

**REPORT TO:** EDUCATION COMMITTEE AND POLICY & RESOURCES COMMITTEE –  
26 NOVEMBER 2012

**REPORT ON:** MENZIESHILL – NEW PRIMARY SCHOOL AND NURSERY SCHOOL AND  
OPTIONS FOR MENZIESHILL COMMUNITY CENTRE

**REPORT BY:** DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION AND DIRECTOR OF LEISURE AND  
COMMUNITIES

**REPORT NO:** 445-2012

## **1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT**

- 1.1** The purpose of this report is to advise the Education Committee of the outcome of the informal consultation undertaken during the period August to October 2012 and to seek approval to formally consult on the preferred option under the terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010.

## **2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 2.1** It is recommended that the Committee:

- i) note the content of this report;
- ii) approve in principle the proposals to merge Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream primary school on the site of the former Menzieshill multis (precise location to be determined), incorporating a nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School
- iii) instruct the Director of Education to formally consult on the proposals contained in recommendation (ii) above in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 and report back to Committee in due course on the outcome of the consultations so that a final decision on the proposals can be made.
- iv) In the case of the Policy and Resources Committee, instruct the Director of Leisure and Communities to report back on the option appraisal on Menzieshill Community Centre.

## **3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

- 3.1** The estimated cost of building a new 3 stream primary school together with a separate pre-school centre totalling approximately 5,500m<sup>2</sup> is £11.5m based on a start date of January 2015 and a completion date during spring of 2016. An indicative allowance of £11m was introduced into the Capital Plan in February 2012. It will be necessary to adjust the Capital Plan at its next review to reflect the revised cost and phasing of the project.
- 3.2** The capital costs will be funded from borrowing, with an element being “prudential” ie funded by the estimated revenue savings in staff and property costs. The estimated revenue savings of £71,000 per annum will fund total prudential borrowing of £1.5m leaving £10m to be funded from corporate borrowing. The resultant annual loan charges on the corporate borrowing of £10m will be £486,000 (full year effect from 2017-18) which will be contained within future years’ Revenue Budgets.

## **4.0 BACKGROUND - THE COMMUNITY CENTRE**

- 4.1** Reference is made to Article I of the Policy and Resources Committee of 9 February 2012 at

which it was agreed that, within the forward Capital Plan, provision should be made for the replacement of primary school provision serving the Menzieshill area of the City, and improvements to community facilities.

- 4.2** Following approval of this report, the Chief Executive met with the Management Committee of Menzieshill Community Centre and it was agreed that, as far as possible, the existing accommodation and facilities within Menzieshill Community Centre would be replicated within any new build option or the existing building would be improved to ensure that it tied in to the new building and was fit for purpose.
- 4.3** Following these meetings, and in consultation with the Local Management Group, a project specification has been drawn up to describe the existing facilities, the objects of the projects, roles and responsibilities for the Project Team, and notes the current governance arrangements which it is recommended should continue beyond the project itself.

## **5.0 BACKGROUND - EDUCATION**

- 5.1** There is an identified need to provide new accommodation to replace Hillside Primary School, Gowriehill Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School. The existing buildings are more than 30 years old and significant sums of money would require to be spent to keep them at a reasonable standard.
- 5.2** Hillside Primary School has a current roll of 295 pupils from P1 to P7 and this includes a number of pupils in the school's Enhanced Provision unit. It has an occupancy rate of 80%. The number of pupils who attend Hillside Primary School and live outwith the designated catchment area is 186. Gowriehill Primary School has a roll of 130 pupils including the pupils in the Enhanced Provision unit. It has an occupancy rate of 32%. The number of pupils who attend Gowriehill Primary School and live outwith the designated catchment area is 60. Neither school has nursery provision. The nursery provision within the Menzieshill area is contained within Menzieshill Nursery School and St Ninian's Primary School.
- 5.3** Current and recent rolls for the two primary schools in the proposal are detailed below.

