



Consultation Events October and November 2005 – Race Equality and Diversity Schemes

1 Purpose of the Report

This report summarises the consultation process undertaken regarding the Race Equality and Diversity Schemes being drawn up by Dundee City Council, NHS Tayside and Tayside Police and presents the findings and recommendations from the consultation.

2 Introduction

Public agencies in Dundee are currently in the process of writing their Race Equality schemes for 2005-2008 and wished to make contact with minority ethnic communities in order to record their perceptions of services available in Dundee.

The last accurate recording of the minority ethnic community in Dundee was made at the 2001 census when 5333 residents were recorded. There is evidence of significant increases in both the student population and the numbers of economic migrants living in Dundee since then.

3 Methodology

The three agencies involved in the consultation decided to hold joint consultation events to allow the communities to make comment on all three services. A joint statement was drawn up summarising the main points of their respective race equality and diversity schemes which was then translated into the main community languages. (see Appendix 1). A list of consultation questions was also drawn up to elicit responses.

It was agreed to target three main minority ethnic communities resident in Dundee:

- Chinese
- Indian
- Pakistani

In consultation with the communities, four meetings were held, including one for women only which allowed them to participate fully free from any cultural restraints. Invitations to minority ethnic community groups, the mosques and the temples were sent out in plain English and community languages and events were promoted by the community contact team employed by Dundee City Council. The events were recorded and transcribed by support services provided by NHS Tayside.

Two representatives from each agency and ninety six people from minority ethnic communities attended the meetings.

4 Consultation Responses

The following section outlines the main findings of the consultation – full consultation notes are to be found in Appendix 2

4.1 Agency Consultation with minority ethnic communities.

There was unanimous support for holding regular consultation events in the future. Two to three times a year was suggested at all the meetings. All who attended also agreed that it was a good idea for agencies to come together and speak to the communities. The following suggestions were made to make sure the meetings worked well:

- An agenda should be sent out to the communities before meetings
- People should have the chance to say what they would like to talk about before meetings
- A newsletter should be sent out to let people know what progress there has been between meetings
- Meetings should be arranged at a variety of times to allow fuller participation
- Meetings should be promoted through community organisations, mosques, temples, DCLAG
- The venues used for this series of meetings were seen as suitable

All in attendance were agreed that their names and addresses could be used to contact them about future consultation events.

4.2 Agency communication about services

When asked about the type of information that they would like to receive about our services, it became evident that most people in attendance were not clear about what services are actually provided. For example, none of the people in attendance at one of the meetings knew how to report a racist incident or what would happen once they had.

It was intimated that one of the most effective way of communicating about a new service is face to face or word of mouth. The following was suggested to improve communications:

- Written communication should be translated into community languages or if not possible made available in plain English
- Agencies should find out about language support needs on first contact with service users
- Agencies should make use of existing community networks to promote new services including arranging to speak at community groups if appropriate

The following requests were made for agencies to come out and address groups:

- (i) The Chinese Women's Group and the Elderly Chinese Group would like agencies to come and talk to them about their services
- (ii) The Chinese business community would like the DCC Licensing Board to come and listen to the problems they are having with completing license applications
- (iii) The Anti Social Behaviour teams and the Community Safety Wardens should be invited to the next meeting
- (iv) Tayside Police will organise personal safety checks for traders in the Chinese community

Lastly, more information was required about Health campaigns, benefits agency, immigration, bus pass criteria and how to report a racist incident.

4.3. Service Accessibility – Use of interpreters and translation.

NHS Tayside and Dundee City Council informed the meetings that they were in the process of reviewing their translation and interpreting services. They also pointed out that given there are fifty five languages being spoken in Dundee at present that translation of all documents into all languages will not be practical.

The perceived lack of effective translation and interpreting services was an area of great concern at the meetings. The following points were put forward by the community:

- Interpreters should be available at GP surgeries and hospitals
- Outpatient appointment documents should be translated
- Dissatisfaction was expressed with the telephone interpreting service – people would prefer face to face communication
- Access to telephone service often not offered or not available as consulting room did not have a telephone.
- Reports of delays in getting appointments due to difficulty getting interpreters
- Members of the Chinese community would prefer first point of contact to be in Chinese

- People often relying on their families for help but unable to contact them as use of mobile phones is forbidden or experienced difficulties in having family meetings with consultants
- The Indian community expressed concern that information was rarely produced in Hindi
- More bilingual people should be employed by agencies
- Complaints were also made about the Inland Revenue – contact will be made to invite them to a future meeting of the Chinese community
- DCC License applications guidelines should be translated
- Concern was expressed regarding confidentiality issues – this needs to be made clearer with a statement made on publicity materials in the future
- If a document relates to a serious matter such as an eviction – it should be translated into the service user’s first language
- If an agency is using a contact translation service if you need help statement-it should also include the subject matter of the communication in the community language as people do not know what the subject of the communication is

The agency representatives outlined some improvements they were hoping to introduce and agreed to report back in full at the next meeting

4.4 Recruiting more people from minority ethnic communities

It was agreed by all that one of the ways to improve our communication and our services would be to recruit more people from minority ethnic communities. The following suggestions were made:

- Give more information about types of jobs available
- Advertise posts in community venues
- Have a job fair for minority ethnic communities
- Set up work placement schemes
- Run campaigns with training providers encouraging more people to enter professions
- Setting up mentor schemes
- Translation and accreditation of qualifications should be established

- Employ more people on the basis of their experience and provide training

4.5 How to increase access to our services

This section of the report outlines other concerns expressed regarding use of our services:

- a) Complaints were made regarding waiting times after reporting a racial incident. Also, one person had not heard anything after reporting an incident five weeks ago, Tayside Police explained that racial incidents were given high priority but it depended on the urgency of the situation. Some difficulties had been experienced with their new phone system but this was being reviewed. People who report a racist incident should be kept informed of the progress of the report.
- b) Concern was expressed by the Pakistani Community over the quality of halal food in hospitals. The Hindu community also indicated that there was a lack of staff awareness and training in that taking the egg off the plate will not then make it acceptable. NHS Tayside indicated that the service is getting reviewed and that staff training is also needed in this area.
- c) Concern was also expressed regarding the lack of response to correspondence to Dundee City Council. The DCC representative noted that the response deadlines were different depending on the situation. For example, if you telephoned a complaint to the Helpline, they must respond in five days. It was agreed that acknowledgement of receipt of communication was only polite.
- d) Difficulties are being experienced with housing repairs only being available in
- e) office hours resulting in people having to take time off work. It was agreed that greater flexibility of access to services would be desirable although not specifically a minority ethnic community issue. The DCC representative confirmed that this was being looked into.
- f) Difficulties in attending for blood tests in the morning was also discussed. It was confirmed that this was to allow them to be processed the same day.
- g) A request was made to DDC Libraries to have an additional paper, the Punjabi Times. This request will be passed on.
- h) More signage is needed for community organisations, mosques etc..The DCC will arrange leaflets for the community on how to request signage.
- i) More information is needed about other consultative bodies such as Patient Focus, Community Councils etc..

Conclusion and Recommendations

The series of consultation events was acknowledged by all as being a positive start to building up a dialogue on how to improve our services to minority ethnic communities. It is recommended that:

- This report be considered by Dundee Equality and Diversity Partnership to establish a regular consultative process meeting no less than twice a year
- Dundee Translation and Interpreting Service and NHS Tayside review their current provision of interpreters and translators
- Communication and Marketing strategies for minority ethnic communities should be developed in consultation with communities
- Staff training regarding cultural awareness should be made a priority within agencies

An action plan should be developed through the Equality and Diversity training Partnership to achieve these goals as a result of this consultation

Appendix 1

Race Equality and Diversity

What we will do

- We will make sure that all minority ethnic communities are encouraged to work for us as employees and with us as members of the community.
- We will check that you can use our services easily
- We will work with you to decide what services are needed in Dundee and how we can provide them
- We will tell people how to report a racist incident and make sure that our staffed are trained to respond

How we will do this:

- Talk with you about what new services you would like and what you would like changed
- Listen to your suggestions and if possible put them into practice
- Let you know what has changed as a result of your suggestions
- Make it easier for you to tell us what you think about our services
- Give you information about services that is clear and easy to understand
- Give you translations of leaflets, letters and information when you need it
- When you use our services, we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one
- We will train all our staff to make sure that our service meets your needs
- We will check the numbers of people using our services from minority ethnic communities to make sure that there are not any problems with people using them
- We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

If you would like to know more about our services or work with us to improve them, please contact

Susan Gunn
Equality & Diversity Team Leader
Communities Department
Dundee City Council
Central Library
Wellgate
Dundee
DD1 1DB
Tel: 01382 431513
Email:
susan.gunn@dundee.gov.uk

Nasreen Mohammed
Diversity Adviser
PO Box 59
West Bell Street
Dundee
DD1 9JU
Tel: 01382 596742
Email:
nasreen.mohammed@tayside.pnn.police.uk

Ali Farquharson
Policy & Development Adviser
Equality & Diversity
Directorate of Change and
Innovation
The North Lodge
Kings Cross Hospital
Dundee
Tel: 01382 424064
Email:
ali.farquharson@thb.scot.nhs.uk



Appendix 2

Community Consultation Event

Date: 13.11.2005

Community: All communities

Allison Fannin (NHS Tayside) led event and Ali Farquharson (NHS Tayside) facilitated group with Chinese community (5 members of community, 1 interpreter and 3 agency representatives from DCC, Tayside Police and NHS Tayside).

Note-taker: Liz Magee (NHS Tayside)

How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

- It is very useful to attend an event like this
- Community members felt it was important to meet more than once a year to allow time for feedback to happen and/or action to take place between meetings.

