quality development within the Central Conservation Area.

By the successful renovation of important City Centre buildings, the distinctive architectural character of the City Centre will be retained and will assist in addressing the following key theme of Dundee 21:

- Places, spaces and objects combine meaning and beauty with utility.
- Diversity and local distinctiveness are valued and protected.
- Health is protected by creating safe, clean and pleasant environments.

5 EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 There are no direct Equal Opportunities Implications associated with approval of this draft site planning brief for public consultation.

6 BACKGROUND

- 6.1 The Tay Hotel is a large listed building strategically located within Dundee City Centre. The building has been vacant for approximately a decade, but offers an excellent opportunity for redevelopment, directly adjacent to the City's Waterfront Masterplan area. The redevelopment of this site will be based on the re use of the existing category B listed building which forms an important landmark within the Central Conservation Area.
- 6.2 The Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review and the Dundee Urban Design Guide 2001 contain the planning standards appropriate to the redevelopment of the site in response to the Scottish Executive's national guidance on design quality in Designing Places 2001 and Planning Advice Note Design Statements (PAN 68). The Local Plan Review policies and design guidance of particular relevance to the site are included within the Site Development Brief and include:
- 6.3 Policy 60 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 - 'Alterations to Listed Buildings' states that "The alteration of a listed building will only be acceptable where the proposals have regard to the preservation or enhancement of its architectural or historic character. Alterations will not be permitted where the works would diminish the architectural integrity of the building or its historic interest."
- 6.4 Alterations and/or extensions, where appropriate, should generally be contemporary in design and use high quality materials. More importantly they should not detract from the original built fabric or any architectural or historic features of the original building. 'Pastiche' alterations and extensions will not be encouraged unless, within their context, they can be fully justified.
- 6.5 Policy 59 - "Alternative Uses for Listed Buildings" states that "Suitable alternative uses will be considered to secure their future. Any adaptation of the fabric must be undertaken carefully and sensitively and have minimum impact on the architectural or historical interest, character and setting of the building."
- 6.6 Policy 65 - 'Archaeological Sites' states that "Where any proposal could affect a site of known archaeological importance or potential, the applicant will be required to provide an assessment of the archaeological value of the site and the likely impact of the proposal on the archaeological resource."
- 6.7 Historic Scotland's 'Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Building and Conservation Areas 1998' shall be referred to for specific guidance on the conservation, repair and alteration of the listed building.
- 6.8 The Draft Site Development Brief has been prepared as Supplementary Planning Guidance to the Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review providing guidance to prospective developers, agents and designers to arrive at an informed and comprehensive solution for the redevelopment of this site.

7 CONSULTATIONS

- 7.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Head of Finance and Assistant Chief Executive (Community Planning) have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

8 BACKGROUND PAPERS

Dundee City Council - Dundee Local Plan Review 2003

Mike Galloway
Director of Planning & Transportation

Iain Mudie
Head of Planning

IGSM/GK/RJ

7 August 2006

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

APPENDIX 1

FORMER TAY HOTEL - SITE DEVELOPMENT BRIEF

Introduction

The Tay Hotel is a large listed building strategically located within Dundee City Centre. The building has been vacant for approximately a decade, but offers an excellent opportunity for redevelopment, directly adjacent to the City's Waterfront Masterplan area. The redevelopment of this site will be based on the re use of the existing category B listed building which forms an important landmark within the Central Conservation Area.

The City Council is determined to achieve the highest standard of redevelopment in this significant, centrally located site. A wide-ranging scheme will be required in order to unlock the full potential of this building, including proposals for conservation and conversion of the listed building itself, and for car parking provision and vehicular management adjacent to, and surrounding the site.

This site development brief has been prepared as supplementary planning guidance to the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 providing specific policy guidance to prospective developers and designers to arrive at an informed and comprehensive solution for the redevelopment of this site.

The building is bounded to the north and west by Whitehall Crescent. To the south and east the property is bound by Dock Street. The surrounding area is predominantly made up of ground floor commercial with residential uses on upper floors. The Tay Hotel forms an important element within a large formal 'city block', and is a key site in achieving the aims and vision of the Dundee Central Waterfront Development Masterplan.

