

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL

CONSULTATION REPORT

PROPOSAL:

- the closure of Menzieshill High School and re-delineation of the catchment area of Harris Academy to include Menzieshill High School's existing catchment area within Dundee
- to transfer that part of Harris Academy's catchment area, which comprises the catchment area of Rosebank Primary School, to Morgan Academy's catchment area and make Morgan Academy the associated secondary school of Rosebank Primary School
- make Baldragon Academy the associated Dundee secondary school of Longforgan, Inchtute, Abernyte, Auchterhouse, Birkhill and Liff Primary Schools from August 2016.

This Consultation Report is available on the Dundee City Council website - www.dundee.gov.uk/education - and also in printed form from the following locations: Customer Services Reception Area, Dundee House; Harris Academy; Menzieshill High School; Baldragon Academy and Rosebank Primary School.

• BACKGROUND

- 1.1 At the meeting of the Education Committee on 24 November 2014, an updated school estate report was agreed (Report No 436-2014 refers) and the Director of Education was instructed to bring details of the consultation process to committee and in line with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010. On 8 December 2014, the Education Committee agreed the proposal (Report No 466-2014 refers) in principle and instructed the Director of Education to formally consult on the proposal.
- 1.2 The proposal was to close Menzieshill High School and re-delineate the catchment area of Harris Academy to include Menzieshill High School's existing catchment area within Dundee; to transfer that part of Harris Academy's catchment area, which comprises the catchment area of Rosebank Primary School, to Morgan Academy's catchment area and make Morgan Academy the associated secondary school of Rosebank Primary School; and to make Baldragon Academy the associated Dundee secondary school of Longforgan, Inchtute, Abernyte, Auchterhouse, Birkhill and Liff Primary Schools from 15 August 2016.

It was proposed that Menzieshill High School be discontinued at the close of the school session 2015/16 and that the changes in the rezoning also take effect for all applications for school places at Harris Academy, Morgan Academy and Baldragon Academy for the school session 2016/17 onwards.

It was also proposed that all pupils currently enrolled in Menzieshill High School would be entitled to transfer to the new Harris Academy at the commencement of academic session 2016/17. Any pupils who wished to enrol at another school would be entitled to make a placing request for that school.

The following arrangements would then apply from session 2016/17:

- Perth and Kinross primary schools (Abernyte, Inchtute and Longforgan) and Angus primary schools (Auchterhouse, Birkhill and Liff) which were all formerly associated with Menzieshill High School would become associated primary schools of Baldragon Academy;
 - the Dundee associated primary schools of Menzieshill High School, (Gowriehill Primary School, Hillside Primary School and Camperdown Primary School) would become associated primary schools of Harris Academy; and
 - Invergowrie Primary School would remain an associated primary school for Harris Academy;
 - Morgan Academy would become the associated secondary school for Rosebank Primary School.
- A number of educational benefits were identified as part of this proposal:
 - Pupils attending the new Harris Academy will benefit from a modern, state-of-the-art school with purpose-built and varied learning environments designed to support a range of teaching and learning approaches.
 - The inclusion of a bespoke area for pupil support, including enhanced accommodation for pupils with complex additional support needs, will further enhance the integration and quality of pupil support service provision within the school. The inclusion of a number of pupil support interview areas will strengthen existing partnership working between school staff and education services, external agencies and third sector partners.
 - The creation of a rich digital learning environment, with the inclusion of wireless technology and hand-held devices, will support learning and further extend related teaching approaches across the school community, inspiring both pupils and staff. This will promote greater pupil engagement and motivation in their learning experiences, ultimately leading to improved outcomes.
 - Within the new Harris Academy, pupils will benefit from increased and improved opportunities for inter-disciplinary learning within bespoke co-located curriculum areas e.g. Drama, Music, Art & Design and Dance; Home Economics and Physical Education; Science and Technology. Such adjacent learning areas will facilitate natural cross-curricular links for staff and pupils.
 - Consistent with new school buildings, the school environment in its entirety will have a positive impact on the motivation, behaviour, health and wellbeing, aspirations and, ultimately, outcomes for young people leading to improved post-school positive destinations. It is envisaged that the 'open' ethos of the school design will have a positive impact upon the emotional health and wellbeing of both staff and young people and engender a calm and purposeful environment for learning.

- A larger staff population will enable pupils to access curriculum experiences facilitated by a staff team with augmented knowledge, expertise, specialism, skills, talents and interests. The larger staff team will be instrumental in providing greater personalisation and choice for pupils, both through varied pedagogy and curriculum provision.
- Increased scope and flexibility in the deployment of staff will result in greater opportunities for pupils to access discrete classes within the senior phase. This will limit the need for bi-level and tri-level teaching, currently a significant challenge within Menzieshill High School. As a result, pupils will be taught within a narrower ability range across subjects, commensurate with pupils' individual needs, abilities and aspirations.
- The provision of a broader range of relevant curriculum experiences and extended opportunities for pupils' achievements, coupled with increased flexibility of staff deployment, will be instrumental in providing an enhanced inclusive learning environment for pupils to better meet their learning needs.
- Continued opportunities will exist for parents and carers to be involved in their child's education through a range of home and school engagement activities aimed at supporting their child's learning. As at present, parents will have opportunities to participate within the school's Parent Council.
- The establishment of a revised catchment area for Harris Academy, embracing the rezoning of the Menzieshill High School catchment area, will result in improved transition arrangements from Primary to Secondary school as a result of a more inclusive induction experience for Harris Academy pupils. Currently, a large number of pupils who reside outwith the current Harris Academy catchment area are excluded from this process. Specifically, pupils will benefit from improved progression and continuity in their 3-18 Harris community educational experience.
- Associated Perth and Kinross and Angus pupils choosing to attend Baldragon Academy from the beginning of session 2016/17 will, from January 2017, attend the new purpose-built Baldragon Academy on the school's existing site.
- Pupils attending the new Baldragon Academy will benefit from a modern state of the art school with purpose-built and varied teaching accommodation conducive to the promotion of relevant and engaging educational experiences for young people.
- The new associations from Perth and Kinross and Angus primary schools and subsequent increased school roll will afford Baldragon pupils additional opportunities to widen their network of friends both within and outwith the Dundee community. In fostering new relationships and friendships, pupils will enhance their own and others' personal and social development.
- Rosebank Primary School currently sits at the most easterly part of the existing Harris Academy catchment area, 2.1 miles from Harris Academy. Rosebank Primary School will be relocated to a new shared campus site

in the Coldside area in spring 2016. This closer proximity to Morgan Academy and its associated primary schools will further strengthen Rosebank Primary School's natural links and affinity to the Coldside community.

- As a result of the above, such pupils will have Priority 1 status to attend what is deemed by many Rosebank Primary School parents to be their local community secondary school.
- Rezoning Rosebank Primary School's catchment area to Morgan Academy's catchment area will enable those pupils to forge associations and friendships with other young people residing in their locality who currently attend Morgan Academy. This will further strengthen young people's links and sense of belonging to their local community in addition to more fully exploiting existing opportunities for the integration of services for children and families.
- In rationalising the school estate and rezoning Rosebank Primary School to the Morgan Academy catchment area, many pupils will have a shorter distance to travel to secondary school.
- Under this new proposal, pupils currently residing in the Rosebank Primary catchment area will no longer be required to submit a placing request to attend Morgan Academy.
- A number of additional considerations led to the proposal for relocation:
 - These proposals will bring significant financial benefits to the City Council. The closure of Menzieshill High School and the attendance of its pupils at the new Harris Academy building will reduce the financial overheads arising from the maintenance and organisation of two separate establishments. Whilst the proposal will have no adverse impact on children attending other schools in the city, the closure of Menzieshill High School will reduce inefficient operating expenditure thus allowing the necessary redirection of resources to support pupils across Dundee
 - A significant number, 490, of Harris Academy's pupils actually live outside the school's catchment area. Of these 490 non-catchment pupils attending Harris Academy, 150 live in the Menzieshill High School catchment area. The majority of Harris Academy's non-catchment area pupils will be attending the school as a result of a placing request, either directly to Harris Academy or previously to one of its feeder primary schools. With the opening of a new state of the art building, it is likely that Harris Academy will see a significant increase in the number of placing requests. Where there is spare capacity at Harris Academy, these placing requests will generally be granted. It is likely that there will be an increase in the proportion of families resident in Menzieshill High School's catchment area making placing requests to Harris Academy. Such pupil migration will further reduce Menzieshill High School's roll.
 - The proposed closure of Menzieshill High School and transfer of the current pupil population to Harris Academy is only feasible at this point in time due to the artificially low roll of Harris Academy. In the event of this

proposal not going ahead in August 2016 and the Harris Academy roll normalising as anticipated, the possibility of transferring this large number of Menzieshill High School pupils would not be feasible. Furthermore, if in the future Menzieshill High School's roll declines further, any resultant post-closure solutions at a later date would present significant challenges to the Education Department.

- 1.4 As a result of the committee decision, the Director of Education was remitted to carry out the consultation procedures in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 in respect of the proposal. The consultation programme is detailed in paragraph 2.1 below, and a summary of the main points raised is set out in section 3.
- 1.5 A report from Education Scotland is required under the terms of the Act to address the educational aspects of the proposal. The report is attached as Appendix 1. The report states that:

“Dundee City Council's proposal to close Menzieshill High School and make associated amendments to the catchment areas of Morgan Academy and Baldragon Academy from August 2016 has a number of overall educational benefits. In particular, elements of the proposal will significantly improve access for many young people in the West of Dundee to a modern learning environment, wireless information and communications technology and a broader curriculum, including access to industry standard vocational learning environments.

The increased number of staff will provide young people attending Harris Academy and those who would in future be likely to become pupils of Harris Academy with a wider range of learning experiences. It will offer staff the opportunity to augment their own knowledge and expertise within a larger staff team. A larger number of staff will also offer young people access to single level classes in the Senior Phase, providing more flexibility to meet their individual needs. Approximately 350 young people attend Harris Academy as the result of placing requests. The proposed larger catchment area will mean that staff can plan curriculum transitions for almost all of the young people transferring to Harris Academy from P7, helping to improve progression and continuity in learning. Young people requiring additional support will benefit from bespoke facilities and a broader range of expertise amongst teaching staff. From January 2017, children who choose to transfer from the associated primary schools in Perth and Kinross and Angus will benefit from a new learning environment at Baldragon Academy. Many pupils from Rosebank Primary School will benefit from having a shorter distance to travel to their associated secondary school. If the proposal goes ahead, the projected revenue savings are substantial and will enable Dundee City Council to secure best value in the running of its services.”

The report concludes that:

“Overall, Dundee City Council's proposal to close Menzieshill High School and make associated amendments to the catchment areas of Morgan Academy and Baldragon Academy from August 2016 has a number of overall educational benefits. There will be increased opportunities for staff development, self-evaluation and curriculum development. Young people with additional support needs will benefit from an increased range of specialist staff experience and improved bespoke facilities.

Stakeholders have a range of reasonable concerns. In preparing its final consultation report, Dundee City Council needs to set out reasonable steps to address these concerns. In particular, the council needs to set out how it will address the issues about transport for all young people affected by the

proposal. The council needs to provide details on how it intends to ensure effective transitional arrangements for all children and young people who will attend the enlarged Harris Academy. It needs to provide information on the arrangements to be put in place to develop an inclusive identity and meet the needs of all young people attending the enlarged Harris Academy. The council needs to set out more clearly why it believes the current proposal is the most viable and reasonable one for the Menzieshill community. Finally, the council needs to provide more details on arrangements it will put into place for siblings who may wish to attend the same school as their older brother or sister.”

- 1.6 The Director of Education has considered carefully the HMle report and its implications, in particular where the report highlights specific issues raised during the consultation period. It is to be noted that the report recognises the potential benefits that will accrue from the proposed move. Having reviewed the proposal in the light of the representations and the Education Scotland (HMle) report, it is clear that many of the highlighted issues were identified in the proposal or are referred to directly in this consultation report.
- 1.7 It should be noted that the Council has, since publication of the Proposal Paper, decided that the Young Mothers Unit located within Menzieshill High School be re-located to Jessie Porter Nursery School/ Baldragon Academy Campus.

2.0 CONSULTATION

- 2.1 The formal consultation procedure included:
 - giving notice of the proposals to the parents of pupils at the affected schools, and the parents of pupils expected to attend the affected schools within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper (12 January 2015)
 - giving notice of the proposals to the pupils at the affected schools (12 January 2015)
 - giving notice of the proposals to the staff at the affected schools (12 January 2015)
 - giving notice of the proposals to Trades Unions representing staff at the affected schools (12 January 2015)
 - giving notice of the proposals to relevant Community Councils (12 January 2015)
 - giving notice of the proposal to Local Community Planning Partnerships (12 January 2015)
 - publication of the proposal on the Education Department's website (9 January 2015)
 - an announcement of the proposal in the local press, inviting any person to make written representation to the Director of Education (9 January 2015)
 - public meetings in the local areas (22, 27 and 28 January, 2 and 3 February 2015)
- 2.2 A summary note of all meetings held during the consultation period outlining questions asked, Education Department responses and key statements is attached as Appendix 2.

- 2.3 46 written representations were received on the proposal during the consultation period. A thematic summary of written submissions received from parents/carers, citizens and organisations from Dundee, Perth and Kinross and Angus Councils is attached as Appendix 3.
- 2.4 Of the 46 written submissions received, 22 submissions were received from Dundee parents, carers and residents with 8 additional submissions received from organisations and individuals as follows: Menzieshill High School Parent Council; Rosebank Primary School Parent Council; Hillside Primary School Parent Council; Gowriehill Primary School Parent Council; West End Community Council; Dundee Civic Trust; Save Menzieshill High School Campaign; Councillor Laurie Bidwell.
- 2.5 Of the 46 written submissions received, 15 submissions were received from Perth & Kinross and Angus parents, carers and residents with an additional submission received from Perth and Kinross Council – Lifelong Learning Executive Sub-Committee.
- 2.6 In accordance with the Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010 copies of all written representations and 'Frequently Asked Questions/Comments' were required to be submitted to HMle for their consideration in the preparation of their report.
- 2.7 No substantive errors in the Consultation Proposal document were identified as a result of the consultation process.

3.0 MAIN ISSUES ARISING FROM THE CONSULTATION, WITH RESPONSES

- 3.1 Parents from the current Menzieshill associated primary schools had concerns for the transitional arrangements that would need to be put in place to ensure that pupils in next session's P6 and P7 were adequately prepared for the important move to a new secondary school.

The proposal paper sets out in some detail the arrangements that would be put in place for P7 transition both to the new building and the new school (see Section 9) It would be important, however, if the proposal goes ahead, to ensure that the newly associated primary schools of Harris Academy enter into the normal cluster arrangements with the new secondary school to ensure that all pupils benefit from curricular planning and transitional arrangements. It is worth noting that Harris Academy has an excellent relationship with the current group of primaries associated to the school .The Education Department is confident that these excellent relationships would extend to the new associated primary schools. To enable this to occur smoothly (along with the transitional arrangements to the new building previously mentioned), all of the Guidance staff from Menzieshill will be transferring to Harris Academy to provide an extended team for at least school session 2016/17 to further support the transition.

- 3.2 Parents from Dundee schools involved asked for greater clarity on the transport arrangements for those living what will be a greater distance from their former secondary school.

The proposal paper identifies that transport is an area that would have to be looked at in greater detail, particularly for families living in the northern part of the catchment area. If the proposal goes ahead, the Education Department with Planning and Transport Colleagues will be entering into discussions with National Express Dundee to look at how current services could be extended to cover this part of the catchment area. In addition to this, we will be working with external agencies and Planning and Transport to look at encouraging cycling and walking using safe routes from all parts of the proposed extended Harris Academy Catchment to the new building on Perth Road. The current Harris Academy Project Board supporting the construction of the new school already has a sub group looking at transport and it is likely that, if the proposal goes ahead, the project board could be expanded by inviting current Menzieshill High School parents on to the group. The Transport sub group could then take on an expanded role in advising on transport.

To mitigate the travel difficulties that some families may face it is proposed that the Director of Education recommend that the Education Committee approve the following transitional arrangements:

- Pupils transferring from Menzieshill High school to Harris Academy, for the commencement of school session 2016/17, will be eligible for a bus pass for the remainder of their school career, if they live more than 1 mile from Harris Academy (as calculated by the 'shortest safe walking distance' procedure used in current authority transport guidelines) and live in the current Menzieshill High School catchment area in Dundee.*
- Pupils living in the current Menzieshill High School catchment area in Dundee who move into Harris Academy S1 at the commencement of school session 2016/17 will be entitled to a bus pass for the remainder of their school career, if they live more than 1 mile from Harris Academy (as calculated by the 'shortest safe walking distance' procedure used in current authority transport guidelines).*

The cost of the provisional transport arrangements outlined in section 3.2 will be approximately £94k in session 2016/17 reducing year on year to £21k in session 2021/22

- 3.3 Parents from Perth and Kinross schools involved asked for greater clarity on the transport arrangements for families currently with children at Menzieshill High School and/or children who might attend Baldrigon Academy in the future.

Dundee City Council does not provide school transport for any young people who live outside Dundee. This policy will continue. Dundee City Council has had initial discussions with Perth and Kinross Council on possible transport arrangements in the event of the proposal going ahead. If the proposal goes ahead as the Education Scotland report states

"Dundee City Council needs to continue the discussions it has started with Perth and Kinross Council so that both councils can share any revised travel plans with stakeholders as soon as possible."

Final decisions and responsibility for transport arrangements for Perth and Kinross families rests with Perth and Kinross Council.

- 3.4 Parents from all schools raised very natural concerns about the need for an inclusive identity to be achieved in an enlarged school.

The opening of a new building provides the ideal opportunity for this to occur as all pupils will be moving to the new building at the same time. More than half the Harris Academy school population will have had no experience of the former Perth Road building and this allows pupils to be placed on a more common footing in establishing an inclusive identity for the school population. However, this is not an easy or straightforward task. These types of transitions require more detailed planning.

The Parent Council of the school will also play an important role in creating this sense of inclusion and it would be important that the Harris Parent Council and the current Menzieshill Parent Council work closely together until formally becoming a single parent council at the beginning of session 2016/17 if the proposal proceeds.

The points below set out how this initially will be achieved:

- In terms of pupils' perceived shared ownership of the 'new' Harris Academy, both current Harris Academy pupils and new Harris Academy pupils will move 'as one' to the new school building on its opening in August 2016. School staff will support the fusion and transition of existing and new Harris Academy pupils to the new school through a range of means including: joint preparatory visits to the new building, careful composition of pupil tutor groups, assiduous approaches to curriculum continuity and transition, and the deployment of carefully monitored whole-school pupil support arrangements.
- The early establishment of a curriculum framework for the new school will inform an audit of staff requirements (teaching and support staff) for the effective delivery of the curriculum within the new school. It is anticipated that around 23 FTE teaching staff of the existing 47 FTE teaching staff currently deployed within Menzieshill High School will be redeployed to the new Harris Academy.
- The transition of former Menzieshill High School pupils to Harris Academy will be further supported by a temporary increase in staffing allocation to the new school. Importantly, such enhanced staffing levels will include former Menzieshill High School Principal Teachers of Guidance who, in partnership with existing members of the Harris Academy Guidance Team, will play a lead role in supporting and monitoring the well-being, transition and outcomes of all pupils. The temporary appointment of a number of additional Pupil Support Workers and School Support Workers from Menzieshill High School will further support pupil transition arrangements to the new school.
- In preparation for the transition to the new Harris Academy in Session 2016/2017, school leadership teams from both schools will engage in a joint process of curricular and school improvement planning.
- Given the differing prior educational experiences of pupils from both schools, school leadership teams will jointly determine key milestones to

monitor the smooth transition of all young people into the new Harris Academy.