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- Group consensus on every 6 months (twice yearly)
- Community members would prefer to meet with all agencies at a joint meeting like today's event ('one-stop shop' approach)

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- Although participants were aware of various Chinese groups/associations at work in the area, it was felt that in some cases these groups could be more active and take a more coordinated approach e.g. student group did not appear to be as active as some of the other groups

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

- Please ensure that written information is available in first language
- Some participants had arrived in Dundee very recently and felt that it would be very useful to have a 'central information point' where they could go to access useful information about each of the services and other relevant information about living in the area
- On arriving in Dundee, these individuals were required to contact Tayside Police and felt that this first contact provided a good opportunity to disseminate information in the form of a 'welcome pack', which could contain information on how to register with a GP, what to

do in the event of an emergency and how to contact community groups etc

- The agencies present urged community members to use the contact information provided at today's event to address issues arising between now and future meetings
- Tayside Police advised community members not to throw correspondence away in case it turns out to be important. Contact DCC for translation/interpreter services or ask a family member/friend to check if letters contain important information

2. We will give you information that is clear and easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

- The community stated a preference for face to face contact rather than written information, because meetings like today presented an opportunity to ask questions and discuss issues with an interpreter present
- If possible, community members would like to be contacted at a home address by letter to invite them to attend meetings and it would be useful if an agenda could be enclosed with the invitation
- All participants were happy for their contact details to be used for future notification
- Some participants felt that a 'central information point' was still the best way of providing useful information
- Community members felt that it was useful to include information on accessing translation services with health related material displayed in public areas. However, if participants saw a poster and didn't understand the message being conveyed, they would not necessarily contact translation services to find out. They would have to view the information as being potentially important and without comprehension of the language used, would not be in a position to do so
- All agencies present agreed that delivering information in poster format effectively was challenging and relied on community members keeping in touch with each other and having information communicated to them through their own community groups
- Although all agencies present agreed that meetings would be organised to deal with issues of importance, participants felt that it would be useful to discuss health promotion at a future event

How should we give you this information?

- As recorded earlier, participants favoured face to face meetings instead

of written information

- Some participants favoured a 'central information point' to cater for the Chinese community

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one.

Do we arrange an interpreter for you already?

- None of the participants had availed of this service
- One participant knew the interpreter present at today's event through contact with other community groups, but not through formal contact with DCC's translation/interpreter services
- Some of the participants had recently arrived in Dundee and were aware that a service existed, but were unsure of how and when to access it

Is this useful?

- All participants agreed that a service providing translation and interpretation was very important
- All agencies present emphasised the importance of learning some key phrases to help in the event of an emergency e.g. when dialling 999 be able to state what the emergency is (fire/medical/police) and your language (Chinese and dialect). Emergency services will then be in a position to organise an interpreter
- Several participants felt it would be useful to organise 2-3 monthly meetings for 'newcomers' to provide them with key pieces of information and suggested that this could be organised through the universities. An example was cited of Chinese students failing to insure cars, because they believed car insurance was optional
- One participant felt that more 'in-house' interpreters should be employed/available, particularly in the hospital setting
- Another participant recalled a situation where medical care was needed out of hours and the service available by telephone was unhelpful and caused anxiety
- All agencies present agreed that interpreter services were extremely important to the Chinese community, but acknowledged difficulties in arranging face to face access to an interpreter out of normal working hours

4. We will check that you can use our services easily

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

- Several participants expressed a wish to know more about the services provided by Dundee City Council, Tayside Police and NHS Tayside.
- Participants referred to a previous suggestion that all newcomers should be provided with information and dates of community meetings on initial contact with Tayside Police
- All participants agreed that a 'newcomer information pack' would be very useful as well as individual departments speaking at community meetings
- The agencies present asked participants if they would like to be involved with creating a 'newcomer/pack' and all participants agreed that they would and could be contacted following today's meeting

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority communities to come and work for us?

- One community member asked if it would be possible for a family member to teach Mandarin
- DCC Responded that to work as an interpreter, good command of the English language was essential, but this query could be referred to Education
- Participants knew that free English classes were available at Mitchell Street
- Participants felt that English classes available at Dundee College were too expensive
- One participant lived close to Dundee, but within Angus and as such was told that she could not attend the Mitchell Street classes
- DCC replied that Mitchell Street could discuss with Angus to enable the participant to avail of the classes closer to home
- Another participant queried whether or not volunteers could go into homes to teach English
- Everyone felt that this was a useful query, because individuals may not always be able to attend classes away from home and DCC would look into this

Community Consultation Event: 13 November 2005

Community: All

Led by: Alison Fannin

Panel: Nasreen Mohammed; Susan Gunn

Note-taker: Joyce Cruickshank

Number of community members: 6 males, 10 females, including 2 translators

1. How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

- We would like the agencies to come to the community
- This should be a 2-way process: as well as disseminating information, people's views should be collected

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- Yes, twice a year would make sense

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- No, best if we come to a central place

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

- It is important that all agencies work together, but it would be helpful for them to meet the communities individually, as it would make it more relevant
- There should be people appointed as community contacts – not just the 3 on the sheet. People will then get to know who will deal with their problems
- Interpreters and translators should have background knowledge of the service they are working with. "Ordinary" translators may not have the language necessary and may be at a disadvantage.

2. We will give you information that is clear and easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

- It would be good if a worker could come from the agencies to the community and tell them what to do

How should we give you this information?

- Please send out letters in Chinese (from Chinese lady)
- There are various ways of communication (internet, written, verbal), but no one way that is acceptable to all
- A "one stop shop" would be best
- People gave permission to have their names and addresses used for contact, although they would also like contacted through community groups and mosques

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one.

