## KEY INFORMATION

#### Ward Lochee

#### Proposal

Erection of 11 houses

Address

Land at Munro Place and Ettrick Crescent, Dundee

#### Applicant

Dundee City Council Housing Department 1 Shore Terrace Dundee

#### Agent

KDM Architects 15 Camperdown Street Broughty Ferry Dundee DD5 3AA

Registered 20 Nov 2009

Case Officer Eve Jones



# New Council Housing Proposed in Munro Place/Ettrick Crescent

The erection of 11 houses is **RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL subject to conditions.** Report by Director of City Development.

# RECOMMENDATION

The development proposes the erection of 11 houses, 3 of which are wheelchair adapted single storey properties, along two sides of this roughly triangular site. The scale, design and materials will complement the existing housing. The site is not designated as Public Open Space and appears to have limited play value. The development complies fully with the Dundee Local Plan Review requirements and the objections raised are not supported for the reasons given in this report. The application is recommended for APPROVAL subject to conditions.

# **SUMMARY OF REPORT**

- Planning permission is sought for the erection of 11 detached and semi-detached, one and two storey houses. All will have at least one off street parking space. The houses will have two or three bedrooms and will accommodate 4 or 6 persons.
- The site is roughly triangular with a frontage to Munro Place to the north west and Ettrick Crescent to the north east. It formerly contained a playground and is enclosed by fences. The former play equipment was removed from the area in 1998/1999 due to problems with vandalism.
- Policy 4: Design of New Housing and Appendix 1 Dundee Local Plan 2005 are of relevance. The proposals meet the requirements of Appendix 1 in all respects.
- One written objection and one petition, with 90 signatures, were received within the statutory period. All objected to the building of houses on land that should be retained as a playspace.
- A public consultation event was held to publicise this development and another site at Liff Road, the Report on which is elsewhere on this agenda. 530 invitations were sent and 34 people representing 28 household were recorded as attending. 6 asked that specific concerns relating to this site be noted. Loss of playspace and traffic issues were the main planning issues raised. All of the houses will have at least one off street parking space.
- The objections are not supported and it is considered that the provision of a small group of well designed new houses will complement the surrounding area.

# **DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL**

Planning permission is sought for the erection of 11 detached and semi-detached, one and two storey houses. All will have at least one off-street parking space. The houses will have two or three bedrooms and will accommodate 4 or 6 persons. The 3 single storey houses are wheelchair adapted and have two off street parking spaces, one protected by a car port. The houses have between 120m<sup>2</sup> and 181m<sup>2</sup> of private garden space. The houses front the two roads which bound the site. The land to the rear is open to accommodate required surface water the drainage infrastructure. This will be fenced for security

# SITE DESCRIPTION

The site lies within the well established Dryburgh housing area off Coupar Angus Road. It is roughly triangular with a frontage to Munro Place to the north west and Ettrick Crescent to the north east. It bounds the rear of existing housing on Dryburgh Crescent to the south. A small group of local shops lies to the north, separated from the site by a footpath which also serves a small electricity sub-station.

The west side of the site is bounded by a footpath. On the east side of the site, a footpath cuts through the site resulting in one plot lying to the east of the path.

The site slopes gently down to the south over most of the area with a steeper slope at the extreme southern edge. It was formerly occupied by a playground and is enclosed by fences.

#### **POLICY BACKGROUND**

#### Dundee and Angus Structure Plan 2001-2016

There are no policies relevant to the determination of this application.

#### **Dundee Local Plan 2005**

The following policies are of relevance: Policy 4: Design of New Housing.

#### Scottish Planning Policies, Planning Advice Notes and Circulars

There are no statements of Government policy relevant to the determination of this application.



#### Non Statutory Statements of Council Policy

There are no non statutory Council policies relevant to the determination of this application.



## SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES

There are no specific sustainability policy implications arising from this application.

# **SITE HISTORY**

There is no planning history relevant to this site.

## **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

The application was the subject of statutory Neighbour Notification and one written objection and one petition were received within the statutory period. The single objection was to loss of the playspace. The covering letter to the petition also indicated that those signing the petition objected to the building of houses on land that should be retained as a playspace. The person who organised the petition also objected personally on grounds of privacy. Members will already have

had access to the objection letters. The issues raised will be considered in the Observations below.

## **CONSULTATIONS**

The Head of Environmental Health and Trading Standards advised that the submitted Geo-Interpretive environmental Report suggested that further investigation be carried out and any remediation be carried out before any of the units are occupied. It is considered that this can be the subject of appropriate conditions if Members are minded to approve this application.

The site layout will be forwarded to Tayside Police to consider the layout and the security of proposed fencing.

The site layout has been designed in consultation with Scottish Water's requirements.