- Where possible, teaching and support staff from Menzieshill High School will be redeployed to matched permanent vacancies within the new Harris Academy.
- In support of all staff redeployments, school leaders, supported by central officers, will deploy a range of strategies to support the smooth transition of staff to their new schools. Such measures will include, where required, pastoral support visits by link Education Officers to ensure staff wellbeing.
- During the period 2016/17- 2017/18 school leaders, with the support of central officers, will complete a review of the school's aims, values and vision. Central to this process will be the active engagement of 'new' Harris Academy pupils, parents/carers, staff and community partners.
- Throughout school sessions 2016/17 to 2018/19, school managers, supported by central officers, will complete a series of monitoring and evaluation activities in relation to the educational benefits for pupils, previously outlined. Such activity will include the systematic analysis of pupil attainment and achievement data and the views of pupils, parents and staff in relation to pupil wellbeing.
- A local authority extended review of educational provision within Harris Academy will be undertaken in session 2018/19 and its findings shared with all key stakeholders.
- In support of formulating a shared common identity with the new Harris Academy P7 pupils from all associated primary schools will jointly engage in a planned series of transitional activities prior to completing their shared P7/S1 induction experience.

- 3.5 Parents from Rosebank, Longforgan and Inchtute Primary Schools raised concerns about the possibility of their sibling children ending up in different secondary schools because they would no longer be Priority 1 for Harris Academy.

Dundee City Council has recognised this concern as part of the consultation and, if the proposal goes ahead, will put transitional arrangements in place to allow Priority 1 status for affected schools.

It is proposed that the Director of Education recommends to the Education Committee that, until the end of school session 2020/2021, any placing request for Harris Academy, from pupils who attended and live in the catchment area for any former associated primary schools of Menzieshill, where the young person has a sibling (as defined in our Enrolment and Placing Request Guidelines) attending Harris Academy will be given priority 1 status.

Having looked in some detail, with the support of Perth and Kinross Council, at the current school rolls, a maximum of 5 pupils per year fall into this category.

It is proposed that the Director of Education recommends to the Education Committee that, until the end of school session 2020/2021, any placing request for Harris Academy, from pupils who attended and live in the catchment area of Rosebank Primary School, where the young person has a sibling (as defined in our Enrolment and Placing Request Guidelines) attending Harris Academy will be given priority 1 status.

- 3.6 Concerns were raised from Menzieshill Community representatives on the sustainability of community engagement activities should Menzieshill close. There were also concerns about the impact the closure of the school might have on the wider community.

A range of community users currently access facilities within Menzieshill High School. These include:

- *Russian School on a Saturday*
- *Swimming Pool use 2 nights per week and on a Saturday*
- *Police Youth Volunteers (Tuesday evening use of classroom)*
- *Use of school gym by community football teams (Mon, Tues, Wed, Thu)*

Importantly, all groups, including the above, would be able to access new state of the art sports/other facilities at the new Harris Academy.

The new build primary school in Menzieshill, along with the refurbished local community centre, will also provide a choice of facilities in the area for community groups and other users. This will, importantly, include high quality sports facilities.

Parents in Dundee are in the fortunate position of having a choice of secondary and primary schools because of the compact geographical nature of the city. Over 30% elect to attend a school outwith their natural community. This is the case in the Menzieshill community where over 150 pupils currently choose to attend Harris Academy. The wider Menzieshill community will be well served locally with a new primary school and community centre as well as being able to access the nearby new Harris Academy. Along with this, within the wider Dundee area there is currently an extensive range of swimming pools and sports centres available for use. It would be important to reiterate that the Menzieshill High School population has dropped significantly over the last 6 years. If this continues or accelerates because of the availability of capacity in the new Harris Academy then the maintenance of secondary education would no longer be tenable in the Menzieshill area and options for managing this would be extremely limited.

- 3.7 Issues were raised from some responses about how projected pupil populations had been calculated, the difficulties in mid to long term projections, and how this could have potential adverse effects on their children's education if the future numbers are significantly different from the data.

Whilst it is accepted that it is not possible to predict with complete accuracy future school populations, every effort has been made using the data available, past trends and including the most recent Housing Land Audit to

predict likely school capacities. In relation to secondary pupil populations, more realistic data is always available because these figures are based for at least the next 7 years on actual primary rolls. These rolls may change slightly over time, but they do provide a more stable picture. The majority of placing requests are made in Dundee at the primary stage; therefore parental intentions for secondary are also clearer.

- 3.8 Many responses were received on the difficulties that pupils may face moving from a small primary school to a large secondary school and that Menzieshill High School is preferable for this transition because of the pupil population. This was also a concern for parents with pupils currently at Menzieshill High School where there was a feeling that the change to a large school would be difficult. Some responses indicated that 500-600 was the optimum size for a secondary school. Views were particularly strong where families had young people with additional support needs, where there was a view that a smaller school would provide a better provision for supporting pupil needs.

It is not uncommon for pupils from rural schools to transfer to large comprehensives. This is common place across Scotland. Secondary school marks an important point of transition for young people and many enjoy moving into a vibrant large school. Larger schools have larger staffing groups with larger numbers of Principal Teachers of Guidance and Support for Learning staff. Ratios for pupil support will be broadly similar. To assist though with this transition, the entire Guidance Team will be moving with Menzieshill for a temporary period to provide additional capacity for support and to provide continuity. It will be important for pupils with Additional Support Needs, that transitions are carefully planned. With the enlarged school, the Support for Learning Department will see a generous increase to allow for additional support in the transition period.

There is no national evidence that would suggest that schools of 500-600 attain better results or provide a greater level of pastoral support that a school of 800-1200.

- 3.9 The Perth and Kinross submission referred to in paragraph 2.5 sets out their views of the impact of the proposals on the Perth and Kinross pupils already in attendance at Menzieshill High School, and those primary pupils living in Perth and Kinross who are resident in the catchment areas of, and attend associated primary schools who may be affected in the future. Support is noted within the submission in relation to the potential enrolment of Perth and Kinross pupils currently in attendance at Menzieshill High School within Harris Academy and the proposed enhanced staffing levels to support pupil transition and continuity of educational provision.

- 3.10 Specific areas of concern outlined in the Perth and Kinross submission included:

- the merged nature of what are perceived to be 3 disparate proposals connected with the proposed closure of Menzieshill High School.
In outlining the original proposal, Dundee City Council considered it important to emphasise the inter-relationship of all the subcomponents. Had these various components been dealt with in individual reports, it would have been difficult to understand the purpose and value of any individual aspect. These proposals are inextricably linked and cannot be evaluated properly without reference to one

another.

- the absence within the proposals to ensure, via priority status, the attendance of younger siblings at Harris Academy along with their older siblings currently in attendance at Menzieshill High School

This has been addressed in paragraph 3.5 of this report

- the absence of plans to address the potential adverse effect of siblings attending different secondary schools

This has been addressed in paragraph 3.5 of this report

- the impact and possible consequences for Perth and Kinross Council regarding current admission and transfer to secondary school policy for pupils living in Longforgan, Inchtute and Abernyte

The responsibility for the organisation of all admission and transfer procedures for pupils living in Perth and Kinross Council rests with Perth and Kinross Council. Over and above the arrangements outlined in paragraph 3.5 of this report, the proposal paper outlines Dundee City Council's ongoing commitment to provide a Priority 1 place for all pupils in current Perth and Kinross primary schools with an associated Dundee City Council secondary school.

- perceived reputational issues for Perth and Kinross Council regarding possible parallel consultation on relevant related matters

As part of the consultation process for this proposal, Dundee City Council has carried out all of the statutory requirements. This included consultation with all affected Perth and Kinross schools and mandatory consultees.

- the possible impact of different travel arrangements and the assumption that associated costs would be met by Perth and Kinross Council.

Procedures for determining the final transport arrangements are set out in paragraph 3.3 in this report. Final decisions and responsibility for transport arrangements for Perth and Kinross families rests with Perth and Kinross Council.

- 3.11 In addition to the above, Perth and Kinross Council have requested clarification on the position of Perth and Kinross pupils currently attending Menzieshill High School who may not wish to attend Harris Academy if Menzieshill were to close.

Paragraph 1.3 of the proposal paper deals with this issue in full. If the proposal goes ahead, any current Menzieshill pupils who does not wish to attend Harris Academy may make a placing request for another Dundee school.

4.0 THE SCHOOL PREMISES (GENERAL REQUIREMENTS AND STANDARDS) (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 1967

- 4.1 The proposal meets the requirements of the above Act, and accordingly the Director of Education is not required to apply to Scottish Ministers for dispensation from the standards.

5.0 CONCLUSION AND NEXT STEPS

- 5.1 Having reviewed the Education Scotland Report and looked at the consultation responses in detail including those issues raised at the public meeting, it is recommended that the proposal should go forward in its present form.
- 5.2 As this proposal relates to the closure of a school, the council must notify Scottish Ministers within six working days after taking its decision of any decision to close a school. Dundee City Council must also publish on its website the fact it has notified Scottish Ministers of this decision and the period in which consultees have the opportunity to make representations to Ministers asking for the proposal to be called in. Ministers have the power to call in a proposal, but only where it appears to Ministers that the council has failed in significant regard to comply with the Act's requirements, or in coming to its decision has failed to take account of material consideration relevant to the proposal. Ministers have up to 8 weeks from the date of the council's decision to decide whether or not to issue a call-in notice.

MICHAEL WOOD
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION
2015

21 May

Appendix 1

Report by Education Scotland addressing educational aspects of the proposal by Dundee City Council to close Menzieshill High School. The council proposes to close Menzieshill High School. The proposal will also realign the catchment area of Harris Academy to include Menzieshill High School's existing catchment area within Dundee. Rosebank Primary School will be included within the catchment area of Morgan Academy so that children from Rosebank Primary School will transfer to Morgan Academy at the end of P7 instead of Harris Academy. Baldrigon Academy will become the associated Dundee secondary school for Longforgan, Inchtute, Abernyte, Auchterhouse, Birkhill and Liff Primary Schools. The council plans to implement all aspects of the proposal from August 2016.

1. Introduction

1.1 This report from Education Scotland has been prepared by HM Inspectors in accordance with the terms of the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments contained in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*. The purpose of the report is to provide an independent and impartial consideration of Dundee City Council's proposal to close Menzieshill High School. The council proposes to close Menzieshill High School. The proposal will also realign the catchment area of Harris Academy to include Menzieshill High School's existing catchment area within Dundee. Rosebank Primary School will be included within the catchment area of Morgan Academy so that children from Rosebank Primary School will transfer to Morgan Academy at the end of P7 instead of Harris Academy. Baldrigon Academy will become the associated Dundee secondary school for Longforgan, Inchtute, Abernyte, Auchterhouse, Birkhill and Liff Primary Schools. The council plans to implement all aspects of the proposal from August 2016. Section 2 of the report sets out brief details of the consultation process. Section 3 of the report sets out HM Inspectors' consideration of the educational aspects of the proposal, including significant views expressed by consultees. Section 4 summarises HM Inspectors' overall view of the proposal. Upon receipt of this report, the Act requires the council to consider it and then prepare its final consultation report. The council's final consultation report should include a copy of this report and must contain an explanation of how, in finalising the proposal, it has reviewed the initial proposal, including a summary of points raised during the consultation process and the council's response to them. The council has to publish its final consultation report three weeks before it takes its final decision. Where a council is proposing to close a school, it needs to follow all legislative obligations set out in the 2010 Act, including notifying Ministers within six working days of making its final decision and explaining to consultees the opportunity they have to make representations to Ministers.

1.2 HM Inspectors considered:

- the likely effects of the proposal for children and young people of the schools; any other users; children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the council area;
- any other likely effects of the proposal;

- how the council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal; and
- the educational benefits the council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the council's reasons for coming to these beliefs.

1.3 In preparing this report, HM Inspectors undertook the following activities:

- attendance at the public meetings held on 27 January 2015 in Harris Academy and 2 February 2015 in Baldrigon Academy in connection with the council's proposals;
- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others; and
- visits to Menzieshill High School, Gowriehill Primary School, Hillside Primary School, Camperdown Primary School, Rosebank Primary School, Harris Academy, Baldrigon Academy, Morgan Academy, Longforgan Primary School, Inchtore Primary School, Abernyte Primary School, Auchterhouse Primary School, Birkhill Primary School and Liff Primary School, including discussion with relevant consultees.

2. Consultation Process

2.1 Dundee City Council undertook the consultation on its proposal with reference to the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*.

2.2 The consultation on the proposal ran from 12 January to 27 February 2015. During this period the council held five public meetings in a number of schools involved with the proposal. The meetings were generally well attended, with the meeting in Menzieshill High School being very well attended. At these meetings there were mixed reactions about the proposal. The council issued consultation papers to Perth and Kinross Council and Angus Council, including children at the primary schools directly affected by the proposal. This did not include Invergowrie Primary School. A number of parents from both council areas attended one or more of the public meetings. The council received 46 written responses to the consultation and almost all were against the proposal. The response from the Menzieshill High School Parent Council included views from a range of stakeholders, all of whom were against the proposal. The council held meetings with children, young people and staff from the Dundee City schools involved in the proposal. While many children and young people saw the benefits of the proposal they too had a number of concerns.

3. Educational Aspects of Proposal

3.1 Dundee City Council's proposal to close Menzieshill High School and make associated amendments to the catchment areas of Morgan Academy and Baldragon Academy from August 2016 has a number of overall educational benefits. In particular, elements of the proposal will significantly improve access for many young people in the West of Dundee to a modern learning environment, wireless information and communications technology and a broader curriculum, including access to industry standard vocational learning environments.

3.2 The increased number of staff will provide young people attending Harris Academy and those who would in future be likely to become pupils of Harris Academy with a wider range of learning experiences. It will offer staff the opportunity to augment their own knowledge and expertise within a larger staff team. A larger number of staff will also offer young people access to single level classes in the Senior Phase, providing more flexibility to meet their individual needs. Approximately 350 young people attend Harris Academy as the result of placing requests. The proposed larger catchment area will mean that staff can plan curriculum transitions for almost all of the young people transferring to Harris Academy from P7, helping to improve progression and continuity in learning. Young people requiring additional support will benefit from bespoke facilities and a broader range of expertise amongst teaching staff. From January 2017, children who choose to transfer from the associated primary schools in Perth and Kinross and Angus will benefit from a new learning environment at Baldragon Academy. Many pupils from Rosebank Primary School will benefit from having a shorter distance to travel to their associated secondary school. If the proposal goes ahead, the projected revenue savings are substantial and will enable Dundee City Council to secure best value in the running of its services.

3.3 In Menzieshill High School and Gowriehill, Hillside and Camperdown Primary Schools there were mixed reactions to the proposal. All Menzieshill High School parents who met with HM Inspectors thought that secondary education would be better delivered on the Menzieshill site. The majority of children, young people and staff in Menzieshill High School, and the majority of parents, children, young people and staff in Gowriehill, Hillside and Camperdown Primary Schools, who met with HM Inspectors recognised the educational benefits which the new Harris Academy would provide. They felt that the new learning environment, greater subject choice and more opportunities to work with pupils from a wider socio-economic background would benefit young people. However, they also had a number of concerns with the proposal.

3.4 Many stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors were concerned about transition arrangements. Almost all parents, children and staff from Gowriehill, Hillside and Camperdown Primary Schools requested greater clarity in relation to the transition support which would be provided for P6 and P7 children. Currently, there is an extensive programme of transition arrangements in place for children moving from P7 to Menzieshill High School, which includes curricular links, assessment information, and school visits. Stakeholders had reasonable concerns about the lack of clarity regarding the integration of children from Menzieshill High School and

Harris Academy. In its final consultation report, the council needs to set out how it intends to address these concerns

3.5 All stakeholders in the Menzieshill area schools who met with HM Inspectors had concerns about transport arrangements to Harris Academy for children and young people. Under the current arrangements, children who attend Longforan, Inchtute and Abernyte Primary Schools who choose to attend Menzieshill High School and live more than three miles from the school are entitled to free transport to school. The free transport is funded by Perth and Kinross Council. Parents in the associated Perth and Kinross schools wanted a clear statement from Dundee City Council and Perth and Kinross Council on whether this arrangement would continue when children who currently attend Menzieshill High School move to Harris Academy from August 2016. Parents also wanted a similar statement regarding young people from the associated Perth and Kinross schools who might attend Baldragon Academy from August 2016. Stakeholders have reasonable concerns and Dundee City Council needs to continue the discussions it has started with Perth and Kinross Council so that both councils can share any revised travel plans with stakeholders as soon as possible.

3.6 Almost all stakeholders in Menzieshill High School and Harris Academy who met with HM Inspectors had reasonable concerns about the arrangements the council will put in place to ensure an inclusive identity in the enlarged Harris Academy. Also that the council achieves a positive transition for all young people, parents and staff. These include transitional arrangements for curriculum planning, staff development and staff deployment, particularly of senior staff, arising from the proposal. The council will need to work closely with staff, parents, children and young people in addressing these concerns. It will need to set out clearly in its final consultation report how it proposes to address these issues.

3.7 Almost all the community representatives who met with HM Inspectors saw the educational benefits which would be provided by the proposal. However, they had concerns about the sustainability of community engagement activities and the regeneration of the area should Menzieshill High School close. While understanding that many parents from the Menzieshill area choose to send their children to Harris Academy, many community representatives felt there was a perceived disconnection between the regeneration programme and the closure of the secondary school. In addressing this issue, the council needs to assess the impact of the proposal on the local community and set out why it believes the current proposal is the most viable and reasonable option open to it.

3.8 Many stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors had reasonable concerns about perceived inequalities in the proposal. In particular, stakeholders in Rosebank, Longforan and Inchtute Primary Schools were concerned that the new arrangements meant younger siblings might not be educated at the same school as their older brother or sister currently educated at Menzieshill High School. This concern was exacerbated by the fact that Harris Academy would be at near capacity and therefore may not have the flexibility to offer placing requests to siblings. They wanted Dundee City Council to reconsider the proposal and allow younger siblings the opportunity to attend Harris Academy along with their older brother or sister. Parents in Rosebank Primary School raised concerns about the inequality of

allowing Invergowrie Primary School, which is outside Dundee City Council, to remain associated with Harris Academy. Parents in Rosebank Primary School felt it was unfair that an out of authority school would be given priority for places at Harris Academy. In taking the proposal forward, the council needs to work closely with all relevant stakeholders to address these concerns.

3.9 Almost all stakeholders in Baldrigon and Morgan Academies who met with HM Inspectors saw the educational benefits of the proposal. Those in Morgan Academy welcomed the increased catchment area. They thought it would improve curricular transitions for larger numbers of pupils in the area. Those in Baldrigon Academy welcomed the prospect of an increasing number of pupils and the opportunities this would bring.

3.10 Perth and Kinross Council responded to the consultation. It suggested that three proposals have been merged into one and that the individual proposals are not adequately addressed within the current proposal paper. Angus Council did not provide a formal response to the consultation proposal.

4. Summary

4.1 Overall, Dundee City Council's proposal to close Menzieshill High School and make associated amendments to the catchment areas of Morgan Academy and Baldrigon Academy from August 2016 has a number of overall educational benefits. There will be increased opportunities for staff development, self-evaluation and curriculum development. Young people with additional support needs will benefit from an increased range of specialist staff experience and improved bespoke facilities.

4.2 Stakeholders have a range of reasonable concerns. In preparing its final consultation report, Dundee City Council needs to set out reasonable steps to address these concerns. In particular, the council needs to set out how it will address the issues about transport for all young people affected by the proposal. The council needs to provide details on how it intends to ensure effective transitional arrangements for all children and young people who will attend the enlarged Harris Academy. It needs to provide information on the arrangements to be put in place to develop an inclusive identity and meet the needs of all young people attending the enlarged Harris Academy. The council needs to set out more clearly why it believes the current proposal is the most viable and reasonable one for the Menzieshill community. Finally, the council needs to provide more details on arrangements it will put into place for siblings who may wish to attend the same school as their older brother or sister.

**HM Inspectors
Education Scotland
March 2015**

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF STAFF MEETING AT MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL HELD ON THURSDAY 22 JANUARY 2015 AT 3.30PM

In attendance: 45 Staff (teaching and support), Michael Wood (MW) (Director of Education), Paul Clancy (PC) (Head of Secondary Education and ASN) Danny Webster (Secondary Education Manager) and Tracey Stewart (Education Officer) – NOTETAKING

Note of Meeting

Meeting commenced 3.45 pm.