Do we arrange an interpreter for you already?

- Normally use family members for translation

Is this useful?

- Telephone translation not working well
- Not easy to give details about someone else, for example, someone who is ill, there is a lot of passing information back and forth
- In order of preference, interpreters should be (a) face to face; (b) on call; then (c) the telephone service
- A request for help in Chinese or Urdu goes straight to the translator's mobile phone
- It was suggested by the community that we should learn from other countries and their interpretation and translation services, but it was pointed out that people in other countries pay for this service
- It was stated that as children learn English, the problem will be lessened

4. We will check that you can use our services easily

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

- Halal food, while available in hospitals, is not edible and the resource is being wasted

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us?

- People need not have qualifications - employ them on the basis that you will train them
- People who volunteer, but have no formal qualifications, should be considered
- Offer day release for training as this will not harm people's jobs
- A discussion followed on the above points, pointing out that this happened already in the NHS and Dundee City Council
- Job Fairs for minority ethnic communities were suggested, as were work placements and mentors. So too, was better careers advice for young people
- There was a difficulty in people filling in application forms
- Partnership work was underway with Abertay and Dundee Universities asking about training, support services and translation of qualifications into English
- It was pointed out that there was already a Job Shop for minority ethnic communities, in addition to Action for Jobs

**Community Consultation Event 26 October 2005 – Chinese
Community – Group 1**

Led by: Ali Farquharson

***Panel:* DCC, NHS Tayside and Tayside Police.**

Number attending: 25

***Note-taker:* Joyce Cruickshank**

1. How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

- The community agreed unanimously that they would like to be involved in future

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- A regular event like this one would be useful
- Three or four-monthly meetings would be just right
- Members do not want to meet health, council and police separately

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- Yes. The community liked the format of today's event

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

- Contact the community before the meeting re the agenda
- Members agreed their names and addresses could be used for contacting them

2. We will give you information that is clear and easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

- Despite much debate, a clear answer did not emerge as to the type of information people would like
- The majority were not aware of available health, council or police services
- Translation is the main problem for information giving
- Whatever information is provided by agencies, it should be translated into Chinese

How should we give you this information?

- The community would like an interpreter to disseminate the information to them individually
- Giving information via a website is no use at present, although some members would like to learn how to use the internet

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one

Do we arrange in interpreter for you already?

- Yes

Is this useful?

- Yes, however it would be helpful to have bi-lingual people answer the phone when phoning doctors' surgeries or the hospital.

4. We want to make it easy for you to use our services

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

- Print everything in Chinese (Written Chinese can be understood by all). The majority wished this sent to every individual in the community
- All were willing to allow their names and addresses to be kept for contact details
- It would be acceptable to give information about services to community leaders, who could then disseminate it

(Health and Council)

- If someone speaking the language would answer the telephone

(Health)

- Having interpreters in hospital and GP surgeries
- Having a translation on hospital outpatient appointment documents
- Having a translator taking the patient to see the doctor
- Health and Council agreed they would talk jointly about interpretation and translation services and report back at a later meeting

(Council in Angus)

- Many comments and questions were directed at council services in Angus. For example, domestic bins and nuisance neighbours. The Dundee City Council rep undertook to collect these at the end of the meeting and pass them on to the appropriate person

(Police)

- Have the police respond immediately after an incident, not up to an hour afterwards
- It was explained to the community that the police try to prioritise incidents according to urgency
- The police were asked if they had an interpreter and they said yes
- Some members of the community spoke about trouble in their shops and asked what they should do. The Chief Inspector present said he would arrange for personal safety advice to be given. He would report back to the community when he had a time and place arranged

AII)

- There is a lack of awareness of what services are available from agencies
- Official forms were a problem, particularly for benefits. It is difficult to follow any instructions written in English. The general feeling was that more translation and interpretation were necessary
- It was stated that the Government provided a telephone translation service and the community was asked how much of a problem these forms were. The answer was that the initial phone call was a problem because the person who answered the phone was not Chinese
- Following a discussion, it was agreed that the leaders would try to organise for agencies such as the Inland Revenue, the Department of Work and Pensions, Citizen's Advice and other voluntary organisations to attend a community meeting and discuss how to deal with language problems. Permission was asked to use the names and addresses obtained at the beginning of the event
- No-one knew about the Community Safety Strategy or how to report a racist incident
- The agencies assured the community that such information would be made available to them. They would report back at a future meeting

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us?

- Hold regular meetings
- Say what qualifications are needed for each job
- Send advertisements by post to individuals
- Do not advertise in the newspapers as Chinese people do not read them
- Advertise in the Chinese supermarket in Trades Lane, and other community places
- Write the ads in Chinese

Community Consultation Event

Date: 25 October 2005

Community: Chinese

This event was introduced by Susan Gunn from Dundee City Council (DCC) and 50 members of the Chinese community attended.

Group work was facilitated by Nasreen Mohammed (Tayside Police) with 25 members of the Chinese community. The group panel was made up of representatives from DCC, Tayside Police, NHS Tayside and NHS Tayside Patient Focus Public Involvement.

