

**REPORT TO:** EDUCATION COMMITTEE AND POLICY AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE - 25 JUNE 2012

**REPORT ON:** MENZIESHILL - NEW PRIMARY SCHOOL AND COMMUNITY CENTRE

**REPORT BY:** DIRECTOR, LEISURE AND COMMUNITIES  
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

**REPORT NO:** 258-2012

## **1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT**

- 1.1** This report is intended to brief the Council on proposals for improvements to the primary school and community centre in the Menzieshill area and to set out the options under consideration for the consultation process.

## **2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 2.1** It is recommended that:

- the Committees note the report and instruct the Project Team to progress with consultation on the options, as detailed below; and
- the outcome of the informal consultation will be reported back to the Committees in due course and a preferred option identified. The Education Committee will at that stage be asked to instruct the Director of Education to consult formally on this preferred option under the terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010.

## **3.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

- 3.1** In its Capital Plan 2012-2016 (Report No. 48-2012), provision has been made for a new primary school and community centre in Menzieshill, with an estimated project cost of £11 million. The indicative spend programme shows:
- £200,000 worth of expenditure in 2012-13
  - £500,000 worth of expenditure in 2013-2014
  - £5,600,000 worth of expenditure in 2014-2015
  - £4,700,000 worth of expenditure in 2015-2016

## **4.0 BACKGROUND - THE COMMUNITY CENTRE**

- 4.1** Reference is made to Article I of the Policy and Resources Committee of 9 February 2012 at which it was agreed that, within the forward Capital Plan, provision should be made for the replacement of primary school provision serving the Menzieshill area of the City, and improvements to community facilities.
- 4.2** Following approval of this report, the Chief Executive met with the Management Committee of Menzieshill Community Centre and it was agreed that, as far as possible, the existing accommodation and facilities within Menzieshill Community Centre would be replicated within any new build or, failing that, the existing building would be improved to ensure that it tied in to the new building and was fit for purpose.

- 4.3** Following these meetings, and in consultation with the Local Management Group, a project specification has been drawn up and is attached (Appendix 1).

This specification describes the existing facilities, the objects of the projects, roles and responsibilities for the Project Team, and notes the current governance arrangements which it is recommended should continue beyond the project itself.

**4.4** Asset Management Condition Report

As it currently stands, the Asset Management Database for Dundee City Council indicates remedial works to the value of £550,655 as being required to the existing building. These are to be checked by an in depth condition survey which has been commissioned.

It is, however, likely that the total cost of refurbishment and improvement work to Menzieshill Community Centre would be in the region of one and a half million pounds.

**5.0 BACKGROUND - PRIMARY SCHOOL AND NURSERY PROVISION**

The creation of a new school in the Menzieshill area will improve the quality of the school estate. The current provision for primary and nursery education in the Menzieshill area comprises the following three primary schools and one nursery school:

- St Ninian's Primary School
- Hillside Primary School
- Gowriehill Primary School
- Menzieshill Nursery School

The current occupancy rate of the three primary schools is below capacity. Hillside Primary School has a roll of 290 pupils in total and is the largest of the three schools in the area with an occupancy rate of 79%. In addition to the mainstream classes from P1 to P7, the school has an enhanced provision for a group of pupils with Additional Support Needs. Gowriehill Primary School has a roll of 139 pupils in total with an occupancy rate of 34%. It also has an enhanced provision for pupils with Additional Support needs. There is no nursery provision in either Hillside or Gowriehill Primary Schools.

- 5.1** St Ninian's Primary School has a roll of 147 pupils and has a current occupancy level of 69%. It has a nursery provision to accommodate 20 children each session. A section of the school building is used to provide a base and office accommodation for Dundee Educational Psychology Service. The focus for consultation will not include St Ninian's Primary School.
- 5.2** Menzieshill Nursery School is a standalone nursery school providing accommodation for 90 children in each nursery session. It is always fully occupied and is able to cater for part-time children as well as a small number of full time children.

**6.0 OPTIONS**

There are a number of options for consideration.

- 6.1** The first is to build a new integrated primary school and community centre.
- 6.2** The second is to retain and refurbish the community centre and build a new primary school on the adjacent site.

**6.3** One sub-option exists, and that is to retain the existing community centre and refurbish it, and to build a new primary school, creating integrated and shared usage of some elements of both buildings, in particular, the refurbished games hall.

**6.4** The options in relation to the school estate are:

- Merge Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream non-denominational primary school;
- Merge Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream non-denominational primary school with a new Menzieshill Nursery School on the same site; or
- Merge Hillside and Gowriehill Primary Schools and build a new 3 stream non-denominational primary school and incorporate a mainstream nursery provision to replace Menzieshill Nursery School

A 3 stream primary school with a new Menzieshill Nursery School on the same site would have a number of advantages:

- It would replace traditional buildings with 21st century accommodation;
- It would lower operational costs by having all establishments on the one site;
- It would be designed to ensure improved vehicular access and road safety around the new site thereby removing the significant parking issues in the area around the existing Hillside Primary School;
- It would minimise capital costs by replacing three old buildings with one new build; and
- It would be more energy efficient and would improve our carbon footprint.

