

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

Listed building consent is sought for alterations and extensions, including partial demolition, of St Aidans Halls on St Vincent Street, Broughty Ferry to form a residential care home.

The proposal includes retaining the majority of St Aidans halls and the removal of the eastern section and brick-built Kippen Hall at the south end of the site. A modern two storey extension will be built on the east elevation, overlooking the adjacent cemetery. An existing stone wall along the east boundary will be altered to respond to the various glazed openings of the extension. A four storey extension will be built at the south end of the site. This will accommodate the majority of bedrooms for the care home. The proposed materials for the extensions are natural slate for the roofs; blue/brown facing brick for the walls; substantial areas of glazing (to maximise light into the building); standing seam zinc cladding with zinc flashings and detailing between window panels; single ply membrane for flat roof section on the 4 storey element and aluminium clad timber windows and natural stone will be reused from existing downtakings.

Various alterations to the retained hall buildings are new timber panelled entrance doors, existing recesses opened up to form windows and the installation of some obscure glass to conceal the edge of first floor levels. Railings will be reinstated onto the low stone wall around the boundary of the site.

The main entrance to the care home is on the west elevation and a service access is located to the north.

Seven car parking spaces will be provided to the north of the building. There will be some soft landscaping around the edges of the site and two private amenity spaces for residents to use at the west end of the site.

The applicant submitted a supporting statement, which outlines the overall project of the New Kirk, which includes the three buildings of East Church, St Aidans Church and St Aidans Halls. The statement contains a site context; assessment of the existing building stock; consideration of alternatives; consultation and decision

making process; the development proposal; appraisal of the proposed development and summary and conclusions.

The design strategy of the proposed residential care home are summarised by the applicant as follows:

- To maintain the current corner condition at the junction of Brook Street and St Vincent Street, thus retaining the view to St Aidans church and spire;



- To retain in full the principal street elevations and key features of the existing building;
- Reinstatement of the perimeter railings and form secure landscaped spaces for residents to use and improve the quality of the existing streetscape;
- Remove the poorly designed brick extension and replace with a new building that responds successfully to the adjacent site massing (4 storey tenement);
- Rationalise site servicing and parking strategy

In response to objections received regarding the potential adverse impact on residential amenity due to overshadowing and loss of daylight, the applicant submitted daylight and sunlight analyses.

The design brief for the worship centre evolved from an initial statement and schedule of accommodation provided by the Building Group. The focus of the brief was the fundamental ability to accommodate multi-disciplinary use on both floors of the building together with a strategy for maintaining sufficient levels of natural light within all areas of the building. Various existing features were outlined as

requiring to be retained within the church building.

The opportunities, limitations and challenges of the existing building and site were assessed. From an urban design perspective the edge condition of the site is fundamentally weak. The lack of a definitive boundary has resulted in an ill-defined separation of pedestrian and vehicular zones and as a result no ownership or control has been taken of the external spaces, which in turn has led to valuable space being utilised as unregulated off street parking. This lack of a definitive hierarchy to the external spaces leaves us with all areas around the building being perceived as openly accessible to all, thus leading to concerns over building security and management. The building scale and overall language towards Long Lane is also fundamentally flawed. The Kippen Hall, a brick built extension to the original school buildings fails to complement the surrounding urban landscape. This later addition

detracts from the character of the building and it is proposed to remove it.

Various pre-application have taken place with the applicant prior to the submission of the detailed planning and listed building applications.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is located on the east side of St Vincent Street and south side of Brook Street. The site lies to the east of Broughty Ferry's main shopping and commercial centre. The existing property on the site is a C(s) listed single storey hall building with stone walls and slate roof. A B-listed church building is located immediately to the east with a cemetery behind backing onto Long Lane. The cemetery is also B-listed. There is a stone boundary wall along the east boundary of the site. There are 3 and 4 storey tenement flats on the south side of Long Lane. There are 3 storey sheltered flats on the opposite side of St Vincent Street and single storey cottages on the opposite side of Brook Street.

