

REPORT TO: CITY DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE - 6 DECEMBER 2010

REPORT ON: ROUTE UTILISATION STRATEGY FOR SCOTLAND GENERATION TWO - DRAFT FOR CONSULTATION

REPORT BY: DIRECTOR OF CITY DEVELOPMENT

REPORT NO: 703-2010

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 This report outlines the purpose, content and proposals contained within the Network Rail consultation document "Route Utilisation Strategy for Scotland Generation Two - Draft for Consultation" and Dundee City Council's response.

2 RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 It is recommended that the Committee note the purpose, content and proposals contained within the consultation (Appendix A refers) and endorse Dundee City Council's response contained in Appendix B.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 3.1 There are no financial implications arising as a result of this report.

4 BACKGROUND

- 4.1 The purpose of the Route Utilisation Strategy (RUS) for Scotland Generation Two - Draft for Consultation is to enable Network Rail and organisations providing services relating to railways to plan their businesses better, and funders to plan their activities better; and to set out feasible options for network capacity, timetable outputs and network capability and the associated funding implications of those options.

- 4.2 The RUS seeks to optimise the use made of available route capacity as well as promote the development of further capacity through targeted interventions consistent with the level of funding that is likely to be available over the next 30 year time horizon. It will also assist Scottish Ministers in the development of their strategies for the future development of the rail network.

- 4.3 The extent of the rail network coverage for the RUS is the whole of the rail network in Scotland excluding the East Coast Main Line (south of Edinburgh) and the West Coast Main Line (south of Carstairs).

- 4.4 Among other outcomes, the RUS will therefore:

- Propose options to achieve the most efficient and effective use of the existing rail network;
- identify cost effective opportunities to improve the network where appropriate;
- enable Network Rail to develop an informed renewals and maintenance programme in line with Scottish Ministers' aspirations and the reasonable requirements of train operators and other key stakeholders; and
- enable local and regional transport plans and freight plans to reflect a realistic view of the future rail network.

- 4.5 This consultation draft of the RUS outlines the issues that the RUS area currently faces and those that are predicted to rise over the next 30 years.
- 4.6 It then outlines the proposed options to be developed to address these gaps and the next steps that should be taken in each case.
- 4.7 The responses to this consultation document will shape the final RUS.

Summary of Dundee City Council's Response to RUS

- 4.8 Dundee City Council's response to the RUS focuses on the issues relating to the Tay Estuary Rail Study (TERS) that proposes the introduction of a new local rail service that serves all the train stations between Perth and Arbroath. The RUS ignores the TERS proposal even though Network Rail are well aware of the local and regional aspirations for improvements to local rail services. Dundee City Council have requested that the TERS work is included in Network Rail's final RUS. The full response to be submitted is detailed in Appendix B.
- 4.9 The issues arising from the RUS and affecting the Dundee City Region in terms of TERS are presented in Appendix A.

5 POLICY IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 This Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti-Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management. The major issues identified are:
 - a Sustainability - The responses to this consultation document contained in this report are aimed at improving local rail opportunities and rail connectivity between Dundee and other major cities in Scotland. The responses thus address the sustainability Transport and Travel principle to promote opportunities for sustainable transport and encourage the use accessible public transport to reduce private car dependency.
 - b Strategic Environmental Assessment - there are no implications in relation to this report;
 - c Anti-poverty - there are no implications in relation to this report;
 - d Equality Impact Assessment - there are no implications in relation to this report;
 - e Risk Management - there are no implications in relation to this report.

6 CONSULTATIONS

- 6.1 The Chief Executive, Depute Chief Executive (Support Services), Director of Finance and Assistant Chief Executive have been consulted and are in agreement with the contents of this report.