#### **OBSERVATIONS**

Section 25 of the Act provides that an application for planning permission (other than for a national development) shall be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

#### **The Development Plan**

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.

## Policy 4 - Design Of New Housing

"The design and layout of all new housing in Dundee should be of a high quality. As a basis for achieving this, new development will be required to conform to the Design Standards contained in Appendix 1 of this Local Plan unless:

1 the City Council, through either site allocation in the Local Plan or site planning briefs, considers

### Dundee City Council Development Quality Committee

#### Page 46

it appropriate to vary the standards to reflect the constraints or opportunities offered by the development of a particular site; or

2 the proposal is within an established low density residential area, in which case the density of the new development should reflect this and more generous external space standards will be required.

New housing development should also have regard to the principles of the City Council's Urban Design Guide.

In addition, new housing development should meet "Secured by Design" standards. New residential streets should be designed to promote low vehicle speeds of 20 m.p.h. or less. New housing should have regard to opportunities to maximise energy efficiency and promote sustainable waste management."

The site lies within the suburban area with regard to Policy 4 and Appendix 1 of the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005.

proposals The meet the requirements of Appendix 1 in all respects. The houses provide 2 or 3 bedrooms and have garden grounds of at least 120m2. All have at least one off street parking space and the wheelchair adapted houses have a car port with one additional space within in the driveway. Three of the semi-detached houses have space for a future garage in addition to the parking space. The rear gardens will be bounded by a 2 metre fence to the rear with 900

high railings to the street frontage. A landscaping scheme can be the subject of an appropriate condition if members are minded to approve the application.

Part of the rear of the site is set aside to accommodate the necessary provision of drainage infrastructure to deal with surface water drainage from the proposed development. This land will be fenced for security purposes and gated to allow for access for maintenance.

It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the provisions of the development plan.

#### **Other Material Considerations**

The other material considerations to be taken into account are as follows:

The application was the subject of statutory Neighbour Notification and one written objection and one petition were received within the statutory period. The single objection was to loss of the play space. The covering letter to the petition also indicated that those signing the petition objected to the building of houses on land that should be retained as a play space. The person who organised the petition also objected personally on grounds of privacy.

The issue of the loss of the play space is covered in the following supporting information. The issue of loss of privacy for an adjoining owner relates to maintenance of a boundary fence. This is a common problem where fences are erected on boundaries. The proposed house adjacent to this garden will have its own 1800mm high boundary fence and privacy will be maintained.



#### **Supporting Statement**

The applicant has submitted a summary of the public consultation event held to publicise this proposed development and another site at Liff Road, the Report on which is elsewhere on this agenda. The Statement is available in Members' lounges.

530 invitations were sent to tenants and owners to attend a drop-in session for both sites, held locally, between 2.30pm and 7.00pm on Thursday 10 December 2009. 34 people representing 28 household were recorded as attending and 6 asked that specific concerns relating to this site be noted.

## Application No 09/00738/FULL

The concerns were:

- 1 Loss of the play space. One household objected to the loss of the space which is used by their grandchildren. A significant number of residents attending also commented the area was never used by children as it was frequently covered in glass and dog mess. Anecdotal evidence on the day suggested play equipment was removed in response to a campaign by the local community as equipment had been repeatedly vandalised and children using the space caused a problem.
- 2 Traffic and parking problems. These were raised by two residents who were advised that all of the houses had off street parking spaces but concerns still remained.
- 3 Concerns about proximity of proposed houses. The proposed houses were some distance away from the resident's own property. The layout meets minimum window to window distances and in relation to
  - the houses to the south, the distance between facing windows of habitable rooms well exceeds the 18 metre minimum.
  - 4 Loss of view. This is not a planning matter but the resident was advised that the house opposite would be single storey.
  - 5 Proposed development would prevent purchase of additional ground to form a driveway. The residents were very unhappy that they would now be unable to purchase additional ground that they felt had been agreed to by the Council some years previously. These residents sent in the petition referred to above.

This is not a planning matter as no land has been sold to the householders. The applicant has investigated this matter and found no record of any formal application to purchase additional land.

The applicant has submitted the following information in support of the application.

#### Application No 09/00738/FULL

Loss of play area - the former play equipment was removed from the area in 1998/99. Initially only the equipment was removed due to problems with vandalism. In 2004/05 the hard standing area for the equipment was also removed and the area landscaped to form an open grassed area. The site is not designated in the Dundee Local Plan Review 2005 as Open Space.

The proposal to provide new build affordable housing was therefore taken from a backdrop of no previous demand for the area to be returned to a play provision. During the consultation exercise manv residents noted they were in favour of housing being provided on the site and were not aware of it currently being used by local children.

