

KEY INFORMATION

Ward Brackens

Proposal

Development of 2 separate primary/nursery schools and associated facilities.

Address

MacAlpine Primary School
St Leonard Road
Dundee

Applicant

Anne Wilson, Director of Education
Dundee City Council
Floor 8, Tayside House
28 Crichton Street
Dundee DD1 3RJ

Agent

Denis Thornton, Dundee
Schools PPP Projects
Floor 8, City House
Overgate
Dundee DD1 1UH

Registered 28 Feb 2003

Case Officer R Anderson



Replacement proposed for MacAlpine Primary School

The Development of 2 separate primary/nursery schools and associated facilities is **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS**. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

It is considered that the new schools can be accommodated on the site which takes account of residential amenity, access requirements, open space provision and landscaping interests. The proposal conforms with national and local planning guidance. Accordingly, the application is recommended for approval subject to conditions.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- The Council's Education Department is looking to improve education facilities throughout the council area as part of a Public Private Partnership (PPP) project.
- The application is part of a series of applications submitted after funding has been secured from the Scottish Executive. It seeks to agree the principle of redeveloping the site for two new primary schools and associated facilities.
- Two letters of objection were received. The main issues related to the impact of the development on surrounding residential amenity, lack of parking and increases in traffic levels.
- It is considered that a replacement school could be accommodated on the site without detriment to residential amenity and taking account of access, open space provision, and landscaping.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Outline Planning permission is sought to demolish and replace the existing primary school at MacAlpine primary school. It is proposed that two new 460 place primary schools with two 0-5 age group nursery, community facilities comprising a main sports hall, smaller gym, 2 community rooms, 2 parent resource rooms and a community office, 2 5 - a - side pitches and parking will be provided. No details have been provided with the application at this outline stage. However the submitted indicative plans (not forming part of the application) do indicate that the school buildings will be situated in the west and south east of the site with the pitches to the north. It must be stressed however that these indicative plans merely indicate that the site can accommodate the level of development proposed. Vehicular access will be provided to the south of the site off St Leonard Place.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The site, measuring some 3.64 Ha in area, is located in the north west of Dundee some 3.5km north of the city centre immediately to the north and west of St Leonard Place and MacAlpine Roads respectively. It is bounded to the west, north and east by residential properties, whilst to the south is public open space and St Leonards Church. Currently on the site is a substantial concrete and flat roofed building which is the current primary school, whilst to the south of the site is a cleared area which used to house part of the primary school latterly used as a YMCA. Extensive areas of green open space are located mainly to the west, south and north of the main school, with trees along the southern boundary. The main school entrances are currently located to the north and east of the site.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

Dundee Local Plan 1998

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy H1 of the Dundee Local Plan indicates that in predominately residential areas, developments which do not adversely affect environmental quality by virtue of design, layout, traffic, parking noise and smells and are in accordance with other policies in the plan will be permitted.

Policy SCE5 encourages the dual use of school buildings and associated facilities for dual uses including the wider community.

Policy OS1 (schools) encourages the retention of open space within schools or on land associated with school uses.

Policy LT11 seeks to ensure that there is an adequate provision of sports facilities throughout the council area.



Policy LT14 encourages dual use of open space associated with schools for community uses. It also indicates that the loss of open space maybe acceptable where the alternative uses are appropriate and don't have a negative impact on surrounding land uses.

ENV 12 encourages the retention of existing trees.

Dundee Urban Nature Conservation Subject Local Plan 1995

The site is not in one of the wildlife corridors identified in the Urban Nature Conservation Plan.

Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 68 - Dual Use of Open Space within School Grounds

Policy 72 - Trees and Urban Woodland

Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

The following are of relevance:

The removal of sports pitches for any development is not generally supported under NPPG 11 - Sport, Physical Recreation and Open Space. However where development is in an area of the playing fields where it will not affect it's sporting potential or amenity value it may be acceptable.

Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

There are no non statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application

LOCAL AGENDA 21

Key Theme 4 is of relevance and seeks to ensure that local needs are met locally. The theme seeks to encourage the use of school buildings for community uses. The application incorporates community provision within the proposals. Key theme 7 is also relevant and seeks to ensure that access to facilities, services, goods and people is not achieved at the expense of the environment and are accessible to all. The improved schools and the provision of community facilities will improve on existing facilities for the residents in the surrounding area. Key theme 12 is also relevant and seeks to ensure that opportunities for culture, leisure and recreation are readily available to all. The incorporation of community provision in the proposal will meet the aims of this key theme.

