

**KEY INFORMATION**

**Ward** West Ferry

**Proposal**

Formation of dormer on north elevation

**Address**

35 Balgillo Road  
Broughty Ferry  
Dundee  
DD5 3LW

**Applicant**

Mr & Mrs Ferguson  
35 Balgillo Road  
Broughty Ferry  
Dundee  
DD5 3LW

**Agent**

G D Architectural Services  
101 Brook Street  
Monifieth

**Registered** 31 Mar 2003

**Case Officer** J Finlay



The formation of a dormer extension is **RECOMMENDED FOR REFUSAL**. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

**RECOMMENDATION**

The proposed dormer would have an adverse visual impact on the property and surrounding area and is not considered to be acceptable in this instance.

The application is recommended for **REFUSAL**.

**SUMMARY OF REPORT**

- Planning permission is sought for a dormer extension on the front (north) elevation of the dwelling at 35 Balgillo Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee.
- The application raises issues for consideration in terms of Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 and Policy 14 of the Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review.
- The application is referred to the Development Quality Committee meeting at the request of the local Councillor.
- It is considered that the proposed dormer would have an adverse visual impact on the property and surrounding area. The proposal is considered to be contrary to Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 and Policies 14 and 55 of the Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review.
- A more attractive style of dormer could be produced, mirroring the appearance of other dormers in this area, but the applicants wish to provide a bathroom only and not to further alter the internal layout to achieve a satisfactory design solution.

## DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Planning permission is sought for the formation of a dormer on the front elevation of 35 Balgillo Road, Broughty Ferry to form a shower room. It will be finished in PVC cladding on the outer walls and flat felt roof and extend almost to the ridgeline of the roof. It will have one small double window with obscure glass to the west end of the front elevation and a small single window on the west elevation of the dormer.

## SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the south side of Balgillo Road and it is a semi-detached bungalow with large double dormer on the rear elevation which extends the full length of the roof and provides two bedrooms on the upper level. The house is finished in a dry dash render, brick basecourse and tiled roof. There are no front dormers on the other half of the semi-detached property to the east. However there are numerous dormers on the front elevation of other houses along Balgillo Road.

## POLICY BACKGROUND

### Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

### Dundee Local Plan 1998

The following policies are of relevance:

H4: Alterations and extensions to houses will normally be approved provided the appearance of the house and surrounding area is not adversely affected. Approval is, however, unlikely to be granted where the siting and scale of the extension significantly affects the degree of sunlight, daylight and/or privacy enjoyed by the occupants of adjoining property; where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building; and where more than 50% of the original garden ground would be lost and off street parking provision reduced.

### Dundee Urban Nature Conservation Subject Local Plan 1995

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

### Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 14: Alterations and Extensions - Proposals to alter or extend existing dwellinghouses will only be permitted where:



- there is no adverse impact on the appearance of prominent elevations of the house; and
- there is no significant loss of sunlight, daylight or privacy to the occupants of neighbouring properties; and
- more than 50% of the original useable garden area will be retained; and
- the design and materials respect the character of the existing building.

Policy 55 promotes good design standards.

### Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

The Governments Policy on Architecture 2001 and Designing Places 2001 emphasise the importance of design in the planning process.

## Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

The Council's Urban Design Guide is of relevance.

## LOCAL AGENDA 21

Key theme 15 is relevant to the consideration of this application and seeks to ensure that diversity and local distinctiveness are valued and protected.

## SITE HISTORY

There is no planning history of direct relevance to the application site in these circumstances.

## PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Statutory neighbour notification was carried out and no letters of objection were received.

## CONSULTATIONS

No adverse comments were received from any of the statutory consultees.

## OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with the provisions of Section 25 of the Act the Committee is required to consider:

- whether the proposals are consistent with the provisions of the development plan; and if not
- whether an exception to the provisions of the development plan is justified by other material considerations.

## The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

Policy H4 seeks to ensure that alterations and extensions do not detrimentally affect the appearance of the house and surrounding area. The Policy indicates that consent is unlikely to be granted where the materials, style and form are alien to the existing building.