Introduction by M Wood and purpose of meeting clarified. Consult on proposals etc. Reference back to years gone by and first question he was asked was when will the school be closing. Reiteration of the challenge of closing a school.

Roll has dropped rapidly over last few years – there are 150 pupils who are priority one for Menzieshill but who attend Harris via placing requests. If school roll remained above 650 we wouldn't be here today. There is an opportunity to rationalise school estate in this point in time.

Recognised staff's anxiety of where they will go beyond this. Acknowledgement of impact on staff and their professional development. Not defending the decision – year on year it's increasingly difficult to make the required savings.

Politically we need to take this consultation forward – MW explained the process. Collation of responses to Education Scotland, HMI look at proposal and consider, amongst other things, was due process followed, decision made by Education Scotland who prepare a report which remains on stock for 3 weeks. It will go back to committee end of May/beg June 2015 with recommendation for elected members' decision.

Commitment given to work with staff to take things forward.

Key issues, questions and responses

Staff – At a PT meeting which PC attended, Paul gave assurances that PTs will get posts as they come up across the City. Can this be put down in writing? Keen to get things in writing so that there is a written record to refer back to in May 2015.

PC – Yes happy to do this but we can't assume that the school will close. This meeting will be shared as part of the consultation process. Trade Unions will be informed and will consequently inform their members. We have started to look at staffing across the city – there will be a 3 year cash conservation and we will work with you to get you into PT posts. We will put a reserve on posts – if the proposal goes ahead we will redeploy staff at the earliest opportunity. We will work with Unions and already have an agreement in DNCT for other posts. We will share the protocol with staff. We can't put this out in writing at moment as this is not finalised. If the proposal goes ahead we will get together with all PTs and give you that picture. We are treating these as compulsory transfers and we have a protocol for this. We are working in the background to get ready for this. Voluntary Early Retirement (VER) will be offered as an option and we are confident over a 3 year period.

In August 2016 posts unfilled will be on a conserved salary.

All staff, wherever they are, will be offered development opportunities to maintain their career pathway options.

We are confident that we will fill the posts.

Staff – again can we get something in writing?

PC – I can reassure staff that the discussion we are having right now this is being recorded – copy of the discussions are available and SMT will be meeting with trade unions over the next few weeks. We are giving this information in spirit of honesty that we want to get everyone in post. We want to keep people in Dundee.

Staff - What criteria did the council use that the school will close and not merge?

MW – Made reference that funding was received to build a new school (ie Harris Academy) and that there would be no justification to close a newly built school.

PC – Emphasised that the proposal is not to close two schools. Closing Harris would not succeed. If this were the case we could not act for 5 years. Outlined position of implications of status quo and the artificially low school roll. There would be no possibility of closing a brand new school – this is a view of our legal team. This is a window of opportunity, due to the artificially low roll at Harris Ac, to move Menzieshill at this point in time. The new school will fill up regardless.

Staff - Is there a half way position?

PC – confirmed legal position – this is what we are consulting on. And there is no half way position.

Staff – asked about mergers in the past – Whitfield/Linlathen; Rockwell/Kirkton

MW - Need to justify proposal to close – don't think it would be right to have a hybrid model.

Staff – There will be around 23 staff moving to Harris – are we talking about non promoted members of staff? Is this a guesstimate? Is it backed up with hard facts?

PC - We have a clear idea because we have a staffing formula and therefore we know how many staff we need. The exact areas of where they will be will be

determined on the curriculum of the school. Maths and English are clearer but the rest will come from the design of curriculum. We are clear: 23 FTE posts will be required.

Currently there are around 46 FTE in Menzieshill.

Staff - What about non teaching staff?

PC - Need to look at various roles across the city – do something similar – is there a vacancy that you could fill. Will sit with the unions and work out a protocol. We will sit with each group and what will this look like in reality.

There is a no redundancy policy so everyone will get a post.

Staff – How do you decide which one of two PSWs would go to Harris if only one goes?

PC - Pupil Support Workers – currently deployed 2 per school. We will have to consider a number of things in the moves. There are increased opportunities for a number of support staff to move to other areas because of the type of things they do.

This has not been fully worked out but the principles are there.

We don't currently have the same protocols for support staff – this will have to be worked out. This detail will be discussed in consultation with staff and trade unions.

Staff - Is it practical to put this number of pupils into the Harris site. Only 80 parking spaces, busy Perth Road. Will the school not be over full?

MW - Currently 970 pupils in Harris Academy – only 450 pupils are priority 1. There will be ongoing placing requests which would be high.

Significant numbers come from outwith the city – there will always be a drift into making placing requests

One of the plus points of taking Menzieshill into Harris is that transition arrangements will be easier and the experience better for pupils.

Strathclyde formula is used to work out the capacity of a school – this is used throughout the country. 1309 rated but can take more. This is generous. Grove has 1370 capacity. The original proposal was 1200 but as the building plan progressed additional footprint was able to be added.

Harris in the 1990s had 1300 pupils regularly so the Perth Road has had that experience before.

Car parking – authority policy is to reduce car parking facilities. Tried to build reasonable car parking but we would be encouraging staff and pupils to use buses – Dundee has a good transport link. The building won't have an issue to have the capacity.

Placing requests are down at moment because of the decant to Rockwell but that is the reason and this would go up when the new building opens.

Staff – There has been a reference to the guidance team moving to help pupil transition. What about the psychological problems that may be caused to pupils and

friction between pupils. How long will guidance team remain in Harris?

YMU – don't seem to have given this the same consideration – why was this transition not given the same level of support?

MW – I'm less inclined to agree that there will be friction. All pupils are moving at the same time and supported by all staff. Activities will support engagement and ownership of a new school context. Most kids are remarkably resilient.

Staff – I have previous experience of 2 mergers – reference to St Saviours and Lawside. Suggests there may be potential for friction. What steps will be taken to ensure an easier transition.

MW – People in the room have the solutions. What conditions need to be put in place for this to work. It is possible.

PC – the advantage here is that both sets of pupils will be going into a brand new building at the same time – this is not like a normal closure. 150 pupils currently go to Harris Academy from this catchment area – they are neighbours and friends of pupils in Menzieshill High School. Both sets of pupils move at the same time. Not moving to a pre existing building. We think in preparation pupils will have planned opportunities to mix. Guidance staff will be enhanced for as long as need be. Possibly more than a year and may be dependent upon guidance vacancies across the city. There will be a need for more PTs Guidance due to increased roll. Time and resource will be given to ensure pupils settle in.

Staff - Agree pupils are more resilient than we think but I think that with two groups of pupils moving to a new building, the prevailing view is that it really belongs to the Harris pupils.

MW – Young people in S1-3 (*at Harris*) have no association with the new building.

Staff – statement – Menzieshill High pupils don't have the luxury of keeping the same uniform, kit etc.

PC - recognise uniform is an issue – not naive to say there won't be friction and we need to work together. We need to build that and need to leave a legacy. Similar experience at St Paul's which was a merger. This was difficult. Need to minimise this. Need to encourage pupils to see this as a new start. Need to think that they are moving to Harris as their new school. Need to move in as pupils of Harris Academy. We will offer what support we can to ensure all pupils can move to the new school. Sponsorship of uniforms may be possible. Pupils have a view of why this is happening. My view is that they (*pupils*) are up for the move. We will work with families.

Important that pupils move in and would like them to have the uniform – don't necessarily need blazer. We would like to achieve that. We will facilitate and support what pupils want to do.

We need to come up with a plan so that there is an identity with the school in discussion with families and pupils.

HT - Parent council would be committed to try and help funds to ensure every pupil should get a blazer if they want a blazer. Acknowledges high cost of blazer and looking into cheaper supplier.

Parents want to focus on what is the best transition for their young people.

PC – it would also have to be said that not all pupils at Harris have blazers

Staff - Staff transition – looking for staff to get together – will there be opportunities for staff to come together to ask questions, share? When will time be made available for that?

PC – biggest logistical task – timetable, curriculum, got to get that right. Lot of discussion will need to take place between school and department.

Staffing complement – look at this to get staff visits, development days, - problem is getting cover but we are willing to look at this.

Staff - back to YMU question – MW responded

MW – Irrespective of this consultation and decision the unit will move – it is not part of the consultation. Reference to the media. This is a consultation. Reading in the media things that are not simply true. I have not been contacted to discuss any of this. Savings proposal ie YMU. There are difficult decisions to be made and this would be on the stocks whether Menziesshill would be closing or not. Again reiterated that such decisions are not easy. Jessie Porter Nursery with Baldragon, gives us an excellent opportunity to provide wrap around care. MW shared details of the demographic of mothers and babies in the unit. Need to look at cost effective way of delivering this system.

I will be discussing this with trade unions and staff but not as part of this consultation. PC – girls (*young mums*) can go to Harris. This is not part of the public consultation. YMU is a central service and does not form part of this consultation. We will look at the young mums through our normal mechanisms.

Staff - If plan goes ahead – would you be willing to increase the staff in MHS and Harris in the next academic year

PC - Yes we would be happy to look at that to keep the staffing the same or enhance it. We will need to see what the roll ends up like following placing requests. The issue is finding bodies due to supply or lack of it.

We will be asking Scottish Government for additional time/inset days.

Staff - What happens to our resources?

MW - Ebay! – followed by serious response. Reference to horse trading and initiative of staff. Staff not backwards at coming forwards – I'm quite happy with that. I have no worries that the resources will go to good places.

Harris Academy will have new furniture and capital investment – lot of new equipment in the building. We would need to ensure if there are any adaptations in the curriculum and may require additional resources.

PC has contacted schools already to be sensitive about the requests being asked.

MW – we will work with you to provide storage for resources.

Staff – what about music instruction – will that continue?

PC – absolutely.

Meeting ends.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PARENT COUNCIL MEETING AT MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL HELD ON THURSDAY 22 JANUARY 2015 AT 6.00PM

Present: Michael Wood, Director of Education
Paul Clancy, Head of Education (Secondary and ASN)
Helen Gray, Head Teacher
Taletta Jamieson, Parental Engagement Officer
Danny Webster, Secondary Education Manager
Tracey Stewart, Education Officer (Note Taker)
Parent Council Members (5)

Note of Meeting

Meeting commenced 6.03 pm

Introduction by MW and purpose of meeting clarified

This is part and parcel of an ongoing consultation into the proposed closure of Menzieshill High School and related matters as outlined in the consultation proposal paper. I will aim to speak in plain English.

We are here to listen to get a sense of thinking and views – there is no hidden agenda here. We met with staff earlier – MW shared staff issues, in particular what will happen to their jobs; how to get the best transition for young people and how we aim to give the time to plan this effectively. This was a productive meeting.

The Young Mums' Unit (YMU) is getting some negative press. I will be upfront here – these are two completely separate issues. We are in a hugely challenging time with budgets. Regardless of this proposed closure we would have put up the saving of staff efficiencies within the YMU. There is no other place in the city with that level of staffing. The Unit will transfer regardless – there is a new campus at Baldragon – within Jessie Porter nursery we will create a bespoke baby room and this will offer progression beyond 2 years. It will be a better environment. It has been wrongly reported that the mums won't go to Harris – we know that 4 will have left by the time the new school opens. I won't be speaking in public about individual young mums who have right to privacy. The relocation of the YMU has nothing to do with this consultation.

This is the most contentious decision that you need to come to – the closure of a school. Clearly it has an impact but we have a situation where the roll in Menzieshill High School has fallen to 470/80 mark and within Harris there has been a significant drop from 1050 to 970 because of the decant to Rockwell. This gives us an opportunity to bring the two schools together specifically at this point in time. In addition, we would not be legally justified closing a brand new school.

KEY STATEMENTS, QUESTIONS AND RESPONSES

Parent - We would feel better if the school was to be a merger not a closure.

MW – Currently in Harris there are 150 young people who are priority one for Menzieshill and if they currently attended Menzieshill we wouldn't be having this conversation.

Parent – The Education Department has not encouraged these 150 pupils to attend Menzieshill.

MW – Transition arrangements are excellent in Menzieshill and staff work hard every year to encourage transfer to Menzieshill.

Parent – The school has improved with Helen (HT) over the last 4 years.

PC – Menzieshill roll has dropped over the last 3 years. Almost all pupils from feeder primaries go to Menzieshill. There is little we can do to stop parents putting in placing requests. Parents are making placing requests at the P1 stage. It is the parents' right under placing request legislation to do so. We do encourage families to attend their local community school. There is no hidden agenda. The Menzieshill High School continue to do all they can to get pupils in their catchment to attend.

Parent – You have stated that Harris will be over capacity in 5 years time – over the maximum role of 1309.

PC explains the range of criteria outlined within section 4.5 of the proposal paper adding that it is transparent that in worst case scenario, if all houses were built and if all pupils go to Harris this may indeed be the case.

MW explains the figures of priority 1 pupils for Harris and the number of pupils who attend due to placing requests. 590 pupils, of the current 940 roll, live in the Harris catchment area or attend Harris through prior association with Invergowrie Primary School. The remainder of the roll come through placing requests outwith the catchment area.

Parent – Do you not think you are making things too tight and putting the whole of the school estate under pressure?

MW – The estate can cope with that.

PC – If leading up to 2022 all building takes place then perhaps - if we see by 2020 and there is a boom due to the waterfront we will allow this to inform our evolving plans. You plan the school estate as things happen. It costs £2 million a year to keep the school open. Our need in 2020 is unknown. There are significant dangers of the roll at Menzieshill falling.

Parent – Could the Authority have reacted sooner? Why were the catchments changed in such a way?

PC - In Dundee, 32% of pupils go to schools of parental choice. We can only turn down placing requests on legal grounds of refusal.

MW – We can do something differently here and if we don't do this now it puts the young people in Menzieshill at risk.

Parent – There is a brand new 3 stream primary school being built in the area, whole regeneration of the area, a new community centre and you are taking away the secondary school.

MW – During the consultation of Hillside I was faced with comments that Hillside was not part of the Menzieshill community and we would be making children mix with the Gowriehill children.

Parent – There is a big concern that our children won't be welcomed into the new school.

Parent – What have others been saying from other schools about not getting their children in to the new school?

MW – I've been out doing other consultations and only one parent turned up from Downfield, for example.

Parent – Concern of pupils over next two years. What if Menzieshill High School staff look for jobs in the interim? What will the impact be on the current pupils?

PC – We have guaranteed to all staff that they will be redeployed. We are working hard to ensure all staff in Menzieshill have a job in Dundee. Principal Teachers will be redeployed to available vacancies, with 23 Menzieshill High School staff going to the new school. All Guidance staff will be going to Harris to support pupils' enhanced transition. We have given strong guarantees to staff that they will have continuity of employment. Salary will be higher in Harris and other schools. I have a view that no one wants to "jump ship". **HG** (HT) intimated that staff have been speaking to her and that they want to stay in Menzieshill.

MW - Explanation of acting posts across all schools to move the PTs. We are working really hard to keep staff as they are our greatest resource. There is also an assurance that we won't be redeploying staff from Menzieshill until the school closes.

PC - We will do everything we can to retain staff. We feel encouraged. Pupils are up for this and with our support this will continue.

Parent - Will we have any say in the transition of the pupils from Menzieshill to Harris?

MW – Yes - the success of the transition will be a team effort and will involve staff including shared inset events, pupils moving together, joint development days, joint site visits. We also need to remember that the current pupils in S1, 2 and 3 in both schools have no association with the previous Harris building. They will be moving together into a new school.

Parent – We are concerned about identity of the school.

MW – We recognise this and we will need to work hard on this - there will need to be dialogue on this. We will be planning for this.

MW - Transport is another area – we have looked at that in detail. We are already in dialogue with bus companies – we know there are 73 pupils with free school meals living 2 miles away and will get free bus passes.

Parent – There are lots of parents living on the threshold of not getting Free School Meal Entitlement and that could put lot of pressure on them having to pay for transport. Lots of pupils can walk but those on the edge of the catchment can't walk – it's too far but still under 3 miles so not entitled them to a free bus pass, eg, the children in Charleston ?

PC – There will be a large number of pupils who get funded transport – 8 out of 19

will qualify for a free bus pass from Charleston. Across the City there are children on the cusp of free bus passes so this is not solely a Menzieshill issue.

MW – It would never be possible to place a school which is equidistant for all.

Parent – We understand money and understand benefits but we need to acknowledge those on the cusp.

PC – We will try to mitigate a number of circumstances and we will try to protect our young people as far as possible. We are working with a lot of cycling companies and encouraging children to come to school in different ways.

Parent – Some parents have safety issues/concerns.

MW – We are working with people around their travel plan and safe routes to school. There is no hard data to show that there is more danger. Police say there is now less chance of being knocked down – it is a bit of a misconception.

Parent – Travel and how all this information came out will be the main things which come up in public consultation. Parents found out from their children who had been informed by reporters before anything official had come out.

MW – We tried to plan the day as best we could. It is disappointing. The day was planned in such a way as to avoid this situation. Dundee is a huge village with a morning and afternoon newspaper. The report came out around the November Inset days (13/14 November). There was a decision to take to the November committee as a point of critical mass had been reached around those getting to know about the proposal and risk of leaks but the two Inset days blocked us getting this information to parents in an effective way.

Parent – We have great concerns about the unprofessionalism in Harris Academy and the way they are dealing with this. Pupils and parents are saying things which are not helpful. This continues at the Harris Parent Council.

MW – Explained the lengthy consultation process we need to go through resulting in the outcome not going back to Committee until end May. It's a long process which doesn't help. Michael intimated that he has spoken to the Head Teacher at Harris re parent council meetings and has had assurances that this did not happen.

MW reinforced the decision making process that is made by the committee and should it go ahead we will work to make this a success.

Parent – What Management Team will be taken forward to the new school?

MW – Once we know if this is going ahead we will look at everything in microscopic detail. At the moment we are in consultation. We will be looking at Voluntary Early Retirement (VER) for staff.

PC - Looking at the age profile we believe there will be a good balance on the SMT from both schools. We want to move as many staff as possible to Harris. We will commit to move all guidance staff for at least a full session perhaps longer. There may be VER in both schools' management teams.

We have all of these things to go through but we will put resources in where required. It is in our interests to make this happen. If it goes ahead there will be lots of planning. Key staff will be in the new school. **PC** acknowledged the difficulties of pulling on the Harris blazer for Menzieshill pupils. It is in our interest to make this work for all our families and pupils.

Parent – Concern it will get to stage where all secondary schools in Dundee will be big. There won't be the opportunity to transfer pupils to small schools. Even in a big

school with the best HT and guidance staff we still have a concern that there won't be same level of support. All the staff in Menzieshill know the pupils well.

A lot of the transfers in to Menzieshill have been pupils with problems.

PC – To be fair most placing requests to any school are because of problems – this happens across all our schools.

Parent – Other schools don't have the same knowledge of how to deal with pupils who have problems.

MW – Each registration group builds up good relations and this has been built up. It's not about the size of the school. You don't wait until things go wrong. Harris received excellent for pupil support in latest inspection. There are a lot of vulnerable young people at Harris. It's not just about the size but the structure can ensure the right conditions for knowing pupils.

Parent – What about kids who need a push? This happens more readily in a smaller school – some kids need a smaller school and we won't have a choice.

MW – Parents don't often have the luxury of that choice. You wouldn't get paid transport for a placing request. Local schools should serve their communities. A big plus, therefore, would be that at the time of transition this would be a more focussed community. This is not possible where places are taken up by a myriad of schools via placing requests. Currently, 21 primary schools feed into Harris. This proposal will make transition easier for pupils attending the new school.

PC – You are arguing about not much choice, but if you have choice you can have disparity in your school estate. We are aiming for 90% efficiency of use for all our schools. For all schools below 50% we are losing opportunities in other areas of spend. The costs and opportunities lost are considerable. Can we really afford to run at less than 50%? We are in a comprehensive system and our buildings should be the same. In 1970s all schools in Dundee were big. 1300 pupils is not too big.

