

Erection of 1 1/2 Storey Extension to the Rear Elevation

KEY INFORMATION

Ward The Ferry

Address

23 Elie Avenue
Broughty Ferry
Dundee

Applicant

Mr Derek Mawhinney
23 Elie Avenue
Broughty Ferry
Dundee DD5 3SF

Agent

Jon Frullani Architect
Unit 5 District 10
25 Greenmarket
Dundee DD1 4QB

Registered 7 Dec 2017

Report by Executive Director
of City Development



SUMMARY OF REPORT

- Planning permission is sought for the erection of a one and a half storey extension to the rear (south) elevation of a dwellinghouse. The proposal would replace an existing ground floor extension and rear dormer window.
- Policy 10 of the adopted Dundee Local Development Plan (2014) is relevant to the determination of the application.
- The statutory neighbour notification procedure was undertaken, one letter of representation has been received from Broughty Ferry Community Council.
- In accordance with Dundee City Council's scheme of delegation, this application is to be determined by the Development Management Committee following an objection from Broughty Ferry Community Council.
- More details can be found at <http://idoxwam.dundee.gov.uk/idoxpa-web/simpleSearchResults.do?action=firstPage>.

RECOMMENDATION

Replacement of existing single storey extension and rear dormer with one and a half storey extension utilising same footprint as existing ground floor extension is recommended for APPROVAL subject to conditions.

1 DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL

- 1.1 Planning permission is sought to replace an existing single storey rear extension and first floor dormer with a one and a half storey extension. The proposals would facilitate the reconfiguration of the dining and kitchen areas on the ground floor and extension of two bedrooms and the provision of additional bathrooms on the first floor.
- 1.2 The proposed extension has a footprint of 18 square metres and a pitched roof to a height of 6.5 metres. External finishes are proposed to match the existing dwelling, including dry dash render to external walls, UPVC windows and concrete roof tiles. Roof lights are proposed to the east and west elevation roof planes and patio doors are proposed to the south elevation. First floor windows on the south elevation are to be recessed and include obscured glazing to protect the privacy of neighbouring properties.



Figure 1 – Ground Floor Plan



Figure 2 – Proposed Elevations

2 SITE DESCRIPTION

- 2.1 The application site relates to a traditional one and a half storey semi-detached dwellinghouse located to the south side of Elie Avenue, Broughty Ferry. The dwellinghouse is finished with sections of render and blockwork, brown UPVC windows and door and concrete roof tiles. There are dormers in the roof on the front and rear elevations. There is an extension to the rear of the property which has a flat roof and is finished in render. The dwelling benefits from front and rear garden ground and vehicular access onto Elie Avenue.
- 2.2 The surrounding area is residential in character with properties on Elie Avenue, Falkland Place and Elie Place.



Figure 3 – Site Photo

3 POLICY BACKGROUND

- 3.1 The following plans and policies are considered to be of direct relevance:

ADOPTED DUNDEE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN 2014

Policy 10: Householder Development

PROPOSED DUNDEE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Policy 11: Householder Development

- 3.2 There are no other plans, policies and non-statutory statements that are considered to be of direct relevance.

4 SITE HISTORY

- 4.1 No relevant planning history.

5 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

- 5.1 The statutory neighbour notification process has been undertaken and 1 letter of objection has been received from Broughty Ferry Community Council raising the following concerns:
- the proposed extension is of a size and style which would not maintain the character of the surrounding area.
- 5.2 Members will already have access to the letter of objection and the issues raised are considered in the Observations section below.

6 CONSULTATIONS

- 6.1 **The Head of Community Safety and Protection** - has commented that the site is within an area where basic radon protection measures should be installed as a matter of course in all new developments. An informative relating to radon protection should be attached to any planning permission granted.
- 6.2 **Broughty Ferry Community Council** - has objected to the application. The Community Council raise concern with the size and style of the proposed extension and state that it would not maintain the character of the surrounding area.

7 DETERMINING ISSUES

- 7.1 **Section 25 of the Act provides that an application for planning permission (other than for a national development) shall be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.**

THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN

The provisions of the development plan relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy Background section above.

DUNDEE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

- 7.2 **Policy 10: Householder Development** - of the Local Development Plan supports development where it:
- does not have a detrimental impact on the character or environmental quality of the house and surrounding area by virtue of size, design and materials;
 - does not result in significant loss of private and useable garden ground;
 - does not result in a detrimental effect on the neighbouring properties in terms of physical impact, overshadowing or overlooking;

- does not have a significant adverse effect on the existing level of parking provision; and
- the development is consistent with all other policies of the Plan.

7.3 The preamble to Policy 10 also states that householder developments should adhere to the guidance contained within the Dundee Local Development Plan Householder Development Supplementary Guidance (2015). The householder guidance advises that all extensions should respect and complement the character of the existing house and surrounding area. Well-designed extensions should be smaller in scale and not over-dominate the existing house, complement the existing property and surrounding area, and have no adverse impact in terms of residential amenity.