Tay Hotel - The Building

The building is category B listed, and lies within the Dundee Central Conservation Area. It was constructed in 1889, originally as a hotel - formerly Mathers Hotel and latterly the Tay Hotel. The building is five storey with double attic and has a convex plan to Whitehall Crescent and basement to Dock Street, on a prominent gusset site. The building incorporates a former nightclub and bar to Dock Street which form part of this development brief site. The Whitehall Street elevation has a number of retail/commercial units to ground floor level (nos 26-42) which are in separate ownership from the Hotel, and are therefore outwith the scope of this brief. The building has significant value, both architecturally as a separate entity, and in terms of its townscape value within the context of the Central Conservation Area.

Exterior

The Whitehall Crescent and Dock Street elevations are finished with ashlar sandstone with a grey slated mansard roof. The rear elevations, facing onto a central courtyard, are built in cream coloured brickwork. The prominent and grand main entrance once faced the Caledonian Railway Station, and incorporates decorative carved stonework in limestone - a rare example of this in Dundee. At roof level, the building contains a number of chimney's which will be required to be kept as they are an important element of the character of the building, any proposal for their partial removal would require full justification to both Historic Scotland and Dundee City Council to assess whether this would be acceptable or not.

The south west roof corner elevation - is finished with an attractive rectangular-domed roof and finialled pagoda-like cap, complete with cast iron brattishing, elements of which are missing. Another historic feature on the roof is the existing cupola, which provides light to the internal grand vesica staircase. It is expected that such details are restored taking into account Building Standards requirements, and a schedule of such works will be required to support a listed building consent application.

A large proportion of the ashlar stonework facade has been 'repaired' using cement based 'plastic' stone repairs. It is likely that many of these will be boss, and therefore require removal. Repairs should be in matching natural stone, and new plastic repairs will not be permitted. All proposed re-pointing of stonework shall be required to be completed with an appropriate lime based mortar, the use of cement will be unacceptable.

Interior

The most significant feature internally is the grand vesica (elliptical) staircase, although the cast iron balusters of the staircase are presently encased by reinforced plaster. Every attempt will be made to retain this grand feature, and restore it to its former glory. Should the staircase prove to be an insurmountable obstacle to the redevelopment of the building, detailed justification to both the Council and Historic Scotland will be required to assess whether this would be acceptable or not.

The insertion of a lift, and provision of secondary means of escape will require careful consideration to ensure minimum intervention to original historic fabric. Such alterations and/or extensions should be contemporary in design, use high quality materials, and will enhance rather than detract from the original listed building.

The property is a Category B listed building containing a number of historical features, for example cornice details, window shutters and doors etc. The features will be required to be retained and reinstated where possible, in order to minimise the impact of the development on the character of the listed building. A schedule of works will be required to be submitted as part of an application for listed building consent, detailing features to be removed, retained and reinstated etc.

Historic windows shall be retained and upgraded where possible in accordance with national guidance received from Historic Scotland. Where repair is not possible all proposed windows will require to match the historical details including glazing, material, opening method and glazing pattern. Detailed scaled drawings (1:10) of any window replacement will be required to be submitted as part of an application for listed building consent, with justification why the window cannot be repaired.

Alterations/Extensions

Policy 60 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 - 'Alterations to Listed Buildings' states that "The alteration of a listed building will only be acceptable where the proposals have regard to the preservation or enhancement of its architectural or historic character. Alterations will not be permitted where the works would diminish the architectural integrity of the building or its historic interest."

Historic Scotland's 'Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Building and Conservation Areas 1998' should be referred to for specific guidance on the conservation, repair and alteration of the listed building.

Alterations and/or extensions, where appropriate, should generally be contemporary in design and use high quality materials. More importantly they should not detract from the original built fabric or any architectural or historic features of the original building. 'Pastiche' alterations and extensions will not be encouraged unless, within their context, they can be fully justified.

Suitable Uses

The Tay Hotel was built as a hotel and was in such use until the 1990's, when it was used briefly as a hostel. The building has lain vacant for a number of years.