Parent – Feel there is huge disparity of the pupils in the 2 schools – ethos. Concern over mixing of pupils. There will be 2 transitions for current p7 pupils. Children are different.

PC – Children are not different – each school has its own ethos – we need to plan the transition. Maybe the parents have a different outlook. Young people are young people are young people.

Parent – There has always been a clash between Harris and Menzieshill pupils.

MW – Kids are resilient and more mature than we give them credit for and we do them a disservice. We will make it work for them. We have to.

PC - There is as much work to do with pupils in Harris to prepare them to meet their 400 new friends and their staff, two parent councils coming together. We want to move on to the next stage. Our aspiration is to get through this.

Parent – Can we start having joint parent council meetings?

PC – You can come together to talk on a regular basis but not form a joint council. There will be more communication at all levels.

MW draws meeting to a close at 18:58.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PUBLIC MEETING AT MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL HELD ON THURSDAY 22 JANUARY 2015 AT 7.00PM

In attendance

Approximately 175 members of the public

Michael Wood (MW) (Director of Education), Paul Clancy (PC) (Head of Secondary Education and ASN, Stewart Hunter, Convenor of Education)

Danny Webster (Secondary Education Manager) and Tracey Stewart (Education Officer) – NOTE TAKING

Introduction by MW

Welcome and thanks for attending. Purpose – chance to ask questions, seek clarification, make views known. This is a difficult time – school closures are contentious because they involve people. We need to be absolutely clear why we are proposing this and the process we have to go through. The process is a lengthy one and involves Education Scotland, Scottish Government, Elected Members. In real terms the outcome will not go to committee until the end of May/June 2015.

The fundamental question is – why and why now? In Menzieshill the roll is under 500 (487) and we know that Harris has declined to an artificially low level below 1,000 so there is a window of opportunity to bring the schools together – what that means is change for Menzieshill and we need to be very clear about what we have to do to make sure it happens as smoothly and effectively as we can.

We met with staff earlier and the Parent Council and we are now here. Ultimately the school would close and move to a new Harris building in August 2016 and for that to happen we need to prepare. Downside of that not happening - it would be difficult to stack up Menzieshill – the curriculum may not be able to be delivered. We staff to a formula – there are approx 45 staff in Menzieshill High School.

We propose 23 staff from Menzieshill will go to the new Harris and all the guidance staff in the first instance so young people will have continuity of care in their transition. We need to prepare pupils for moving in to a new school – planned

process e.g. uniform, transport. In the proposal paper we have tried to set out why we think this is important. It is a window of opportunity to make this happen – if we take no action now and the roll in Harris was to go up and Menzieshill goes down even further we could be sitting in 2017 with a roll of 350/400 (*within Menzieshill*) and have to think what we will do with the pupils then. We are committed to making the move happen now due to the educational benefits for pupils.

Happy to take on any questions.

Questions/Issues/Responses

Public – will there be overcrowding in the new Harris?

MW – No, the school will be at its maximum at 1309. Pupil rolls based on August 2016. This includes impact of housing developments as per the report. Roll at Harris is 940, with 490 are placing requests including 150 who could attend Menzieshill. Priority 1 pupils are guaranteed a place. I will reiterate that it will not be over crowded.

Public – I don't want my children going to the Harris. The 150 (*from Menzieshill*) should be here. Should we not change placing request rules?

MW – no it's national legislation. Placing requests are law – it is a legal process.

Public - What about the right for the people here in Menzieshill? What about wellbeing?

Having a big school is Americanised – we have a right to wellbeing. Not all children flourish in a large school. I am the local minister here. Is this consultation or lip service to the community?

MW – not so much a question as an insult. Your views are being recorded as you speak and will feed into the process.

Public - Do we have access to Education Scotland? Will they listen to us?

MW – Yes when Education Scotland come to the school your voice will be heard - they will invite you in to discuss the process with them.

I understand the views in room – I have spoken to people who have views for this move as well.

PC – we need to consult – we need to go through the process

Public - Why should Menzieshill High pupils go to a school called Harris?

Comments being shouted out – we don't want our kids to move, you are deciding it is closing, to save money, and just cramming pupils in to the school.

Pupils from Longforgan – why are you moving them to Baldragon?

MW – this is linked to capacity issue

Public – have you considered all the possible housing developments?

PC – yes

Public - Why was this made public before parents knew about it?

MW - I knew this caused an upset – it coincided with an INSET weekend.

PC – the original plan was to go to committee in December but we had to speak to some people about it and it got to the stage that we decided to go to the November committee – timing was unfortunate

Public – you leaked it

PC – we did not

MW asks for young person's question

YP –Why don't you adjust the catchment area to build the roll at Menzieshill

MW – we could do this but it would not guarantee an increased school roll - you can have any catchment area but parents have the choice to put in placing request. 30% of pupils in Dundee attend non catchment schools.

PC – explains that if P&K and Angus school pupils were to go to the new Harris there would not be sufficient capacity to accommodate them. Just because you add an area does not ensure the school roll.

Public – Longforgan pupils won't go to Baldragon why don't send them all to Harris?

MW – you have a choice of 2 priority one schools; the proposal states that Harris can't accommodate the P&K school pupils.

Public - are you a mind reader?

PC – no

Public – 1996 agreement states that the transportation agreement terminates on school closure

PC – I don't know the agreement in P&K

MW – I have discussed matters with P&K and Angus. Parents have been advised that their catchment areas will change and that there was no guarantee that their pupils would be transported. P&K are responsible for the transport of their pupils.

Public – you are causing this contract to cease

MW – we will speak with P&K

Public – you are putting the onus on P&K

MW – it is their responsibility

I will follow this up with P&K in the morning

Public (Pupil) – what about all the pupils who have been bullied previously by Harris pupils? I don't want to go back there.

Public (Parent) – hugely concerned about wellbeing of pupils in a big school

Public (ex support staff member of Menzieshill) – I worked here for 25 years and don't understand why the council are going to knock the school down; it's in a great situation. Makes no common sense. This is a great school – one of the finest in Scotland. It is safe, no traffic. They are going to pass this school to go to Baldragon. You should test the water before you do something.

MW – for clarification – I was not in post when the Harris design building was being drawn up so to suggest this was planned is not true.

Public – the Harris will be overcrowded what are you going to do then. Build a new school?

Public – if this is doing the best for children the only drawback would be not getting the subject they wanted. Could you not try to link timetables between schools so that they could be shared across the city. And keep the school open.

MW – we do that already – with City Campus.

Public – what about our petition?

PC – in terms of the consultation you can make comments – we would welcome this and we would welcome all and any comments including the petition. You can leave

views on website – we welcome all consultations in written form and these can be sent in.

Public – my daughter is a YMU pupil. My daughter will be discriminated as one of the most vulnerable and won't have the continuity in her education.

MW – I don't want to speak about that (*the YMU*) and at no point have we said that young mums can't go to Harris. We will have discussions with all involved in the unit. We will be meeting with parents. I'm going to oppose that – this is a personal thing for the young mothers.

PC - What we are discussing is the closure of Menzieshill – the proposal. The YMU is a central service – we are proposing to move that as a central service to another location within Dundee. It is not appropriate for tonight's discussion.

Public (parent of pupil at Hillside Primary) – my child is in p6 at Hillside – I am a resident in Inchtore. Now my child can't go to Harris?

MW – you would have to put in placing request.

PC – this is consistent across the City. It's the same as Ancrum Road Primary – if they don't live in catchment they would have to put in placing request to get into Harris.

Public (pupil) – the Western Gateway development – are these not predictions? You can't say it as you don't know as they are predictions.

Public – I am a parent of an S1 at Menzieshill and my son is in p6 at Inchtore. He can't start at the new Harris. This is a real problem as a family as is the transportation.

MW – yes you would have to put in a placing request

Paul – outlined the placing request process. This is the reality of this proposal – some won't get places.

Public – shouting out - that is wrong and we want it changed – you are not looking out for the pupils

Public – shouting out - What about transport – there are no buses from Charleston – are you going to pay for a bus pass? I'm a single dad with little money.

MW – outlined criteria for free transport – children with Free School Meal entitlement living 2 miles from school would be entitled.

Public - Parents going to be out of pocket for transport. £120 month it will cost.

Public – we are 1.8 miles so don't come in to that – what are you going to do?

PC – we will be working with bus companies to ensure transport options.

Public – my nephew is autistic and he is meant to start next year – will he receive less support?

MW - Harris is a school with enhanced provision (*for social and communication difficulties*) – outlined the nature of support.

Public - how will they get same level of support?

MW – staffing levels will be greater and the expertise of staff.

Public – they only get their grades because of support given here. Class sizes, what about them? They are smaller here and so they get more 1:1 attention; pupils thrive here especially pupils who are struggling, they thrive better in a smaller school.

MW – class sizes have maximum no matter what school

Public – I know there are 36 in a class in Harris – young people have said this
PC – there is no class size of 36 in Dundee.

Public – will my child get same level of support at Harris – he has ASN?

MW – I can guarantee that

Public – GIRFEC – why would you send rural children 8 miles away to a school in an area of deprivation? Would you want your children to go to Baldrigon? Can you guarantee the same educational benefits?

PC – You are entitled to your view. Many people won't share the view.

Public – it's just about saving money – keep it open

Why is Invergowrie being treated differently. Invergowrie doesn't move in this proposal.

We are here for the welfare of the children – you are here for the benefit of the budget (£4m) not the welfare of the children.

PC – is part of this proposal to do with saving money? Yes.

P22 of the proposal outlines the benefits of the proposal. We have stressed that the greatest benefits are the educational benefits.

Public – questions around the proposal – where do you get that? (*the proposal paper*) Parents haven't been able to get copies of the proposal – questioning the process.

PC - reads out the benefits around finance on p 22 of proposal

PC – we are being upfront

Public – you are trying to sell them out

Public – is this all down to money. What about the V&A museum – we don't want that. Would you take candy from a child?

Public – we are all funding more money for you guys. Parents will have to shell out more money for getting their kids to Harris.

SH (Convenor) – it would have been vetoed if it had all been about money.

Public – concern over local media

SH (Convenor) - We don't have control over local media

Public - Stewart – can give you assurances that Menzieshill was never mentioned in the new build of Harris 3 years ago?

SH (convenor) – this is simply not the case. There was no discussion 3 years ago.

Public – How much money is this site getting sold for?

SH – For every building that is sold – Stewart explained the process where property is no longer in use – it goes to city development and they then try to market it. So if this goes ahead it will be up to city development.

Public – shouts - stop the proposal now – you are forcing this on us.

SH – The education committee are the committee to make the decision. There is no guarantee it will get passed. There are other reps outwith councillors who sit on committee – 2 teacher reps. The decision is fair, open and transparent.

MW – suggest calm, to foster a good discussion, and reinforces his wish to engage.

Public – I do see it brings opportunities and possibilities but do also see the transport issue – think this needs to be considered and is a big issue. Need to keep

an open mind. What is the feeling amongst the staff in both schools – they are the experts in education. I think it's wrong to make allegations that people are doing things bad for our kids as I don't think they would do that.

MW – staff have generally been positive – reiterated that all is being recorded.

Public –there are no playing fields in the new 'super' Harris – would be better keeping Menzieshill- could build a smaller school and have facilities. You are not thinking about the pupils – you are making them walk up to the playing fields.

Public –mixed messages in the community - building big primary school in the area building a new community centre and regeneration of shops and new houses. We are trying to regenerate the community and now we are getting mixed messages – doesn't join up the city council. We want to move Dundee on.

MW – I am listening and understand your view

Public – we put our children to Menziehsill High as part of our community and you have no right to take that away from us

MW – your view will feed in to the consultation – this is a consultation process.

Public –Menzieshill is not a bad school – this should be recognised

MW – I don't disagree and that is recognised

Public – How can the council justify closing the school?

MW – The proposal speaks for itself. The school roll is declining and we would be at a difficult stage of where would the pupils go.

Public (parent and ex member of staff) – I am putting faith in the consultation process – it doesn't always go through. Question – what is the plan for education between now and 2016 not having detrimental effect?

PC –Pupils and their achievements are our primary concern. We intend to enhance staffing levels to allow staff coming together. We need to make sure this will happen. Lots of planning. Difficult to make too many plans until the decision has been made. It has been thought through.

Public – raising concern about transport and safety

MW – you will always get pupils who live close and further away from any school – you won't get equidistance but I reiterate we will look at transport.

Public – will pupils be consulted?

MW – yes – this has happened today. The school is working with pupils.

Public – We are coming to the school as a community – YMU are part of us and they (*the young mums*) should come with us.

MW – there is a misunderstanding – they can go to Harris if they choose to do so.

Public – question about catchments continuing to come through.

Public (pupil) – there are educational opportunities in the move e.g. more choice. My concern, however, is will we be able to take a community approach with us.

MW – 400 local people – 68 from outwith. A community creates itself with or without a school. A community creates itself.

Public – long term question – you must have some form of back up secondary idea if Menzieshill does not close?

PC – projected figures – if that does not happen Harris will fill up with placing requests it will always fill up. We fully anticipate that the placing requests will rise again. If there is a drift from P&K to Harris or further families being drawn to a new build. That is why it is coming forward now.

Public – why not attract more to Menzieshill? What have you done to raise the profile of Menzieshill?

MW – we have continually worked to promote Menzieshill High School but parents are for whatever reason sending pupils to other places – putting in placing requests. Parents have a right.

Public – P&K parent – Menzieshill roll has declined – this school will be under capacity I would prefer some other solution. I don't see any other houses in next 4/5 years to bring roll back up to capacity. I think it is more important that my child has an option of going to a Dundee school?

Public – has there ever been a proposal rejected?

Convenor (SH) – this is not a done deal. Gave example of a nursery that said no.

Public – I have 2 children at Menzieshill currently – one son trains as a gymnast – walking up to Elliot road – I don't want my children to do that. Also crossing the Perth Road.

Public – what's going to happen with p7s next year about transition?

PC – points out that transition would be to Harris

MW – teachers are committed to make sure pupils are supported. We will be looking at the whole transition process differently – there would be new transition arrangements.

Public (Pupil) – best school I have ever had – don't want to sit exams in S4 at Menzieshill and then new Harris teachers for S5.

MW – we will be taking teachers from here to Harris.

Pupil interruption – pupils from Harris hate us!

Public – how many pupils need to be on school roll to make a school viable.

MW – around 600 or above

Public - Why was there no warning over the past 2 years that if it keeps on dropping.....?

MW – Can I put that on its head - MW explains this would in itself have had a negative affect.

PC – staff do great job – majority of pupils come to Menzieshill who are at feeder schools. Parents can make choices. The issue is actually placing requests that are made at the P1 stage. Where there is capacity parents will make choices. We have to uphold the law.

Public – what happens to all the extra curricular activities?

PC – these will continue.

Public – parent from Longforgan - from P7 - you are taking the choice away from us. I can't make any informed decision due to lack of information. Also concern raised about access to extra curricular activities.

MW – reiterates that P&K has 2 Priority 1 schools

Public – swimming pool – what about the loss in the community

Public – where can we get statistics – Longforgan – Baldragon HMI evaluations – 2010; is there not a policy where pupils are not allowed to cross the Kingsway

PC – there is no policy that they don't have to cross the Kingsway

MW – in summing up:

All the information will be collated and analysed and we will look at common areas – e.g. transport. Group them together and this will also be shared with committee and a public report will be drawn up. That is my guarantee. Bottom line is we are listening.

SH – there are 34 members on committee – 29 councillors plus 3 religious reps and 2 teacher reps – secondary and primary. No guarantee that this will go through as the SNP administration is in a minority.

Public – why can't you change this from closure to a merger? You could perhaps tweak the proposal so that you can guarantee the transport costs.

Public – Menzieshill is the hub for the community. Is there a possibility that you can change your mind?

SH – Yes that is possible.

Public - Lots of pupils come to Menzieshill for sport – need to think about that – everything was there at hand. I love this school and love this community. Keep on protesting.

Applause

MW – thanks for coming

Meeting finished at 2045 hours

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PUPIL MEETING AT MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL HELD ON THURSDAY 22 JANUARY 2015

Note of Meetings

Meeting 1 – 11.10 am

Number attending – 7 pupils, 5 x S3 and 2 x S2

Helen Gray (HG) (HT), Danny Webster (DW) (Education Manager), Tracey Stewart (Education Officer) Notetaking

Introduction by HG – welcomed Danny/Tracey and outlined the purpose of the meeting.

Key questions/issues/responses

Pupil – I don't think the school should shut – Menzieshill is a community for a reason, children need their education at this school. Young Mums' Unit (YMU) has done a great job here. Couldn't imagine being at another school. This school has helped me through a lot – love this school it's like a second home.

HG - You will get support from your Guidance teacher and HT – your guidance teacher will be making the move with you.

Pupil – The school will be too big, school here is a good size. It's like my second home.

DW - I would like to clarify that you are saying that you like the fact your school is in the community and the school is small and you have concern about moving to a bigger school.

YMU – it will be moving to a bigger site – it is a Dundee City resource and will get moved anyway.

Pupil – Longforgan etc would need to move to Baldragon, that's too far away, and we have everything here. We don't want it to close. We have a YMU – only school which has that.

I know that 490 pupils is not enough but we have good pupils and excellent teachers, and good classrooms here.

HG – there are concerns that pupils will be split up all over the city if we don't take this window of opportunity.

Pupil - Pupils from Charleston, Lochee etc will have to travel far to get to school and there should be one in their community and this is an issue. Some mums and dads can't afford to give money to children for buses and lunch every single day. Concerned about the impact this will have on family life.

Pupil – Concern that I have heard about people voting to close the school – have these people even been to the school?

DW response to transport question. There are 73 children who live more than 2 miles away and have FME – they would receive paid transport.

There hasn't been any vote on closing the school. This is just a proposal to close the school. There has been discussion at Committee to go to consultation. This is the first step in that process.

Pupil – Came back about travel – paid travel is ok but not good enough – still concerns about pupils in Menzieshill, Charleston, Lochee and we should have a school in this community. Don't understand – it's stupid.

DW– You are concerned that your community won't have a school – I get that and this has been recorded. You may have read the consultation paper – the school has had a declining roll, sitting at less than half of its capacity. There are, eg, 150 pupils who could come here as first priority but parents have chosen to send their children somewhere else.

We genuinely believe that we have a duty to provide the education in an efficient way and that costs money. The capacity currently of Menzieshill is 48.9% full which is not efficient. We think that we can give young people in this community very good education in a new building with new facilities and great teachers. Where you put brilliant teachers in brilliant facilities you will get brilliant education – if we believed that this was not beneficial to you we wouldn't be doing it. This is a very good school.

Pupil – I don't understand why we can't just stay here.

DW– Although you do get great education here the curriculum is restricted because it is not possible to offer a full range of subjects here. The breadth of curriculum will be extended if this goes ahead. There will be less need for bi level and tri level classes – N4/5 or N4/5/Higher because of high numbers. In bigger schools you can have discrete classes. It's what can be provided in a much bigger school.

Pupil – I get a taxi to school – would I still get it?

HG - Yes

Pupil - If we do move how would we react with each other?

HG – If this goes ahead we would have a year to plan and would propose if I have anything to do with it and I'm sure I will – we would visit the school, site visits. I would envisage that we would get money so that S1's could come together for team building days together. SMT would be meeting and Guidance teachers together to plan the curriculum, classes and we are committed to doing that. Mr Webster and Mrs Stewart would be there to help. We will be nervous – and I won't lie but we want to take away big anxieties and fears. This would be done over the next year.

Pupil – Discipline procedures – what would they be?

HG – I can't answer that at the moment but what I can say is that pupils would be consulted all the way.

DW – Discipline procedures are different but similar – they are based on common set of guidelines which the Authority provide. The Council has said that Menzieshill should close because of the benefits to pupils which we have listed. But haven't left it at that – we would meet with pupils regularly – focus groups of pupils to monitor and evaluate the benefits and see if they are realised. We will review what has happened.

Pupil – There will be more people around this community as new houses are being built. Will that not make the number of people go up?

