

KEY INFORMATION

Ward Balgillo

Proposal

Proposed garage extension with study above

Address

The Bungalow Balmossie
Farm
Arbroath Road
Broughty Ferry
Dundee DD5 1QL

Applicant

Mr & Mrs D Bell
The Bungalow
Balmossie Farm
Broughty Ferry
Dundee
DD5 3QZ

Agent**Registered**

15 January 2002

Case Officer

Charlie Walker



Garage Extension Proposed at Balmossie Farm

Proposed garage extension with study above is **RECOMMENDED FOR REFUSAL**. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

It is considered that the large projecting dormer with patio doors will detract from the appearance of this dwelling contrary to Policy H4 of the Plan. Although the house is a considerable distance from the Arbroath Road, its roof will be visible on elevated ground and the conifer hedge will not screen it. The isolated location of the cottage emphasises its prominent position. The proposal is therefore recommended for **REFUSAL**.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought to erect a 2 storey extension to the side of this detached bungalow to provide a large double garage on the ground floor and a study upstairs. The extension will effectively double the plan area of the house but will also provide accommodation on 2 levels. The extension will continue the plan form and roof profile of the existing house but in addition it is proposed to form 2 large dormers on the front elevation, 1 of which will extend to the front wall of the building and to the apex of the roof. It is also proposed to form a balcony on the front elevation.
- Policy H4 of the Plan states that alterations and extensions to houses will not normally be approved where the style and form are alien to the existing building.
- Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and no public response was received.
- It is considered that the large projecting dormer with patio doors and balcony extension will detract from the appearance of this dwelling contrary to Policy H4 of the Plan.
- Design modifications could produce a satisfactory solution. The applicant was contacted to seek a compromise design but he responded to state that he was unwilling to modify his plans.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought to erect a 2 storey extension to the side of this detached bungalow to provide a large double garage on the ground floor and a study upstairs. The extension will effectively double the plan area of the house but will also provide accommodation on 2 levels. The extension will continue the plan form and roof profile of the existing house but in addition it is proposed to form two large dormers on the front elevation, one of which will extend to the front wall of the building and to the apex of the roof. It is also proposed to form a balcony on the front elevation.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The site comprises a detached bungalow, which although of fairly recent construction (1960's approx.), is of a traditional rural design with roughcast walls and a pitched tiled roof. Immediately to the west are 2 traditional stone and slate cottages now converted to a single house. The site is surrounded by a conifer hedge and sits on the private access road to Balmossie Farm some 330 metres from the Arbroath Road. The ground rises uphill from the Arbroath Road so that the 2 houses are visible from the road, albeit at a distance. The conifer hedge screens the house but the roof is visible above this hedge.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Planning Advice Note 36 on the Siting and Design of New Housing in the Countryside, although targeted at new houses rather than extensions to existing houses, contains useful guidance on design matters. It criticises house styles that are more characteristic of suburban than rural areas. It advocates design guidance to ensure that new building is more sympathetic to, and compatible with, traditional buildings of the area.

Rural Development Policies RD2-13 of the adopted Dundee Local Plan 1998 apply to this area but as they focus on new housing they are not directly relevant to the current application.

Policy H4 of the Plan states that alterations and extensions to houses will not normally be approved where

the style and form are alien to the existing building.

LOCAL AGENDA 21

The Councils Agenda 21 Policies seek to value and protect diversity and local distinctiveness.

SITE HISTORY

There is no relevant history of planning applications for this site.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and no public response was received.



CONSULTATIONS

No comment on the development was received from Statutory Consultees.

OBSERVATIONS

The determining issue for the Committee in this instance is whether the proposed development complies with Policy H4 of the adopted Dundee Local Plan 1998 and if not whether there are material considerations that would justify the approval of the application contrary to the Plan.

Normally it is difficult to add a 2 storey extension to a bungalow without producing an unsatisfactory design. Here the existing house has a raised finished floor level and the site of the extension lies well below this, so that a 2 storey extension is acceptable in principle. However it is considered that the large projecting dormer with patio doors and balcony extension will detract from the appearance of this dwelling contrary to Policy H4 of the Plan. The larger of the 2 dormers extends from the wall head to the apex of the roof and will appear very heavy and oversized on the front elevation. The balcony will also appear incongruous but will be less visible than the dormer extension. Although

the house is a considerable distance from the Arbroath Road, its roof will be visible on elevated ground and the conifer hedge will not screen it. The isolated location of the cottage emphasises its prominent position. PAN 36 lends support to the importance of design in the countryside and the need for compatibility with traditional buildings of the area.

Because the design of the proposed extension contravened Policy H4 of the Plan, the applicant was invited to amend his plans. It was considered that there was an opportunity for the applicant to extend his house in a visually satisfactory manner by removing the large dormer and replacing it with a smaller one and to delete the balcony. He wrote back stating that he was unwilling to amend his plans.

In these circumstances it is considered that the proposed development cannot be approved contrary to Policy H4. Even taking into account the distance from the Arbroath Road, it is considered that the proposed development would detract from the appearance of this attractive rural cottage. The conifer hedge does not screen the roof of the dwelling due to its elevated location. It is therefore considered that there are no material considerations that would justify setting aside Policy H4 and approving this application.

DESIGN

The design of the proposed dormer extension will detract from the appearance of this dwelling and will appear very heavy and oversized on the front elevation. This attractive rural cottage, although a distance from the Arbroath Road, is in a visually prominent position and its roof would be visible from that road. It is considered that the design could be amended to produce a satisfactory solution for this development.

CONCLUSION

The design of the proposed extension would detract from the appearance of this attractive rural house contrary to Policy H4 of the adopted Local Plan. Design modifications could produce a satisfactory solution but the applicant is unwilling to modify his plans.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be REFUSED for the following reason(s):-

Reason

- 1 The proposed extension, by reason of the large dormer with sliding doors would detract from the appearance of this rural cottage contrary to Policy H4 of the adopted Dundee Local Plan 1998, and there are no material considerations that would justify departing from the Plan in this instance.