The hall building is a former school building which was built in 1874. It has T-plan halls, which were formerly separate girls and boys entrances to the

school. St Aidans church took over the buildings in 1913 to use them as church halls. There are semi-circular arched details above the entrance doors. The windows are traditional sash and case with 8-pane glazing patterns. There is a single storey red brick later extension at the south end of the site, known as Kippen Hall. There are no formal car parking spaces at present and cars park to the west and north of the building. There is a footpath along the north side of the site, next to Long Lane.

POLICY BACKGROUND

Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

Dundee Local Plan Review 2005

The following policies are of relevance:

Policy 59: Alternative Uses for Listed Buildings - suitable alternative uses will be considered for listed buildings where this is necessary to secure their future. Any adaptation of the fabric must be undertaken carefully and sensitively and have minimum impact on the architectural and historic interest, character and setting of the building. Reference should be made to other policies in the Plan.

Policy 60: Alterations to Listed Buildings - The alteration of a listed building will only be acceptable where the proposals have regard to the preservation or enhancement of its architectural or historic character. Alterations will not be permitted where the works would diminish the architectural integrity of the building or its historic interest.

The City Council will provide specific supplementary guidance on the following: window and door alterations, advertisements, shopfronts, roller shutters, treatments to masonry and painting and use of materials.

Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

SPP 23: Planning and the Historic Environment sets out the framework for dealing with applications relating to listed buildings. More detailed

guidance is provided in the "Scottish Historic Environment Policy" published by Historic Scotland. It suggests that extensions should be subordinate to and not dominate the original building but suggests that there may be circumstances where quite substantial additions can be made to a building without detracting from the character of the original work.

SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES

The proposal includes the re-use of listed buildings and this is considered a sustainable solution to redevelopment of this site for a residential care home.

SITE HISTORY

Broughty Ferry New Kirk consists of the East Church, Broughty Ferry and St Aidans. Recently the two churches merged and now congregate in the East Church.

This has left St Aidans Church unused and so the New Kirk formed a Property Sub-Group to investigate various options for redevelopment. Full property valuations of East Church, St Aidans and St Aidans halls were carried out to inform recommendations during the consultation period. Property conditions, area analysis and analysis of the halls/buildings usage were also carried out. Five various options for redevelopment of the sites were presented by a Joint Working Group. The following option was chosen:

- Retain and do minor improvements to East Church and designate as a principal place of worship;
- Retain and convert St Aidans Church into new Worship Centre and Hall Accommodation;
- Sell off St Aidans Halls site;
- Minor improvements to East Church Halls.

In order to redevelop St Aidans Church finance is required and the redevelopment of St Aidans Halls is seen as the source for finance for this project.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Four letters of objection were received from neighbouring residents to the partner planning application. The

following grounds of objection also relate to the listed building application:

- 1 Design and scale of new buildings are inappropriate;
- 2 Demolition of listed building should not be allowed;
- 3 The use of materials for the new development do not fit in with the surrounding buildings or streetscape;
- 4 The roof design conflicts with the style of the surrounding buildings;
- 5 Adverse impact on character of area.

Members will have seen copies of the objection letters. The issues raised are discussed in the Observations section of this report below.

The application was advertised as affecting a listed building on 13 January 2009.

CONSULTATIONS

Broughty Ferry Community Council submitted an objection to the application with the main grounds of objection as follows:

- The proposed 4 storey block will have an adverse impact on the amenity of occupants of the adjoining tenement building in Long Lane;
- Views of the listed church and halls from the north will be impaired by the presence of the new block;
- The size and design of the new block does not fit in with the character of the nearby buildings and conservation area. An attractive feature of the site is its low level character and spaciousness and the new development will create a feeling of encroachment;
- The partial demolition of the main building will result in the loss of original Victorian features. The setting of the church will be adversely affected;
- Overdevelopment of the site - members will already have had access to the Community Council letter and the points raised are considered in the Observations Section of the report.

OBSERVATIONS

In accordance with Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, the Council is required to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess.

