

KEY INFORMATION

Ward Broughty Ferry

Proposal

Extension to south elevation and alterations to dwellinghouse

Address

34 Monifieth Road
Broughty Ferry
Dundee
DD5 2RU

Applicant

Mr & Mrs S Gillespie
34 Monifieth Road
Broughty Ferry
Dundee
DD5 2RU

Agent

Registered 13 May 2002

Case Officer J Finlay



Proposed Rear Extension to House in Monifieth Road

An extension and alterations to an existing dwellinghouse is **RECOMMENDED FOR REFUSAL**. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

The proposed extension is unacceptable in terms of Policy H4 as it is considered there will be an unacceptable degree of overshadowing and loss of light from the proposed extension for the adjacent neighbours to the east. Therefore the application is recommended for **REFUSAL**.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought for a 1.5 storey extension to the rear (west) elevation of a semi-detached house at 34 Monifieth Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee.
- One letter of objection was received from an adjacent neighbour to the east and the main points of concern are potential loss of daylight, overshadowing, appearance and scale of extension and potential precedence being set.
- Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 is relevant which states that extensions to houses will normally be approved provided the appearance of the house and surrounding area is not adversely affected by loss of light, overshadowing or loss of privacy.
- It is considered that the scale of the extension will result in an adverse impact on the residential amenity enjoyed by neighbours to the east due to overshadowing of the garden ground and adverse visual impact of a blank gable wall over 6m high.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for a 1.5 storey rear extension on a semi-detached 2 storey dwelling at 34 Monifieth Road. The extension will provide a kitchen and dining area on the ground floor and sitting room and study on the upper floor. Its dimensions are approximately 6.8m in length, 4.5m wide and 6.1m in height. The proposed materials are facing brick and slate roof to match the existing roof.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the south side of Monifieth Road and it is a 2 storey semi-detached stone-built dwelling with slate roof, sandstone on the front elevation and brick built walls at the back of the house. There is a small one storey brick boiler house on the rear elevation and timber shed on the west elevation. There is a stone boundary wall 1m high along the east boundary and 1m red brick wall along the west boundary. There is a 1.8m high timber fence along the rear (south) boundary.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee Local Plan 1998

H4: Alterations and extensions to houses will normally be approved provided the appearance of the house and surrounding area is not adversely affected. Approval is, however, unlikely to be granted where the siting and scale of the extension significantly affects the degree of sunlight, daylight and/or privacy enjoyed by the occupants of adjoining property; where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building; and where more than 50% of the original garden ground would be lost.

BE4: All new developments within areas allocated as garden ground areas will be required to meet specific criteria. This includes the requirement for a high quality design, extensions exceeding 20% of the volume of the original building will not be acceptable unless designed in such a way as to appear independent and linked discreetly to the original house.

LOCAL AGENDA 21

The key aims of Local Agenda 21 relevant to this application are that health is protected by creating safe, clean, pleasant environments and places, spaces and objects should combine meaning and beauty with utility.

SITE HISTORY

There is no site history of relevance to the application site.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and one letter of objection was received from the adjoining neighbours to the east stating concerns about loss of daylight, overshadowing, appearance and scale of extension and potential precedence being set upon area.



CONSULTATIONS

The relevant Council Departments and other bodies were consulted and no adverse comments were received.

OBSERVATIONS

The determining issues for the Committee in this instance are whether the proposal complies with the policies in the Local Plan and if so, whether it would have such an adverse impact on the amenity enjoyed by adjoining neighbours to merit refusal of the application contrary to the provisions of the Plan.

Policy H4 states that extensions will normally be approved provided the appearance of the house and surrounding area is not adversely affected. Approval is, however, unlikely to be granted where the siting and scale of the extension significantly

affects the degree of sunlight, daylight and/or privacy enjoyed by the occupants of adjoining property; where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building; and where more than 50% of original garden ground would be lost and off street parking provision reduced. Policy BE4 requires the proposal to be of a high quality design and use materials appropriate to its surroundings. Extensions exceeding 20% of the volume of the original building will not be acceptable unless designed in such a way as to appear independent and linked discreetly to the original house. It is considered that the proposal is acceptable in terms of Policy BE4 requirements and the terms of Policy H4 will be discussed in the sections below.

An objection was received from adjacent neighbours to the east stating concerns about the proposed extension over-dominating the existing house and will therefore have a significant impact on the neighbouring house due to its resultant height and length/depth into the garden which will lead to a significant loss of daylight and overshadowing of habitable rooms and garden. Furthermore, they object to the appearance and scale of the proposed east boundary brick wall and unacceptable precedent being set upon area.

A justification was submitted by the agent on 28th June 2002 which argued that there will be no significant loss of light for the kitchen window at ground floor level. The reason is that a shadow is currently cast over this window by an existing single storey section of the house. The agent agrees that there will be overshadowing onto the garden ground at 36 Monifieth Road. However, they argue that there is significant overshadowing at present by a two storey extension at 30 Monifieth Road. It is agreed that due to the form of the existing house with various heights at the back, there will not be overshadowing or loss of daylight in the conservatory of the dwelling at no 36. The applicants are not prepared to reduce the extension to single storey due to the additional floorspace desired. In any event, they consider that any overshadowing caused by the proposed extension would not be

decreased significantly by reducing the height to single storey.

A letter of support was received from the applicant on 5 July 2002 which raised similar issues. Photographs have been submitted as supporting information, which show existing overshadowing from neighbouring properties. It states that the upper storey of the proposed extension is required as a study, which it is hoped will be used as a child's nursery/bedroom in the future. The staircase has been positioned in such a way so that the room can be subdivided with a stud partition wall at a later date, if necessary. The applicant states that any overshadowing of the garden ground will be minimal as there is already considerable overshadowing in the late afternoon.

The applicant agrees that the extension will cause overshadowing for the adjacent neighbours, albeit minimal. It is considered that due to the proposed height of the extension which is 6.1m, there will be a significant degree of overshadowing and loss of light for the neighbouring residents to the east. Further, it is considered that the east gable wall will have an adverse visual impact for the neighbours to the east due to its scale and massing. There are no material considerations that would allow the application to be recommended for approval in these circumstances. Therefore the application is recommended for REFUSAL.

DESIGN

The proposed materials and design will blend in with the existing dwelling and so the proposal is acceptable in design terms. Should Members decide to approve the application, it is recommended that a condition be applied requiring that the east gable wall is finished in a light/white colour to reflect light. The applicant has agreed to such a condition being applied.

CONCLUSION

It is considered that the proposal is contrary to Policy H4 as there will be significant overshadowing for the garden ground at 36 Monifieth Road due to the height of the 1.5 storey extension which will be over 6m in height.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be REFUSED for the following reason:

Reason

- 1 The proposal is contrary to Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 as there would be an unacceptable loss of daylight and overshadowing for neighbouring residents to the east.