DW – There has been an analysis of housing in this area – **DW** gave examples of this per household. It means that there would be a place for every pupil even with the houses built for places at Harris.

HG – It would take 10 years for this to grow. Costs £1.9m to keep the school open per year so can't justify keeping school open waiting on numbers going up. We might be raging in 10 years time if another school has to be built but we can't hold on to that.

Pupil – It feels like we are losing our identity.

HG – Acknowledge this but we will consult – remember when I came we discussed this and changed the uniform/tie. Remember this is a new Harris Academy and we are a new community and going in together. You can influence this. There are 500 of us and 700 of them – lets make it the best school in Scotland.

Pupil – What will happen when Menzieshill shuts?

HG – Don't know – we can't make that decision right now. We can't have those discussions until we know if it is going to close.

DW – The Education Committee of the council will make the decision and the Council will tell Scottish Government. If the Council has gone about its business accurately then the SG may not call this decision in but they have the right to call it in.

Pupil – Will pupils from Harris move into the school at the same time?

DW – Yes at the same time. We have noticed that other Authorities have taken groups of pupils together in the same bus to the school at the same time. Pupils and staff would go for visits together. We have guaranteed that this will happen.

Pupil – Fights and arguments – is that not a big issue?

HG – This shouldn't be if we learn and act maturely. We will try our hardest to make transition as smooth as possible.

DW – I know what you mean. I think about it as loyalty. I have observed at eg in the UK Rock Challenge – was there any problem – you have already experienced where young people from different schools where it has been very productive.

Pupil – Concern that we will get Menzieshill v Harris.

HG – We would be looking at people like you to step up to the leadership role.

Pupil – Subjects – I get enough support in this school, concern classes would be

bigger and concern that wouldn't get support required. I struggle in a lot of subjects – worried that because more people would we still get this support.

HG – Staffing formula, bigger school gets bigger allocation. You would hope that if you have specific needs they would be met. Staff will meet to plan and relevant information would be passed on and envisage that this will happen. Reiterated discrete classes whereas in Menzieshill bi and tri level classes. You will also be more mature in a year and a half. Also S5 classes tend to be smaller. Totally understand and trying to allay your fears.

Pupil – Menzieshill is best school in Dundee – don't want that taken away.

DW – I understand your sense of belonging. There are rules about class sizes – 31 and 20 – they would not go beyond legal limits.

Pupil – S3 pupils have just made choices. Will this change when we move?

DW – If this goes ahead you would be moving in to S5. Built in to the proposal the 2 management teams, with support from the centre, will discuss the curriculum model for the new school. Importantly your voice will be at the front. And let me say if there is any HT who will fight for your best interests it is Miss Gray and she will be at the forefront of this. When you choose for S5 you will probably have a wider range of options. Absolutely yes. It is about the benefits if this goes ahead.

Pupil – When we move we won't get same teachers.

HG – Some staff will go to the new school.

Pupil – Why won't you be the HT, Miss Gray? Has this been decided?

DW – If the school were to close, Harris has a HT. You will be moving to a new building together.

Pupil – It's not fair that our HT won't be the new HT. We are losing everything – name, staff, Headteacher, uniform. This is not fair. It's not right that we won't keep the headteacher – this should be looked at.

DW – Acknowledges the strength of feeling coming through from pupils towards their Headteacher.

Pupil – Yes Miss Gray is great.

Pupil - Will the timetable times change?

HG – Yes probably but will be very similar.

Meeting ended

Meeting 2 – commenced 12.15

11 Senior Pupils (S4, S5 and S6) attended

Welcome by Helen Gray (HT)

Pupil – Is it right that the Council won't own the Harris building – hiring it?

DW/HG – It's a partnership – funding coming from variety of places.

Pupil – Will the population in this area decrease further?

Danny – Our statistical analyst has looked at the area and crunched the numbers. The new Harris has capacity of 1309 – x number of houses equates to x number of

pupils etc etc. Looked at all of this – there would still be adequate space in the new Harris Academy to accommodate all new people in the area.

Pupil – Recent catchment areas changed – less than a year ago. Someone hasn't done their job right! Why have another policy. More about saving money than a better education.

DW – Explained the catchment policy and placing requests and explained the main rationale. The Education Scotland Act explains that you should be able to send your child to your local community school.

HG – Good question but it would take a long time to have an impact here – probably would take 10 years. We can't keep paying for the school at £1.9 m a year. We don't have that sort of money but more importantly how would we keep the curriculum going? We wouldn't be able to offer as full a curriculum.

Pupil – I can only do one modern language – French. We can't do what we want.

HG – I would love to recruit another teacher but I don't have the money.

DW – The proposal says that the main reason for doing this is for the educational benefit of the pupils in this area. We need to provide an adequate and efficient education. 490 pupils don't live in the Harris community who go there. We have a moment in time now that we can guarantee places for everyone in Menzieshill. 1309 would fill up with placing requests and our fear is that if there were available places it would put pressure on declining roll at Menzieshill. The curriculum may be further curtailed. This school provides excellent education with excellent leadership but this is tough and would get tougher and may reach a point in time that would not be young people's best interests.

Pupil – Bi level classes are much more difficult so that's a huge point.

DW – It's helpful and I would acknowledge that it has been helpful for you to share that.

HG – It would be possible to offer discrete classes as opposed to bi level.

Pupil – Classes would be bigger though.

HG/DW – But class size would not go beyond legal limits.

Pupil – Catchment areas – Longforgan pupils would have to travel further to go to Baldrigon.

DW – The proposal is 4 fold, one is to align the catchment to Harris – broaden it. It's a public pound but we have a duty in Dundee to provide an adequate and efficient education for the young people in our area. Those pupils you are describing are important but belong to another LA and because they are important we have agreement with other LAs we are still giving an option to go to a Dundee School.

Pupil – Longforgan has a Dundee postcode.

Pupil – Pupils won't go to Baldrigon – reality is they will go to Perth school. Seems like a token effort.

HG – It's been an agreement. There would not be places for Longforgan at the new school (*Harris*).

DW – I understand and would equate it to parents caring for their own children first but acknowledging the need to care for other parents' children.

Pupil – Why are Invergowrie getting a place in Harris and Longforgan not?

DW – The proposal is to maintain the alignment of Invergowrie.

Pupil – It is not fair. Longforgan and Inchtute are minutes away from each other and

are not getting to maintain the relationship built up with Menzieshill.

Pupil – Very few people went to Perth – there is no link between Longforan and Perth or Baldragon and it feels like we are losing the community. More sheep than people in Longforan but community is so important and we want this acknowledged. Other people in my old primary school won't have that – this is difficult for us.

DW – We are capturing the strength of feeling about community and belonging but communities can rebuild.

Pupil – My view is that pupils at Harris view this as detrimental. We are hearing negative views.

DW – You are using this to share your emotions and that is perfectly appropriate but we would be keen to capture your questions.

Pupil – This is a really good school to be part of – Miss Gray has transformed things – excellent relationships. If we go to a bigger school these relationships will go. We hear from Harris that this is not the same. We hear that they don't have the same sort of relationships – and we feel this could be overlooked.

HG – If this proposal goes ahead, as of school session 2015/16 we would be planning for as smooth a transition as possible. Pupils would have transition days together to build relationships with the Guidance and SfL staff. Transfer of records so provision and transition can be as smooth as possible. We would be wanting to allay fears. We would work as hard as possible to make this work. The first couple of years there would be enhanced staffing. There would be 23 of our staff moving to the new school. We would work together to ensure progression within the curriculum and staffing. Guidance staff are moving. We can't do that yet until the decision is made. It would be wrong to do this now.

DW – No doubt there is a different feel from a small to a large school. In my experience the ethos and culture of a school is about the relationships that exist within the building. It is possible to get a small school feel in a large school. The transition can be managed and supported – your guidance staff will be going to the new school.

Pupil – What new facilities would there be?

DW – Industry kitchens, sports facilities, photographic studios, drama and dance studios.

HG – For example this would offer progression in hospitality – industry standard kitchen.

DW – It is laudable that you are presenting views here beyond yourself. We will arrange for pupils to jointly travel to visit the new school.

HG – We would want you to be instrumental to support the transition – you are the role models.

Pupil – Relationships - can understand that but my friends from Grove and Harris don't agree – they tell me that the large numbers don't merit good relationships

Pupil – Timetable changes – when would that happen?

HG – Not thought through that completely yet. We have started planning within Menzieshill for next year's curriculum but next year we would do it earlier. HG gives example of possible timeline. We would try our hardest to ensure progression in all curriculum areas. Bigger chance of getting your options in a broader curriculum.

DW – Need to construct your curriculum under a set of principles – one of which is personalisation and choice. We would aim to provide the best curriculum possible.

There are a number of subjects which are not possible in a smaller school. You can provide greater breadth and personalisation and choice in curriculum pathways.

Pupil – What about Harris staff? Will they leave to let our staff in?

DW – 23 staff will go from Menzieshill to the new school. The starting point is the curriculum and what we will offer that then determines the staffing within the ratio. We currently don't know the best fit of staff yet. This will need to be worked out and would be presumptuous to do that now.

Pupil – How does the transition keep going and what about the use of the facilities?

DW – There will be community use in the evenings. The philosophy of the new Harris is a community ethos and the current community use in Menzieshill can use Harris facilities – the whole new community would have the right and entitlement to use the new facilities.

Pupil – Transition of pupils – programme good here at Menzieshill.

HG – This would be part of the discussion and we think it's great. We will share that with the new school and will be part of the planning but it's too early to do this now. This will be from August 2015 if the proposal goes ahead.

DW – What happens here is special but there is a commitment across all school clusters to a 3-18 education. You would look at what works well.

Pupil – 3 areas need to be addressed. How do we ensure the ethos and community feel that benefits us currently?

Longforgan/Inchure is a bad idea and should be renegotiated.

What happens when Harris fills up – where do they go then? Will other schools be upgraded?

DW – The Council is committed to ensure all our young people are in schools fit for the 21st century and there is a long term strategy

Picked up your views on relationships/community. One person who should know you well is (Form Tutor) and a Guidance Teacher . Your class teachers will get to know you. This is part of the planned strategy. Small school feel in a large school – this is a good point that we need to work on.

Pupil – Hope it does go to plan but I doubt it. Please give this a lot of effort

Pupil – Transitions – my brother in p7 knows all the staff already and we need to ensure that this continues

HG – We will take these ideas to the table.

Pupil – We will need to trust these people then – we need to look at what the great aspects of each school comes together we would have the best school in Dundee and we just need to hope that we can create that.

HG – There would be a commitment especially in the first 2 years to monitor and evaluate what the impact is the transition.

DW – 490 pupils currently go to Harris who don't live in the catchment but this will be numbers coming together.

Pupil – Harris is an academic school – what about children who are not academic?

DW – We have been in an era of multiple intelligences for over a decade. Some people's intelligences are not about academic. Some of you are relationship smart, intraperson smart, literacy smart – I get what you say. The curriculum is the totality of the curriculum – 4 contexts for learning – integral to the curriculum . The point

here is opportunities for achievement are as important as the subjects. It is important to meet the needs for each individual. ASN Act 2009 you have to provide according to individual's needs. Everyone has a right to the best education.

Pupil – There are a lot of restriction here (*in Menziesshill High*) on picking choices, not enough staff/pupils. Would we be more likely to get these choices?

DW – There would be opportunities to have a broader curriculum in the new school. Danny explained the staffing formula. Good point to finish on – the breadth of the curriculum is highlighted in the proposal as an educational benefit of the pupils.

Meeting ends

**DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010
FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL
HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS
ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING
CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF
HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE
CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN
ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE
ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND
TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY
SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE,
BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016**

**RECORD OF STAFF MEETING AT HARRIS ACADEMY HELD ON
TUESDAY 27 JANUARY 2015 AT 3.30PM**

Present: 20 staff (approx.)

Also in attendance:

Mr Michael Wood, Director of Education (MW)

Mr Danny Webster (Education Manager)

Miss Iris Thomson (Education Officer – note taking)

Welcome – Mr Jim Thewliss, Head Teacher, Harris Academy

Introduction by MW. Purpose of meeting clarified

Consultation process outlined to staff (future, direction of travel, etc.) It is a consultation – there is no definitive decision as yet. Has got to go to Education Scotland and to Education Committee no later than the end of June 2015.

Committed to say that members of the Guidance team from Menzieshill would go into Harris, at least for the first year, to help smooth pupil transition to their new school.

KEY STATEMENTS, QUESTIONS AND RESPONSES

My primary concern is the accommodation. The new Harris building is built to accommodate a certain number of pupils. How many are actually going to arrive?

MW – New Harris is built to accommodate 1309. Your school role is currently 940. There are currently 150 pupils who could go to Menzieshill High School on the Harris roll as a result of placing requests. There is a window of opportunity to bring these 2 schools together in 2016, but if that doesn't happen then, it may never happen. If the proposal falls and parents look at the new Harris building and there is more of a drift away from Menzieshill, suddenly the school is sitting with around 300 pupils in it and we can't put them in Harris., as it will be full.

The building will be built to accommodate the number of pupils who will arrive with us and then we will be capped – is that right?

MW – Yes. If you are not a priority 1

Is it 1309?

MW – Original 1200 didn't reflect class sizes. Notional capacity is 1309.

We won't go above that?

MW – I would hope so. 687 houses are planned to be built in the land action plan. We have to do a calculation as to how many likely pupil places that is going to translate in to. We have done everything we can, worked closely with City Development to make sure that figures are right (all the way up to 2035).

Guidance staff moving – is that purely Guidance or are you taking about SFL, staff in the wider sense?

MW – Would need to look further into that. I can see some logic in what you are suggesting. Not yet decided about SFL.

DW – We have spoken about the temporary augmentation of guidance staff in the proposal paper but we haven't referenced specifically SFL teachers.

If Menzieshill parents who decide that they don't want to put up with uncertainty and want to put in a placing request here now - what is the position with this?

MW - We need to manage this. e.g. Let's set a cap at 180 (hypothetical). Placing requests need to be revisited.

Would there be a priority (e.g. in excess of 180) for Menzieshill pupils?

MW – You would have to apply the criteria. Clearly it's about distance from the school. (MW Outlined the revised placing request priorities for the questioner).

In terms of resources, would there be any additional resources?

MW - We will do everything we can to support staff – e.g. shared events. There will be opportunities wherever possible. **Menzieshill – what will happen to our resources?** On a department by department basis there will be some pluses there too.

Irrespective of the decision, is that going to have any impact on what we envisage happening in 2016?

MW – no it won't have. Regardless of that, we envisage that the new Harris will fill up. It won't affect the school or the opening in any shape or form.

What is happening with Invergowrie primary school?

MW – This is an associated primary school so the youngsters will continue to attend Harris Academy providing that they live in Invergowrie.

What are the plans for the Young Mothers Unit (YMU)?

MW – The plan is that they will move to the new Jessie Porter Nursery school. Reason is that, on that campus site you will have Jessie Porter Nursery, Sidlawview primary school and Baldragon Academy. Jessie Porter can provide wrap around care for 3 year olds. We are looking at the YMU in terms of the staffing level and are in discussions around that.

Have there been any plans made for the Menzieshill site?

MW – No. The land goes to City development and in the fullness of time it may well be for sale. There are no plans at the moment as we are only at the stage of consulting on our proposals.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PARENT COUNCIL MEETING AT HARRIS ACADEMY HELD ON TUESDAY 27 JANUARY 2015 AT 6.00PM

Present:

Mr J Thewliss, Head Teacher, Harris Academy
Mr F McPherson, Councillor
Mr Michael Wood, Director of Education (MW)
Mr Paul Clancy, Head of Secondary Education and ASN
Mr Danny Webster (Education Manager)
Miss Iris Thomson (Education Officer – note taking)

Note of Meeting

It is recorded that there was no parental attendance at this meeting.

Meeting closed at 6.55pm.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PUBLIC MEETING AT HARRIS ACADEMY HELD ON TUESDAY 27 JANUARY 2015 AT 7.00PM

Present: 59 attendees including parents/carers, pupils and elected members. Also in attendance: Mr Michael Wood, Director of Education (MW), Mr Paul Clancy, Head of Education (Secondary and ASN (PC), Mr Stewart Hunter (Convener of the Education Committee)

Mr Danny Webster (Education Manager – note taking)

Miss Iris Thomson (Education Officer – note taking)

Welcome – Mr Jim Thewliss, Head Teacher, Harris Academy

Introduction by MW. Purpose of meeting clarified

Outline of proposal consultation requirements – meetings such as these are part of the process. You have the chance to ask questions which will feed back into the consultation process. That is important – your views matter. This is a chance to reflect and share some thoughts and we will try to answer any questions you have. Any changes to the school estate are always challenging. Harris will be moving back in to the new building in August 2016 and the proposal is that Menzieshill High pupils would move into the 'new' Harris at this time. The proposal works in the following way – consultation process runs until 27th Feb. At this time we take what we have in terms of feedback and produce a report which goes to Education Scotland. They will send people out to check if people were involved, consulted, etc. Then they will look at the proposals and rationale behind them. At any point, thereafter, Scottish Government, can then pull this back in. I don't anticipate that this consultation process will come to an end until perhaps the end of May/June. It is more important, however, that you get a chance to make your point and have your views heard. I am happy to take on board any questions and talk things through.

KEY STATEMENTS, QUESTIONS AND RESPONSES

Parent - Is the consultation taking place after a decision has already been made as no alternatives are evident? What alternatives have been looked at?

MW - When it goes to the Education Committee, we ask for permission to go to

consultation. We have tried to set out in the report what the benefits are, etc.

INTERRUPTED ...but what alternatives are there, we have not been asked for our views on various options.

PC – explains that not going ahead is also an option. He then explains the rationale behind the reason to close. Options are to go ahead or not. There are no other viable proposals - it is the 'status quo' or change.

Education Convener explains that the decision will be whether or not to go ahead.

Do you think it is appropriate for an SNP councillor to be explaining?

SH (Education Convener) – explains how the proposal works and highlights that an important point to remember is that the Education Committee is the only committee where the administration is not in the majority and, therefore, it is not possible to force things through.. We have to see what the consultation says – it is not a done deal.

When you went to consultation with Lochee/Charleston, none of our views were taken into account

SH (Education Convener) responds – I took no part in that decision as one of my children was involved in that consultation.

Are you also agreeing to increase class sizes in Dundee schools?

MW – There are maximum class sizes in every school. This is a discussion that I am happy to have at the end.

Are your figures (projected figures for the Harris roll) realistic because your figures for Lochee and Charleston were wrong?

MW – our figures are accurate. If you don't mind, I'm happy to talk to you about this at the end.

Isn't it going to be a big squeeze into Harris? Will the school be big enough? It looks like Harris was for 1200, now it is bigger at 1309. How did you do that and why?
Another parent adds - *I don't see that you have any buffer in Harris and I don't think this is a good idea.*

MW explains that, as you build a new school, the design for any new school can evolve and change. Original capacity of 1200 was recalculated using the national formula (Strathclyde) and revised to 1309. Director then goes on to explain that Harris currently has 940 pupils but that only 590 live in the catchment area or attend Harris Academy via association with a linked primary school. 150 of the pupils attending via placing request are priority 1 pupils for Menzieshill High School. Parents can place their children given the placing request legislation. There are lots of placing requests coming into Harris. If the proposal falls, it is highly likely that the roll at Harris will go up due to placing requests. It can be done. We are confident that we can bring the schools together.

I understand it can be done but is it a compromise - is it a squeeze or not?

MW – No, there is capacity,

Will you guarantee that you will not exceed 1309?

MW – I can't guarantee that. We have examples within the city which are currently over capacity. We can say, however, that given the numbers coming in from primary schools, the notional capacity is 1309. We have 7 years worth of data. In addition, we have looked at the Land Action Plan, etc., how many houses will be built.

PC – We are dealing with placing requests that are actually governed by law. You

admit your pupils in S1/2 in groups of 20 (practical classes). If parents put in placing requests, there is a process which needs to be gone through. If a placing request is accepted, we have to provide a place. If this goes to the Sheriff Court, we would be obliged to provide a space. Harris will be at capacity or near capacity.