2 Increase in traffic - a total of 11 units are proposed for the site, all of which will have their own off street car parking provision. 5 of these will access from Ettrick Crescent and 6 from Munro Place. Only a small number of residents raised concern on this matter.

> Consultants were commissioned in May 2009 to prepare a Transport Statement (TS) in connection with the proposed residential development consisting of 9 units (subsequently increased to 11 units) on this site.

The TS has generally been undertaken with the guidance contained within SPP 17 -"Planning for Transport" and Planning Advice Note (PAN) 75 and SPP3 Planning for Housing. The traffic element of the assessment is in accordance with Scottish the Government's guidelines "Transport Assessment Implementation: A Guide." All proposed or amended infrastructure has been designed in accordance with Dundee City Council's adopted road guidelines.

The TS demonstrates that the additional people trips, in particular vehicle trips, generated by the proposed development will have a negligible impact on the local road network. No external road infrastructure works are proposed as part of the development.

The Transport Statement concludes that the site is capable of accommodating the travel characteristics associated with a residential development consisting of 9 units. The site will integrate well with the existing transport network with the site being accessible by a range of transport modes.

#### Assessment of Material Considerations

It is concluded from the foregoing that the objections on the grounds of the loss of play space are not supported for the reasons given and are not accorded sufficient weight to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan.

Similarly, the individual objection on the ground of loss of privacy is also not supported or accorded weight against the development plan.

The supporting statement details the relatively low number of local residents expressing concerns about the proposed development and it is considered that these concerns have been addressed in the statement.

It is concluded from the foregoing that insufficient weight can be accorded to any of the material considerations such as to justify the refusal of planning permission contrary to the provisions of the development plan.

#### Design

The design and materials proposed will result an attractive group of new houses within an existing well established housing area.

## CONCLUSION

The development proposes the erection of 11 houses, 3 of which are wheelchair adapted single storey properties, along two sides of this roughly triangular site. The scale, design and materials will complement the existing housing. The site is not designated as Public Open Space and appears to have limited play value. The development complies fully with the Dundee Local Plan Review requirements and the objections raised Page 47

#### RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that consent be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:

- 1 The development hereby permitted shall be commenced within three years from the date of this permission.
- 2 Details of the finishing materials proposed to be used shall be submitted to the Council for approval and if approved the development shall be carried out only in accordance with such approved details.
- 3 Prior to the commencement of development, a comprehensive landscaping scheme for hard and soft landscaping shall be submitted for approval and if approved, the works shall be carried out only in accordance with such approved details.
- 4 The development shall be carried out in full accordance with the approved landscaping scheme within 6 months of the occupation of the last house. Any trees or shrubs removed, dying, being severely damaged or becoming seriously diseased within 5 years of planting shall be replaced by trees or shrubs of similar size and species to those originally required to be planted in terms of this condition.
- 5 Prior to the commencement of development, a Noise Impact Assessment shall be carried out to assess the potential noise impact of the electricity substation and the flue to the adjacent hot food takeaway. Any remediation required to address any noise impact shall be submitted to the planning authority for approval. Any agreed remediation shall be fully implemented prior to the occupation of any of the units so affected.
- 6 Development shall not begin until the investigation and risk assessment proposed in the submitted Geo Environmental reports are completed and, if necessary, a remediation strategy to deal with contamination at the

#### Application No 09/00738/FULL

#### Page 48

site has been submitted to and approved in writing by the planning authority. The strategy shall contain proposals to deal with contamination to include:

- a the nature, extent and type(s) of contamination on the site.
- b measures to treat/remove contamination to ensure the site is fit for the use proposed and does not contain any significant pollution linkages.
- c measures to deal with contamination during construction works.
- d verification of the condition of the site on completion of decontamination measures.
- 7 Before any unit is occupied the remediation strategy shall be fully implemented and a verification report, with relevant documentation demonstrating that the objectives of the remediation strategy have been achieved, shall be submitted to and approved by the planning authority.
- 8 Full details of the proposed fencing and gates to the land required for the Scottish Water wayleave shall be submitted to the planning authority for approval following discussions with the Police Architectural Liaison Officer and the relevant Departments of the City Council and the works shall be completed in accordance with the approved details prior to the occupation of the dwellings hereby approved.

#### Reasons

- 1 To comply with Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.
- 3 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.
- 4 To ensure a satisfactory standard of appearance of the development in the interests of the visual amenities of the area.

- 5 In the interests of the amenities of the future occupants of the residential accommodation.
- 6 In the interests of the amenities of the future occupants of the residential accommodation.
- 7 In the interests of the amenities of the future occupants of the residential accommodation.
- 8 In the interests of the amenities of the future occupants of the residential accommodation.

#### **Dundee City Council Development Quality Committee**