The building is identified in the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 as a potential housing development opportunity. However, this designation does not preclude the consideration of other uses, and in principle the reuse of the property as a hotel would be acceptable. Uses which enable the most sympathetic reuse of the building, avoiding extensive internal subdivision, are sought. The conversion to residential use would require units to have a minimum internal floor space of greater than 60m².

Policy 4 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 - "Design of New Housing" states that "The design and layout of all new housing in Dundee should be of a high quality. New development will require to conform to Design Standards contained in Appendix 1.

Where conversion of a listed building or other worthy of retention is proposed, there may be limited flexibility in applying parking and garden ground requirements where compliance is impractical. The development of flats through conversions of buildings of merit may also be acceptable where conversion to flats is the only appropriate action. Appendix 1 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005, states that all flats must have a minimum of two bedrooms.

The internal layout of the building with its deep floor plan and limited number of openings, suggests that in order to secure its future and minimise the impact on the existing layout, a number of single bedroom units maybe acceptable. However detailed justification to the Council would be required to assess whether this would be acceptable or not. Any proposal for such properties would require to be no more than 49% of the total number of proposed units.

The site falls within the 'City Centre Speciality Shopping and Non Core Area'. In addition to Retail use, other non retail uses within Classes 1 (Shops), 2 (Financial), Professional and other Services) and 3 (Food and Drink) of the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) (Scotland) Order 1997 will also be supported in principle.

Policy 59 of the Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review - 'Alternative Uses for Listed Buildings' states that "Suitable (alternative) uses will be considered to secure their future. Any adaption of the fabric must be undertaken carefully and sensitively and have minimum impact on the architectural and historic interest, character and setting of the building".

Other Relevant Planning Policy

Tay Hotel is located within the City Centre Area of Archaeological Potential. The finalised Dundee Local Plan Review, Policy 65 - 'Archaeological Sites' states that "Where any proposal could affect a site of known archaeological importance or potential, the applicant

will be required to provide an assessment of the archaeological value of the site and the likely impact of the proposal on the archaeological resource.

Accessibility

The site is very well located in relation to public transport, the train station being adjacent to the building, and bus station within 10 minutes walk. The building is very well serviced by most local bus services within 200 metres. The City Airport provides scheduled services in addition to private aviation facilities.

Disabled Access

The Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) 1995 requires service providers to make 'reasonable adjustments' to the physical features of their premises to overcome physical barriers to access. Whilst the Council supports the principle of equal access for all, the DDA does not overrule planning or building legislation and existing requirements for planning and listed building consents remain. An access audit should be prepared for any redevelopment of the building, which will be submitted as supporting information to the listed building consent application.

Car Parking and Vehicular Access

At present there is no parking associated with the building, other than on street short stay parking. The potential for limited parking within the building itself should be investigated. There are currently in the region of 1900 long stay parking spaces in close proximity to the City Centre. Furthermore the site is situated within the boundary of the City Centre Residents Parking Scheme, which provides access to a number of Dundee City Council's long stay parking facilities at a reduced rate.

Facade Alterations To Dock Street

The ground and basement level elevation to Dock Street is relatively poor in quality, having been previously altered, and presently detracts from the status of the listed building. The alteration of this lower part of the elevation may be acceptable, although any proposal for facade enhancement will require to use appropriate high quality materials, and complement the character and appearance of the existing building.

Environmental Improvement

Information to support a Planning and Listed Building Consent Application

Conservation Plan

A Conservation Plan will be required to support any application for listed building consent. Historic Scotland's Heritage Policy Guide 1 "Conservation Plans" provides guidance on the content and preparation of such a document. Dundee City Council and Historic Scotland will be stakeholders in this process.

Stonework Survey

A detailed stone condition survey will be required as part of any application for listed building consent, as will a detailed method statement of repair works, to be agreed with the Council's Conservation Officer.

Method Statement of Repairs

A detailed analysis of all proposed repairs, e.g. re pointing (material, mix ratios etc), windows and all historical features, shall be required to be submitted as part of any application for listed building consent.

Dundee City Council Contacts

Pre-application discussions with Dundee City Council's Planning and Transportation Department is advised. Appropriate contacts are:

Dennis Gordon, Senior Planning Officer, Tel 01382 433922

Gary Knox, Conservation Officer, Tel 01382 433414