7 BACKGROUND PAPERS

7.1 Route Utilisation Strategy for Scotland Generation Two - Draft For Consultation

<http://www.networkrail.co.uk/browseDirectory.aspx?dir=\RUS%20Documents\Route%20Utilisation%20Strategies\RUS%20Generation%202\Scotland&pageid=4449&root=\RUS%20Documents\Route%20Utilisation%20Strategies>

7.2 Tay Estuary Rail Study

<http://www.tactran.gov.uk/projects.html>

7.3 Transport Scotland Strategic Transport Projects Review

<http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/strategy-and-research/strategic-transport-projects-review>

Mike Galloway
Director of City Development

Neil Gellatly
Head of Transportation

NHG/EG/EB

17 November 2010

Dundee City Council
Tayside House
Dundee

APPENDIX A

Structure and Content of Scotland Route Utilisation Strategy Generation Two - Draft for Consultation

Background

In March 2007 Network Rail produced a Route Utilisation Strategy for Scotland and this was established in May 2007. Network Rail have recently published their second Route Utilisation Strategy (RUS) - Generation Two Consultation Draft and this document revises the demand forecast of the previous RUS and assesses the implications for the rail network future capabilities.

The origins of producing a RUS is shaped and directed through the Office of Rail Regulation and Network Rail's network licence requires it to establish and maintain Route Utilisation Strategies. Through its guidance The Office of Rail Regulation guidance sets out the main objective of the RUS and is defined as:

"the effective and efficient use and development of the capacity available on the network, consistent with the funding that is, or is likely to become available during the period of route utilisation strategy and with the licence holder's performance of the duty."

The Guidance requires Network Rail to explain how it should consider the position of the railway funding authorities, their statements, key outputs and any options they should wish to be tested.

Under the 2005 Railways Act, Scottish Ministers have responsibility for the railways within Scotland and this is administered on their behalf by Transport Scotland. As the major funder of infrastructure and most passenger train operations within Scotland, Transport Scotland has the ability to make decisions in relation to future funding of the railways. The funding regime for Network Rail is agreed on a five yearly basis referred to as Control periods. The RUS is important in planning for the rail industry as it utilises available input from Transport Scotland High Level Output Specification (HLOS) and the Strategic Transport Project Review (STPR). The recommendations of the RUS form an input to decisions made by funding organisations and suppliers on issues such as rail franchise specifications and investment plans. The RUS forms an important part of Network Rail's Initial Strategic Business Plan and feeds into the HLOS process which will define the outputs required from Network Rail in the next Control Period (Control Period 5 (CP5) - 2014 - 2019).

Scope of RUS

The RUS covers the majority of Route and Track miles within Scotland. Track and Routes excluded relate to the West and East Coast Main lines. Therefore track from Edinburgh Waverly to the Border near Berwick-upon-Tweed in addition to track from Carstairs to the Border near Gretna do not fall into the remit of this RUS. These sections of track are catered for within other Route Utilisation Strategies. The RUS considers all train services that use the routes for all or part of their journey to the extent necessary to achieve the route utilisation objective regardless of whether or not the physical infrastructure is within the boundaries of the scope area of the RUS.

The RUS links in with other important Strategies, Policies and plans are influence directly relevant to its development and these related

- National Transport Strategy including Scotlands Railways
- Strategic Projects Review (STPR)
- East Coat Main Line RUS
- West Coast Main line RUS
- Freight RUS and the Strategic Freight Network
- Network RUS: Scenarios and Long distance Forecasts
- Network RUS: Electrification
- Network RUS: Stations(currently in development)
- Network RUS: Rolling Stock and Depots (currently in development)

Current capacity, demand and delivery

The RUS considers the present day function and capacity of the Rail Network in Scotland and this covers both the passenger and freight operations.

Issues such as demand pattern, over crowding as well as how the current infrastructure performs are also analysed as part of the RUS. The RUS considers passenger franchised operators and the freight operators.