It is considered that the proposed development complies with the requirements of the Act. The extensions to the listed building are well designed and due care and consideration have been given to the height, massing and materials of the surrounding buildings and those on the site. It is accepted that the existing buildings on the site are pretty low lying and the proposed extension, particularly to the south, will alter its original scale and massing substantially. However in terms of the streetscape the height of the extension is in keeping with the tenement on the opposite side of Long Lane. The scheme has been well-designed with carefully considered extensions which allow the main architectural features of the building to be preserved.

It is concluded that this is a case where quite substantial additions can be made to a building without detracting from the character of the original work (as referred to in "SHEP") and that the design of the proposed extensions complements that of the surrounding area.

It is considered that the development will preserve the character of the listed building and that the requirements of Section 14 of the Act are discharged.

Other Material Considerations

The Development Plan - the provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

Policy 59 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 seeks to ensure that alternative uses for listed buildings are appropriate and that any adaptation is undertaken carefully and sensitively and have minimum impact on the character of the building.

The proposal site is located within a residential area and so this use is considered appropriate. There is minimal demolition of the original

building and the new extensions have been designed to cause minimum impact on the architectural and historic character of the building. Therefore the proposal complies with this Policy.

Policy 60 requires proposals to preserve or enhance the architectural or historic character of the listed building. It has been discussed under the assessment of the proposal against Section 14 of the Act that the proposal complies with these requirements. It is considered that the proposal will preserve the character of the listed building and the proposed extensions will add a modern element to the character of building and streetscape.

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the provisions of the development plan and Section 14 of the Planning Act 1997.

Objections from Neighbours and Broughty Ferry Community Council

1 Design and scale of new buildings are inappropriate - the design and scale of surrounding buildings has been taken into consideration by the applicant. The four storey element to the south is lower in height than the adjoining tenement building.

2 Demolition of listed building should not be allowed - it is considered that the Kippen Hall at the south end of the south, which was a later extension, detracts from the character of the listed building. Therefore its removal is welcomed. The other proposed demolition is considered acceptable and its replacement with a modern building takes into consideration the characteristics and roofscape of the original listed building. Therefore the demolition is supported.

3 The use of materials for the new development does not fit in with the surrounding buildings or streetscape.

The new build elements of the proposal are sympathetic to the design and materials of the existing halls on the site. Natural slate and stone will be used, which are in keeping with the retained building and surrounding buildings. The palette of materials has been limited to

maintain a clean and simple architectural language.

4 The roof design conflicts with the style of the surrounding buildings - the surrounding context clearly points towards a pitched roof solution. However, this would increase the overall height of the southern block. This was resolved by introducing a split in the section with a flat roof over the circulation space. The overall roof height is dictated by setting the minimum possible level for a habitable first floor level. This objection is therefore not supported.

5 Adverse impact on character of area - it is considered that the retention of the majority of the listed halls and the addition of the proposed feature extension on the south elevation enhances the character of the site and surrounding area.

It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be accorded to the objections such as to justify the refusal of listed building consent. The development will preserve and enhance the character of the original building. It is therefore recommended that listed building consent be granted.

Design

The design of the proposal is considered acceptable and will preserve and enhance the character of the original building and surrounding area.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that the proposed development complies with Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and Policies 59 and 60 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005. The objections are not supported and there are no material considerations that would justify refusal of the application in these circumstances. Therefore the application is recommended for APPROVAL.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that consent be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:

1 The works must be begun not later than the expiration of 5

years beginning with the date of this consent.

- 2 Details of the proposed boundary railings shall be submitted to the Council for approval before any development is commenced and if approved the development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.
- 3 Details of the proposed finishing materials shall be submitted to the Council for approval before any development is commenced and if approved the development shall be carried out only in full accordance with such approved details.

Reasons

- 1 To comply with Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 In order to ensure that the character and appearance of the building as a building of architectural and/or historic interest is retained
- 3 In order to ensure that the character and appearance of the building as a building of architectural and/or historic interest is retained.