SITE HISTORY

02/00158/OUT - Outline erection of replacement primary school - Approved April 2002

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Two letters of objection have been received regarding the application. The main issues arising are

The impact on residential amenity particularly from the effects of floodlights

- Increase in traffic
- The siting of the pitches
- Lack of parking provision

These matters will be considered in the "Observations" section of this report.

CONSULTATIONS

Sportscotland support the provision of indoor facilities and will offer advice when necessary on the specification for outdoor facilities.

The Director of Leisure and Arts has requested details of any landscaping proposed, including replacement planting if required. Existing trees should be retained and incorporated into comprehensive landscaping plans.

The Scottish Environment Protection Agency have indicated that the preferred method of surface water discharge is via SUDS and encourage early consultation with relevant parties to design an appropriate solution.

OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with the provisions of Section 25 of the Act the Committee is required to consider

- whether the proposals are consistent with the provisions of the development plan; and if not
- whether an exception to the provisions of the development plan is justified by other material considerations

The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

Policy H1 - The main question is whether the site is capable of accommodating two schools and associated facilities without detriment to surrounding land uses. The site is extensive and with the removal of the existing building and the previously

removed building it is envisaged that two schools could be developed which will not adversely affect neighbouring properties which at any point would be some distance away. There was up until very recently two buildings on the site. The daily influx of pupils into the area is something residents are used to and therefore even with increased numbers there would be no significant change to existing amenity. Any noise emanating from the school would be realised during daytime hours when a level of disruption at break times is to be expected. The proposed community uses are to be mainly used during daytime hours. Any evening use of the community facilities is likely to be carried out indoors. In terms of the design of the new buildings and their impact, these issues are not known at this stage and will be considered in a subsequent detailed application.

In terms of traffic and parking the existing roads around the school are publicly maintained and regularly accommodate increases in traffic at key periods of the day. Although the number of pupils visiting the site will increase and potentially more vehicles will visit the area the patterns and timing of traffic will not change and subsequently neither will the impact on local residents. Many pupils attending the school will live locally and will be encouraged to use public transport and walk to school. With regard to parking provision the site is surrounded by on street parking and is fairly extensive. It is considered that considerable parking areas and modern turning/access facilities commensurate with the land use proposed should be included in any detailed proposal. As part of the detailed plans full transport assessments should be undertaken covering access, parking, drop off/pick up points, cycling and traffic plans. This again will ensure that the impact to surrounding residents is minimised. The proposal therefore conforms to policy H1 of the Local Plan.

Policy LT14 - In the majority school sites there are extensive areas of playing fields which are also a valuable community resource. In this case there are large areas of open space to the south and west of the site. Although the extent of new building is not known at this stage it is anticipated that, as there were two buildings on the site in the recent past, with extensive play areas remaining, this arrangement

can be achieved with this proposal. If the amount of open space is less than there is at present the increase in community facilities which will be provided in the buildings, will make up for any loss of open space. The playing fields provided and the indoor facilities will ensure that the site is used by the community and the school. It is considered that such provision would be in keeping with policy LT14.

Policy SCE5 - Again this policy promotes the shared use of school facilities and playing fields for community use. As indicated above the proposal is in keeping with this policy.

Policy OS1 - It is not clear from this application how much open space will remain as the precise details of development are not known at this stage. However it is clear that open space will be provided which will cater for two five a side pitches and playground areas.

Policy LT11 - As indicated in considerations above the introduction of community facilities into the design of the new school will bring benefit to the wider community and is supported under this policy.

ENV 12 - there are some mature trees to the north east of the existing site which do form an important element in the appearance of the site. Although no details have been provided on landscaping a condition will be attached to the consent which requires full landscaping plans including tree surveys to be included as part of any detailed submission. This issue will be dealt with at that stage. But as part of this application the trees are not being removed and therefore the proposal conforms to this policy

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the provisions of the development plan.

Other Material Considerations

The other material considerations to be taken into account are as follows:

Policy 68 - The same considerations for this policy are outlined in considerations for policy OS1 above.

Policy 72 - The same considerations for this policy are outlined in the considerations for policy ENV12 above.

