

KEY INFORMATION**Ward** West End**Proposal**

Alterations and three storey rear extension to form additional accommodation.

Address

Queens Hotel
160 Nethergate
Dundee

Applicant

Queens Hotel
160 Nethergate
Dundee

Agent

Mast Architecture & Design
Ltd
Park Lane House
47 Broad Street
Glasgow
G20 2QW

Registered 21 Dec 2006**Case Officer** B Knox

Extension Proposed to Listed Building in Nethergate

The proposed extension is **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL** subject to conditions. Report by Director of Planning and Transportation

RECOMMENDATION

This proposal complies with Policy 60 and Policy 61 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005. The statutory duty set out in Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 is also discharged. The application is recommended for **APPROVAL** with conditions.

SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Listed Building Consent is sought for alterations to an existing hotel within the city and the formation of a three storey rear extension to form additional accommodation.
- Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and Policy 60 (Alterations to Listed Buildings) and Policy 61 (Development in Conservation Areas) of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 require the Council to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess.
- One letter of objection has been received to the application which raises concerns regarding the design.
- It is considered that the development will preserve and enhance the appearance and character of the listed building and consequently the criteria of Policy 60 and 61 and the requirements of Section 14 of the Act are discharged. There are no material considerations that would justify a decision contrary to this. The application will require to be sent to Historic Scotland should the Members be minded to support the proposals.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

The application proposes the erection of a 30 bedroom extension of three storeys to be located to the rear of the existing hotel in the car park area. The extension would provide additional bedrooms, an ante room and an entrance lobby. To make best use of the topography and site characteristics, the extension will have a void to the ground floor level and be supported by columns. The remaining void will allow car parking spaces to be retained and will be screened by a sculptural metal artwork panel. The entrance feature will be finished in a buff ashlar block and the remainder of the extension will be finished in materials including a standing seam zinc roof with green copper colour cladding and a smooth acrylic render.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the Nethergate west of South Tay Street. The property is a Category B Listed hotel and is a four and a half storey building, retaining much of its traditional external appearance. Internally, some of the features remain but mainly to the lower floors of the building.

There is a bank to the east of the site and commercial and retail uses directly opposite the hotel to the Nethergate frontage. The Sensation science centre is located to the rear of the hotel. The ground in this area slopes considerably in a north west to south east direction meaning that the science centre is at a much lower ground level than the hotel and can be accessed by stairs which are located at the rear of the Queens Hotel car park area.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

Dundee Local Plan Review 2005

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 60: Alterations to Listed Buildings - the alteration of a listed building will only be acceptable where

the proposals have regard to the preservation or enhancement of its architectural or historic character. Alterations will not be permitted where the works would diminish the architectural integrity of the building or its historic interest.

The City Council will provide specific supplementary guidance on the following: window and door alterations, advertisements, shopfronts, roller shutters, treatments to masonry and painting and use of materials.

Policy 61: Development in Conservation Areas - within Conservation Areas all development proposals will be expected to preserve or enhance the character of the surrounding area. This will require the retention of all features which contribute to the character and appearance including unlisted buildings of townscape interest, trees and landscape features and the historic pattern of streets and spaces, as identified in the Conservation Area management plans to be advanced in the near future.



Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

The following are of relevance:

National Planning Policy Guideline 18: Planning and the Historic Environment sets out the framework for dealing with applications affecting listed buildings.

Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998 (Historic Scotland).

Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

There are no non statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application.

SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES

There are no specific sustainability policy implications arising from this application.

SITE HISTORY

There have been a number of minor alterations to the interior and exterior of the building in the past years but none of these have relevance to the determination of the current application.

A recent application for Listed Building Consent for the internal alterations to an existing suite was approved on 13 February 2008 (07/01062/LBC) but is not considered to have direct relevance to the determination of the current application.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The application was advertised as affecting the setting of a Listed Building on 23 January 2007.

The applicant carried out the statutory neighbour notification procedure at the time of the original submission. The neighbouring properties were further notified of an amendment to the proposals.

One letter of objection were received at the time of the original submission raising the following concerns:

- The design is inappropriate in scale, design and materials.
- The horizontality of the rear extension, the fenestration, the mono pitch of the roof and the extent of the bay and use of block work are likely to have an adverse effect on the listed building.

CONSULTATIONS

No adverse comments have been received from any of the consultees.

OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with the provisions of Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, the Committee is to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their settings or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess.

The existing hotel accommodates several features of architectural interest within the building and the extension will not impact upon these. The existing rear elevation to the hotel is generally of high quality. However, the area to the west has been previously altered and has been subsequently finished in cement render which is damaging to the fabric of the listed building. It is therefore considered that the location of the extension in this area is positive and will help to improve the appearance of the listed building.

In terms of the form and massing of the extension, the horizontal emphasis is considered to be an appropriate means of extending the property. The juxtaposition of the verticality of the original main building with the horizontality of the proposed extension allows them to be read in two distinct parts. This will ensure that the intended appearance, form and setting of the original main building is retained and not lost by the provision of the proposed extension.

The materials proposed will complement the character and appearance of the existing building. There will be a limited palette of materials which will preserve the architectural character of the existing building. The block work to be used is of high quality and a colour appropriate to the existing building.

It is concluded that the appearance and setting of the building will not be adversely affected by the scale and design of the proposed new build element of the development to the rear elevation. The development will preserve the character of the listed building and the statutory duty set out in Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Area) (Scotland) Act 1997 is discharged.

Other Material Considerations

The other material considerations to be taken into account are as follows:

The Development Plan

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

In terms of Policy 60 (Alterations to Listed Buildings) and Policy 61 (Development in Conservation Areas) of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005, this matter has already been considered in the assessment of the proposed development under Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Area) (Scotland) Act 1997 and it was concluded that the proposals would preserve the character and appearance of the listed building and surrounding conservation area.

Views of the objector

- Poor quality of design and lack of attempt to relate the new development to the existing building.
- The design is inappropriate in scale, design and materials.
- The horizontality of the rear extension, the fenestration, the mono pitch of the roof and the extent of the bay and use of block work are likely to have an adverse effect on the listed building.

The above concerns all relate to the design form and appearance of the proposed extension. The proposed form and palette of materials to be used has already been assessed in the Observations section above.

With regards to the proposed scale of the building, the existing building is a four and a half storey building of a significant scale within the surrounding townscape area. It is considered that the three storey extension, whilst large will not compete with or dominate the existing main building.

The fenestration is considered to be appropriate and has been detailed in such a way as to provide interest to the regular window pattern necessary. In addition, given that this is an extension of modern design, it is considered that a mono pitched roof utilising

appropriate materials will provide a contemporary solution.

It is therefore considered that the concerns regarding the design approach and solution can be dismissed.

It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be accorded to any of the material considerations such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan. It is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted with conditions.

Design

The design of the proposed extension has been discussed in detail above and is considered to be an acceptable and appropriate form in relation to the existing building. The proposed materials are from a limited palette and will have a neutral effect upon the character and appearance of the existing building.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the relevant policies of the Development Plan and that there are no material considerations that would justify a decision contrary to this. The application is therefore recommended for APPROVAL with conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 1

This consent shall not be issued unless and until Historic Scotland has formally decided that the application will not be called in for determination by Scottish Ministers.

Recommendation 2

It is recommended that consent be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:

- 1 The works must be begun not later than the expiration of five years beginning with the date of this consent
- 2 Full details and the specification for the copper detailing to be used shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development.

Reasons

- 1 To comply with Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 In order to ensure the character and appearance of the extension and existing building.