Note-taker: Liz Magee (NHS Tayside)

1. How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

Participants agreed that it would be very useful to be involved in the future. The community would like to see changes as a result of consultation, not just consultation for its own sake.

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- The community would like to meet 2-3 times a year to keep up to date with information and communicate with all agencies
- When asked on how agencies should feedback, the community said they would like face-to-face meetings
- The best time to meet would be between 12 noon and 2 pm on a Monday or Tuesday
- Meetings should not be arranged in the evenings or at weekends

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- Yes. There are 2 groups in particular who would like agencies to come along: Elderly Women's Group at Pine Court and a Chinese Women's Group
- Many participants belong to the Chinese business community and would value a meeting with DCC where information on licensing laws could be discussed

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

As above.

2. We will give you information that is clear and easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

- Participants from the business community would like translated information from DCC on licensing laws, including applications and guidelines.

How should we give you this information?

- Participants would prefer to meet agencies face to face.
- Written material would be more useful in Chinese.

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one.

Do we arrange an interpreter for you already?

- Some participants had tried to access this service, while others relied on family members to accompany them, for example to hospital appointments.

Is this useful?

- One participant asked if it would be possible to access an interpreter if a family member was to undergo surgery
- NHS Tayside responded that it would be possible to arrange an interpreter in these circumstance and again highlighted the importance of mentioning this to the family GP from the outset
- Another participant was keen to find out how to access these services
- DCC advised participants to contact them initially to arrange an interpreter or translation services
- Most participants experienced difficulties with the service including;
 - Being unable to communicate in English with the person answering the phone at Translation/Interpretation Services
 - Big delays in accessing an interpreter for a hospital appointment and often participants said they were unable to arrange support in time
- Participants suggested setting-up a dedicated phone line for Chinese enquiries, so at least the first point of contact could be in Chinese and an appropriate referral could be made at that point
- DCC took a note of this suggestion.

4. We will check that you can use our services easily

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

- As above, participants suggested setting up a dedicated phone number for use by the Chinese Community and this was noted by Dundee City Council
- Send correspondence in Chinese
- In the event of reporting a racial incident, some participants were concerned about having to wait for periods of 20 minutes or longer for police to phone them back or respond. This was particularly difficult if police phoned a member of the community to check on a situation and that individual was unable to communicate well in English
- Tayside Police responded that racist incidents were given high priority, but resources were not always available to respond immediately to all calls and the nature of the call would have to be taken into account to allow for effective prioritisation
- Participants felt it would be very helpful to have access to a Chinese-speaking person at Ninewells Hospital main reception area.
- NHS Tayside queried if it would be useful to include clear, translated instructions on where to go for a hospital appointment in correspondence.
- Tayside Police hope to include a translated information slip with all correspondence providing information on where to go etc by next year
- Tayside Police don't always have sufficient information available to know which language an individual speaks, so the information included with correspondence will be provided in the main languages only
- Participants were encouraged to give Tayside Police feedback
- NHS Tayside has access to more detailed information through medical records etc and is therefore in a better position to know which language to use in corresponding with a patient/client

- All participants agreed that these suggestions from both agencies (health and police) would be very useful and helpful
- Participants were unhappy with the telephone service provided in the hospital setting to cater for interpretation needs:
 - Participants reported that some hospital rooms didn't have phones
 - Many people relied on their mobile phones to contact family/friends for help, but they were unable to use this technology in hospital and as a result felt very isolated and didn't know what to do
- NHS Tayside responded that some of these problems would be resolved through better training for staff on the arrangements in place to access interpretation/translation support for patients

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us?

There was insufficient time to cover this issue at the meeting.

Participants did not raise the subject of recruitment in any other areas of discussion covered by this *pro forma*.

**Community Consultation Event: 7 November 2005
Community: Minority Ethnic Women**

Led by: Ali Farquharson

Panel: Allyson Angus; Nasreen Mohammed; and Lorna Ferry

Note-taker: Joyce Cruickshank

Number of community members: 4 (Chinese), plus interpreter

1. How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

- More meetings like this, two or three times a year
- A previous meeting had been arranged some time ago, but there was no follow up

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- Yes

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- Best if community meets with agencies, as some people are not member of groups and would miss out if agencies came out to the community

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

- When someone who speaks the native language answers the telephone
- Written communication was problematic, because the whole letter is usually in English with only the translation and interpretation piece appearing in the person's native language. This meant they could not understand what the letter was actually about, so did not know who was the best person to ask for advice
- It was advised that there were 55 languages used in Dundee so it would be impossible to translate every letter into a person's native language

2. We will give you information that is clear and easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

- Give information on the services that are provided by agencies (a "menu")
- Give information explaining how and when to contact services
- Information on the Benefits Agency and on Immigration
- Health Promotion/Health Improvement/how to keep healthy
- Bus pass criteria
- How to report a racist incident

How should we give you this information?

- Firstly, to the home address
- Through meetings, where the information can be taken back and studied in detail
- Give to community groups, who will disseminate
- There are 3 Chinese Women's Groups – Interpreter will provide names and addresses
- Two-way process – community members should test out the services as "mystery shoppers" and feedback

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one

Do we arrange an interpreter for you already?