NPPG 11 - Sport, Physical Recreation and Open Space - In the majority of cases school sites come with extensive areas of playing fields which are also a valuable community resource. National Policy is to ensure that the loss of such resources is minimised. In this case there are existing areas of open space/playing fields to the south and west of the site. Although the extent of new development is not precisely known at this stage the indicative plans show sufficient areas of open space with formal pitches. This is in addition to the play areas, which can also be accessed for recreational uses. Such provision would be in keeping with NPPG 11.

The points raised by the objectors

- The impact on residential amenity particularly from the effects of floodlights
- Increase in traffic
- The siting of the pitches
- Lack of parking provision

The impact on amenity of surrounding residential properties - At present the site in question houses a large primary school and areas of recreational space including play areas. The proposal is to incorporate the same facilities in two separate buildings. Although the plans show an indicative layout it is not certain at this stage where any of the proposed development will be located - although the school buildings are shown in a different location from the existing and former buildings. These buildings appear sufficiently far from residential properties so as not to have a negative impact on amenity. The open grass area indicated to the north of the site contains two five - a - side football pitches. These pitches will not be floodlit (indeed the council's policy is that no floodlights will be incorporated into any of the primary school proposals) and will be formally laid out and marked. Essentially this area will be used similar to open space and it is anticipated that there will be no significant difference on the impact on surrounding residences as there is at present.

In terms of the reduction in access in and around the site - the precise location of accesses into and out of the site are not known at present, but the new schools will require modern contemporary standards of facilities of

which access will be one. It is considered that access into the site will be designed to the best standards available at the time. The detailed scheme will also incorporate appropriate parking standards, which will be in line with the council's general policy of limiting parking provision in favour of encouraging more "greener" modes of transport to be used.

With regard to the perceived increase in traffic for the area it is anticipated that as the number of schools and facilities on the site is increasing there will be an increase in traffic levels. However similar to the existing arrangements these increased traffic levels are mainly realised at key periods of the day and can be anticipated. It is unlikely that the community uses later in the evening time will generate similar levels of traffic and again can be easily absorbed into the existing road network. The road network around the site contains two main roads in St Leonards Place and MacAlpine Road and provides good access for increased levels of traffic. It is anticipated that any increase in traffic will not cause significant additional detriment to surrounding residences, however this cannot be confirmed until detailed transport studies are undertaken.

It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be accorded to any of the material considerations such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted with conditions.

Design

No details of the building design or layout have been put forward at this stage in the process.

CONCLUSION

The provision of new primary schools and community facilities is encouraged by the council and will benefit the public in this area of the city. The size of the site and its current use render it capable of accommodating the development without impacting detrimentally on surrounding residents. Appropriate parking and access arrangements can be included in the site as part of the proposed development and should be the subject

of conditions. Playing field provision and the maintenance of landscaping should also be the subject of conditions and included in detailed plans. Accordingly approval subject to conditions is recommended.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that planning permission be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:-

- 1 Before development commences written approval from the planning authority must be obtained for the details of the siting, design and external appearance of any building(s), the means of access and landscaping.
- 2 Plans and particulars of the reserved matters referred to in Condition 1 above shall be submitted for consideration by the planning authority and no work shall begin until the written approval of the authority has been given.
- 3 Application for approval of reserved matters shall be made to the planning authority within 3 years from the date of this permission.
- 4 The development hereby permitted shall commence within 5 years from the date of this permission, or within 2 years from the date of approval by the planning authority of the last of the reserved matter
- 5 That a traffic assessment including access/egress and parking provision be submitted to the Council for approval prior to the commencement of development and if approved the proposed development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.
- 6 That details of all plant and equipment shall be submitted to the Council for approval prior to the commencement of development and if approved the proposed development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.
- 7 That a tree survey of the application site shall (in accordance with BS 5837) be carried out and a Report setting out details of all trees and

proposal for the retention and/or removal submitted to the Council for approval prior to the commencement of development and if approved the proposed development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.

Reasons

- 1 To reserve these matters for future consideration by the Council.
- 2 To ensure that all reserve matters are submitted for consideration by the planning authority.
- 3 To comply with section 59 of the of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) act 1997.
- 4 To comply with section 59 of the of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) act 1997.
- 5 To ensure that the proposals can be accommodated within the existing road network.
- 6 To ensure that the proposed development does not have a detrimental affect on the environmental quality of existing residents.
- 7 To allow for an assessment of the existing trees within the site and to establish which should be retained or removed.