

KEY INFORMATION

Ward Broughty Ferry

Proposal

Alterations and extension to existing dwellinghouse

Address

4/6 Camphill Road
Broughty Ferry
Dundee
DD5 2JH

Applicant

R Ferguson
4/6 Camphill Road
Broughty Ferry
Dundee
DD5 2JH

Agent

ARKTX Chartered Architects
20 Lammerton Terrace
Dundee
DD4 7BL

Registered 17 April 2002

Case Officer J Finlay



Proposed Extension to House in Camphill Road

Alterations and extension to an existing dwellinghouse are **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL** subject to conditions. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

The proposed extension is acceptable in terms of Policies H4, BE4 and BE11 of the Local Plan and will result in a much improved dwelling in terms of design and materials. There will be no adverse impact on the residential amenity enjoyed by neighbouring residents. Accordingly, the application is recommended for **APPROVAL** subject to conditions.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought for a two storey extension to the west elevation of a dwelling at 4/6 Camphill Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee.
- The dwelling has a B-listed former Church building to the west and C(s) listed library building to the east and therefore design is an important consideration for the proposed extension. The proposal site is also located within a Conservation Area.
- A letter of objection was received from a neighbouring resident to the west and an objection received from Broughty Ferry Community Council. Objections were raised to the impact of the extension on the Conservation Area, adverse impact on the residential amenity enjoyed by residents to the north and west, overlooking to the west, loss of privacy, potential parking and access problems.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for alterations and a 2 storey extension to the west elevation of a dwelling at 4/6 Camphill Road, Broughty Ferry, and Dundee. The house was previously split into two separate dwelling units on ground and first floor levels and will be one dwelling unit after the proposed extension is developed. The extension will provide a patio/playroom at ground floor level and lounge on the first floor and will provide additional floorspace of approximately 58sqm on each level. It will have a slate roof, cream roughcast render, sliding patio doors on the front elevation and redwood framed windows. The entire house will be re-rendered to match the extension and the windows replaced with replica sash and case redwood windows on the front elevation and single pane redwood windows on the other elevations. An access bridge will be formed from Camphill Road to provide access to the first floor level.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the south side of Camphill Road and north side of Queen Street. The dwelling is a 2 storey detached house with a grey cement render, slate roof and a mixture of white painted timber windows. It is currently split into two separate family units on ground and first floor. There is a B-listed former church building to the west with a detached cottage behind and C(s) listed public library to the east. There is a modern 4 storey flatted development on the opposite side of Camphill Road to the north, with turret features and balconies. The 2 storey house is at a much lower level from Camphill Road and only a top section of the house is visible on the north elevation. There is an access on the north elevation to the first floor level and steps down to the house from Camphill Road with red painted iron railings, which will be re-used on a proposed access bridge.



POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee Local Plan 1998

H4: Alterations and extensions to houses will normally be approved provided the appearance of the house and surrounding area is not adversely affected. Approval is, however, unlikely to be granted where the siting and scale of the extension significantly affects the degree of sunlight, daylight and/or privacy enjoyed by the occupants of adjoining property; where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building; and where more than 50% of the original garden ground would be lost and off street parking provision reduced.

BE4: Development in Garden Ground

- All new developments will be required to meet specified criteria including a high quality design and materials appropriate to its surroundings.

BE11: Within Conservation Areas all development proposals will be expected to complement and enhance the character of the surrounding area.

LOCAL AGENDA 21

The key aims of Local Agenda 21 are that health is protected by creating safe, clean, pleasant environments and places, spaces and objects should combine meaning and beauty with utility.

SITE HISTORY

Planning permission was granted for an extension to 6 Camphill Road in September 1987 (ref: 87/12536/D) and planning permission was granted for the formation of a hardstanding and a

gateway in August 1984 (ref: 84/10057/D).

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and the development was advertised as affecting the setting of a Listed Building and Conservation Area on 30th April 2002. A letter of objection was received from a neighbouring resident at 2 Camphill Road stating concerns about overlooking, loss of privacy, adverse visual impact on Conservation Area and traffic and access problems. A letter of objection was also received from Broughty Ferry Community Council stating concerns about adverse impact on residential amenity for those to the north of the development site.