The application property where the dormer is proposed is a single storey semi-detached house and it already has

a large dormer extension on the rear elevation. It and the adjoining house have no dormers on the front elevation. Although a number of houses on Balgillo Road have front dormers these are of a much more attractive style with extensive areas of glazing. That style of dormer would be acceptable at this property. However it would involve the applicants reconsidering the internal layout of their house and providing bedroom accommodation to the front of the house. They are unwilling to do this as they wish only to provide an upstairs bathroom to the front of the house.

Concerns were raised at the outset by officers regarding the design of the dormer and its visual impact on the house and surrounding area. It appears as a large unattractive heavy box on the front of the house. Its unattractive appearance is accentuated by the small proportion of glazing to solid walls and the fact that it extends almost to the ridgeline of the house. The applicants have submitted amendments to the design of the dormer in an attempt to address the concerns raised by the Council. However these amendments do not change the overall appearance of the dormer. A more attractive style of dormer could be produced, mirroring the appearance of other dormers in this area. However the applicants wish only to provide an upstairs bathroom to the front of the house and not to consider alternatives for the internal layout which such a design solution would involve.

It is considered the proposed dormer would still result in over dominant features and detract from the appearance of the house. In addition, the dormer will result in an incongruous feature in the streetscape and detract from the visual appearance of the surrounding area. It is considered that the proposal is not in accordance with Policy H4 in the Dundee Local Plan 1998.

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal does not comply with the provisions of the development plan.

### **Other Material Considerations**

The other material considerations to be taken into account are as follows:

## **Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review**

Policy 14 reiterates the advice given in Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998. It is considered that the proposal does not comply with this policy for the same reasons as discussed in connection with Policy H4 of the adopted Local Plan above. In addition, the policy indicates that extensions will only be permitted where they do not adversely impact on a prominent elevation of the house. It is considered that the dominance and appearance of the proposed dormer on the front elevation will detract from this prominent elevation. Furthermore, the design does not respect the character of the existing building, which has quite a shallow pitched roof.

Policy 55 states that for all new development the emphasis will be on design quality. The preamble to this policy refers to Government policy on design and the Council's Urban Design Guide. It is considered that the proposed development does not meet the requirements for good quality design in Policy 55 of the Finalised Local Plan.

Government advice on design in the "Policy on Architecture" 2001 and "Designing Places" 2001 emphasises the importance of design in the planning process.

The Dundee Urban Design Guide 2001 also emphasises the importance of good design. It is considered that the design of the proposed extension fails to meet the aspirations of the Urban Design Guide.

It is accepted that there may be past examples of poor dormer extensions to the front of properties not dissimilar to the current proposals. However the increased emphasis on good design both in Government Guidance and in the Council's Urban Design Guide suggest that any extensions permitted in the past should not be used as a precedent for approving development of poor design now.

It is concluded from the foregoing the material considerations all weigh against the granting of planning permission. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be refused.

## **Design**

The design of the proposed dormer is not in keeping with the existing house and presents an over dominant feature fronting onto Balgillo Road. It appears as a large unattractive heavy box on the front of the house. Its unattractive appearance is accentuated by the small proportion of glazing to solid walls and the fact that it extends almost to the ridgeline of the house.

## **CONCLUSION**

It is considered that the proposal is not in accordance with Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998 or Policies 14 and 55 of the Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review due to the design and adverse visual impact on the house and surrounding area. There are no material considerations that would justify approval in these circumstances.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

It is recommended that planning permission be REFUSED for the following reasons:

### **Reasons**

- 1 The proposed dormer is not in accordance with Policy H4 of the Dundee Local Plan 1998, as it would have an adverse impact on the visual appearance of the house and surrounding area. There are no material considerations that would justify departing from the policies of the development plan in this instance.
- 2 The proposed dormer is not in accordance with Policies 14 and 55 of the Finalised Dundee Local Plan Review as it would have an adverse visual impact on a prominent elevation of the house and the design does not respect the character of the existing building. There are no material considerations that would justify otherwise in this instance.