- Yes

Is this useful?

- Query whether this could be used for private correspondence – no
- How do you differentiate between business and private?
- The telephone service is a waste of time and money – not available when required (ie, needs a telephone socket and a relevant place to make call)
- Communication difficulties between interpreter and client
- Face-to-face communication preferable
- No knowledge of how to report police incidents – too big a problem, therefore try to avoid

4. We will check that you can use our services easily

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

- Different agencies coming together like this and explaining how their services can be accessed (especially social services)
- A meeting will be organised for the purpose of explaining how the health service works, particularly services for the elderly
- The community would like the departments to tell them what services they have, people cannot contribute if they don't know what services are "selling"
- The analogy was made of a menu: tell me what you have, I will tell you what I expect. Tell me your limitations

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us?

- There is a language problem – Chinese people cannot do most of the jobs advertised
- Need to sort out interpretation and translation – we need to meet the people who are using the service and make arrangements together
- Even bi-lingual speakers still need an ability to do the job
- Start with schools and colleges – go and speak to the younger generation
- Ensure that there are no barriers to their gaining employment (such as racism)
- Advertise in community groups and supermarkets (Trades Lane and Gellatly Street)

Community Consultation Event

Date: 09.11.2005

Community: Minority Ethnic Women

Led by: Ali Farquharson (NHS Tayside). Group work with 15 women (including an interpreter) was facilitated by Susan Gunn (Dundee City Council). The group panel was made up of representatives from Dundee City Council, Tayside Police and NHS Tayside. A crèche was provided.

Note-taker: Liz Magee (NHS Tayside)

1. How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

- Participants agreed that meetings like today were important
- Face to face contact was preferable to written material
- Participants felt that turn out was quite poor for this event and that within their communities meetings were often perceived to be boring
- Others felt that community members find it quite difficult to make time to attend events like this

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- The group agreed that twice yearly meetings would suffice
- Some participants felt that joint meetings were a good idea, whereas others preferred to meet with separate agencies
- All agencies represented responded that it would be possible to arrange further meetings with separate agencies if communities requested that in addition to larger 6 monthly meetings
- Agreement was reached on holding 6-monthly meetings with all agencies represented and further meetings to be arranged based on specific requests

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- Participants responded that they would access community meetings to find out more about services and keep up to date
- In the event of an important issue being particularly relevant to women, participants agreed that it would be useful for agencies to

Speak at the Dundee International Women's Centre

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

- As previously recorded, participants felt that face to face meetings with access to an interpreter provided a useful opportunity for communities to feed back to agencies and vice versa

2. We will give you information that is clear and is easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

Group members agreed that posters and leaflets provided a valuable way of providing information on a range of services, but only if translated, plain English and/or pictorial versions were available

This point was reinforced by another participant who cited research demonstrating that a significant proportion of the UK population has difficulty with reading and writing – this is across the board and not just an issue for minority ethnic groups

Participants with children valued information they received from health professionals including leaflets distributed to pregnant women and young mums by Health Visitors, but would prefer to receive translated versions

Translated leaflets are available from a central point, but NHS Tayside would look at how more of these resources could be made available locally

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one

Do we arrange an interpreter for you already?

Participants felt that around 80% of community members relied on a family member or friend to help with translation/interpretation.

Agency representatives acknowledged that this was far from ideal, because;

- interpreters should be trained in all aspects of delivering the service and meet appropriate standards
- this placed a great burden on those family members/friends asked to attend hospital appointments to interpret/translate
- this could be problematic regarding confidentiality- all DCC interpreters adhere to confidentiality and data protection laws

Is this useful?

- The main reason cited for relying on family members was the difficulty participants experienced in arranging an interpreter in time for hospital appointments
- Participants experienced delays in accessing interpreters and felt that the capacity available did not take account of the need/demand for this service
- One participant, qualified to provide Arabic translation reported a lack of awareness regarding access to the service, demonstrated by individuals sending documents to Edinburgh and Glasgow unnecessarily
- Participants found the telephone service available within the Acute sector unhelpful and would prefer face to face contact with an interpreter where possible
- Agency representatives acknowledged that staff did not always know how to access translation/interpretation services and that further training was needed to raise awareness when dealing with patients in particular. Training is currently underway
- Agency representatives reminded participants that at times, staff may overestimate a client's command of English if a client can communicate in a very basic way e.g. able to make an appointment, but unable to communicate effectively with health professional at that appointment
- Agencies are working jointly to move towards a single system
- In future, one participant queried whether there would be one interpreter available per health centre
- NHS Tayside and Dundee City Council responded that they work with a pool of interpreters

- Participants felt that the current workforce does not reflect Dundee's minority ethnic groups fully and if it did, some of the issues with translation and interpretation would be resolved
- Agency representatives reminded participants that they should always report difficulties to inform continuing and improved service development
- Both NHS Tayside and Dundee City Council responded that while it might be fine for employees to converse with clients in a minority ethnic language, they could not act as translators/interpreters. Specialist training is required to become a translator/interpreter. This training is particularly important when dealing with complex medical matters to avoid any confusion or misinterpretation
- DCC plans to provide communities with cards specifying their language and the need to access translation/interpretation services. Community members could then use these cards to communicate with agencies in the first instance
- DCC will also explore transferring helpline requests directly to the mobile number of a DCC interpreter to speed up the process.