The overall market for the RUS covers virtually the whole population of Scotland at just over 5 million. The majority of this population is concentrated in the central belt around Glasgow and Edinburgh. Out with this the population becomes sparser although there are still significant population centres around the other main cities of Scotland such as Aberdeen, Dundee, Stirling, Perth and Inverness. The RUS has defined the Passenger Market into five groups and these are:

- The Glasgow Conurbation Market
- The Edinburgh Conurbation Market
- Interurban Market
- Rural Market
- Anglo Scottish Market

The Glasgow conurbation market is the largest of the five above groups as it accounts for around 59% of all rail trips in the RUS area. Dundee falls into the Interurban Market and this market has shown strong demand in the last few years particularly since 2002. The RUS does not give precise information relating to Dundee other than that there been growth in rail demand although not as strong as the growth in and around Aberdeen. There has also been growth in the movement of freight by rail but this has been at a much slower rate than the passenger growth. Since the last RUS in 2007 the capacity of the network has not really increased apart from the opening of the Stirling to Alloa line, capacity enhancements to Waverley station, Glasgow/Kilmarnock upgrade, and line doubling between Bathgate and Newbridge. The utilisation of the network again is similar to 2007 although in 2010 it does highlight a number of capacity constraints on the routes between Dundee and Glasgow/ Edinburgh.

The performance of the network has improved and this is indicated by ScotRail's Public Performance Measure (PPM) which has increased from 83% to over 90% between 2005 and 2010. This has been largely down to paying particular attention to the reliability at key strategic points of the network. The RUS also identifies a number of schemes that are planned within the timeframe and are used as part of the baseline, if funding is made available for them. The projects identified are:

- Edinburgh to Glasgow Improvement Programme (EGIP)
- Airdrie to Bathgate
- Paisley Corridor Improvements
- Borders Railway
- Rolling Stock Cascade
- Tier 3 Development fund

The RUS has used two scenarios to estimate future passenger demand with one assuming a more steady state where the growth seen over the last ten years does not materialise and continue into the future. The second scenario is based on passenger demand forecasts where strong rail growth continues into the future. The interurban market, which is most relevant to Dundee is reported to grow between 48 percent and 74 percent during this ten year look ahead. The analysis from this forecast is that crowding will become more prevalent by 2019 for services operating into and out of Aberdeen. It is anticipated that these high loads would not extend beyond Inverurie and Stonehaven. The forecast Loadings on the Aberdeen to Edinburgh/Glasgow routes will be generally within capacity although for some trains there will be overcrowding on approach to the major centres during the peak times. Freight demand forecast are expected to increase at about an annual rate of approximately 3% between 2006 and 2030.

Gaps and Options most relevant to Dundee City Council

A significant number of gaps are forecast, including lack of early services, future electrification and peak capacity around Glasgow and Edinburgh. The main gaps analysed as part of the Interurban Market which is most relevant to Dundee are:

- Capacity from Stirling to Edinburgh/Glasgow
- Peak capacity at Inverness and Aberdeen
- Service frequency and journey times between key regional centres and the central belt.

The RUS has identified that reducing journey times and improving services between major urban areas is a Strategic objective of the Scottish Government and Regional Transport Partnerships. The RUS recognises that Aberdeen to Glasgow/Edinburgh is a corridor of strategic importance and has considered options how to achieve the government's objectives. The options are:

- Recasting Aberdeen to Central belt as Express Services - This option provides a revised trains service to reduce journey times between Aberdeen and the major centres. This option considers one train per hour express from Aberdeen to Glasgow and one train per hour express to Edinburgh. These trains would only stop at the major centres such as Perth and Dundee en route to both Glasgow and Edinburgh. There would also be one train per hour from Aberdeen to Dundee stopping at all stations.
- Recasting the Aberdeen to Central Belt timetable on improved infrastructure - This option is based on the above option but with additional infrastructure provide on the Montrose - Usan section. This is to remove the capacity constraint (single line section) at Montrose - Usan.