CONSULTATIONS

No adverse comments were received from any of the statutory consultees.

OBSERVATIONS

The determining issues for the Committee in this instance are:

- 1 Whether the proposed development complies with Policy BE4 of the Local Plan;
- 2 Whether the proposed development would adversely affect the setting of the Conservation Area; and
- 3 Whether the proposed development would adversely affect the residential amenities enjoyed by adjoining occupiers protected by Policy H4 of the Local Plan.

Policy BE4 specifies criteria to be met when development is proposed within garden ground areas. This includes the requirement for a high quality design and materials appropriate to its surroundings. It is proposed to re-render the existing house to match the extension and this is considered to be an improvement. The windows will be replaced with redwood windows and replica sash and case on the front elevation. The extension will blend in with the existing dwelling in terms of design and materials. The dwelling has considerable garden ground to the front of the house and patio area to the west and the proposed extension will

not use a significant amount of this area. It is considered that the proposal satisfies all other specified criteria in Policy BE4.

The existing dwelling is a relatively simple design and is not of outstanding quality. The proposed alterations, which include replacing windows and re-rendering the entire house to match the proposed extension, will result in a more improved dwelling in terms of visual appearance in this Conservation Area. The dwelling will complement and enhance the surrounding buildings and area with the proposed alterations, especially when viewed from the south as the site is very exposed from Queen Street.

Objections were received from Broughty Ferry Community Council stating that the proposal will have an adverse impact on the residential amenity enjoyed by residents in the flatted development to the north. Loss of view if not a valid planning objection and the extension will not result in overshadowing or overlooking for these residents. The agent provided a survey section taken from the development to the Carbet Castle flats to the north and it indicates a considerable drop in level from one to the other. Therefore it can be concluded that the proposal will not have an adverse impact on the amenity enjoyed by these residents.

Objections were received from a resident at 2 Camphill Road, whose main concerns are with potential overlooking into their back garden. The proposal includes balconies at ground and first floor levels on the front elevation. The issue of potential overlooking from the first floor balcony was raised with the agent and the suitability of a balcony at this level questioned. The agent subsequently submitted amended plans, which include the addition of a wall 1.2m in length and extending the height of the extension, and located to the west of the proposed balconies. A condition will be attached to ensure that this proposed screen is finished in appropriate materials to complement the dwelling and surrounding Conservation Area. This screen wall is proposed as a measure to eradicate any potential overlooking and a sketch of sightlines was submitted which indicates there will be no overlooking into the property or garden to the west. It should be noted that the garden area

at no 2 is already overlooked from Camphill Road. The proposal is located to the north of the existing adjacent cottage and therefore there will be no loss of daylight. Objections were raised to parking problems and the need for additional parking spaces. The property will be reduced from two flats to one residential unit and this does not require additional parking space. The current access to Queen Street will be used for vehicular access to the property. The proposal is in accordance with Policy H4 for the aforementioned reasons.

Taking all the above into consideration, the proposal is in accordance with the relevant policies in the Dundee Local Plan 1998 and the proposal will result in an improved appearance of this dwelling within a Conservation Area. There are no material considerations that would justify refusal of the application in these circumstances. Therefore the application is recommended for APPROVAL subject to conditions.

Design

The design of the proposed extension will blend in with the design and materials of the existing dwelling and the entire house will be re-rendered and have replica sash and case redwood replacement windows installed. It is considered that this will improve the appearance of the house considerably in this Conservation Area.

CONCLUSION

The proposal is in accordance with Policies H4, BE4 and BE11 of the Local Plan and the resultant dwelling will have a much improved design and appearance and will complement and enhance the surrounding buildings and Conservation Area. The objections have been addressed satisfactorily and there will be no loss of residential amenity for neighbours. There are no material considerations that would justify refusal of the application.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:

- 1 The development hereby permitted shall be commenced

within five years from the date of this permission

- 2 Details of the proposed materials and finishes for the screen on the front elevation and to the west of the balconies shall be submitted to the Council for approval before any development is commenced and if approved the development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details
- 3 The dwelling shall only be used as one residential unit and separate permission will be required to split the property into separate units

Reasons

- 1 To comply with Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development which is located within a Conservation Area
- 3 To ensure adequate parking provision within the development in the interests of the amenities and highway safety