We have heard that children in Invergowrie will have to go to Baldragon. Is that the case?

MW – No. If you live in Invergowrie, you are Priority 1 for Harris.

So the catchment areas are not going to change?

PC – That is clearly outlined in the proposal.

How do you think that children will cope with the social change going to Baldragon?

Director mentions PC has had 5 children taught in Baldragon and that he also was a former pupil.

Parent then remarks about journey.

MW - Director intimates that Perth and Kinross children have 2 Priority 1 schools - 1 in Dundee and 1 in Perth and Kinross. Director indicates that boundaries for the Harris catchment will not change.

PC intimates that we do not have a legal obligation to provide for Perth and Kinross. Parent remarks that she didn't ask to be labelled Perth and Kinross.

When the decision was taken to rebuild the Harris, what was the size of the school going to be?

MW – The Harris role has traditionally sat around 1150 – it is now sitting at 940, that is why we have a window of opportunity to make this happen. If it doesn't happen, there is a real danger that the Menzieshill role continues to decline and we couldn't have this discussion in a few years time.

PC – If the Menzieshill role continues to drop, it becomes very very difficult to run Menzieshill as a school and the costs then have an effect on staffing across Dundee

What happens if both Menzieshill and Harris get a large number of placing requests over the next year?

MW – We need to look at how we control that. This coming Friday is the final day by which parents need to make their school choices for S1.

PC – We fully anticipate that Harris will be operating at full capacity and that we will be turning people away no matter what.

What will we do if Menzieshill remains open?

Director explains about the five year rule.

PC explains that, if the roll drops, it will be difficult to sustain a curriculum at Menzieshill and that there would likely be cost implications which will impact upon the rest of the city.

If there is a reprieve to Menzieshill, given the fall in the roll, will my child receive an equal education at Menzieshill?

PC explains that if only 2 young people wish to do Higher Physics, that still requires a teacher and therefore, it becomes very expensive. We may have to look for shared arrangements for Highers which impacts upon transport.

Are you looking at this now?

MW - No, we have to go through the consultation.

Parental comment - A plan B at the start would have been good!

Parent interrupts – A brand new building with 1300 pupils. Menzieshill pupils are not used to that.

MW – We have a situation that is quite unique in that 2 schools are going into the new building on the same day.

Have the children been asked their opinion? What about children from feeder schools?

MW – Children are being consulted as we speak

If there is a reprieve to Menzieshill what will happen to the YMU? These are vulnerable young women, identified by Scottish Government as vulnerable.

We are moving this (the YMU) to Jessie Porter in any case. Director explains the advantages for wrap around care.

Parent comments that these vulnerable young women will now be in a large school.

Has there been a consultation re the relocation of the YMU?

MW - No, as it is a resource for the city, not Menzieshill.

Parent comments - But they have rights as well.

MW - Yes, but they also have rights of privacy.

SH (Education Convener) comments that all stakeholders will be consulted re YMU.

PC remarks that all the current mums in the YMU will have left.

PC outlines that the range of facilities within the YMU will be increased and enhanced.

You talk about consultation but all that happens is you have 3 guys who just justify why you want to make this decision – that's not consultation. One of my children goes to Rosebank and one goes to Harris. We have to face the position that my children go to different schools. If you want to know what we think, you have to listen.

MW – I am here to explain this proposal

Parent 1 – it doesn't sound like a consultation. Menzieshill has been run down. Parents started to send their kids to Harris because we heard what was likely to happen. We are not idiots – you need to listen to us.

MW – With respect, that is not true. I can say that there is no sense that this has been decided some time ago or that the school has been run down. 150 parents have chosen to send their children to Harris. Any parent has the right to put in a placing request to a school of their choice.

SH – I became Deputy Convener of Education in 2009 and there was no conversation about closing Menzieshill for the last 5 to 6 years so that notion is not true and I can give you my assurance.

Parent 2 – We are not making this up. Council employees have discussed this – I know that this has and can give you names. Parents have made decisions based on information which was leaking out from the council. It is why people chose to do what they did.

Let's have 3 good reasons about why the 'status quo' should stay.

MW – I'm not going to get sucked into that. Menzieshill has a very good reputation – there is no question about that. Menzieshill has a super Head Teacher and excellent staff – equally, there are lots of positives about Harris Academy. The reality is that, if we do nothing, Menzieshill may 'wither on the vine'.

PC – We would have to keep the school wind and watertight, etc. There is a brand new school sitting here with ample capacity. If we do nothing, we know that new buildings attract more numbers. We fully anticipate that happening.

Parent, why would it wither - because the roll went down?

PC – The school would reach a point where you may have to replace the building.

PC comments upon the small city. My fear is now what if it doesn't go ahead?

PC explains that Harris will be a magnet school and that if we do not go ahead, the school will fill up. Primary rolls are rising. There is a real issue if we do not act.

I'm concerned what are you going to do about Menzieshill.

SH (Education Convener) indicates that we will support Menzieshill if the proposal does not go through.

PC adds but at a cost to the city

What are you doing with the transport? Harris will have a huge catchment area. They all have to walk or parents have to spend a lot of money on a bus pass. Do you have real plans?

PC – I think we have a reasonable idea of families who would require transport.

Working with National Express to provide routes that would be convenient for those parts of the catchment. We are going to have to consider how we respond to this.

We need to make some kind of arrangement to find out what needs to be done. This would be put into the consultation paper when it is finally published.

MW – if you live more than 3 miles away from the school, you get free transport.

SH – one of the dangers of answering these questions is that it looks like you have already made your mind up about the proposal.

All the extra buses – where are they going to go? Perth Road will be gridlocked.

MW – The Director outlines the level of off-road parking and indicates that this is much better than it was before.

SH – Irrespective of the decision, we will get the transport right. Project board and school safety board will take this on board.

Question - What about a community based school?

What was the highest Menzieshill has ever been?

MW -, over 1,000.

Parental comment - You should attempt to accommodate pupils in a split family situation e.g. Rosebank and Harris pupil. I have a child at Harris through a Placing request and two others at Primary school. Can you phase things?

MW – the move wouldn't go ahead until August 2016. It would be up to the staff in the schools to do a lot of work, with our support in terms of transition.

St. Saviour's and Lawside was a really difficult merger. What are you going to do differently?

MW – it is something that we are going to tackle. Many of these questions have actually been talked through in some detail.

Harris has 590 priority 1 pupils, the school was built for 1300 – what was the thinking behind this? Was it not thought at the time that building extra capacity was going to be detrimental to Menzieshill?

The figure was increased to over 1300.

Is the infrastructure in place to accommodate this number at decant times?

MW - Yes. Both at the beginning and end of the school day, the design will take cars off the road.

What about pupils walking? Will the sheer volume 20% to 30% increase by manageable?

Comment that 'Robertsons had originally said it would be about 1000.'

Parent raises problem of litter and pupil footfall – 30% increase in pupil numbers. It's bad enough at the moment (e.g. litter) when half of the school seems to decant down Perth Road at lunchtime.

MW – to put it in context, we need to work with young people about litter. Adults drop litter too.

Roll at the decant was 1150.

PC – We are working hard to maintain pupils in the school at lunchtime, opportunities, etc. We recognise that it will be busy and that pupils will want their freedom. We will respect the community and work in positive ways to work with the community. Mr Thewliss and his staff work hard with the pupils and the community.

Congestion issues raised by parent. Pupils going back and forwards along Perth Road (and walking on the road) – and it's a main road. Parent believes that Perth Road will become a 'no go' area at lunchtimes due to the number of pupils

Director comments that it is a 'Catch 22' situation as local businesses will benefit.

Parent comments that when moving from Grove to the West End it was a relief. Suggestion that this will be aggravated. "When I lived in the Ferry, I was told none of our pupils would ever do this (i.e. drop litter)."

PC – We will work with the community. It is a common problem across Scotland.

Is Elliot Road a suitable venue for that number of pupils going up for games, PE, etc?

MW – yes, because classes are limited to the maximum class size.

PC – there is certainly an issue. We did not have facilities for a green site. There is absolutely no issue about their being enough PE facilities to cover 1309 pupils.

What happens to the teachers?

MW – we have worked out that 23 teaching staff would transfer from Menzieshill. We have continuity arrangements in place for Guidance staff to help smooth the transition of Menzieshill pupils. Nobody will lose their jobs.

Parent - But that's not all of them.

MW - Yes but these are teaching staff.

Director explains that we will look at where promoted staff will go.

Parent adds - This sounds like a decision given your comments.

Question around the adverse impact on the city if you were to add extra staff. Why is there a definitive statement in the paper regarding the adverse impact of additional resources on other pupils in the city?

MW – in terms of the proposal, the reality is that we have a finite and decreasing budget. Every penny is a prisoner. Putting more staff in 'x' causes a problem in 'y'. It would have an impact. You would have to ask 'How do we balance the books?'

Consultation will run its course then we need to look at that.

Follow up question -. You are saying that it is a consultation but it is written as a factual statement. Are you saying that additional staffing needed by Menzieshill High school will not be provided by additions to The Education Department budget?

MW articulates a view that it is likely that the climate of austerity will continue and the director has to manage his budget.

PC – We have tried to be up front and honest re finances. It would be extremely naïve not to set out a realistic position of what the financial implications might be.

Follow up question/statement from parent - disappointed that you find that naïve. The Director's response is naïve, as is the paper in articulating that this is a definitive position.

11.1.3 from proposal paper quoted by parent. You seem to be saying that if Menzieshill is closed and moved to Harris, there will be money to spread around for other pupils.

PC – educational benefits statement is extensive. Very little refers to financial savings.

Has there been any research done in regard to larger schools having educational benefits to pupils?

MW – 1300 is not a particularly large school in terms of Scotland. Maximum class sizes in every school in the land.

Parent - You have the whole social environment, all of which impacts on their learning

PC – It's not to do with the size of this school – research is not conclusive there. This is not an unusual number given the history of Harris Academy.

INTERRUPTED by another former pupil who states that the school is not an inconvenience to the community.

What are you going to do to improve the attainment in the lesser performing schools in Dundee?

MW - This is about learning from the past.

Questions around the name of the school and a view articulated that it should have been a merger not a closure.

PC – gives an acknowledgement that this will be difficult. To be clear - we would have to close Harris Academy and justify this.

INTERRUPTED - Is that not easier? Will it be called the 'new' Harris?

Given that only 590 priority 1 pupils attend Harris, why did you go for 1200?

MW - original Harris was always around 1150.

Director explains that you have to build a school to fit the current population that exists.

Parent reply - but you could have capped the S1 entry to facilitate less drop in the roll of other schools. Key point is that the council could have had greater foresight to the concerns of Menzieshill and the dropping roll.

MW - We are where we are and now we have to look at how we can take this forward.

Whatever the views are, the reality is that the building is fantastic. If young people go in there, they will think this is special.

Comment, it is not desirable for a school to go over capacity - will all three of you agree to that?

MW - We know the numbers, we know we are able to do this.

Was the Courier wrong?

PC, every building has a notional capacity in Dundee.

SH (Education Convener) comments about Craigowl and the over capacity. We are managing the capacity.

Councillor - Facilities in the new Harris will be so much better – fewer pupils may go down the Perth Road. Michael will have to convince us that his proposal is the right proposal and if he doesn't convince us, then it won't happen.

How do we ensure that the children and parents and staff from Harris are integrated?

MW – if the proposal goes ahead, we have already had some discussion about how the transition is as good as it can be, how staff work together to align course/activities, opportunities for young people to go down to the school, and so on. It's about being as creative as you possibly can be because, ultimately, the young people may come together.

Parent comment - It's still called Harris. Menzieshill are losing their identity. Completely new uniform. Why was it not a proposal to change the name?

PC – we need to do a lot of work there to have these pupils feel that it is part of what they are doing. There are a lot of friendships between pupils from Menzieshill and Harris. For us to go forward with a merger, we would have to close Harris Academy, we would have to close Menzieshill and put forward a proposal for a new school.

Concern expressed that Harris becomes overpopulated with pupils in the next three or four years and it will go excessively over the 1309 that the school is designed for. Comment, it is the teachers not the building that matters.

MW – We have to balance this.

Parent comment - Jim Thewliss (*HT at Harris*) said that 'it is the staff, not the building'

MW – I fully accept this, but it is both. It's not just the staff that makes the school, it is a balance between the staff, pupils and the building. The quality of the accommodation does matter.

PC, it's not just the building - it's the facilities and amenities.

Councillor Richard McCready – Can we get a guarantee that the decision will be made at the Education Committee and not anywhere else?

SH (Convener) - I guarantee that it will go to the Education Committee.

Statement from parent - You are still shouting them down. You are not listening and you need to consider things e.g. the name of the school. You may not be able to answer that but you could consider it. You could consider renaming the Harris. You feel like you are being attacked, but you need to listen. I just feel that you keep telling me that you are going to do what you are doing.

Councillor comments regarding elected members needing to make a decision based on their own conscience.

I would like to see all these written representations.

Yes, all written representations will be available.

School name comment by parent - Harris is a much older school and it would be a shame to put an end to it.

Conversation then ensued between parents about the longevity of their respective schools.

How much more expensive per head is running a high school of 500 and running a school of 1000?

MW – we tend to calculate pupil costs as a city-wide average. Smaller school – less cleaning staff, etc.

PC – As a small school at less than 50% capacity, Menzieshill is considerably more expensive to run.

What seems to be happening is that you are justifying your proposal rather than considering other things e.g. you could consider renaming the school,

etc.

SH – That's a fair point and one that we will take on board

Councillor F. Macpherson, – helpful if all members of Education Committee had a view on name/uniform – would like to see all the written feedback that comes back and not just the report. Can we have a commitment from the Director that we will be able to have this?

MW – That's not a problem because all of the written representations are published

Parent 2 - Do the Councillors see what is sent in to you direct?

PC – Any response which is sent as a written representation is published.

Director seeks to see if there are any more questions.

Comment from floor that all Councillors have surgeries and public can attend.

SH (Convener) – you can actually leave your comments on the website too.

PC – We will be here at the end of the night if anyone wants to ask any questions of us.

Jim Thewliss, Head Teacher at Harris, brings the evening to a close with thanks.

Jim gives reassurance that comments will be recorded.

Meeting ended at 20:45.

Theme	Comment
Harris Identity Integration of Pupils	<p>“Will we lose the Harris uniform, name & ethos?”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • gang culture/warfare • worse for Menzieshill pupils coming into Harris • Disruption of learning for Menzieshill re move. • Concerns voice re news reports of drug dealing outside Menzieshill • Gang/culture warfare – bit exaggerated not likely to be an issue • Cost to departments of extra pupils- will Menzieshill budget be passed to Harris departments?
Catchment Area/Placing Requests	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Younger siblings at different school from 2016 • Say that siblings won’t be split/allowed to put in a placing request – but that means losing friend base. • New homes being built close to Harris so overcrowding due to new people in area + Menzieshill
Friendships	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase friendship group, but Menzieshill pupils may feel left out.
School Accommodation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New school won’t be large enough for everyone “squished in”. • Menzieshill pupils deserve a new school too. • Larger class sizes • Past history from elsewhere where assurances have been given re “no overcrowding” but schools now overcrowded (Craigowl PS)
Teachers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New teachers = new talents
Bus routes/local concerns	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interfere with current bus routes • Cost of transportation increase • Buses already overcrowded • Shops to accommodate all pupils?

Harris Academy Pupil Council – 17 February 2015 - Feedback

Suggestions:

Pupils from both schools to take part in a survey/referendum, and let them say what they want to happen (Yes/No) – Menzieshill pupils to join Harris or stay where they are.

Induction days/weeks should proposal go ahead

Fiction

“...Invergowrie pupil will have to go to Perth High School.....”

Consultation Document:

1.3 It is proposed that all pupils currently enrolled in Menzieshill High School will be entitled to transfer to the new

“Invergowrie Primary School will remain an associated primary school for Harris Academy;...”

Mother & Baby Unit	“concerned about it coming to Harris because it will encourage young girls to become pregnant” “a vital service in Dundee and needs to stay and should be included in the new Harris”
--------------------	--

Dundee Courier – report 13/2/15

WHAT WAS AGREED?

- The restructure of the Young Mums Unit including relocating it from Menzieshill High School to the Jessie Porter Nursery, at the Baldragon Academy site and the loss of one principal teacher role — £44,000 in savings.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

THE CLOSURE OF MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF MEETING WITH ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL STAFF HELD ON WEDNESDAY 28 JANUARY 2015 AT 3.30 PM

Present: Paul Clancy, Head of Education (Secondary and SfL), Jan Smith, Education Officer, Kenny McKeown, Education Officer (Recorder), Dawn Stanfield (HT), Mark Elder, Laura Kilhooly, Alison Mullay

Paul Clancy introduced the evening. He outlined the consultation process and timescales and explained the proposal in relation to the Education Scotland Act. Paul also explained the reasons for Rosebank Primary School being re associated with Morgan Academy.

Paul outlined where the numbers of pupils which make up Harris Academy population came from.

The teachers had no questions about the realignment of Rosebank PS to Morgan Academy but were puzzled regarding a letter that has gone to some P7 pupils asking them to submit a placing request to Morgan academy. Paul stated that he would look into the reasons for this.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF MEETING WITH ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL PARENT COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY 28 JANUARY 2015 AT 6.00 PM

Present: Paul Clancy, Head of Education (PC) (Secondary and SfL), Kenny McKeown, Education Officer (Recorder), three members of the parent council

Paul Clancy introduced the evening. He outlined the consultation process and timescales and explained the proposal in relation to the Education Scotland Act. Paul also explained the reasons for Rosebank Primary School being re associated with Morgan Academy.

KEY STATEMENTS, QUESTIONS AND RESPONSES

Parent - Why are pupils from Invergowrie given priority 1 status before pupils from Dundee?

PC - It seems that precedence is being given to pupils from outwith Dundee however, this was an agreement reached between the two authorities that was put in place at the disaggregation of Tayside Regional Council. In addition we would not be able to refuse a placing request as long as there was space in the school.

Parent - Transport issues from Charleston and Harris. How do pupils get back after extra curricular activities? Can bus passes be provided for everyone not only those on benefits? There are no direct bus routes to Harris academy from Charleston.

PC – Discussions are taking place with the bus companies about this. Hopefully there will be a solution which will help.

PC - Explanation of the reasons behind the original decision to move Rosebank Primary School from Morgan Academy's Catchment area to Harris Academy's catchment area. Realigning Rosebank PS with Morgan Academy is a move back to the original status. A commitment will be to ensure that anyone with siblings at Harris Academy at the time of the move i.e. from P1 upwards could have priority 1/dual status with Morgan Academy.

Parent – This would help alleviate concerns of affected families.

Parent – Could the realignment wait until Rosebank PS moves into new building?

PC – I'll check the numbers involved but it will probably not be possible.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

**RECORD OF PUBLIC MEETING AT ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL HELD ON
WEDNESDAY 28 JANUARY 2015 AT 7.00 PM**

Present: Paul Clancy, Head of Education (PC) (Secondary and SfL), Kenny McKeown, Education Officer (Recorder),

Paul Clancy introduced the evening. He outlined the consultation process and timescales and explained the proposal in relation to the Education Scotland Act. Paul also explained the reasons for Rosebank Primary School being re associated with Morgan Academy.

KEY STATEMENTS, QUESTIONS AND RESPONSES

Parent – Will pupils at Rosebank PS who have siblings in Harris Academy have priority 1 status?

PC – That might be possible depending on the numbers of young people involved. This would be checked.

Parent - Can P7 pupils currently at Rosebank go to Morgan Academy now?

PC - Special arrangements can't be made to allow this to happen as there is a placement request procedure. However there is nothing to stop parents of P7 pupils submitting a placing request to Morgan Academy.

Councillor JB – If the closure of Menzieshill was not taking place do Rosebank parents naturally align with Morgan Academy or Harris Academy?

This met with a mixed response from parents

Parent - When was decision/discussion made about move to Morgan?