- Review of Line speeds - This option considers potential improvements to increase line speed at Dock Street tunnel north of Dundee, Perth Station, Perth to Barnhill junction, and remodelling of Arbroath Station.
- All day frequency improvement between Glasgow and Dundee - This option improves service frequency between Glasgow and Dundee by extending (to/from Dundee) the 12 current daily Glasgow to Perth services in the 2011 timetable.

Emerging Strategy

The RUS has considered the options from identifying gaps and possible future options to meet those gaps and has produced a proposed draft Strategy.

The RUS Strategy is primarily focused on Control Periods CP 5 and CP 6 which covers between 2014 - 2024 however it also gives details on the proposed infrastructure and service improvements in the current period CP4. It also gives indications and on what the Strategy direction is for Control Period 7. The most relevant intervention in CP 4 is the proposed improvement to the East Coast Mainline service between Edinburgh and London. This has consequences to the Edinburgh and Glasgow to Aberdeen services.

In Control Period 5 and 6 there are no proposals being put forward that have a significant relevance to Dundee City region and the options highlighted above have not been recommended to be taken forward in the medium term (CP5-CP6 up to 2024). The main reason for rejecting the above gap options is on economic grounds. The RUS indicates that consideration should be given to investigate more local services between Perth, Dundee and Carnoustie/Arbroath although this is not to be until Control Period 7 which is beyond 2024 and can be considered as a future long term proposal.

APPENDIX B

Dundee City Council's Response to the Route Utilisation Strategy for Scotland Generation Two - Draft for Consultation.

Dundee City Council welcomes the opportunity to comment on the Route Utilisation Strategy for Scotland Generation Two - Draft for Consultation (RUS) and acknowledges that the rail network is a very important transport link to the other main cities in Scotland namely Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen. The rail network also provides a key link for the city of Dundee to other areas of Scotland and the UK. The Council recognises the benefits and welcomes the recent service improvements by the introduction of a faster Edinburgh to Aberdeen service and the additional hourly service linking Dundee to Edinburgh.

Dundee City Council is extremely disappointed that there has been no recognition of the Tay Estuary Rail Study (TERS) which would provide a local service serving stations between Perth and Arbroath. It seems the only reference to a local service being implemented in the Tayside area is the possibility of one being considered in Control Period 7 which is beyond 2024. The Council through the Tay and Central Scotland Transport Partnership (TACTTRAN) has strongly supported the introduction of a regional service and this is still the case. Dundee City Council request that the TERS work is considered and ultimately actioned so a local suburban train service can be implemented to benefit the area. The scope of the RUS has omitted work streams that are outwith that detailed in paragraph 2.7 of the report and seems to fail in appreciating that the Regional Transport Partnerships (RTPs) are undertaking Rail based work in relation to their Regional Transport Strategies. This work should be assessed by the RUS and Dundee City Council consider that not to include these projects gives the impression that the RUS process is flawed as it is not considering all options as per the principles of Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG). To ensure that effective and efficient use of the Rail Network is maximised all options should be included in the RUS process. The TERS project is one such project that should be included.

The TERS proposals is a key transport proposal that supports economic growth, sustainability and connectivity for the TACTTRAN region. Dundee as the main regional centre serves a far greater population from the region and the TERS proposals would bring significant benefits to the city as better rail connections would provide economic, environmental and transport integration benefits. The City Council is currently progressing with the Central Waterfront Development and the V & A Dundee project which will bring huge benefits to the city and will raise the profile of the city through out the UK and beyond. Transport links and improvements such as TERS are important to ensure that the full potential of these projects is realised.

The omission of the TERS proposal is even more surprising as Transport Scotland, Network Rail and First Scotrail were all represented on the Steering Group that has assisted in directing the TERS work. The TERS work shows that the introduction of a Perth to Arbroath local service would result in the effective and efficient use of the Rail Network as the TERS Benefit to Cost Ratios demonstrate that it performs very favourably in comparison with other rail schemes. The current financial climate puts even more emphasis of obtaining value for money from the Rail network and services. Projects such as TERS can easily demonstrate this, even in austere times.