	<b>2008/ 2009</b>	<b>2009/ 2010</b>	<b>2010/ 2011</b>	<b>2011/ 2012</b>	<b>2012/ 2013</b>
Gowriehill Primary School	192	173	142	139	130
Hillside Primary School	273	269	282	291	295
<b>Total</b>	<b>465</b>	<b>442</b>	<b>424</b>	<b>430</b>	<b>425</b>

- 5.4** Menzieshill Nursery School provides 70 FTE places and is currently full to capacity.
- 5.5** In terms of travel distances from home to the location of the proposed new site schools, the Council's Geographical Information System (GIS) identifies that 82% of the total primary pupil population for Hillside Primary and Gowriehill Primary Schools live within 0-1 miles of the proposed new site area. Travel distances have not been included for children attending Menzieshill Nursery because a significant number of the children who attend come from a variety of areas across the city given the high level of choice when selecting a pre-school place.

## **6.0 INFORMAL CONSULTATIONS**

- 6.1** During the period August to October 2012, there has been informal consultation with each school community involving staff, pupils, parents and carers through Parent Councils; the Local Community Planning Partnership; the local community; community centre users and key community stakeholders. The Director of Education met with the Local Community Planning Partnership. The Head of Primary Education undertook a programmed series of meetings as part of the informal consultation process. This involved meetings with:

- a group of parents and carers from each establishment; and
- staff associated with each establishment;

Members of each Pupil Council were also consulted with at school level. Following the outcome of the informal consultation process, it is now appropriate to move to the formal consultation stage as determined by the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010.

## **7.0 OPTION APPRAISAL (EDUCATION)**

- 7.1** A detailed option appraisal has been undertaken by the Director of Education before arriving at the recommendations included in this report. The options considered were:

### **Option 1**

Do minimum to maintain Hillside Primary School, Gowriehill Primary School and Menzieshill Nursery School to present standards – major capital maintenance works will require to be carried out over the medium to long term to keep the schools operational with consequential disruptive effects on Education.

### **Option 2**

Build one new 3 stream primary school to replace Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools, leaving Menzieshill Nursery School in its existing building.

### **Option 3**

Build one new 3 stream primary school to replace Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and also build a new Menzieshill Nursery School on the same site.

### **Option 4**

Build one new 3 stream primary school to replace Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and incorporate a mainstream nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School.

## **7.2 Expenditure for each option**

The capital costs (including life-cycle capital maintenance) at outturn prices for each option are –

<b>£000</b>	<b>2012/13</b>	<b>2013/14</b>	<b>2014/15</b>	<b>2015/16</b>	<b>2016/17</b>	<b>2017/18 to 2037/38</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>
Option 1	0	0	262	14	1,076	1,456	<b>2,808</b>
Option 2	200	450	2,250	7,300	346	308	<b>10,854</b>
Option 3	200	500	2500	8,000	300	255	<b>11,755</b>
Option 4	200	500	2500	8,000	300	255	<b>11,755</b>

## **7.3 Revenue Costs**

### **7.3.1 Annual Property Costs of Each Option (at Current Prices)**

Option 1	£311,000
Option 2	£304,000
Option 3	£307,000
Option 4	£307,000

### 7.3.2 Management Teacher Staff Savings (at Current Prices)

Based on the current management structure within the primary schools it is anticipated there would be management teacher staff savings for each of these options as follows:

Option 1	Nil
Option 2	£67,000
Option 3	£67,000
Option 4	£81,000

### 7.4 Net Present Values

The net present values for each option over 25 years at a discount rate of 3.5% are as follows:-

Option 1	£7,759,000
Option 2	£14,292,000
Option 3	£15,161,000
Option 4	£14,981,000

7.5 The table below shows in summary how each option "scores" against the non-monetary objectives for the project.

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4
1 Meets short term needs	√	√	√	√
2 Satisfies long term demand (education)	X	X	√	√
3 Satisfies long term demand (property)	X	X	√	√
4 Deliverable while schools operational	X	X	√	√