PC – The proposal to close Menzieshill has probably been under discussion for approximately 15 months. However there was no concrete decision made until approximately 6/8 months ago. Had you known 15 months ago you might have made different decisions which secondary school to put your children to but the proposal might not have been realised and there would have been an impact on other schools.

Placing request procedures have also been made in parallel to this proposal to minimise the impact on other schools.

Councillor Jimmy Black (JB) – This is still a proposal. A final decision will not be made until Education Committee votes. There is still a possibility that the proposal might be rejected. There is no guarantee that this will go ahead.

Minister – Will it be a whipped vote at the Education Committee?

JB – This will probably be a whipped vote.

Councillor Laurie Bidwell (LB) - described the composition of Education Committee

Parent – Can parents make representation outwith this forum?

Paul – Yes further representation can be made to Education Committee. These would be beneficial if they contained some alternative proposals.

Parent – Can you not get rid of placing requests?

PC – This would require an act of parliament to happen. Parental choice is enshrined in law and it is highly unlikely this would be rescinded.

LB - Will there be space within Morgan Academy?

PC – Morgan Academy's capacity is 1050 and this cannot expand any further. Morgan academy is a listed building and therefore cannot be extended. Currently there are 250 placing requests submitted to Morgan Academy. A recent audit indicated that the population in Morgan Academy would be 989 by 2022. Rosebank being reassigned to Morgan Academy will have a benefit to other schools in the city by reducing the number of placing requests. This means that pupils will by necessity have to attend their designated school.

Parent - Is there an over capacity of places across Dundee?

PC - Currently there are approximately 7000 pupils across a school estate which can accommodate 9000 pupils. It would be good if we could look to operate at about 90% capacity. Currently we operate around 69% capacity.

Parent - Currently there are Rosebank pupils who live outside catchment area.

PC - Outlined placing request procedure. In addition some pupils may be educated in schools where there is specialist ASN provision. These decisions are made by a panel. Another example is the Young mum's unit. This is a a whole city resource which has been situated in a few places across the city. This is currently based in Menzieshill HS but will move to purpose built facilities regardless of whether Menzieshill HS closes.

Minister – If siblings are split between two secondary schools parents can't be in two places at the same time to either drop off or pick up pupils. Not convinced benefits will outweigh upset.

PC - After the numbers are looked I am fairly confident that Morgan Academy could take siblings.

Parent/LB - Is there a possibility of delaying the reassignment of Rosebank Primary school until the new PS is built nearer to Morgan academy? This could be similar to the Barnhill/Grange/Monifieth/Grove option.

PC – This is unlikely due to the numbers involved but this will be looked at and put into the consultation

Parent – Is it possible to use Menzieshill High School in different ways to

utilise the space?

PC – The way that the school is build would make it difficult to turn it into a community building at the same time as the school is operating. It would mean members of the public accessing the school and grounds at the same time as pupils.

JB - Are you OK with idea the Rosebank catchment changes?

Parent – it's difficult because we are in the middle of it.

Parent - Will classes get bigger?

PC – We are not anticipating class sizes will rise as there is a staff pupil formula that has to be adhered to.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

THE CLOSURE OF MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016.

RECORD OF STAFF MEETING AT BALDRAGON ACADEMY HELD ON MONDAY 2 FEBRUARY 2015 AT 3.30PM

In attendance

18 Staff (teaching and support), Paul Clancy (PC) (Head of Secondary Education and ASN)

Danny Webster (Secondary Education Manager) and Tracey Stewart (Education Officer) – NOTETAKING

Note of Meeting

Meeting commenced at 4.30 pm

Introduction by PC and purpose of meeting clarified. PC outlined the proposal to staff. Outlined legislation. Education Scotland will receive all the evidence and hold focus groups with staff and look at process. They will look to see if there are any gaps in the process.

PC took time to outline the position in Menzieshill and makes points on the proposal as follows:

- roll has dropped to 487 and doesn't look like it will increase
- so many pupils make placing requests to Harris Academy that explains the low roll.
- If they didn't go to Harris, Menzieshill would have a viable school roll
- Harris roll 940 and Menzieshill roll low – at this point in time we could bring the 2 schools together.
- If we didn't do this at this time Harris would fill up through placing requests.
- The current pupils who go to Harris from P&K would no longer be able to go there.
- This has implications for Baldragon Ac – pupils from P&K would have priority 1 status at Baldragon. Also the Western Gateway pupils would be aligned to Baldragon.
- Elected members felt strongly that we offer a priority 1 status to such P and K pupils in Dundee. Parents may, however, elect to take their priority 1 P&K option.

- Finally one other primary school, Rosebank Primary will be realigned to Morgan.

Happy now to take any questions you may have.

Key Issues, Questions and Responses

Staff – If the roll in Baldragon increases will the staff capacity increase?

PC – Yes, as it is based on staffing formula and related job sizing. It will be gradual, the increase. It could equate to around 13 pupils a year from P&K.

Staff - Who provides the transport for those pupils in P&K?

PC – P&K do - we only provide transport for pupils from Dundee.

Staff – The P&K associated schools have priority one status. Will there be a contingency to protect the new Baldragon if the roll rises?

PC - The maximum coming will be 12-14 a year. PC outlines the roll projections for the new Baldragon – it will reach 1000 in 2022 so there is plenty of capacity. Unlikely that all pupils from the projected figures will actually come to Baldragon. We do know that parents have noted an interest in visiting Baldragon.

Staff – What about pupils from Downfield – placing requests from Downfield parents to go to Harris. Would that continue?

PC – Harris would only be able to accommodate those in the catchment. Downfield would not be part of that. Paul outlined the figures of pupils who go to Harris currently which includes Downfield. We have noticed that through the decant of Harris that placing requests have gone down. Local school population has gone up as a result.

Staff – I have heard that Baldragon got a hard time at Menzieshill consultation meetings – Baldragon was being slagged off. Did this happen?

PC – Yes and we defended the school. Given short shift. PC reassured people that the reputation of Baldragon is good. The issue is not just specific to Baldragon, it's an Issue in many schools – people pass the door of Braeview, Craigie etc. Schools who don't lose pupils are Morgan, Harris, Grove. View of traditional school that parents have. It is a reputational thing – need to continue to build the positive story of all Dundee schools.

PC also explained the last round of placing requests' consultation. Just need to keep working on it. You are getting a brand new building, great staff, super stuff going on.

Staff – reputation is changing.

PC – in the past an associated primary HT (*to Baldragon*) told parents to put in placing requests to Harris!

Staff – The Young Mothers' Unit (YMU) is coming to Baldragon – what is that about?

PC – Explained that YMU is a different issue. It is going to Jessie Porter but the young mums will be getting their education in Baldragon. Going to P&R committee on 12 February and this will move regardless of the outcome of the Menzieshill consultation. This will improve the service provision.

Staff – It was brought up at the pupil council meeting and I didn't know about it.

Staff – Is there a reason for it not going to Harris?

PC – It's two fold – by placing the baby unit at Jessie Porter Nursery it provides wrap around care, providing progression for the babies beyond age 2. Harris does not

have the capacity of provision. It is better to put it in a central point in the City and also the situation with the nursery on campus.

PC – any more questions?

No - Meeting ended 5.09 pm

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

THE CLOSURE OF MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016.

**RECORD OF PARENT COUNCIL MEETING AT BALDRAGON ACADEMY HELD
ON
MONDAY 2 FEBRUARY 2015 AT 6.00PM**

In attendance

Paul Clancy (PC), Head of Secondary and ASN, 2 parents
Danny Webster, Secondary Education Manager and Tracey Stewart, Education Officer - NOTETAKING

Note of Meeting

Paul introduced the meeting and outlined the proposal and the process for closing Menzieshill High school. Education Scotland are tasked to look at the proposal paper and the issues/questions raised through the consultation process and provide a report to the Local Authority (LA). The LA then produce a final report to go back to Council for approval or not and then it goes to Scottish Government for final check. Scottish Government then determine if it will go ahead.

There is a declining roll at Menzieshill – PC outlined position of 150 pupils going to Harris through placing requests. The new Harris roll will be 1309 and its roll is currently 940. Our belief is that the school will fill up through placing requests in the future if we don't move Menzieshill pupils in now. There is an opportunity at the moment, due to the artificially low roll at Harris Ac, to do this now.

In Harris there are only 450 pupils from within the catchment, 490 come from outwith Dundee including 150 from the Menzieshill catchment, 184 pupils go to Harris from other parts of Dundee.

Inchure, Longforgan, Abernyte and Angus schools – will be associated to Baldragon Academy. Also proposed build of Western Gateway will be zoned into Baldragon. The new Baldragon is being built for 1100 pupils.

Rosebank also needs to be zoned to Morgan Ac and the new build of Rosebank PS will be closer in proximity to Morgan Ac.

If all P&K pupils chose to go to Baldragon – it would be 12-14 pupils per year on average. Baldragon would have 831 in the first year if they all come. By 2022 the school would have a roll of just over 1000 if everyone came and all proposed houses are built. There would be plenty of space in Baldragon and a nice new school – lots to offer.

Key Issues, Questions and Responses

Parent – What happens with parents who put in early placing requests to Harris?

PC – We will just have to cope with that through our own placing request procedures. Placing requests close today.

Parent – If we have the room here the more the merrier, you would have a better mix of people.

PC – it will be a better mix, we will do the best we can for all pupils.

Parent – You need to see all the different social classes.

Parent – The curriculum will be better – able to offer more. The school would be a magnet and will attract placing requests.

PC – Yes and the fear is there that if this happens in Harris the Menzieshill roll will drop further. It would then be very difficult to offer a viable curriculum.

Parent – Are there any plans for the Young Mums' Unit (YMU)?

PC – It is coming here – Jessie Porter and Baldragon. It is not disappearing. There is an opportunity to put the baby site in Jessie Porter Nursery and this will offer wrap around care and transition beyond age 2 for the babies. Paul explains about the Family Nurse Partnership and the resource inputs. We think putting them in a bespoke early years' facility is best for the babies and young mums.

Parent – That sounds good. The mums will be keener to continue their education.

Parent – I'm a midwife and that is good.

Parent – I like the idea of getting the mix.

Parent – Will the Western Gateway get a choice?

PC – No their Priority 1 school will be Baldragon. But parents from pupils at Western Gateway will argue that it is still a long way away but transport will be provided. Harris will be full with its own natural catchment. I fully anticipate that Baldragon will benefit.

Parent – Downfield pupils are now coming here – we are seeing the benefit.

PC – yes, the roll from Downfield coming here has increased – this has changed over the years.

Parent – I think it's all good.

PC – anything else you want to ask?

Thank you very much

Meeting ended 6.30 pm.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

THE CLOSURE OF MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016.

RECORD OF PUBLIC MEETING AT BALDRAGON ACADEMY HELD ON MONDAY 2 FEBRUARY 2015 AT 7.00PM

In attendance

Paul Clancy (PC), Head of Secondary Education and ASN – chair; Stewart Hunter (SH), Convenor of Education;
Danny Webster, Secondary Education Manager and Tracey Stewart, Education Officer **NOTETAKING**

16 members of the public, Head Teacher, DHT, Business Manager

Note of Meeting

Introduction

PC welcomed people to the meeting and outlined the purpose of the consultation meeting. In outlining the proposal it was noted that further written questions/issues can be sent in as part of the process. Statutory part of the process is that consultation meetings are held. This concludes at the end of February. All points are sent to Education Scotland and they look at all the information sent through. They will produce a report on the process – they will look at the evidence coming through from the public and make sure this has been addressed in the proposal. They will give the Council advice then the Council will produce a consultation report and that goes to the Education Committee for approval in May/June 2015. The elected members will then decide – they will vote for the proposal. This then goes back to Scottish Government and then people have further opportunity to go to Scottish Government then Scottish Ministers have final say of a school closure.

PC summarised the proposal to close Menzieshill High School and realign catchments as outlined in the proposal.

Menzieshill's roll has fallen to 487 and projections indicate that that level is not going to grow. Building is now under 50% occupancy level. The new Harris will be able to accommodate 1309. The Harris academy roll is currently 940. This is artificially low,

due to the decant to the Rockwell site and associated reduction in placing requests along with a decline in Dundee's population.

There are only 450 pupils within the natural catchment of Harris, 150 come from Menzieshill/Charleston, 156 outwith Dundee, rest of roll 184 from other parts of Dundee. The issue we face is that Harris will fill up – act as a magnet – we fully anticipate that Harris roll will fill – through placing requests. The issue is that within Menzieshill's current population there may be a further drift from Menzieshill to Harris. This would bring Menzieshill's roll down further – very difficult to run the school. Currently they struggle to offer a viable curriculum.

Now, at this point in time, it is possible to bring the two rolls together – but this would not be possible in a few years time. You would then have to divide Menzieshill's catchment amongst a number of schools. This would restrict opportunities in the future.

The schools from P&K and Angus would get priority 1 status to Baldrigon, as well as their current priority 1 in P&K and Angus. Western Gateway would also have priority 1 status and Rosebank would be zoned to Morgan Academy. The new build Rosebank is going to be closer to Morgan. Rosebank was previously aligned to Morgan – up until 1996. This would give the necessary space to accommodate pupils in Harris.

PC outlined the benefits for young people. Also cost to educate pupils in Menzieshill High – there is a cost across Dundee. The main reason for the change are the educational benefits this will bring to pupils. They will have a brand new school and offered a full curriculum.

Questions/Issues/Responses

Public – Making a point – priority 1 for P&K, Angus. What about all the other new buildings in the area? Class sizes are all increasing in the school. Will this not mean overcrowding at Baldrigon?

PC – we have looked at the future housing land audit 2014 and the Western Gateway. In generating pupil projections from new build houses a formula of 1 secondary young person per 8 houses is used . 200 houses – 25 pupils – statistics. We have used that calculation. If, therefore, all houses are built and if all pupils choose to come to Baldrigon, by 2022 there would be just over 1000 pupils and Baldrigon is sized for 1100. Don't anticipated that the P&K pupils would all go to Baldrigon. There will be plenty of room.

Public – Is that the capacity for the new building?

PC – yes, the new building. Total capacity and working capacity explanation given eg, this building could hold 1250/1300 pupils but currently this is rated as a working capacity at 1000. The new Baldrigon is 1100 plus other spaces.

Public – Is the maternity unit moving to Baldrigon?

PC – The Young Mothers' Unit is not part of this proposal but yes we are intending to move it to Jessie Porter Nursery. Care side and education side. Baby side will be based in Jessie Porter and the Young Mums would be educated in the new Baldrigon. This would be done irrespective of this proposal. We think it provides a better service and it is in a more central location.

Public – Question on educational benefits – if this is the case if we look at Menzieshill results/HMI reports and Baldragon results they don't compare.

PC – This is a complex issue. Children will learn wherever they are. I am absolutely confident about the educational benefits of this proposal.

Public – The educational benefits for Baldragon don't seem to be the same as for Harris. The educational benefits should be the same. They are not the same in the proposal paper. They should be the same for both schools.

PC – In terms of Baldragon there will be swimming pool, community facilities

Public – Is Baldragon definitely going ahead?

PC – Yes most definitely

PC – They will be experiencing similar facilities. Both Wifi schools.

Public – We gave it planning permission in November and a briefing for the school just last week. Work will be going ahead in the next few weeks.

Public – If the closure of Menzieshill doesn't go ahead will this affect the building of Baldragon?

KH, (Head Teacher) – No – Baldragon will definitely be going ahead and opening in Jan 2017.

PC – We have agreement and approval for the build.

Public – Transport from P&K – will there be funded transport?

PC – I have had some discussions with officers in P&K and they would be fully expecting that transport will be provided but it will be a politically made decision – initial conversations have been positive.

Public – What will be the transition arrangements from Longforgan?

PC – We are very keen to ensure that transition arrangements will exist. In terms of viewing the school both old and new there will be no problem. We are, however, just at an early stage of the consultation. Session 2015/16 will be a key year if this goes ahead. We are proud of Baldragon and we want people to see what is going on. But this is not a done deal. We have tentative plans in place until it is approved.

Public – At what stage will placing requests be full for Harris Academy? When will Harris be full?

PC - We anticipate in 2016/7 a roll of 1299. Full up to 2022. 687 new residential developments and if all are built – at that point it would be full. If all the pupils go there. Harris Academy will be full or near to full year on year. That's a good thing for Dundee – it will even out school rolls across the City. Families should go to their local school but everyone has a right of choice. Personally I think it is good if you go to your local school.

Public – Who made the decision to take the P&K schools from Harris – you are making us travel further.

PC – we are only given funds to provide education services for Dundee pupils.

Public – except Invergowrie?

PC – I accept that but if you feel strongly about that you can put in a written point. With reference to travelling further - we can't do it – if we could give you a closer school we would but we just can't – would it make any difference travelling a couple of miles more along the Kingsway.

Public – Would the Western Gateway not have saved Menzieshill?

PC – The issue for us is that this will be a village community. A school in the Western Gateway would have been ideal. We can zone the gateway any way we want but we can't stop placing requests. I would anticipate that this new community will put in placing requests.

Public – But there are no places to be had.

PC – Correct. We have outline projections to 2029 and estimates to 2035 this has informed our plans. I have looked at the margin of error in estimates 20 years ago and they were 20% out.

Public – I was at the first meeting in Harris and understand that you don't have a legal obligation to offer the P&K community Dundee schools and we really appreciate that you are giving us an option.

Public - What happens if you have an elder child at Harris but then you have another one go to Baldrigon – is there an assurance that there will always be an opportunity to go to Baldrigon?

PC – good question – you will have a place at Baldrigon.

Public – I've been told that my child won't have a place at Menzieshill – priority 6 parent.

Public – There are other people in that situation in the village, don't attend Longforgan but attend another primary school in Dundee.

PC – Explanation of the placing requests process

Public – misunderstanding – when we know that Menzieshill would perhaps close many parents wanted to move pupils to Invergowrie.

PC - But if you don't live in the catchment area you won't be priority 1

Public – You said that Education Scotland would be making a report - how much of people's views will be taken in to account? It feels like it is a done deal. Will our views really be taken in to account ?

PC – This is not a done deal. We are listening and want to make it the best.

SH – There are 29 councillors and 5 non councillors who get the vote so it is not a done deal SH gives an assurance that all people will need to be making the decision. The decision will not be made until the consultation process has been completed. It can't be forced through the committee. I can't guarantee that we (*the administration*) will win the vote.

Public – How many votes are required for this to go through?

SH - it would be 18 to go through.

PC - Cllr Hunter would have a casting vote.

SH - I genuinely believe that I need to lead and stand up and be counted even though I have noted an interest on a personal level.

PC – Education Scotland will be checking that we have carried out the process properly. They will look at the weight of the educational benefit. The final consultation report will capture all views fully. We have a legal duty to provide adequate and efficient education and stress the summary of benefits with the paper. P22 of the proposal sets out the benefits of the proposal – by far the most important is the educational benefits driven by the pupils attending Harris Academy. There are also, however, significant financial savings. I couldn't be any more honest. Savings are, however, a factor but by far the most important factor are the

educational benefits

Public – HMI report – I’ve looked at reports from Harris and Baldragon. They are very different.

Public – I have two sons at this school (Baldragon) – my sons are doing Highers and Advanced Highers and staff are amazing. The HT, Mr Hearn, does a great job.

PC – I’m glad you raised this point.

Public - But I am only able to look at reports.

Public - I can only have high regard of the school. You can always send your child to a Perth school!

PC – I wouldn’t put all my eggs in examination levels. You need to look at where pupils are when they enter the school and the progress they make.

2010 ,last Baldragon HMI report – stated that this is a good school.

SH – no matter what school you go to please be assured your pupils will get a great education.

HT - more than happy to meet with parents/carers – the staff will do everything they can to make sure they will be the best they can be.

PC – I am an ex pupil, all my kids came here – talked positively about their experience. P&K parents are doubly blessed.

Public – It’s the unknown. Could Mr Hearn come to our school?

PC – Maybe we can do something about that. Come and see Mr Hearn. Not yet however! – Perhaps once the consultation is over. If there is anything else you want to discuss please feel free to give me a phone.