4. We will check that you can use our services easily

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

Discussion focused on reporting racial incidents

- occasion felt that racism was not a big issue. Agencies present reminded participants that to encounter such behaviour only once was still unacceptable and should be reported
- Participants queried whether or not CCTV was useful in dealing with racist incidents and Tayside Police responded that where cameras were in place and in full working order, CCTV was a useful tool

NHS services

- One participant queried if a request could be made to see a female doctor
- Another participant who had requested to see a female doctor at the labour suite was told that she would see whoever was available
- Participants commented that they received, what they perceived to be as negative reactions, from NHS staff when requesting to see a female doctor/health professional
- NHS Tayside representatives responded that requests to access a female doctor should be upheld, but in the event of an emergency

situation where immediate treatment is needed, this may not always be possible

Dundee City Council services

- Participants were aware of community wardens, but did not feel well informed about the range of services provided by DCC and felt that wider publicity was needed
- One participant suggested that public announcements should be made in local newspapers, town centres and via billboards including contact details on where to find more community information
- Another suggestion from participants was to include a community information supplement in the local telephone directory
- Participants would like more facilities provided at council sports centres. Suggestions included; a crèche, women-only sessions and greater privacy while exercising
- DCC to explore providing greater privacy e.g. look at possibility of using curtains or blinds to screen glass windows facing exercise rooms or gym areas

Tayside Police services

- A representative from Tayside Police asked participants to give their views on sensitive issues including the abuse of women and or children
- Participants agreed that issues relating to abuse were usually '*swept under the carpet*' within their communities
- Participants cited a number of reasons for this including;
 - '*In a small community, everyone knows everything and the victim gets labelled.*'
 - Victims of abuse would not want to report it to the police, because the victim and victim's family would be stigmatised.
 - The honour of a family would be brought into disrepute.
 - If the victim of abuse was male, participants felt that an incident would be even less likely to be reported.
- Some participants felt that younger generations would report this type of incident to police, even though older family members would be reluctant to
- Participants emphasised the importance of confidentiality in dealing with matters like this
- All agencies emphasised the availability of a confidential service to deal with matters like this and that staff are required to sign

confidentiality agreements

- NHS Tayside reminded participants that health professionals can provide advice and support
- Tayside Police access external interpreters and participants felt this was very important, because they would not wish to divulge information to someone they recognised within their own community
- Participants would like information to be made available to everyone, not just minority ethnic groups, on where and how to access help
- One participant suggested disseminating this information through TV advertising

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us?

- Participants felt that agency workforces should reflect the ethnic diversity of communities living in the area

Community Consultation Event: 7 November 2005

Community: Hindu, Punjabi, Bengali, Urdu

***Led by:* Nasreen Mohammed**

***Panel:* Ali Farquharson; Santosh Chima; Allison Fannin, Allyson Angus; Sgt Ian Glass; Jim Cochrane; Susan Gunn**

***Note-takers:* Liz Magee and Joyce Cruickshank**

Number of community members: 20 adults and one child

1. How would you like to be involved in the future?

Discussion

- More meetings like this, on a regular basis
- Either monthly or 3-monthly, depending on who is involved
- One member heard about this meeting by word of mouth only this afternoon and stated it was noticeable that a lot of people that would normally have come were absent

Would a regular event like this be useful?

- Yes
- It would be an idea to prepare "question and answer" leaflets, listing the most common problems that the agencies come across and giving a response
- The meetings could be with individuals or collectively, however it suited agencies
- Advance notice should be given – send a leaflet to the community organisations and leaders rather than individuals, eg, mosques, temples and Bharatiya Ashram
- It would be helpful if the community helped to prepare an up-to-date list of active community organisations as previous correspondence has gone undelivered
- The Mark Henderson Centre is a good, central location

Would you like us to come along to your group to speak to you about services?

- Agencies would be welcome to come to community centres, temples, and other community organisations
- Send details out to the community organisations

How can we make it easier for you to tell us what you think about services?

- Word of mouth
- In writing rather than by telephone
- By having the name and number of a contact person who could be approached in between meetings (the invitation leaflet has contact details for the 3 agencies)
- Say how issues can be raised at any time, not just at meetings
- A guaranteed time limit for a response or acknowledgement from agencies
- The contact person may not be able to solve the problem, but should ensure it is passed to the relevant person/department. They should act as the "catalyst"
- Responses should be given as soon as possible, although it depends on the issue and who is responsible for it. (There are 15 council departments dealing with diverse subjects and what is appropriate for one may not be for another)
- General complaints to the council should be recorded on the helpline, which has a target of 5 working days to acknowledge a complaint. (If a communication is sent to a department or a named individual this may take much longer). At present the communication structure across council departments is being looked at
- Communication with the police is logged at headquarters on a database, passed out, acknowledged, and then passed to the appropriate person. For minor matters, they would suggest asking another family member to help communicate. Eighteen months ago the police invested in a system that identified a caller's language and allowed them to arrange for an interpreter to call the person back
- Have housing repairs able to be carried out on a Saturday. This is an issue the council is aware of and it is reviewing its service
- Similarly, it was a problem for some to go to a GP in the morning to have blood taken and the reasons for this were discussed
- Contact should not be restricted to complaints. Members are

encouraged to join existing groups and develop practice from the outset

2. We will give you information that is clear and easy to understand

What kind of information would you like?

