

KEY INFORMATION

Ward Hilltown

Proposal

Replace existing timber fence with concrete blockwork boundary wall

Address

24 Powrie Place
Dundee
DD1 2PQ

Applicant

Mr and Mrs P S Smith
24 Powrie Place
Dundee
DD1 2PQ

Agent

Scot Graeme Developments
Limited
12 Commercial Street
Newtyle
Angus
PH12 8UA

Registered 3 April 2002

Case Officer Julie Finlay



Proposed New Garden Wall in Powrie Place

The replacement of an existing timber fence with a concrete blockwork boundary wall is **RECOMMENDED FOR REFUSAL**. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation.

RECOMMENDATION

It is considered that the proposed wall is contrary to Policies H1 and H4 as it would have an adverse visual impact on the immediate and surrounding area. Furthermore, it would adversely affect the setting of a listed building. Therefore the application is recommended for **REFUSAL**.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought to replace an existing timber fence with a 1.8m high concrete blockwork boundary wall on the south and west boundaries of a dwelling at 24 Powrie Place, Dundee. The dwelling is B-listed.
- Policies H1 and H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 are relevant which seek to protect the amenity of local residents and the appearance of the house and surrounding area.
- No objections were received from neighbouring residents. The application is referred to the Development Quality Committee at the request of the Convenor.
- The proposed materials are not considered satisfactory at this location, which is within the setting of a listed building. A selection of alternative materials have been forwarded to the agent, however these have all been rejected by the applicant on cost grounds. The details of these alternatives are discussed in the "Observations" below.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought to replace an existing 1.8m high timber fence with 1.8m high concrete blockwork boundary wall on the south and west boundaries of a dwelling at 24 Powrie Place. No coping is proposed for the top of the wall and a gate will be located on the south elevation.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the west side of Powrie Place and north side of Whistlers Way. The dwelling is two storey, detached and has a stone finish and slate roof. There is a modern 2 storey extension on the west elevation which is finished in a dry dash render. The house dates from 1854, as inscribed above the front door. There are sash and case replica windows with white inner frames and brown timber outer frames. There is a 1.8m high timber fence around the boundary of the house and garden which has been partially vandalised. There is a parking area to the west. The house was used by the caretaker of the church opposite and was originally linked with the School. There is a new housing redevelopment to the west, which has a mixture of materials and there is a recent wall finished in reconstituted stone along the boundary of the Church opposite.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee Local Plan 1998

H1: Within areas where residential use predominates, developments will be permitted where they do not adversely affect the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents by virtue of design, layout, parking and traffic movement issues, noise or smell.

H4: Alterations to houses will normally be approved provided the appearance of the house and surrounding area is not adversely affected. Approval is, however, unlikely to be granted where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building.

The Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998 by Historic Scotland

provides advice for development within the setting of a listed building.

LOCAL AGENDA 21

The key aims of Local Agenda 21 relevant to this application are that health is protected by creating safe, clean, pleasant environments and places, spaces and objects should combine meaning and beauty with utility.

SITE HISTORY

Planning permission was granted on 22 February 1996 for alterations to a derelict house to form one detached dwelling house (ref: 95/01190/DLB). Planning permission was granted with conditions on 3 September 1996 for the removal and repositioning of a stone cross from the caretakers house to a wall in the Church car park (ref: 96/01295/DLB).



Policy H4 of the Local Plan states that approval is unlikely to be granted where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building. Policy H1 states that developments will be permitted where they do not adversely affect the environmental quality enjoyed by local residents by virtue of design. The Memorandum of Guidance indicates that the presence of walls will often make a significant contribution to the quality of the setting of a listed building. The application was advertised as affecting the setting of a listed building on 6th April 2002.

Discussions and negotiations have taken place with the agent as it is considered that the proposed concrete blockwork would have an adverse visual impact on the setting of the listed building and surrounding area. It is appreciated that a modern two storey extension has been erected on the west elevation which detracts from the appearance and character of the B-listed house. For this reason, a stone

boundary wall, which would seem more appropriate for this location, was not insisted upon. The agent submitted sample blocks of the proposed finish for the wall in order that their suitability could be assessed. It was considered that the two sample blocks provided would have an adverse visual impact on the setting of the listed building and surrounding area.

Suggestions of alternative materials and finishes which were considered to be more

suitable and were presented to the applicant for consideration are as follows:

- a A higher quality replacement timber fence.
- b A harled finish which would blend in with the west gable of the house.
- c Bradstone to match the basecourse of the houses to the west.
- d 4ft brick wall with 2ft high vertically lapped timber fence on top.
- e Brickwork acceptable to the Planning Department.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and no letters of objection were received.

CONSULTATIONS

No adverse comments were received from statutory consultees.

OBSERVATIONS

The determining issues for the Committee in this instance are whether the proposal is in accordance with the policies in the Dundee Local Plan 1998 and whether the design and materials are suitable within the setting of a listed building.

It was indicated that other blockwork and harled finishes had been considered by the applicant but had been rejected on cost grounds. No other samples have been submitted as yet for consideration by this Department. Surrounding finishes were suggested as being more suitable and would blend in more appropriately with the dwelling and the surrounding area. A site meeting was arranged with the applicant to look at surrounding finishes and assess their suitability for the proposed wall. However, cost was emphasised as the reason for not considering these alternative finishes.

The applicant was contacted again and the suggestion of a 4ft high wall with 2ft high robust, vertically lapped timber fence on top was proposed as it was considered it would be within the cost budget of the applicant. This suggestion was discharged by the applicant as they do not wish to use timber due to its higher risk of vandalism and fire hazard.

In these circumstances the proposal cannot be supported as the proposed finish for the wall in standard concrete blocks would have an adverse impact on the visual amenity of the listed building and surrounding area. Therefore the application is recommended for REFUSAL.

Design

It is considered that the proposed design and materials for the wall in standard concrete blocks would have an adverse impact on the setting of a listed building and surrounding area.

CONCLUSION

The proposal is contrary to Policies H1 and H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 as it would have an adverse visual impact on the immediate and surrounding area and would not complement the listed building. There are no material considerations that would allow approval of a standard concrete block wall at this location.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be REFUSED for the following reason(s):

Reasons

- 1 The proposal is contrary to Policies H1 and H4 as the proposed concrete block wall would have an adverse impact on the existing building and surrounding area as the material, style and form do not blend in with the dwelling or surrounding buildings. There are no material considerations that would justify approval contrary to the development plan.
- 2 The proposed wall would have an adverse visual impact on the setting of a listed building as the materials do not blend in with the listed building and there are no material considerations that would justify approval of the application.