**6.5** The final recommendation will come down to the technical feasibility and costs, but the considerations which will be explored for each option are as follows:

Option One - New Integrated Centre

Positive	Negative
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A new build would be expected to have a longer life than the refurbished building.</li> <li>• There would be environmental benefits in terms of energy savings.</li> <li>• There would be expected to be revenue savings through heat, light and, potentially, shared reception.</li> <li>• The image of the building would be brought up to current day standards.</li> <li>• There would be greater use made of both the school and the community facility throughout the week.</li> <li>• School and community links would be strengthened.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Full costs of replacement, including demolition and replacement on a like-for-like basis might not be achievable within the cost envelope.</li> <li>• There is strong community loyalty to the existing building which might be lost through its replacement and through a shared campus.</li> <li>• Shared use with the school will restrict community access during day time.</li> <li>• Shared use might restrict community control and key-holding.</li> <li>• It may be more difficult to retain or develop the strong local management committee under this model.</li> <li>• Innovation may be constrained through joint management arrangements.</li> </ul>

## Option Two - New Primary School/Refurbished Community Centre

Positive	Negative
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Retains the strong identity of the community centre with the local community.</li><li>• Would provide continuity of management of the local community centre.</li><li>• Offers the best potential to attract external funding to the community centre.</li><li>• Allows for the transfer of the community centre as an asset to the local management committee, should such a policy evolve at some point in the future.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• A refurbished community centre might always look like an inferior building to a new build primary school.</li><li>• Improving the infrastructure of the community centre without dealing with the internal fabric and image of the building would leave the job incomplete.</li><li>• Retention of the existing community centre requires an urban design solution to address deficits in the car park/access/shopping mall, and integration of the new primary school. (Successful examples, such as the Ardler Central Core, would be held up as comparisons.)</li></ul>

### **7.0 SITE OPTIONS**

Two potential site options for the new build programme were identified originally to reflect the available land areas within Menzieshill. Each was of a sufficient size to meet the needs of the new accommodation requirements. The options were:

**7.1** The former site of the Menzieshill Multi storey flats. This is the preferred site and has a number of advantages including:

- Good public transport links;
- The central location of the site within the existing combined school catchments; and

The fact that it is sited beside the established location for community facilities given the proximity to the community centre.

**7.2** South Road Park (East of Tesco). This area is currently identified as open space. However the site is not considered to be relevant given the location and a number of potential constraints including:

- The potential loss of football pitches;
- The fact that site is not centrally located within existing school catchments; and
- The sloping nature of the site.

### **8.0 PROGRAMME**

**8.1** The technical feasibility and costs will, potentially, lead to a clear, preferred option.

**8.2** There will be an on-going process of consultation with each school community including staff, pupils, parents and carers; Parent Councils; relevant stakeholders including the Catholic church in relation to St Ninian's Primary School; the Local Community Planning Partnership; the local community; community centre users and key community stakeholders starting in July 2012.

**8.3** Beyond this period of consultation, and a technical assessment, a recommendation will be brought back to the Committees for approval in November 2012.

## **9.0 POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

- 9.1** The Report has been screened for any policy implications in respect of Sustainability, Strategic Environmental Assessment, Anti Poverty, Equality Impact Assessment and Risk Management.
- 9.2** An Equality Impact Assessment has been carried out and will be developed further in light of the option appraisal and technical assessment.

## **10.0 CONSULTATION**

- 10.1** The Chief Executive, Director of Corporate Services, and Head of Democratic and Legal Services have been consulted on the report and are in agreement with its contents.

## **11.0 BACKGROUND PAPERS**

- 11.1** None.