### 7.6 Conclusion

- 7.6.1 Option 1 produces the lowest Net Present Value, but only meets one of the non-monetary objectives. Overall this option does not offer the best solution.
- 7.6.2 Option 2 produces a lower Net Present Values compared to Option 3 but only meets one of the non-monetary objectives. This option does not present the best option.
- 7.6.3 Option 4 has a lower Net Present Value compared to Option 3 and does meet all the non-monetary objectives, however following informal consultation this was not the preferred option since this did not include a separate nursery school.
- 7.6.4 Option 3 has the highest Net Present Value and does meet all the non-monetary objectives. Following the outcome of the information consultation this was the preferred option.

## 8.0 OPTION APPRAISAL (COMMUNITY CENTRE)

### 8.1 Option 1

Refurbish the existing community centre.

### Option 2

Construct a new community centre in close proximity to the existing site (precise location to be determined).

## **9.0 PROPOSALS**

- 9.1** It is proposed to build a 3 stream primary school together with a separate pre-school centre. The new school and nursery will offer purpose – built learning and teaching environments for the delivery of a “Curriculum for Excellence” and state of the art nursery facilities.
- 9.2** It is proposed to retain and refurbish the existing community centre or to include the community centre within the new build programme. The Director of Leisure and Communities will bring a report back to the Policy and Resources Committee at the end of the consultation period.

## **10.0 ACCOMMODATION SCHEDULES FOR THE CAMPUS**

- 10.1** It is proposed to build 3 stream primary school on the site of the former Menzieshill multis (precise location to be determined) with a separate nursery school. The overall accommodation schedule for the education campus is expected to total approx. 5500m<sup>2</sup> in area and will include –

- classrooms for three stream primary school
- 70 FTE place nursery school
- dining/assembly hall
- production kitchen
- double size gym hall (or two smaller gyms)
- stage and drama/music room
- group rooms
- staffrooms
- administration areas and associated accommodation

## **11.0 DESIGN SOLUTION**

- 11.1** Following the development of the finalised schedules of accommodation, the design proposals will incorporate well-defined adjacencies, creative use of circulation space and ideas for construction techniques. The designs will ensure that the buildings are flexible and responsive to current and future teaching methodologies and space requirements for both the schools and the nursery.

## **12.0 EDUCATION SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS**

- 12.1** The new shared site schools would enable the Education Department to:
- create flexible learning and teaching spaces which will enhance the delivery of a “Curriculum for Excellence”
  - promote increased opportunities for integration at pre-school and mainstream level; and
  - provide future - proofed IT infrastructure to support and enhance curricular and management functions.
- 12.2** A shared campus would have a number of advantages:
- it would replace traditional buildings with 21st century accommodation;
  - it would be designed to ensure improved vehicular access; and
  - it would be more energy efficient and would improve our carbon footprint.

### **13.0 FORMAL PROPOSAL PAPER**

- 13.1** A formal proposal paper will be published and advertised in due course.

### **14.0 POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

- 14.1** This report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of sustainability, strategic environmental assessment, anti-poverty, equality impact assessment and risk management. There are no major issues. An Equality Impact Assessment has been carried out and will be available on the Council Web Site at <http://www.dundee.gov.uk/equanddiv/equimpact/>.

### **15.0 CONSULTATIONS**

- 15.1** The Chief Executive, Director of Corporate Services and Head of Democratic and Legal Services have been consulted in the preparation of this report.
- 15.2** It will be necessary to carry out statutory consultation procedures in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 in respect of the proposals to build a new 3 stream primary school to replace the merged Hillside Primary School and Gowriehill Primary School and a new Menzieshill Nursery School.
- 15.3** The statutory consultation procedures will apply to the parents/carers of every pupil in attendance at both primary schools and the nursery school, all staff, trade union representatives and Parent Councils where they are established.

### **16.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS**

- 16.1** Equality Impact Assessment.

MICHAEL WOOD  
Director of Education

14 November 2012

STEWART MURDOCH  
Director of Leisure and Communities

14 November 2012