7.4 In respect of Policy 10, the proposal is assessed against the five criteria as follows:

- 1 In this case, the extension is proposed to the rear elevation of the dwellinghouse in place of an existing single storey extension. The extension is one and a half storey in height, with the ridge of the proposed extension sitting below the ridge of the main dwelling. The position of the extension to the rear of the dwelling ensures it is discreetly positioned and would not be visible from Elie Avenue. The extension is of an appropriate scale and design for this location. The proposed materials would respect those on the existing dwelling and those used in the surrounding area. There would be no detrimental impact to the existing dwellinghouse or the surrounding area by virtue of design.
- 2 The proposal involves the removal of an existing single storey extension and its replacement on the same footprint with a one and a half storey extension. The proposal does not result in the loss of any existing private and useable garden ground.
- 3 The proposed extension would maintain the footprint of the existing single storey extension but would have a pitched roof to incorporate an additional floor of accommodation. The ridge of the extension sits below the existing dwelling ensuring the proposal is sub-servient to the main dwelling. Whilst the eaves of the extension are 1 metre higher than the existing eaves, the proposal is of a scale and form which would not significantly exacerbate any existing overshadowing of neighbouring properties.

The applicant initially proposed significant areas of glazing to the south elevation, with proposed first floor windows serving two bedrooms. However, the windows were within 16 metres of windows on 17 Falkland Place to the south and within 7 metres of neighbouring garden ground. This raised overlooking and privacy concerns. To address these concerns the applicant has amended the extension to provide 18 metres separation between first floor windows and windows of neighbouring property. In addition, first floor windows to the south elevation have been reduced in size and are to be fitted with obscured glazing. The proposed roof lights to the east and west roof planes are of a size and position which do not raise any overlooking concerns. Subject to the provision of obscured glazing to the south elevation, the proposed extension would have no impact on neighbouring properties by means of overshadowing, overlooking or physical impact.

- 4 There would be no detrimental impact on the existing level of parking.
- 5 There are no other policies of the Plan relevant to the determination of the application.

7.5 With the addition of a planning condition, the proposal would therefore comply with the requirements of all five criteria of Policy 10 and the Householder Development Supplementary Guidance.

7.6 **The proposal satisfies Policy 10.**

- 7.7 **It is concluded from the foregoing that the proposal complies with the provisions of the Development Plan.**

OTHER MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

A - PROPOSED DUNDEE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

- 7.8 The Proposed Dundee Local Development Plan 2 was approved by the Council on 21 August 2017. It sets out the spatial strategy that will guide future development up to 2029.
- 7.9 The proposed Dundee Local Development Plan 2 will in time replace the adopted Dundee Local Development Plan, 2014. Approval of the Proposed Dundee Local Development Plan 2 represents the Planning Authority's settled view as to what the final adopted content of the Plan should be. Whilst the Dundee Local Development Plan, 2014 (along with TAYplan) constitutes the statutory Development Plan, the proposed Dundee Local Development Plan 2 has the status of a material planning consideration to be taken into account in the assessment of planning applications.
- 7.10 **The provisions of the Proposed Dundee Local Development Plan 2 relevant to the determination of this application are specified in the Policy background section above.**
- 7.11 **Policy 11: Householder Development** - this proposed policy repeats the four criteria in Policy 10 Householder Development of the adopted Plan. The criteria and policy remain exactly the same. As a result this proposal complies with Policy 11 Householder Development in the Proposed Dundee Local Development Plan 2.
- 7.12 **The requirements of Policy 11 of the Proposed Dundee Local Development Plan are also satisfied.**

B - VIEWS OF BROUGHTY FERRY COMMUNITY COUNCIL

- 7.13 A letter of objection was received from Broughty Ferry Community Council raising the following concerns:
- 7.14 The proposed extension is of a size and style which would not maintain the character of the surrounding area which predominantly features ground floor extensions and dormers.
- 7.15 **Response:** the proposed extension would be one and a half storeys in height and is located on the rear elevation of the existing house. The roof of the proposed extension would be below the ridge line of the existing roof of the house and would replace an existing single storey extension and a dormer extension in the existing roof. The extension would not be visible from Elie Avenue. The extension is of modern design with finish materials including dry dash render and concrete roof tiles to match the design and appearance of the existing house. Given the location, form and design of the proposed extension it is considered that it would have no detrimental impact the visual appearance of the existing house or on the surrounding area. The acceptability of the extension is demonstrated through compliance with the requirements of Policy 10 of the Dundee Local Development Plan and Householder Supplementary Guidance.
- 7.16 Broughty Ferry Community Council also raise concern that the property continues to be used for business purposes following an enforcement enquiry in relation to the storage of trade supplies and vehicles at the address. Following an enforcement enquiry the site owner removed business materials from the site in September 2016. No further complaints have been received to date.

- 7.17 The previous enforcement enquiry is not a material planning consideration regarding the present proposal for an extension to the dwelling. However, as Broughty Ferry Community Council have raised concerns the matter will be investigate again.
- 7.18 The views of Broughty Ferry Community Council in relation to design and impact on the surrounding area are not considered to be of sufficient weight to justify refusal of the application.
- 7.19 **The concerns of Broughty Ferry Community Council are not of sufficient weight to justify refusal of the application.**
- 7.20 **It is concluded from the foregoing that the material considerations support the approval of planning permission.**

8 CONCLUSION

- 8.1 The proposal would result in a house extension of an appropriate scale and design and would have no adverse impact on the surrounding area. The application satisfies the requirements of the Development Plan. There are no material considerations that would justify refusal of planning permission. Therefore, it is therefore recommended that planning permission be granted subject to conditions.

9 RECOMMENDATION

- 9.1 It is recommended that consent be GRANTED subject to the following conditions:
- 1 **Condition** - the first floor south facing windows serving proposed bedrooms shall be obscurely glazed and maintained as such in perpetuity.
Reason - in the interest of residential amenity and privacy.
 - 2 **Condition** - no access shall be afforded to the first floor south elevation recess and no balcony shall be formed.
Reason - in the interest of residential amenity and privacy.