Public – I am the chair of the Inchure parent council. I’m just here to establish the facts. I need to equip parents with as much information as possible.

PC – We felt it was important to keep a priority 1 liaison with P&K. This is a proposal.

Public – class sizes – what are the class sizes here in Baldragon?

PC – class sizes are governed by COSLA agreements and law – e.g. 33 in S1/2 and 30 in S3 and practical not above 20. Every school I know in Scotland operates to these. In some Dundee, schools such as Baldragon average class sizes in English and Maths should be no more than 20 – we have kept to that in some schools in Dundee. Baldragon is one of these schools. Given additional staffing to do this. Others schools can make that decision if they wish. That will continue on and that’s how we are staffing schools.

Public - What’s the numbers in S3 ?

PC - can go up to 30 but Baldragon don’t have any English and Maths classes as big as 30.

Public – I want to be clear that I am not down-crying Baldragon – I’m trying to establish the facts as parent council of Inchtire. I need to equip parents with as much information and facts to allow parents to make their own minds up

PC – I really appreciate that and the fact you have come along. Re-emphasised it is a proposal.

Public – how long will this rumble on for – if it does go back to Scottish Government.

PC – decision in May – we need to wait 3 weeks for people to make representation to the Government and would like to tie this up before the summer holidays.

Public – will my son know by start of S1?

PC – Yes, certainly by end of July.

HMI within audience spoke at this point and clarified the process.

PC – I would ask the citizens of Dundee to consider the alternatives – we have put together a proposal that we believe this is the best option.

Public – It's the fear of the unknown.

Public – What do you predict for attainment levels in Dundee?

PC – We are putting a lot of work in to our primaries – literacy and numeracy – they will go up. And early years and we will have to put in more resources there. New exams – very confident that attainment levels will go up.

Public – Will moving catchment areas help?

PC – My personal view is that it's better getting a better socio-economic mix in schools. We have been working on this in Dundee.

Public – Who will make sure the process has been followed?

PC – Education Scotland will do that and will have a number of focus groups to check things out.

HMI responded – he indicates that he will be doing the report on the proposal. We will advise the local authority to ensure we get it right and to act as a sounding board for Scottish Government.

Public – This is a better meeting to be in - to be in a meeting where you can be heard.

PC – Yes we may have learned from previous experience!

Public – You need to look at the economics of the area – 400 people go to the local shops.

PC – But I've got to think about the educational benefits of the young people not the local chip shop.

We believe we are also strengthening community facilities by the new primary school. We have tried to do that in the proposal paper.

Public – Are there any plans to build on the site of Menzieshill High – has this been taken into consideration in your land statistics? Are your projected numbers wrong then?

PC – There could be an influx because of the waterfront – we need to plan that in years to come.

SH – once a site becomes vacant it goes to City Development department and they decide how it is going to be marketed. There are many sites still vacant. History would show that houses don't get built.

Public – the new primary school is going on a site where multis used to be.

PC – Western Gateway – heavy proportion who buy the new houses are from Dundee, Recycled – not necessarily new people coming to the city.

We have tried to err on the side of caution.

SH – Some may also want to go to a denominational school.

PC – For example the Muslim community – a lot favour denominational education.

PC – We have looked into this.

Public – If there is going to be a change – it would be good if we keep the children together. If there is a bigger mix of pupils coming to this school it will be better. It's a win win situation.

SH – consultation is still open but if you do have a statement/question/ please write in if you feel strong enough about it

Meeting ends 8.23 pm

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

**FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CHANGE THE CATCHMENT
AREAS FOR ARDLER PRIMARY SCHOOL, CRAIGOWL PRIMARY SCHOOL,
DOWNFIELD PRIMARY SCHOOL AND SIDLAW VIEW PRIMARY SCHOOL**

**RECORD OF MEETING WITH BALDRAGON ACADEMY PUPIL COUNCIL HELD
ON TUESDAY 24 FEBRUARY 2015**

In the absence of an elected Pupils' Representative Council in school, I met this morning with what I considered to be a representative sample of pupils in Baldragon i.e. two groups of pupils (total of 45 individuals) including all ages and stages from S1-6. At each meeting, I explained that I wished to seek and record their views and any questions around the current Consultation Process on school estate in the city. Most said they knew something about it, having read articles in the local press. However, I referred specifically to implications for our school with regard to the pupil population. For example, I mentioned the possibility of our associated schools including primaries not currently within our catchment area.

I invited the young people to express opinions, ask questions and raise any issues or concerns. None of them did so. The only comment was that they are happy with the situation.

K J M Hearn
(Head Teacher)

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF STAFF MEETING AT MORGAN ACADEMY HELD ON TUESDAY 3 FEBRUARY 2015 AT 3.30PM

Present: 2 members of staff; Paul Clancy, Head of Education and ASN); Iris Thomson, Education Officer (recorded)

Introduction

Paul Clancy, Head of Education (Secondary and ASN) welcomed staff to the meeting.

PC outlines background to the consultation process and how this is set out in statute. We must consult staff in schools who are affected by the proposal, parent council, public, etc. Education Scotland look at the process and check that this has been carried out properly. They look at what comes back from the consultation and produce a report which aligns the consultation feedback with the proposal and point out where there may be discrepancies between the two. The Local Authority has 3 weeks to consider this and produce a final report which then goes to the Education Committee. Council then either approve or disapprove it. If approved, it goes to Scottish Government. Whatever is discussed today forms part of the formal feedback.

PC talks staff through the proposal and projections re the school roll of Menzieshill and the current make-up of Harris Academy school roll – including pupils from outwith Dundee. He outlines the problem that will occur if Menzieshill's roll continues to drop. Current projections indicate that the pupils can get into Harris: now.. He goes on to speak about the proposal to move Rosebank back into the Morgan catchment area from the Harris catchment area adding that Rosebank was traditionally associated with Morgan. New build at end of Alexander Street will be nearer to Morgan Academy than currently. PC gives an outline of the Educational Benefits statement.

Statement by staff member - I can certainly see the Educational benefits of this but feel sorry for the pupils at Menzieshill.

PC – We have agreed that we will transfer members of the guidance team. We will do our very best to ensure that pupils are supported.

One of my fears is that schools like ours, Baldragon and Harris are going to be working at capacity. Every now and then there is a ripple effect where things go up and down. We are pretty tight at the moment. If another school comes in here, I am worried that we are really going to be struggling.

PC – What is your roll just now?

960/970

PC – With the addition of Rosebank PC goes on to quote projections with the addition of Rosebank primary children becoming part of the catchment from Morgan.

What our catchment roll is and our actual roll is, are 2 different things.

PC – We have to accept placing requests as this is the law. Rosebank will produce about 14 or 15 pupils each year. If they weren't part of your catchment, you would still get these numbers via placing requests.

Because we have so many pupils here who have come from Mill o' Mains, etc, we might have an issue with families who have siblings who can't come here.

PC – There will still be some placing requests to Harris and perhaps Baldragon. I am confident that we will still be able to get the siblings in. We would be arguing that there will be a benefit for schools across the city by having Baldragon, Morgan and Grove full. Harris will be full or near to full, so it won't be able to take placing requests but it will be able to take everyone within its catchment area.

When is Baldragon going to be finished?

PC - January 2017.

Statement by staff member - As a parent of someone who had a child at St. Saviour's, I feel their pain – even though I understand the logic behind the closure.

When Harris was being rebuilt, was there a thought about putting it in another area?

PC – There was a view, could you put it in a new site? There was a strong view that, traditionally, it was part of the West End community. He references Historic Scotland – listed building. We got permission to demolish it, only if we incorporated certain features. The fascia will be clad with old Harris brick, they are building the clock face back in, etc.

A lot of pupils must have to travel a fair distance to get there.

PC – They do.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PARENT COUNCIL MEETING AT MORGAN ACADEMY HELD ON TUESDAY 3 FEBRUARY 2015 AT 6.00PM

There were no parents for Morgan and so the meeting was cancelled.

DUNDEE CITY COUNCIL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

SCHOOLS CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

FORMAL CONSULTATION ON THE PROPOSAL TO CLOSE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL AND REDELINEATION OF THE CATCHMENT AREA OF HARRIS ACADEMY TO INCLUDE MENZIESHILL HIGH SCHOOL'S EXISTING CATCHMENT AREA WITHIN DUNDEE; AND TO TRANSFER THAT PART OF HARRIS ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA, WHICH COMPRISES THE CATCHMENT AREA OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL, TO MORGAN ACADEMY'S CATCHMENT AREA AND MAKE MORGAN ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED SECONDARY SCHOOL OF ROSEBANK PRIMARY SCHOOL; AND TO MAKE BALDRAGON ACADEMY THE ASSOCIATED DUNDEE SECONDARY SCHOOL OF LONGFORGAN, INCHTURE, ABERNYTE, AUCHTERHOUSE, BIRKHILL AND LIFF PRIMARY SCHOOLS FROM AUGUST 2016

RECORD OF PUBLIC MEETING AT MORGAN ACADEMY HELD ON TUESDAY 3 FEBRUARY 2015 AT 7.00PM

Present: 4 attendees, 3 parents/carers, 1 pupil; Michael Wood, Director of Education (MW); Gregor Murray (Depute Convener of the Education Committee); Alex Anderson, DHT Morgan Academy (AA); Danny Webster, Education Manager (recorder); Iris Thomson, Education Officer (recorder)

Introduction by MW. Purpose of meeting clarified

Outline of proposal affecting Morgan Academy/Rosebank Primary School. Legal process – we are duty bound to have public meetings. Biggest implication for Morgan is that in terms of Rosebank, it would return to be an associated school of Morgan Academy. At the moment the roll at Rosebank is quite small – P7 22, P6 23, P5 23, etc. We are not talking about sizeable numbers coming up. Rosebank was originally within Morgan's catchment before being rezoned to Harris (following *the fire at Morgan*). We don't anticipate a problem with any of the associated primary schools. August 2015 – 175 pupils, next year – 172. Year on year, the actual issue about reaching the 180 doesn't come from the local primary schools, it comes from placing requests. Morgan is always full and is capped in S1 at 180 pupils. Under legislation, any parent can make a placing request application. I can't see people being displaced. There are some planned new builds in the Hilltown, running along Alexander Street, but we know that there are no concerns regarding the number of pupils. Director then goes on to speak about the falling Menzieshill HS roll and the plans to absorb this within the Harris Academy catchment area. This consultation has to go through a fairly lengthy process – goes on to outline the nature of this. The Education Committee has the final vote. Director speaks about some issues which have already been raised e.g. transport, siblings already at the school, etc. If the proposal falls, it cannot be revisited for 5 years. The implications for Morgan are slight – if Rosebank don't come into the catchment, there will still be a significant number of placing requests.

INTERRUPTED – parent asking about the reason behind so many placing requests. MW responds indicating that pupils in every secondary school attend

every other one with 30% of pupils not attending their designated school due to parental placing requests in a city with a 6 mile radius.

I am worried about the socialisation of the children trying to form long lasting relationships

GM – if you are moving Rosebank ‘en masse’, they would all be in the same situation. Parental choice means that the department cannot refuse a placing request without a valid reason. There is also the right of appeal

MW- Placing request legislation was set up to give people more choice. (MW asks a parent about young people socialising with others. Parent responds saying that child mixes in terms of his music).

Parent asks question re taking into consideration Stobsmuir housing developments in calculating projected numbers for Morgan.

MW – yes, there is ample room.

Why do you get placing requests all over Dundee?

MW – Dundee is unique. 30% of young people don’t go to their designated school, also 6 mile radius. Pupils in every school attend every other. Affinity with certain schools.

AA – Parents have an affinity with Morgan. There is a long tradition of placing requests.

Parent comments that he is more than welcoming of Rosebank pupils attending Morgan and has no problem with the Hilltown but expresses concern about the perceived trend of rising rolls, specifically at Morgan but also across the wider city.

I do worry about the drift towards bigger and bigger catchment areas for our schools and the future when we don’t have spare capacity within our schools. What’s happening with Menzieshill and Harris sets a worrying trend for what might happen elsewhere.

MW – Can I reassure you that there are no plans to change the school estate. Every school, including Morgan, has a recognised capacity and that is there for a reason. What we have is a window of opportunity within Menzieshill. Things change all the time – at the moment, the secondary rolls are on a downward projector within Dundee. 12 years from now, the school estate might look different from what it does today. Director speaks about the lack of Expressive Arts facilities in the old Harris and how a new building is an improvement on that. In terms of capacity, every school has a set number for first year which can’t be shifted or moved around to suit your purposes. At the moment in Morgan S1 is capped at 180 - that is not something that is going to change. Every year, we do say to people – actually it is full. Parents can appeal and go to the Sheriff Court if they wish. We have tried to future- proof the school estate.

GM – Class sizes are set so we can’t change them.

With the Campus model, you get the issue that certain schools get to run Advanced Higher in their school and other pupils have to move across the city to do their subject.

GM – highlights that this is the exact reason that we have a campus as it gives pupils an opportunity –he goes on to quote Braeview, his former school, as an example.

Parent comments that it’s not quite the same and is better doing Advanced Higher in your own school.

MW – Director comments that he believes in the Advanced Higher campus as it

extends choice for young people. He also mentions about pupils going to Dundee and Angus College and extending opportunities 'beyond the school gates'. He also comments about the drop-out rate from university and says that the campus helps to develop pupils' life skills.

AA – pupils from the Geography Dept go to the campus to do Advanced Higher Geography. I don't know if they would have this opportunity without the city campus model. They would end up in a bi-level class with Higher pupils. It is about the best of both worlds. Lots of other Advanced Highers run in school – e.g. Music

Socio-economic balance made the difference in the quality of our education and our experience. My partner was 'survival of the fittest' and for me it was a different experience which made me flourish. I have concerns for my daughter.

MW – I would describe Morgan as one of our truly comprehensive schools within the city.

AA – I think pupils are all catered for. It takes all sorts. The way we set when they come into S1 – we make sure that they have pals with them in their class. They soon mix with others from other primary schools and develop a strong Morgan identity.

What I am trying to say is, at the moment, my daughter is learning a new skill – how to get on with people, etc. Is this something that is addressed in Morgan?

AA – absolutely, pupils are encouraged through Social Education with the Guidance team to get along with people, look out for others, develop a sense of community, etc.

Parent 1 - At the moment, I've heard that bad behaviour is rewarded by taking pupils to Dundee football ground, etc.....

Parent 2 – I think that Morgan manages things very well. In terms of the mix of the kids that come through, I think the school community is very healthy. It has a big catchment but it is a school community.

MW – As your daughter nears the point of transition, there are open evenings in the school, you can tour the school and make any concerns known to the school.

AA – speaks about good behaviour trips for pupils who are 'on track'.

I have 4 children in different places at the moment. I have a daughter in S3 at Harris and have another 2 younger children at Ancrum Road primary by placing request. I'm not sure which school I want them to go to. I am not sure if they have a choice – catchment. I'm hearing different things about Harris and am not sure if I want them to go there. I am a bit confused as to what to do.

MW – Write down your contact details and your address and we will give you a ring tomorrow.

I notice that the secondary schools have quite strong parent partnership groups. Are you still going to feed down to primaries so that I know as a parent what is happening?

MW – yes. We will keep people abreast of what is happening.

Meeting ended at 7.45pm

APPENDIX 3

Thematic Summary of Submissions Received From Dundee Parents/Carers, Residents and Organisations

Submissions - 22 submissions were received from individual parents/carers and Dundee residents; 8 additional submissions were received from organisations and individuals as follows: Menzieshill High School Parent Council; Rosebank Primary School Parent Council; Hillside Primary School Parent Council; Gowriehill Primary School Parent Council; West End Community Council; Dundee Civic Trust; Save Menzieshill High School Campaign; Councillor Laurie Bidwell.

Themes - Emergent themes and issues from the submissions included:

- Concern over the closure of a small nurturing secondary school (Menzieshill High School) within a regenerating community
- Cessation of community access to and use of Menzieshill High School facilities
- Negative impact on local economy due to closure of Menzieshill High School
- Detachment of new school (Harris Academy) from the local Menzieshill community
- Concerns in relation to increased travel distances, associated pupil safety issues and provision of bus services
- Concern over increased financial costs in relation to travel, uniform and school lunches
- Perceived road traffic safety issues due to increased foot-fall and pupil congestion on the Perth Road, Harris Academy site
- Concern over 'double transition' for current P7 pupils moving to Menzieshill High School in session 2015/16
- Concern over Menzieshill High School roll in session 2015/16
- Need to provide enhanced transition support for young mothers attending the YMU
- Concern over transition arrangements and provision of continuity in curriculum, pedagogy and support matters for Menzieshill pupils
- Failure to meet legislative standards regarding potential future use of the Menzieshill High School site
- Claim of inaccurate projected staff savings in the proposal paper due to maintenance of teacher numbers
- Insufficient prerequisite options appraisal of alternatives to close Menzieshill High School
- Request to improve facilities at the existing Menzieshill High School
- Concern over capacity of secondary school estate and specifically West Dundee; request for options appraisal of West Dundee school estate
- Concern over robustness, reliability and validity of pupil roll projections for the new Harris Academy
- Concern over larger school size (Harris Academy) and narrower ability range within class compositions
- Concern over insufficient school capacity (short and long term) at the new Harris Academy
- Concern over quality of support including that for children with additional support needs within the new Harris Academy
- Concerns over fusion of pupil groups and new pupil composition within the new Harris Academy
- Separation of siblings across two secondary schools – Harris Academy and Morgan Academy for Rosebank pupils
- Concern over viability of aligning Rosebank Primary School to Morgan Ac due to impact on school capacity and increased community foot-fall

- Concern over new pupil socio-economic composition at Morgan Academy
- Concern over higher placing request priority status of Invergowrie pupils compared to Rosebank pupils for Harris Academy
- Request for joint priority 1 placing request status in relation to Harris Ac and Morgan Ac for P1 – P7 pupils at Rosebank PS from Aug 2015
- Concern from Dundee parents/carers regarding priority 1 placing request status of Angus and Perth & Kinross pupils to Dundee schools
- Concern over delineation of the Western Gateway, and specified Angus/Perth & Kinross schools to Baldragon Ac due to poor transport
- Request to review primary school estate in accordance with planned housing developments

Thematic Summary of Submissions Received From Angus and Perth & Kinross Parents/Carers, Residents and Organisations

Submissions – 15 submissions were received from individual parents/carers and residents with an additional submission received from Perth and Kinross Council (Lifelong Learning Executive Sub Committee)

Themes - Emergent themes and issues from the submissions included:

- Concern over the cessation of quality educational provision at Menzieshill High School
- Concern over realignment to a larger secondary school (Baldragon Acadmey)
- Perceived absence of 'real' community ties to Baldragon Academy for Perth and Kinross families/pupils
- Concern over realignment of P & K pupils to Baldragon Academy
- Disassociation with the West Dundee Community and peer/personal relationships
- Concerns over pupil transportation including – increased journey times/distance, costs, safety issues, increased carbon footprint and responsibility for transport provision
- Adverse impact of increased journey time and transportation on pupils' ability to - participate within after-school activities and maintain peer friendships in the evening
- Concern over insufficient capacity (short and long term) at Harris Academy
- Separation of siblings across two secondary schools – Harris Academy and Baldragon Academy and the adverse impact on pupils and families
- Perceived disparity of alignment of Invergowrie Primary School to Harris Academy relative to other parts of the Carse of Gowrie
- Negative impact on the local economy within the Menzieshill community
- Difficulties in executing enhanced transition planning (two years in advance) for pupils (e.g. P5 Longforgan) with additional support needs
- Concern regarding the merged nature of disparate proposals connected with the proposed closure of Menzieshill High School
- Request for clarification on the position of Perth and Kinross pupils currently attending Menzieshill High School who may not wish to attend Harris Academy if Menzieshill were to close
- Concern over impact and possible consequences for Perth and Kinross Council regarding current admission and transfer to secondary school policy for pupils living in Longforgan, Inchture and Abernethy
- Perceived reputational issues for Perth and Kinross Council regarding possible parallel consultation on relevant related matters.