**Stewart Murdoch**  
**Director, Leisure and Communities**  
**14 June 2012**

**Michael Wood**  
**Director of Education**  
**14 June 2012**

## PROJECT SPECIFICATION

## PROJECT: MENZIESHILL - COMMUNITY CENTRE FACILITIES

**Terms of reference regarding Community Centre:**

LMG	Local Management Group (Charity)
Provision of Services	Accommodating weekly programme which on an average week has 112 activities covering social, recreational, educational and general community use.
Communities Section Staff	Community Centres, Youth Work, Adult Learning, Community Regeneration.
Facilities	<p>Annual user figures for 2011-12 were 91,873 of which 26,288 were within the Games Hall</p> <p>Facilities at present are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Large reception area with seating and notice boards.</li> <li>• Games Hall 30 metres x 20 metres can hold 4 badminton courts. Also has very large storage equipment space and separate shower and toilet facilities for male and female participants. This facility also has an external keypad entry system for lets out with normal opening times.</li> <li>• Coffee Bar 10 metres x 10 metres.</li> <li>• Small Hall 10 metres x 10 metres.</li> <li>• Soft Play Room 5 metres x 5 metres.</li> <li>• Large hall with stage 17 metres x 13 metres, fitted out for theatre/musical shows, with kitchen facilities and toilets attached. Kitchen and toilets not included in the size above. This facility also has an external keypad entry system for lets out with normal opening times.</li> <li>• Outside Quad area off Large Hall with safety flooring.</li> <li>• Beechgrove Garden.</li> <li>• Community Garden.</li> <li>• Youth Room 7 metres x 6 metres</li> <li>• IT Suite which holds 6 pc's and tutor desk.</li> <li>• Snooker room which holds two full size tables.</li> <li>• Medium meeting room 6 metres x 3 metres.</li> <li>• Two small meeting rooms 4 metres x 3 metres.</li> <li>• Office space to accommodate Administration Team x 4, Youth Work Team x 4, Adult Learning Team x 4, Resource Assistants, workshop x 2, office accommodation for Local Management Group and office for Centre Manager.</li> <li>• Considerable storage space will be required throughout the building.</li> <li>• Garage for mini bus.</li> <li>• 2 lock ups to store materials.</li> <li>• Lower floor good wheelchair access to all areas.</li> <li>• Large car park with good wheelchair access to Centre.</li> </ul>

**Purpose:**

To create a facility which serves the community to the level currently being provided by Menzieshill Community Centre.

### **What the Project needs to achieve:**

- A fit for the existing programme and users ... "like for like".
- Office Accommodation for necessary staff.
- To consult widely to ensure the facilities meet future needs.
- To be accessible seven days a week from 9am to 10.30 pm.
- To enable the existing LMG charity to move into the new premises with a new lease and partnership agreement or maintain the status quo.
- Key Worker support for LMG provided by Centre Manager.
- Clear communication strategy with Staff, LMG members, Users, Service Providers and Wider Community.
- Explore external funding opportunities to further enhance community facilities.

### **Agreed Roles and Responsibilities:**

#### **Strategic Lead Officer**

- Liaisons with architects/city engineers.
- Development of a project specification.
- Oversee community engagement.
- Input to project management.
- Oversee programme/staff displacement implications including any temporary closure of buildings and the need for staff redeployment.

#### **Operational Lead Officer**

- On-site liaison with architects/city engineers.
- Development and delivery of staff/community engagement strategy.
- Liaison with Local Management Group.
- Contribute to the development of project specifications.
- Arrangements to minimise the disruption to the delivery of services.

### **Governance:**

Currently, the Menzieshill Community Centre LMG contributes to the development and sustainability of many aspects of the current programme. As a Scottish Charity, the group holds a lease and partnership agreement which enables them to develop and secure external funds to further enhance the diversity of opportunities available. This provides a major saving for the local authority through exemption from non-domestic rates. The current support and future development of this group would continue to be supported by community centres staff.

### **Access to Community Facilities:**

The current Menzieshill Community Centre programme dictates that there would be a requirement for access to all the community facilities, seven days per week, 51 weeks in the year and from 9.00 am to 10.30 pm, in particular to the Sports Hall.

### **Staff Accommodation:**

The building currently operates as a staff base for staff who operate within the building and the area it services. There is a requirement to maintain staff accommodation within the new or refurbished facility.

### **Usage:**

The 2011 - 12 user figures are 91,873. To meet the current and future demands, there is a need to reassess what is currently provided and if this would be sufficient for the future being a new facility.

### **Planned Future Developments:**

There is a need to develop services for people in the community with mental health difficulties and those who have drug and alcohol dependencies. The Centre already provides space for groups to

meet who are recovering from drug and alcohol addictions, there are plans to develop this into a health café where people can meet with various agencies available to advise and support them in their struggle with dependency and/or addiction.

The recent community consultations have suggested there would be demand for a fitness suite within the community centre.

The LMG plan to secure funding to install sound and light system to the stage in the Grampian Lounge. This would have an impact on the electrics and there may be a need to upgrade the electric board.

### **Asset Management Condition Report:**

The attached figures are all indicative and total £550,655. The City Development Department has authorised an in depth condition report to be carried out by a qualified Surveyor. This study will also comment on the energy usage/efficiency of the existing building.

#### **DCC Asset Management Database**

	£
Roof works incl. games hall + various other roofs reaching the end of useful life and replacement rooflights	221,400
fixed ladders for safe access and maintenance	9,000
Window Replacements	17,600
Boilers, separation of services library/NHS clinic	135,000
Redecoration - various	11,500
Fire exit - west elevation	4,000
Fixed electrical installation - over 25 years old	98,655
External cladding and other internal decoration works	23,500
Grampian Lounge kitchen - refreshment required	20,000
Upper training room	10,000
	<b>550,655</b>
General upgrading to include aspects such as:	
▪ Other internal works e.g. formation of health suite	
▪ Storage area for games hall	
▪ Lowered ceiling and up-graded lighting in the foyer	
	<b>1,000,000</b>
Improvements to the external façade	<b>500,000</b>
<b>Total estimated cost</b>	<b>£1,500,000</b>