- The community was asked if they knew about community wardens and they said no
- Asked about the flu vaccine, the answer was yes
- People were confident they knew how to report a racist incident
- This could be done to any agency (police, education, housing, victim support, school, doctors, shops etc) and would be fully investigated through the multi-agency panel which collates information from all members
- 80% of all reported incidents resulted in a submission to the Procurator Fiscal and a community member should be informed of the outcome
- If this does not happen, you should contact the police and complain
- An incident is racist if the victim perceives it to be
- The community wardens and the anti-social behaviour team will be invited to attend a future meeting
- The Central Library obtains only one Punjabi paper a week and the community members would like it to purchase another. They had been informed by council staff that the reason was cost
- A community member stated that they were not consulted on dietary needs in hospitals. They were told a catering review has just been undertaken and minority ethnic patients had been consulted during the process. A website had been set up to train and inform staff on cultures, customs and dietary and other requirements and it could be accessed by anyone requiring information. Community members were very welcome to influence this
- There was criticism that there was not enough signage directing people to the mosques and community centres. This should begin on the outskirts of Dundee, avoiding the need for people to telephone community members asking for directions
- The council will prepare leaflets advising members on how to request signs. This will be in plain English

How should we give you this information?

- By leaflets and letters, not phone
- It was stated by a community member that Hindi was the national language of India yet it was missing from most communications. It was explained that advice had been sought before leaflets etc were translated and that Punjabi was more prevalent in Dundee. The comment will, however, be taken on board
- There are 55 languages spoken in Dundee at the moment and not all could be covered, it was a case of getting best value for money
- Where a language was not covered, the communication was written in plain English, so that a dictionary could be consulted
- As well as continuing the present arrangement to meet communities, members were encouraged to speak to the Patient Focus, Public Involvement people with a view to joining panels that they organise and influencing the health service

3. When you use our services we will arrange an interpreter free of charge if you need one.

Do we arrange an interpreter for you already?

- None of the community members had need to use an interpreter, using family instead
- The council was asked if it would pay for an interpreter chosen by a community member and they said no. Interpreters and translators must be qualified and meet certain standards
- If someone was qualified and the council was trying to recruit then that person could be invited to apply for work. Hopefully, as young people learn their native language in addition to English, this will happen
- There was a discussion on having family members interpret for medical appointments but this was not considered to be appropriate in case of misinterpretation and confidentiality
- It is not appropriate for children to be interpreters
- Guidelines from the Lord Advocate for the police state that only qualified interpreters can be used in a formal situation, eg, arrest
- There is a similar situation in the NHS for, eg, diagnosis
- The council are looking at translation for serious matters, eg, eviction. This should be dealt with in the community language or sight translated by an interpreter
- Community members were worried about the confidentiality of interpreters and it was pointed out that these people have, like all agencies, strict rules on confidentiality
- A public relations exercise was needed to convince community members that this was a confidential service
- There could be a statement to this effect on all communications in future

Is this useful?

4. We will check that you can use our services easily

What would make it easier for you to use our services?

- Having reasonable food for vegetarian Hindu – the community members are happy to discuss this with the NHS for patients in hospital
- The NHS responded by saying there had been a review of catering and there should be positive action soon for all faith groups and cultural needs
- Fasting procedures are very challenging for the NHS
- The community members ought to trust the NHS when they say they are providing Halal food
- Issue was taken with the provision of vegetarian food, eg, it was not acceptable to have meat, chicken or eggs in salad. It was still inedible if these items were simply removed from the plate. Nor was it acceptable to have different foods fried in the same oil
- The NHS referred to the website for staff where cultural differences, practices, food, diet and prayer were listed, and what they should be doing and providing
- It was pointed out that this was a 2-way process and community members could influence the site
- The council pointed out that staff training was a priority
- Although community members could communicate within their own houses as there is usually someone who can speak English, there was a difficulty when someone who couldn't speak English was alone
- Such people need support in hospital, where there could be problems around medicine and operations
- NHS Tayside are preparing an advanced service for people needing interpretation, but as there are many languages to be covered, it will be a staged process

5. We will encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us and make sure that they are treated fairly

What should we do to encourage people from minority ethnic communities to come and work for us?

- Encourage people and give them training
- The majority did not know how to go about obtaining jobs and asked what type of jobs were available and how they could apply
- Normally community members use the JobCentre and school areas to look for work
- It was asked that places be advertised in temples, mosques and The Bharatiya Ashram
- It was agreed that work placements on a trial basis were a good idea, it would give good experience
- It was emphasised that these were not only for young people
- If members were already in employment they could think about having a mentor, who would be in a position to advise of any opportunities coming up